

COMMISSION MEMORANDUM

TO: Mayor Philip Levine and Members of the City Commission

FROM: Jimmy L. Morales, City Manager 

DATE: June 7, 2017

SUBJECT: REPORT OF THE FINANCE AND CITYWIDE PROJECTS COMMITTEE (FCWPC) MEETING
ON FRIDAY, MAY 19, 2017

A meeting of the Finance and Citywide Projects Committee was held on Friday, May 19, 2017 at 2:30 p.m. in the Commission Chamber, 3rd Floor of City Hall. Commissioners in attendance: Commissioners Ricky Arriola, Joy Malakoff, John Elizabeth Alemán, and Michael Grieco. Members from the Administration and the public were also in attendance.

MEETING OPENED AT 2:35 P.M.

OLD BUSINESS

1. **Discussion Regarding A Proposed Interceptor Garage At 1623 West Avenue (Lot No. P23)**
Commission Item R9E, September 27, 2016
(Parking)

Saul Frances, Parking Director

AFTER-ACTION

Saul Frances, Parking Director presented the item. He explained this was a potential pedestrian bridge to connect the planned garage at 1623 West Avenue to the 1600 Alton Road Garage developed by Crescent Heights. The prior direction from the Committee was to see if the developer was willing to fund the pedestrian bridge, the developer requested an estimate for it, CIP gave an estimate of about \$300,000. The developer contemplated it and returned with an unwillingness to fund it even though they were willing to provide the access at their facility. There is some diminished public benefit here that if there was some potential to provide access there is also a concern with the being somewhat making the City's garage more attractive because of our rates and potentially filling that garage as opposed to the developers garage.

Commissioner Alemán said she thought this was all to their benefit if they are not willing to pay for it. Commissioner Arriola said that he is disappointed.

Michael Llorente, Llorente and Heckler spoke. He said he wanted to highlight the reason Mr. Galbut decided not to invest in this pedestrian bridge. They see parking demand actually going down including the use of car sharing etc. He said that rather than have a 270 car garage, since parking needs are diminishing and the need for workforce housing is increasing they are urging the City to consider focusing on workforce housing and include parking as a secondary component of the project.

Commissioner Alemán said that she was allowing this to unfold.

Saul Frances said they did receive direction from the Commission meeting to proceed with the garage project at 1623 West Avenue, this item was solely on the pedestrian bridge component.

Commissioner Arriola asked if they talked about workforce housing on this site. Saul Frances said we did.

MOTION: Vote of acclamation to move forward with Commission direction from Wednesday's Commission meeting and take the pedestrian bridge concept off of the table.

2. Discussion Regarding A Skate Park/Parking Structure At The 72nd Street Parking Lot (P92)

Commission Item C4B, February 8, 2017
(Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development)

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director

AFTER-ACTION

Jeff Oris, Economic Development Division Director presented the item. He said the reason this is still here before the committee is because the direction from the committee was to bring back conceptual designs. The full Commission has since decided to move forward and do an RFP for the entirety of this lot, there was one conceptual design that had already been done. He said they just wanted to make sure he showed the design to the committee. He said they can give individual comments that can be provided to the designer that the Commission wants for the lot.

Commissioner Alemán said that all of it looks very interesting and it should certainly go into the discussion with the designer.

NO ACTION TAKEN

3. Discussion Regarding A Potential Lease With The Venture City For Commercial Space Located At 1661 Pennsylvania Avenue

(Jeff Oris)

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director

AFTER-ACTION

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director presented the item. She said that the Venture City is a one stop shop for incubators, business accelerators, they are new to Miami and they are launching in Miami and internationally with the guidance of the Beacon Council. They have toured some of the properties in Miami Beach and are interested in a 2 year rent free lease at the former Oolite space.

Laura Gonzalez-Estefani, CEO and founder of the Venture City spoke. She said they are trying to help stimulate growth of the technology community. She gave some background of what she would like to do with the Venture City in Miami and how to connect it to the rest of the world.

Commissioner Arriola asked where she has done the incubator concept before. Laura said that she has never done an incubator before, but has grown companies and different services and products around the world. This concept is very different than other companies, she gave details on the differences of this type of incubator and accelerators compared to other systems in the world.

Commissioner Arriola said his challenge with this proposal is giving away this property which is not real estate. Due to close proximity to Lincoln Road the estimate is \$60 a square foot depending on a 1 year or 2 year lease, which would cost \$800,000 over the 2 years. He asked why we would do this, when we can give this rent to a paying client or a nonprofit that we would want to attract. He asked why Venture City over other deserving companies.

Laura said if there already is a nonprofit organization that can make use of the space, she would definitely back up because they just want to contribute to the community. She definitely doesn't want to get in the middle of anything. She said they do want to make Miami Beach as a hub for technology, but they need commitment from the government. She said to think about it as a partnership, they will reinvest in the community. She explained they can do many things in the community.

Commissioner Arriola asked how many jobs would be created in the space. Laura said by the end of the year they will be around 25 people, but they will be bringing a lot of companies from different areas around the world to have a hub here. They will be bringing a team of 12 people from Brazil, 3 start ups from Colombia, and a couple from Sweden. They will be generating a lot of jobs and internships. Commissioner Arriola said that he would not like to support the proposal.

