

**ATTACHMENT D
Proposals Comparison for Option 2 (30 Years)**

RFP Evaluation Criteria score by Evaluation Committee	Boucher Brothers 1st Rank (Tied)	The Group 1st Rank (Tied)	Tao Group 3rd Rank Unanimous	RH 4th Rank Unanimous
Qualifications	<p><u>Major Partners</u> Boucher Brothers Major Food Group Itavi Kids Corner Kobi Karp (Lead Architect) Raymond Jungles (Landscape Architect) Spinnaker Group (Resiliency and Sustainability) Sequil (Resiliency and Sustainability)</p> <p><u>Experience</u> Lummas Park (est. 2001) Ocean Terrace (est. 2001) Bandshell Park Beach (est. 2019) Altos Del Mar Beach (est. 2019) Collins Park* (est. 2015) Indian Beach Park* (est. 2015) Ft. Lauderdale (est. 2008) Fountainbleau (est. 1997) W South Beach (est. 2009) 1 Hotel (est. 2015) SOHO Beach House (est. 2010) Boca Beach Club (est. 2015)</p>	<p><u>Major Partners</u> Emil Stefkov - The Group Casa Reia Legeard Studio (Architectural Design) Beilinson Gomez (Architect of Record) Vincent Filigenzi Design (Landscape Architect) Ecosys (Lagoon Consultant) RCC Associates (GC) Mamou-Mani (Fabrication Consultant) Astral Studio (Lead Executive/Marketing) Tetatet (Creative Strategist) Harvest Series (Culture/Community) RIMA Experience (Culture/Community) Tony Cho (Neighborhood Representative)</p> <p><u>Experience</u> Casa Reia (est. 2022) Yamba (2018-2021) Praia Princesa (est. 2016) La Grande Boucherie (est. 2020) Omakase Room (est. 2020) Olio E Piu (est. 2010)</p>	<p><u>Major Partners</u> Mohari Hospitality Santorini Greek Restaurant TAO Group Hospitality Rockwell Group</p> <p><u>Experience</u> Santorini by Georgios (est. 2015) Peninsula Papagayo (est. 2016) Centro Canalejas (est. 2020) 1 Hotel Toronto (est. 2021) Koma Singapore and LAVO Italian Restaurant & Rooftop Bar. (est. 2018)</p>	<p><u>Major Partners</u> RH</p> <p><u>Experience</u> Chileno Bay Cabo San Lucas (est. 2013) Playa Grande (est. 2018) Baker's Bay (est. 2010) Berbuda Ocean Club (est. 2018) Kuki'o Golf and Beach Club (est. 2002) El Dorado Golf and Beach Club (est. 1999)</p>
Programming and Scope of Services	<p><u>Concept</u> 3 restaurants, wellness spa, pool, programmed children's center, retail pavilion, lounge areas, beach concession, sculpture program</p> <p><u>Membership or Day Fee</u> Unclear</p> <p><u>Hours of Operation</u> Beach Concession - City hours 1st Floor + Outdoor Mediterranean : 11am-7pm 2nd Floor Japanese Steakhouse: 5pm-11pm Sadelle's Boardwalk Cafe: 9am-5pm Outdoor, Pool, Kids Club, Wellness, Retail - 11am-7pm</p>	<p><u>Concept</u> Indoor and outdoor restaurant areas, 120 seat performance space, retail area, lagoon lounge area, beach concession, artist and exhibition space, children program</p> <p><u>Membership or Day Fee</u> Unclear</p> <p><u>Hours of Operation</u> Indoor Dining Area, Bar, Retail Weekdays (M-TH) 11:00 am - 11:00 pm Weekend (F-Sun) 11:00 am - 12:00 am Outdoor Lagoon Area Weekdays (M-TH) 11:00 am - 10:00 pm Weekends (F-Sun) 11:00 am - 11:00 pm Beach Concession Area Weekdays (M-TH) 1 hour after sunrise Weekend (F-Sun) Close at 5:00 pm</p>	<p><u>Concept</u> Indoor Restaurant, Outdoor Restaurant, Retail/Market/Café, Beach Lounge</p> <p><u>Membership or Day Fee</u> Unclear</p> <p><u>Hours of Operation</u> Indoor Restaurant Monday - Sunday 11:00 am 2:00 am Outdoor Restaurant Monday - Sunday 11:00 am 11:00 pm Beach Monday - Sunday 8:00 am 5:00 pm Café Monday - Sunday 8:00 am 5:00 pm Market Monday - Sunday 8:00 am 5:00 pm Retail Monday - Sunday 10:00 am 9:00 pm</p>	<p><u>Concept</u> Design Studio, Live Fire Grill, Sculpture Garden, Sushi Bar, Beach House (Hotel 15 rooms), Bath house and Spa, Greek Taverna, Public Park, Beach Promenade, Pool Terrace and Palm Garden, Beach Club, Subterranean parking lot.</p> <p><u>Membership or Day Fee</u> Membership, pricing not indicated.</p> <p><u>Hours of Operation</u> Design Studio Monday – Saturday, 10am – 7pm Sunday, 11am – 6pm Live Fire Grill Monday – Sunday, 11am – 9pm Last seating at 9pm Oshen Sushi Bar Monday – Sunday, 11am – 9pm Last seating at 9pm</p>
