

MIAMIBEACH

PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Staff Report & Recommendation

Historic Preservation Board

TO: Chairperson and Members
Historic Preservation Board

DATE: May 9, 2023

FROM: Thomas R. Mooney, AICP
Planning Director



SUBJECT: HPB23-0567, **603 East Dilido Drive.**

An application has been filed requesting that the designation of Historic Single-family Residence be removed from the property.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approval of the removal of the historic designation.

BACKGROUND

On May 9, 2006, at the request of the current property owner, the Historic Preservation Board reviewed and approved an application to designate the property located at 603 East Dilido Drive as an Historic Single-Family Residence (HPB File No. 3476). At the same meeting, the Board approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the partial demolition, renovation and restoration of the home and the construction of multiple additions and voted unanimously in favor of recommending to the Mayor and City Commission that they approve an Ad Valorem Tax Exemption for qualifying improvements to the historic structure.

On February 14, 2007, the City Commission approve the Ad Valorem Tax exemption (Resolution No. 2007-26460).

EXISTING STRUCTURE

Local Historic District:	N/A
Classification:	Individually Designated Historic Single-Family Residence
Construction Date:	1935
Architects:	Carlos Schoeppl and Arnold Southwell

ZONING / SITE DATA

Folio:	02-3232-011-0630
Legal Description:	Lot 11, Block 4, and 8 foot strip contiguous to same on bay, of the Dilido Island Subdivision, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 36, of the public records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Zoning:	RS-3, Residential, single-family
Future Land Use Designation:	RS-3, Residential, single-family

Lot Size: 10,500 sq. ft.
Existing Use/Condition: Single-family residence

THE PROJECT

The applicant is requesting that the designation of the Historic Single-Family Residence approved in 2006, be removed from the property.

STAFF ANALYSIS

As noted in the Background section of this report, the current owner of the property voluntarily requested historic designation of the single-family residence located at 603 East Dilido Drive in 2006 (HPB 3476). Concurrently, the owner requested approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness for several additions to the home. Below is a general outline of the construction of and modifications to the home that have taken place overtime.

- 1935: The 2-story single-family home was constructed for Mr. & Mrs. Carl Loy (Permit No. 6816). The home was designed by architects Carlos Schoeppl and Arnold Southwell in the Mediterranean Revival Style of Architecture.
- 1935-1942: An addition to the front of the home was constructed sometime between the initial construction and 1942; this addition is not documented in the building card. Based upon review of the original permit plans from 1935, the garage was originally located primarily below the second floor of the home. However, review of a 1942 aerial photograph reveals what appears to be a garage addition in front of (to the west) of the original home.
- 1955: A 1-story guest house was constructed at the front of the property including the introduction of a covered passageway connecting the guesthouse to the home (Permit No 49433). Additionally, the garage was converted to a bedroom.
- 1955-1959: A new structure located to the west of the converted garage appears on aerial photographs. The structure was likely a carport and is no longer visible in the 1985 aerial photograph.
- 1957: A pool within the courtyard is constructed.
- 1990: A new detached 1-story garage was constructed at the front of the property including an extension of the coverage passageway to the west.
- 2007: A new 1-story wing was constructed at the southeast corner of the home containing a master suite, a 2-story porch addition was constructed at the northeast corner of the home, and a 1-story kitchen extension was constructed along the north side of the home (HPB 3476/B0606164).

In 2006, as part of the review of the designation report, the Board found that two of eight evaluation criteria were satisfied to designate the home as a Historic-Single Family Residence. The satisfied criteria included:

- (3) Embody the distinctive characteristics of an historical period, architectural or design style or method of construction;

Built in 1935 and designed by Carlos Schoepl, the subject home is a generally good reflection of the Mediterranean Revival style of architecture, which was the style of choice from the first major land development period in Miami Beach. Some of its significant architectural features that are reflective of the Mediterranean Revival style include: rough stucco wall surfaces, multiple clay barrel tile roofs and smaller proportioned window openings.