Commissioner Alemán said that these people are world class technical people, this is a space that has been more often empty than anything else. To incubate new business we have a whole economic diversification strategy that is being worked on, the types of workers would be in our community would be knowledge workers. There is a challenge of being able to live in the City and work here. She said she doesn't think this would be a challenge with the Venture City people. She said she appreciates the technology industry connection that would form between the City of Miami Beach and the home cities that the people would come from. She thinks it would be valuable and could lead to some interesting things. She said she believes the timing of the 2 years fits well with the completion of the Convention Center. She said the City would need to renegotiate at that point. She said she is in favor of giving this a try and she thinks it is very much in line with the technology revolution. She mentioned there were two letters of reference from Emerge and the Knight Foundation. She would ask that Commissioner Arriola reconsider, since this still has to go in front of the Commission anyway. She would be honored if Commissioner Arriola would allow this to go back to the Commission with a favorable recommendation from the Committee, she said they can still talk about concerns and so forth at that point.

Commissioner Arriola said that there are reasons why this space has sat empty for the last couple of years. It has been used for the Convention Center. The City did not want to go out to market to find users because we have been trying to preserve it for City use. He said he has been talking about getting a nonprofit Arts organization to come in and use it for performance spaces. He said since now we are open to putting it out to market, he does not want to rush into the first offer that is given for the space. He would prefer to wait for something that works. He also said he does not want to give free space to people who can afford to pay the rent.

Laura said that if this doesn't work this time maybe another time would. She said if not with their project maybe there is another project the City can help out that is not so well funded.

Commissioner Arriola said that if they are looking for free rent, there are other areas they can look into. He said North Beach can actually use the jobs they are providing. He said he would be interested in discussing alternative locations in North Beach.

Commissioner Alemán suggested sending this back to the Commission with no recommendation and direction to staff to identify other possible locations that can be considered.

MOTION: Vote of acclamation to send this back to Commission with no recommendation and direct staff to identify other possible locations that can be considered.

NEW BUSINESS

4. Discussion Regarding The Fees Charges To Developers To Appear Before The City's Land Use Boards

Commission Item C4F, April 26, 2017
(Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán)

Tom Mooney, Planning Director

AFTER-ACTION

Commissioner Alemán said she is the sponsor of this item at the request of the Chamber of Commerce. She said when she was first elected the Commission they voted on this and approved the modification of these fee schedules. She said now there have been some complaints of the lack of a cap, this is a good chance to work together between the private sector and staff to see if this is reasonable and to see if there should be any changes made.

Jerry Libbin, President and CEO of the Chamber of Commerce spoke on the item. He mentioned he had some developers present at the meeting in case the committee had any questions. He said in December 2015 there was a 98 page ordinance presented, he also gave some background on the ordinance. He spoke about the cost of getting to the Design Review Board and other land use boards.

Commissioner Alemán said she met with Jerry Libbin, Carmen Sanchez, John Woodruff, Eve Boutsis and went over the chambers proposal. She said she thinks we need to understand how everything works.

Carmen Sanchez, Deputy Planning Director said after that meeting they put together an analysis, which walks us through an example for a proposed project on Ocean Terrace and what it would look like and what the fees would be for those. She said if we look back in 2015 when they adopted the ordinance, the implications behind this, they realized that the City's general fund was covering 72% of the cost related to the land development process. The developers were paying 28% of the cost. They looked at other fees in other cities and our own City's fees, they realized that since 2002, the consumer price index as required by the ordinance had not been reflected in the fees. They took a progressive approach with a goal to be cost neutral, for development to pay for itself. The fees that are actually put in place would generate that. She said these fees have not been in place for over year, so she is not sure if there should be a cap or not. She said they mentioned when they were doing the fees that once there was a full cycle they would come back to the FCWPC and the Land Use Committee and revisit that. They also took strides to make sure the residents' fees were reduced in comparison to new development fees. There is another aspect to this that is important, every time that a developer comes to the Commission, it requires modification to the land use regulations, they are not paying for that. When the changes are made the City is assuming all of the costs. For example, in North Beach the City did certain changes to the LDR, the comprehensive plan, the land use map, and the zoning map, which would have cost developers \$344,000. Every time a project comes before the Commission and there is a referral, the City absorbs the cost of doing

business.

Commissioner Alemán asked if no Commissioner had sponsored any item on the table presented, the developer would have paid the \$344,000 and they would have gone to the Land Use Committee and it would be the additional \$135,000. It would be about a half a million dollars worth of fees to the City. One of the things that were pointed out to her was that renovation of existing square footage does not incur any of the square foot fees. In terms of looking at the budget and seeing that it is netted very closely, maybe the calculation up front was very good. All of the burden is on the new square footage and none on renovations and she thinks that needs to be addressed.

Carmen Sanchez said that they can look at that, how much of the renovation should be assessed as opposed to new square footage. She referenced the table they provided, and said in the last 2 years, the Commission has adopted legislation that if it were to be paid by the developers it would be amount to over half of a million dollars. It is important to understand that.

Commissioner Arriola said the purpose of the ordinance was to be cost neutral. There needs to be a fair system, he said he is looking at it like activity based cost accounting. What is it that is occurring in the City that puts the Planning Department into motion, that should be somehow allocated back. He said he thinks that there are more renovations going on in the City than new development. He thinks it should be looked at.

Carmen Sanchez said that is something that can be looked at. She thinks it is equitable to do that, so that new development does not bare all of the costs. It is just the way the ordinance is written today, so the Planning Department was following direction.

Commissioner Alemán said that when they were looking at when the fees start coming in, they collectively observed when the developer is trying to put a project together, most of the initial steps they are not being charged any fees. She thought that it is probably appropriate.

Carmen Sanchez said that the City doesn't turn anyone away. The fees that are being talked about here sort of offset what the planning department does, but it does not take care of any back of house of any management fees with Finance, Budget, City Attorney's Office, and other support departments.