Design and Timeline	<p><u>Design</u> Full renovation of existing facility</p> <p><u>Timeline</u> 13 months</p>	<p><u>Design</u> Demolition and construction of new facility</p> <p><u>Timeline</u> Building/Permitting 6-12 Months Mobilization 2 Months Demolition 3 Months Construction of Core and Shell 6 Months Finishes 5 Months Maximum 28 Months</p>	<p><u>Design</u> Full renovation of existing facility</p> <p><u>Timeline</u> 10 Months</p>	<p><u>Design</u> Demolition and construction of new facility</p> <p><u>Timeline</u> Demolition 6-8 Weeks Site Work, Foundation, Superstructure 9-12 Months Buildout and Public Improvements 9-12 Months Maximum 26 Months</p>
Public Benefit	<p>Police sub-station Resident App & Discounts Food Donations Hospitality Mentorships Education Grants Community Events Dunes & Other Conservation Efforts City Clean-up Park Improvements Support Seniors Accessible Beach Equipment</p>	<p>Resident discounts Community events Environmental, educational and historic preservation/artistic initiatives.</p> <p>The Group's proposal includes a yearly allocation of benefits valued at approximately \$400,000.</p>	<p>Local Resident Discount Volunteer Opportunities Community Gathering Space Safety Enhancements Cultural Exchange Work with Miami Corporation Accessibility Partner with local charities</p>	<p>Design Related Benefits Economic Benefits Resiliency and Sustainability Benefits Funding and Partnering with the City in new environmental initiatives Public Sculpture Garden Art Gallery Discounted resident memberships Improved Historical Markings and Site Signage</p>
Financial Proposal	<p><u>Financial Proposal</u> 10% of Gross Operation Revenue \$4MM minimum annual rent with a 3% annual escalator after year 2.</p> <p>Boucher Brothers will pay a total of \$4 million dollars upfront and payable as follows: \$1 million upon execution of the agreement, and then \$1 million on or before January 10, 2025, \$1 million on or before January 10, 2026, and \$1 million on or before January 10, 2027. Such upfront payments shall be applied to the 1st year minimum rent guarantee.</p> <p><u>Term</u> 30 Years</p> <p><u>Lease or Management Agreement</u> Unclear</p>	<p><u>Financial Proposal</u> \$3MM annual with 10% escalation every 5 years. Rent abatement during construction.</p> <p><u>Term</u> 20 years, with unilateral option for additional 10 years</p> <p><u>Lease or Management Agreement</u> Unclear</p>	<p><u>Financial Proposal</u> From date of opening or 18 months after possession, whichever occurs first, 10% of Sales with \$2.5MM annual guarantee with 7.5% escalator every 3 years</p> <p><u>Term</u> 30-year term, 20-year contract with one 10-year option to extend</p> <p><u>Lease or Management Agreement</u> Unclear</p>	<p><u>Financial Proposal</u> \$5,000,000 upon delivery of the site \$7,000,000 per year starting two years after delivery of the site Annual Escalator: 3.00% or CPI, whichever is greater \$1,000,000 cultural contribution upon referendum approval</p> <p><u>Term</u> 30 year Lease and Concession Agreement</p> <p><u>Lease or Management Agreement</u> Lease and Concession Agreement</p>