- (5) Represent the work of a master, serve as an outstanding or representative work of a master designer, architect or builder who contributed to our historical, aesthetic or architectural heritage;

The architect of the single-family home located at 603 East Dilido Drive, Carlos Schoepl, is considered a master architect of historic single-family homes in Miami Beach.

Further, as noted in the designation report, the home had been inappropriately altered, but did maintain a reasonable degree of architectural integrity, as the original scale, massing and height were substantially preserved. The additions constructed in 2007 also maintained the original scale of the home, however, they further obscured the original 1935 residence. Although staff believes the 1935 portion of the home minimally satisfies the designation criteria, as presently configured, the numerous additions offer only glimpses of the original home and severely limit one's understanding of the original Mediterranean Revival style residence.

Based upon the significant alterations to the home that have taken place over time and the fact that the same applicant who voluntarily requested designation is now requesting to remove the designation, staff has no objection to owner's request to remove the designation. It is also important to note, that the owner of the home did not finalize the approved ad valorem tax exemption and has received no financial benefit from the designation. Further, the 2007 additions did not require any variances or a waiver from the flood plain requirements.

Finally, since the approval of the historic designation and certificate of appropriateness in 2007, the City has adopted Sea Level Rise and Resiliency Review Criteria that the Board shall evaluate as part of any historic designation or certificate of appropriateness application. Staff would note that the original building and later additions are located below the required base flood elevation plus freeboard of 10.00' NGVD. Therefore, future conditions will likely require more significant alterations to address resiliency and building code requirements, which may further degrade the integrity of the original home.

RECOMMENDATION

In view of the foregoing analysis, staff recommends the application be **approved** as noted in the attached draft Order.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
City of Miami Beach, Florida

MEETING DATE: May 9, 2023

PROPERTY/FOLIO: 603 East Dilido Drive / 02-3232-011-0630

FILE NO: HPB23-0567

APPLICANT: Marjorie O'Neill-Butler TR

IN RE: An application has been filed requesting that the designation of Historic Single-Family Residence be removed from the property.

LEGAL: Lot 11, Block 4, and 8 foot strip contiguous to same on bay, of the Dilido Island Subdivision, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 8, Page 36, of the public records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

ORDER

The City of Miami Beach Historic Preservation Board makes the following FINDINGS OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

- A. The existing 2-story structure was voluntarily designated as a Historic Single-Family Residence on May 9, 2006 at the request of the property owner.
- B. The same property owner submitted an application to the Historic Preservation Board on February 6, 2023 requesting the removal of the designation as a Historic Single-Family Residence.
- C. Based on the documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, circumstances exist that warrant the removal of the voluntary Historic Single-Family Residence designation.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing findings of fact, the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, including the staff recommendations, that the request for the REMOVAL of the designation as an Historic Single-Family Residence which was approved by the Board on May 9, 2006 for the subject property is APPROVED subject to the following, to which the applicant has agreed:

1. The Final Order is not severable, and if any provision or condition hereof is held void or unconstitutional in a final decision by a court of competent jurisdiction, the order shall be returned to the Board for reconsideration as to whether the order meets the criteria for approval absent the stricken provision or condition, and/or it is appropriate to modify the remaining conditions or impose new conditions.
2. Nothing in this order authorizes a violation of the City Code or other applicable law, nor allows a relaxation of any requirement or standard set forth in the City Code.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 20__.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA

BY: _____
DEBORAH TACKETT
HISTORIC PRESERVATION & ARCHITECTURE OFFICER
FOR THE CHAIR

STATE OF FLORIDA)
)SS
COUNTY OF MIAMI-DADE)

The foregoing instrument was acknowledged before me this _____ day of _____ 20__ by Deborah Tackett, Historic Preservation & Architecture Officer, Planning Department, City of Miami Beach, Florida, a Florida Municipal Corporation, on behalf of the corporation. She is personally known to me.

NOTARY PUBLIC
Miami-Dade County, Florida
My commission expires: _____

Approved As To Form:
City Attorney's Office: _____ ())

Filed with the Clerk of the Historic Preservation Board on _____ ())