Jerry Libbin said that the employees are employed to do these jobs for the City. He also said many of the developments are not homesteaded, which means they are growing the tax base every year. He wants to know where that is being factored in. He said he would hope that a cap would be put down that is more modest so people have an idea of where they are going on this.

Commissioner Arriola said that he shares in a lot of what Jerry Libbin said particularly the cap, there is a point where you are building certain buildings that are not more expensive on the part of the Planning department. He said that everyone wants to be equitable here. He said he doesn't know how much time the Planning department needs to come up with some grids and ideas to consider. He said if they can do it by the next FCWPC meeting that would be great if not the next meeting.

Carmen Sanchez said she will do her best to have it for the next meeting.

Sandor Sher, lobbyist, said that when the Planning Department makes changes to zoning there is usually a greater interest. There is a fundamental thing to encourage economic development.

Daniel Veitia, resident, said that on the very smaller scale related to North Beach, many of his

clients went to land use boards just to be able to put a washer and dryer in. It is discouraging to have to pay in order for the board to tell them it is okay to put a washer and dryer. People get lost in the track of being forced to go to these boards for very small things.

Commissioner Arriola would like for Daniel Veitia to send some of his ideas and recommendations for this item to him, John, and Carmen. In reference to what Daniel was saying he said it incentivized people to cheat the system and that is not what we want.

Commissioner Alemán said for Daniel to follow back up with Carmen. This came up in the detailed discussion that was had if you weren't adding square footage you weren't paying any of these fees, that maybe we could do a better job there and use it for some of these small things that were resident oriented.

DIRECTION: Come back to the next or following FCWPC meeting with some grids and ideas to consider for this item.

5. Discussion Regarding The Living Wage Rates For Fiscal year 2017-2018, In Accordance With Chapter 2, Article VI, Division 6, Section 2-408, Of The City Code

Commission Item C4G, April 26, 2017
(Procurement)

Alex Denis, Procurement Director

AFTER-ACTION

City Attorney Aguila said that as part of the annual budget review process, the City Commission has the option of reviewing the current living wage and increasing it or not. This is the first step which is brought up in the budget process, this is the first discussion that we have and the discussion is on whether or not the living wage should be indexed this year in accordance with the consumer price index. Alex Denis, Procurement Director said that the Living Wage is governed by section 2-408 of the City code. The Current rate is \$11.62 with health benefits and \$13.31 without health benefits. The rates were last indexed in September 2014. In considering whether or not to index the rate, the City Commission has options. First option is to increase the rate pursuant to the CPI or 3%, whichever is less. The code allows for a catch up option, the catch up option is for those years in which there was no living wage increase, and finally the Commission has the option of not increasing the rate at all. The CPI increase for the period being discussed is 2.5% which will increase the rate to \$11.91 with a \$1.73 health benefit for a total \$13.64. If the City Commission decides to go with the catch up, the CPI increase is 5.62% which will result in a \$12.27 rate with a \$1.79 health benefit. The Budgetary impacts are \$351,000 for the first option and \$799,000 for the second option.

City Attorney Raul Aguila clarified that this is not a Citywide wage, the City living wage is an hourly wage that the City pays to certain City contractors who do business with the City. This includes parking attendant services, landscaping services, janitorial services, and those type of basic City services. This living wage rate is for those City contractor employers to pay their employees for performing these services in the City of Miami Beach.

Lili Bach political director for SEIU Local 32BJ spoke to address her concerns on the living wage as it stands. The ordinance is outdated and is unable to fulfill its original purpose because of a lack of an annual indexing mechanism. The base rate and the health differential have not kept up with inflation and needs to be revised. She proposes that the City Commission take the following measures. 1. Increase the living wage base rate to accomplish its original intent which is to provide workers an income of 10% above the federal poverty level. 2. Increase the healthcare differential to provide for at least the average cost of an employer paid single health

plans, which would mean raising from \$1.69 per hour to \$3.09 per hour. 3. Modify the indexing formula for the base rate by providing for automatic indexing to inflation and removing the caps for increases. 4. Modify the healthcare differential by using a relevant rate that accounts for healthcare costs increases. The current wages listed does not allow for workers to afford healthcare.

Commissioner Arriola asked why did the wage not keep up with inflation when inflation is really low. Ms. Bach explained it was through the healthcare differential. Commissioner agreed and added that the healthcare differential has grown at double digit rates and were only adjusting for CPI. Ms. Bach explained that for Miami-Dade they were able to raise the living wage by fixing the healthcare differential. Ms. Bach is suggesting \$3.09 increase for the healthcare differential. Raul Aguila explained that there are two options with the living wage. One is a flat hourly rate for employers who choose not to offer benefits which is usually higher. The option Ms. Bach is suggesting is an hourly rate plus a minimum hourly rate where you offer benefits.

Commissioner Arriola requested further clarification on the proposed recommendation. Mr. Aldon De Ryan, the lead researcher explained that to accomplish the goal of 10% above the poverty line, the City needs to adjust the \$11.62 which is the lower end of the base rate to \$13.01 which is in line with Miami-Dade. In October it will be \$13.00 when it adjusts to inflation, and also reinstated the suggestion made by Lili of adjusting the healthcare differential to \$3.09 per hour which is the cost of an average plan. This rate will also be in line with Miami-Dade in October at \$3.16 per hour. Those two together will be \$16.16.

Commissioner Alemán briefly reconfirmed the figures suggested by Mr. Aldon. Commissioner Arriola asked when would this become effective, and would it be retroactive. Raul Aguila explained that would not be retroactive. Mr. Aldon clarified that this would be effective on January 1, 2018. Commissioner Arriola asked if it would be a gradual increase or a one time increase. Raul Aguila explained that it is up to the City Commission, in the past the City has done a phased increase and the City Commission can recommend by pursuant to an ordinance amendment. Commissioner Kristen Rosen Gonzalez stated that she understands that she does not have a vote on this Committee but she would move forward to make it effective immediately. Commissioner Alemán said that it sounds like an addition to the options and briefly asked about the two different options offered. Alex Denis clarified that the options 1, and 2 are based on the current ordinance as of now, and referred back to Raul Aguila's statement that the City Commission can pursue to amend the ordinance. Lili Bach said that they have a different policy that will help amend the ordinance, that way it will be inclusive throughout and they won't have to keep coming back to address the shortcomings annually.

Commissioner Arriola stated that philosophically he agrees with her, however he wants to make sure that the City gets the rest of it right and implements the right mechanism. Commissioner Alemán is in favor of modifying the healthcare rate, and she understands how crucial healthcare is. Commissioner Arriola again reaffirms that he wants to make sure it gets done right and does not want to make a decision now and just pick a number. He suggested bringing this discussion back to the next finance meeting since the changes will not be effective till October or January. Again Raul Aguila stated that this is part of the budget process and a decision does not have to be made today. Commissioner Alemán stated that the \$3.09 increase for the healthcare differential is good, however she would like evaluate a few of the scenarios. Alex Denis added that the evaluation was made and it will be a budgetary impact of \$351,000 for option 1, \$799,000 for option 2, but he does not know the budgetary impact of the proposed recommendation by SEIU Local 32BJ. Lili Bach added that they have it and they can work with Alex Dennis to calculate.

Commissioner Alemán asked Alex Denis to remind them why did the City Commission did not decide to apply the increases with the catch up option in prior years. Alex Denis stated that last

year it was the issue of not wanting the living wage to run away from the minimum wage issue that was on the table but does not remember why for the year before. Raul Aguila said that one of the reasons on years before the prior year the City did not index the living wage because they did a phased in increase over 5 years ago which was a substantial increase to the minimum wage. As far as whether or not the increase go, as you get further along the budget process sometimes the decision not to increase is based on the potential increase in City contracts, in the services that the City pays on City contracts. It can be a business decision. Commissioner Alemán asked where does the City stand in comparison to the County, and other cities in the County. Alex Denis said that the current rate for Broward County is \$13.59 without the healthcare differential and \$12.03 with healthcare. Miami-Dade is currently at \$15.52 with healthcare and \$12.63 without healthcare.

Assistant City Manager Kathie Brooks stated that some years that the City chose to not implement an increase, they looked at cost of living adjustment that were made to City employees because there needs to some level of parity between the increases of contractors versus the increase of City employees that is also taken into consideration before is brought to Finance Committee. Last year employees received a 1% Cola and then 15 months for the next Cola which will be 3%, but we have not looked at the healthcare component of that. Commissioner Kristen Gonzalez said that she would be happy following the county's implementation, and asked how did the county scale up the living wage. Mr. Aldon explained that in April last year the county voted to increase their health differential from \$1.83 to \$2.89 applicable January 2017, and they also changed the way they it gets indexed to inflation to consider the increase in healthcare, that is why is this year is going to increase to \$3.16 in October. Commissioner Kristen Rosen Gonzalez asked what would be the hourly rate for an employee with healthcare and without healthcare in Miami-Dade County. Mr. Aldon replied that the rate they are proposing would be \$16.16 per hour without healthcare, currently the County rate is \$15.52.

Commissioner Alemán expressed that it is concerning on how the City of Miami Beach is so far behind in comparison to the County's rate, and the City of Miami Beach has one of highest cost of living rate, the highest percentage of income goes towards housing and the City needs to close the gap on that. Commissioner Arriola again reaffirmed his position on taking time to discuss with the City Staff to ensure the increase gets done right, and recommended deferring this item. Commissioner Kristen Rosen Gonzalez added that the reason why she suggested following the County's rate is because they probably use many of the same contractors that the City of Miami Beach uses.

DIRECTION: item deferred to the June 16 Finance & Citywide projects Committee. Alex Dennis will provide additional figures comparison for Miami-Dade County and other municipalities.

6. Discussion Regarding A Resolution Approving The City's Sponsorship Of The Nationally And Internationally Televised 2017 World Footvolley Classic, To Be Held In The City Of Miami Beach

Commission Item C4H, April 26, 2017

(Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Rosen Gonzalez)

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director

AFTER-ACTION

Eva Silverstein, Director of Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development introduced the item. Commissioner Kristen Rosen Gonzalez expressed that she is very enthusiastic about this ask, and is not a very big ask is because with the convention center closed many residents have

complained that we need to bring in more special events. This event is taking place in July during "El Classico". A lot of the people that go to El Classico also go to the World Footvolley Classic. This will bring in more people and it would be a great opportunity economically. Sergio Menezes spoke and told a story about how he was introduced to Footvolley. Mr. Menezes explained that he has worked with Graham Winick before, and that there were two Footvolley tournaments in the past, and that this is an opportunity and a homecoming. The reason this one is so special is because last year, thanks to their lobbying effort, Footvolley became a demonstration sport in Rio. He is comparing how the first tournament was held at Nikki Beach and was sponsored by Heineken, to receiving national and International broadcast, and sponsorship by Anheuser-Busch. Sergio explained that have partnership with regional sports network throughout the U.S. and they air 100 hours of television each year. The sport originates in Brazil the number one tourist market for Miami-Dade and South Florida, and there are many compelling factors on why this event makes sense for Miami Beach. Most important reason is that Broward wants this event and they sponsor a similar event yearly. Now do we want visitors to come to Broward or Miami Beach? Since it started in Miami Beach, it only makes sense that when Real Madrid and Barcelona face off in South Florida in 2017, we hold this event at his home court South Beach.

This is going to be an annual event which will be sort of the World Championship of the sport. Brazil has a large traveling middle class and that portion of people love the sport and play the game. The idea is to have a top level event on the TV side and also have a participatory event on the amateur side. Eva Silverstein stated that they are asking for a waiver of special event permitting fee which is approximately \$5,000 and a cash sponsorship in the amount of \$10,000 for the summer, and she recommends deferring to Budget if this is approved as to a funding source. The FIVB Volleyball event gets funded around \$500,000. Their most recent event that just took place in the Bahamas which was the FIFA Beach Soccer World Championship; that was a \$3 million dollar budget, he is only asking for \$10,000. Mr. Menezes describes that they get more hours on television, it is a cutting edge sport, from Miami Beach, and they are going to produce the best Footvolley event in the world. Mr. Menezes informed the Committee that he also plays the sport, and was the captain of the US team in Rio last year, and he is asking the Committee for support.

Commissioner Alemán asked Mr. Menezes to describe the program of the World Footvolley Classic, do they move around the world? Is it something that if it is a success he will bring back to Miami Beach in subsequent years? What is the vision beyond 2017? Mr. Menezes states that they have the Pro Footvolley Tour and this is a special one, their league is Pro Footvolley Tour. They will be in New Jersey the week before that, they go to California, Colombia, and The Cayman Islands. This is the Pro Footvolley Classic, because they play under the name El Classico, and the under the name of World Baseball Classic which have a huge success, therefore they decided on World Footvolley Classic South Beach. He also added that they are many Footvolley organizations around the world that wants to own that cup, and they took the lead on it. Commissioner Alemán asked if this would be an annual event in Miami Beach, and Mr. Menezes confirmed that it will be. Commissioner Alemán asked the Finance Director John Woodruff if there is a funding source for this event. Mr. Woodruff replied that it would be the Resort Tax and it would be allocated during the budget process which would be in the next 2 or 3 meetings. Commissioner Alemán asked if there was time since the event is in July. Interim Budget Director Tameka Otto Stewart stated that they would be able to look into the current budget for Resort Tax or possibly general funds to see if the City can come up with \$10,000.00, and maybe come up in the next meeting. Commissioner Alemán stated that she agrees on moving it forward and try to find the funds with current budget; it is not a large monetary amount. Experience the event and speak about it in the budget cycle, talk about a place holder to try to make this an annual event should it turn out to be a good event and a good fit. Mr. Menezes added that NBC 6 Telemundo is going to be their local sponsor for television media, and iHeart

Radio is going to be local radio sponsor, and national television is beIN Sports. The Committee expressed that they are very happy for this event, and Commissioner Arriola asked if this is his organization. Mr. Meneses explained that there are two sides to the organization; the non-profit which is the federation which determines the national teams, and the commercial side which is the Pro Footvolley Tour. Commissioner Arriola added that this is a small ask and hopes that this event is successful this year, and make this a flagship event held annually in Miami Beach. Commissioner Arriola like the idea that this will take place in Lummus Park, and the City is trying to activate Ocean Drive around culture and sports.

DIRECTION: Item moved; Tameka Otto Stewart to find the funding for this event.

7. Discussion Regarding Contribution Funds To A Regional Hybrid Skatepark/Pumptrack Initiative At Haulover In Conjunction With Sunny Isles Beach, Town Of Surfside, And Possible Bal Harbour And Bay Harbor Islands

Commission Item C4V, April 26, 2017
(Parks and Recreation)

John Rebar, Parks and Recreation Director

AFTER-ACTION

Commissioner Arriola asked what happened with this item at NCAC.

Commissioner Alemán said that NCAC referred this back to the Commission with a favorable recommendation. They had a discussion of the relationship to the other item, they felt they were not in conflict. She said this project will get done within 2 months. She said that Mayor Dietch from Surfside was going to be there for the discussion, but then he missed it, he came to the offices later. He said they already have a commitment of \$150,000 and \$50,000, the total bill is \$267,000. He still has to talk Bal Harbour and Bay Harbor Islands, which he intends to do, once they get the agreement it is only 2 months of construction. It will be in Haulover and all of the municipalities that are participants will be recognized with a plaque. They would love to ask us to go up to \$50,000, depending on what he is able to get from Bal Harbour and Bay Harbor, which he will know soon. She said they have \$100,000 left in the existing budget item for a skatepark. She said she agrees if Commissioner Arriola agrees.

Commissioner Arriola agrees with up to \$50,000, he thinks it is great and it puts a stake in the ground not too far from Miami Beach. It gives us time to see proof of concept because we will be doing this ourselves eventually in the near future. We can see what works and what doesn't. This is a small investment that has a great return. Our residents can benefit from it.

Commissioner Alemán said it will help guide our design.

Commissioner Arriola asked John Rebar, Parks & Recreational Director if we know the operating agreement would be. He said he wants to make sure Miami Beach residents have full access. John Rebar said he does not know, but he will take this direction and start working with the County and with Mayor Dietch.

Commissioner Arriola asked who runs Haulover Park. Raul Aguila, City Attorney said it is unincorporated Dade County. Commissioner Arriola confirmed that any one in Miami Dade County can use this facility.

Commissioner Alemán asked John Rebar to come back to the June Commission meeting with a resolution stating that the City contribute to for up to \$50,000 for dollars to this project.

DIRECTION: Come to the June 7th Commission Meeting with a resolution stating that the City of Miami Beach will give up with \$50,000 to this project in Haulover.

8. Discussion On Performing A Gap Assessment Regarding The Energov Permitting System

Commission Item C7M, April 26, 2017
(Information Technology)

Ariel Sosa, Information Technology Director

AFTER-ACTION

Ariel Sosa, Director of Information Technology introduced the item. Assistant City Manager Mark Taxis stated that the previous week City Staff met with each of the departments to identify major concerns and place them on a list. A team from Tyler was on site that current week to assess what additional concerns may be present, and to go over the list of concerns with Tyler to try to assess what are the software issues, and what issues were a matter of functionality. City staff and Tyler will be spending the next week to 10 days going over the list and breaking it down to one of seven categories. They will be looking for gaps that exist between the previous software and the new software for both external and internal users. They are going to be looking for any issues with software or things that are not working as they should for both external and internal users. And for all four of those areas Tyler will dedicate the resources and the dollars to do whatever it takes to fix those issues. The next two items are going to be improvements and enhancement above what the City had before that is important, Tyler has committed to the extent that they can within reason. The last thing the City is looking into is long-term enhancements for things the City will like to see the software do. Tyler has also committed to having weekly meetings to go through the list and assist with the process. To date, 9 software issues have been identified that needs to be rectified by Tyler, and a few of this issues have been resolved. There are a some things on the internal side relating to reports and workflow, and it is up to the City to decide on how the it wants to conduct business, and how the City wants to avail themselves for the functionality that is already there.

Mr. Rusty Smith, VP and General Manager from from Tyler Technologies spoke and stated that Tyler and the City have a strong partnership. Mr. Smith stated that these implementations are complicated and challenging. Tyler does all the implementation themselves to ensure the highest level of sucess. Mr. Smith states that Tyler is here to show that they are fully committed and will provide all necessary resources. Mr. Smith added that they have also developed a new citizen facing portal that it is already in use in Miami-Dade County, and that is working very well. Tyler intends to host an industry preview in July where business officials, attorneys, and other citizens can attend and see what it is about. They are in the process of refreshing the technology that the City has with the Energov program. In three years the City will have new technologies and more functionality.

Commisisoner Alemán stated that she met with Assistant City Manager Mark Taxis and Mr. Smith and they discussed their methodology, Mr. Smith had described to the Commissioner that Tyler Care is a portion of their methodology is post implementation resolving issues. Commissioner Alemán explained that Tyler came in to cast a net and gather up all of the problems, and they included suggestions by Henry Stohler, and Daniel Veitia as well. Now that they have identified what all the gaps are, they discussed going through and assigning priorities. Commisisoner stated that her priority is to address the external side facing gap first which affects resients and businesses. Commissioner Kristen Rosen Gonzalez asked how long would it take to implement the changes for the problems that have been identified. Mr. Smith replied stating that they are still putting everything together, some will be short term, and some will take longer and that their expectations will be laid out in the summary that will be provided to the

Commission. Commissioner Kristen Rosen Gonzalez stated that she would like to include this process in a customer service survey, she also suggested compiling data from the public to find out what all the complaints are to properly address all the issues.

Mr. Taxis describes one of the issues with the Egov App for reporting code violations which was reported by Mr. Henry Stohler. Commissioner Arriola asked Commissioner Alemán if she can take ownership on this project given her IT experience and added that the members of the public are not happy. He suggested Mr. Smith to put a team of users together to test out and try to break the system, to determine what system enhancements will make it more user friendly.

Mr. Stohler at 1500 Ocean Drive spoke and asked how did the City get in this position. Mr. Stohler stated that in the April 26 Commission Meeting, Commissioner Grieco had pulled from the consent agenda a proposed amendment number 7 to the City's contract with Tyler. He stated that the amendment was approved, however with many critical comments by the Commissioners. He reflects on a report by Commissioner Grieco stating that two Miami-Dade Municipalities had ended their contracts with Tyler Technologies, and that it is a step backwards which requires the City to adopt workarounds for the Tyler system and to adjust the way the City conducts business. Mr. Stohler stated that there were no defenders for the Tyler system in the City Commission, but most remarkable is that the City administration's senior management had stated that Tyler system had created challenges and problems. He states that the Building Director Mariano Fernandez had commented that Tyler is maybe not the best system. Mr. Stohler describes that \$4.8 Million dollars have been paid to the City and another \$500,000.00 is fully committed to be paid to Tyler.

He stated that he was asked to meet with Mark Taxis, but then he met with Mr. Rusty Smith, Mike Deganeon, Carmen Sanchez, Ana Zecchini as well. He stated that he was disappointed that how not one of the attendees brought a piece of paper, and he was asked what was his problem with the Tyler. He stated that his problems were presented on a detailed 4 and half paper dated August 22, 2016 that he had sent to Robert Biles, Ariel Sosa, and Hernan Cardeno. He compares that there were many options in the old system, that do not exist on the new system. He recommended to not depend upon on the highest lofty promises, and advises to fix the issue.

Daniel Veitia spoke and said that he uses the system very often, he states that the system is different but it provides him more empowerment as a user. He explains that the system is complex but more complex is the City's workflows. He states that the system facilitates his ability to do business with the City. Commissioner Arriola recommends to have this item as a standard agenda item and report monthly on its progress.

Direction:

Motion Made by Commissioner Arriola to have this as a standing agenda item and report on it on a monthly basis.

9. Discussion Regarding The Baywalk As Well As The Opening, Building And Funding Of The Baywalk Behind The South Bay Club

Commission Item R7C, April 26, 2017

(Budget and Performance Improvement)

Margarita Wells, Environment and Sustainability Acting Director

Tameka Otto Stewart, Budget and Performance Improvement Interim Director

Tom Mooney, Planning Director

AFTER-ACTION

Margarita Wells, Environment and Sustainability Acting Director presented the item. She gave some background on the item. The NCAC passed this with a favorable recommendation specifically a request for funding in this coming fiscal year, put in a capital budget funding request of \$240,000 to fund the design and permitting South Bay Club baywalk. There are two additional continuous segments that are not funded behind the Bayview Terrace and Bay Garden Manor Condominium and behind the Lincoln Bay Towers on the West portion of Lincoln Road, which is included in the West Avenue phase 2 project.

Commissioner Arriola said the City and residents have been trying to finish the Baywalk. This is one of the segments that the City is responsible for. There are 3 segments that the City is responsible for. This authorizes us to move forward with one of the 3 pieces behind the South Bay Club for the study of what work needs to be done. The design and permitting will cost \$240,000. He asked if it is worth it to look at the other 2 pieces as well to accelerate our efforts, can we leverage our spend to have the remaining pieces done under the same project. Are we better off now to do the study on the entire 3 pieces and spend a little more money.

Margarita said that from a permitting standpoint that would expedite the process.

David Martinez, CIP spoke about how this would look in construction. He said that there is an economy scale to do all 3 make it more efficient. He said maybe they can do something like what they did with West Avenue and put it out to bid in 2 separate projects.

Commissioner Alemán asked if we did the pieces separately it would be \$700,000 or so. If we did it at the same time, it could be less in price.

Margarita said that for the Bay Garden Manor we would need to receive the repairing rights, which we don't currently have. We have it for the remainder of the section.

Commissioner Arriola asked what they need from the committee to put this into motion. He wants to know what they need to proceed.

Margarita said they have submitted a capital budget funding request for just the South Bay Club portion, if they wanted to they can include the remaining sections and that would be approximately \$390,000. This would only be for design and permitting.

Commissioner Arriola said the Baywalk doesn't work until the entire thing is completed, so it is better to do it all at once to save money and accelerate the process.

MOTION: Commissioner Alemán motioned to include the 3 pieces of the Baywalk in the capital budget process to complete the entire Baywalk. Commissioner Arriola seconded.

10. Discussion Regarding The Mid-Year Request For Two New Positions In The Finance Department and Discussion Regarding PatternStream Software For The Office Of Budget and Performance Improvement

Commission Item R7D, April 26, 2017
(Budget and Performance Improvement)

Tameka Otto Stewart, Budget and Performance Improvement Interim Director
John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer

AFTER-ACTION

John Woodruff, Finance Director introduced the Item. John Woodruff stated that there are two items. The new Finance positions and PatternStream Software. Commissioner Alemán that these two positions that were outlined as part of the remedy to provide financial security, as part of the BDO report.

Motion: Commissioner Alemán made a motion to move the item, seconded by Commissioner Arriola.

Tameka Otto Stewart, Budget Interim Director described the PatternStream software and how it works. She explained that this software would help streamline the production of the annual budget document.

Direction: Forward item to Commission for approval with additional information regarding the selection of PatternStream software.

11. Discussion Regarding The Preparation Of A Budget Item Request For Consideration In The Fiscal Year 2018 Budget Process For The Design Of A Parking Garage Structure, And A New Recreational Park With A Skate Park And Community Use Space, At The 72nd Street Parking Lot Site Between 72nd And 73rd Streets And Between Collins And Harding Avenues

Commission Item R7U, April 26, 2017

(Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán and Commissioner Malakoff)

David Martinez, Capital Improvement Projects Director

AFTER-ACTION

David Martinez, Capital Improvement Projects Director introduced the item.

David Martinez provided a request for fiscal year 17 / 18. He stated that \$276,000 were appropriated, and will be requesting another 500,000.00 for next year.

Direction: Move forward with item

12. Discussion Regarding Potential Financial Incentives For Miami Beach To Support The Film and Televisions Industry On A Local Level

Commission Item R9T, April 26, 2017

(Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development)

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director

AFTER-ACTION

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director introduced the item.

Eva Silverstein stated that staff recommends creating a fund for \$500,000 annually from a variety of sources. A \$100,000 budget enhancement item was submitted for next year's budget process. Commissioner Arriola recommends sending item to the Production Industry Council for their recommendation up to certain amount and the rest can go to Commission for approval.

Motion: Commissioner Alemán made a motion to move the 100,000, supported by Commissioner Arriola.

13. Discussion To Explore A Lease To Bring The Wynwood Yard Concept To North Beach

Commission Item R9AG, April 26, 2017

(Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola)

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director

AFTER-ACTION

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director introduced the item. Eva Silverstein stated that the City will have a community outreach event on June 8, at 6:30 pm at the North Shore Community Center. They will begin very quickly noticing the Community, residents, the adjacent properties etc, working with Wynwood Yard soon to be North Beach Yard. Commissioner Alemán asked if it will be affected by the last day of school, and suggested inviting students.

14. Discussion Regarding Future Uses Or The Potential Sale Of Vacant City-Owned Land Located At 226 87th Terrace

Commission Item C4A, October 19, 2016
(Sponsored by Commissioner Grieco)

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director

AFTER-ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred.

15. Discussion Regarding Engaging In A Pilot Program With A Cost Reduction Consultant

Commission Item C4N, March 1, 2017
(Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola)

James Sutter, Internal Auditor
John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer

AFTER-ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred.

16. Discussion Regarding The Maintenance Of Public Bathrooms Citywide.

Commission Item C4N, February 8, 2017
(Sponsored by Commissioner Grieco)

John Rebar, Parks and Recreation Director
Adrian Morales, Property Management Director

AFTER-ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred.

17. Discussion Regarding The Key Development Parameters For The Barclay Plaza Apartments

Commission Item C4A, March 1, 2017
(Office of Housing and Community Services)

Maria Ruiz, Director of Housing and Community Services

AFTER-ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred.

18. Discussion To Explore Placing Cameras On Every Corner Of The MXE (Mixed Used Entertainment) District And On The Beachwalk, And Installing Emergency Activation Boxes Along The Beachwalk.

Commission Item C4P, March 1, 2017

(Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Rosen Gonzalez)

Daniel Oates, Police Chief

AFTER-ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred.

19. Discussion Regarding The North Beach Town Center Redevelopment Proposal, Involving City-Owned Parking Lots, Made By North Beach Town Center Development, LLC, An Affiliate Of Pacific Start Capital, LLC

Commission Item C4C, May 17, 2017

(Sponsored by Commissioner Malakoff and Co-sponsored by Commissioner Arriola)

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director

AFTER-ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred.

20. Discussion Regarding A Sponsorship Agreement With Miami Design Preservation League (MDPL), In A Form Acceptable To The City Attorney And The City Manager, In An Amount Not To Exceed One Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$100,000), In Support OF The 2018 Art Deco Weekend

Commission Item C4D, May 17, 2017

(Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Rosen Gonzalez)

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director

AFTER-ACTION

Eva Silverstein, Director of Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development introduced the item. Lori Bakkum MDPL Art Deco weekend Chairperson and Russel Lee MDPL Art Deco Weekend spoke. Ms. Bakkum is requesting sponsorship of \$100,000.00 for Art Deco Weekend 2018. Ms. Bakkum stated that the sponsorship will go towards Police, Fire, and City Services which will contribute to a safe venue. This is the 41st event, and the topic for this year is Art Deco around the world. Residents, visitors and business will benefit from this sponsorship. Commissioner Alemán said that some research was done regarding grant availability and have plans to review the Art Deco fundings and see how the City staff can support them in pursuit of other fundings as well. Ms. Bakkum stated that they receive a significant county grant and looks forward to City sponsorship this year. Commissioner Alemán thanked the speakers and asked them to see if there is a way to look for funding from sources other than the City first.

Commissioner Kristen Rosen Gonzalez stated that there is a lot of value in this, and she agrees on moving forward with a favorable recommendation. Commissioner Rciy Arriola wants to move forward with a favorable recommendation. He describes that for a very long time this was a signature event in the county even before the explosion of arts and culture. He remembers 30 years ago how th Coconut Grove Art Festival, Art Deo, and a handful of events were the only thing on the calndar to look forward to, this is a signature event and it is important the City to support. He looks forward to working with Ms. Bakkum and challenged her to make it better and better each year. Lori Bakkum thanked the committee and stated that they have around 30 business and residents who are part of this initiative and looks forward for the committee to meet the rest of the event coordinators.

DIRECTION: Motion made by Commissioner Alemán to consider as part of the budget process, seconded by Commissioner Arriola

21. Discussion Regarding The Waiver Of Rental Fees For Halls A, B, C, D, And Adjacent Meeting Rooms At The Miami Beach Convention Center For The National Football League (NFL) And Sponsorship For The 2020 Super Bowl LIV

Commission Item C4E, May 17, 2017

(Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development)

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director

AFTER-ACTION

Eva Silverstein, Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director introduced the item.

Motion: Commissioner Arriola made a motion to approve and move the item, seconded by Commissioner Alemán.

22. Discussion Regarding The Potential Impact Of Higher Homestead Exemptions On Property Tax Revenue For Miami Beach

Commission Item C4F, May 17, 2017

(Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán and Co-sponsored by Commissioner Arriola)

Tameka Otto Stewart, Budget and Performance Improvement Interim Director

AFTER-ACTION

Tameka Otto Stewart, Budget and Performance Improvement Interim Director introduced the item. Tameka Stewart stated the she reached out to the Miami-Dade Property Appraiser's Office. Handouts were distributed with the impact to the City of Miami Beach. Ms. Stewart stated that 14,000 total homesteaded properties that will be affected, of that 11,419 will get reduction of approximately \$140 each on average. John Woodruff asked which year will this apply to. She clarified that it will be for FY 18-19. John Woodruff recommended addressing in some way in FY 18 budget process so not to have as large an impact in FY 19.

DIRECTION: Item moved

23. Discussion Regarding The City Clerk Rafael E. Granado's Annual Performance Evaluation

Commission Item C4G, May 17, 2017
(Office of the City Clerk)

Rafael E. Granado, City Clerk

AFTER-ACTION

DIRECTION: Commissioner Arriola will meet with Rafael E. Granado in the next few weeks

24. Discussion Regarding The City Attorney Raul J. Aguila's Annual Performance Evaluation

Commission Item C4I, May 17, 2017
(Office of the City Attorney)

Raul J. Aguila, City Attorney

AFTER-ACTION

DIRECTION: Commissioner Arriola will meet with Raul J. Aguila in the next few weeks

Meeting adjourned at 5:00 pm

JLM/JW/MTG