MIAMIBEACH

PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Staff Report & Recommendation

Historic Preservation Board

TO: Chairperson and Members Historic Preservation Board DATE: October 18, 2022

- FROM: Thomas R. Mooney, AICP Planning Director
- SUBJECT:HPB22-0526, 230 Palm Avenue Single-Family Residence Historic StructureDesignation.

An application has been filed requesting that the Historic Preservation Board approve a request for the designation of the existing home as an individual historic single-family residence.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the single-family residence as an historic structure, as requested by the property owner.

BACKGROUND

On June 11, 2003, the Mayor and City Commission adopted Ordinance 2003-3414, creating streamlined procedures for the designation of single-family residences.

ANALYSIS

Pursuant section 118-592 of the City Code, a property considered for designation shall possess an integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling or association and meet at least one of the eight criteria outlined in the code. Staff has found that the proposed historic single-family residence located at 230 Palm Avenue possesses integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship and feeling and satisfies two of eight criteria for designation (criteria numbers 3 and 5).

RECOMMENDATION

In view of the foregoing analysis and the attached Historic Structure Designation Report, staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board designate the single-family home located at 230 Palm Avenue as an historic structure.

SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE 230 Palm Avenue HISTORIC STRUCTURE DESIGNATION REPORT



PREPARED BY

CITY OF MIAMI BEACH PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Thomas R. Mooney, AICP, Director, Planning Department Deborah Tackett, Historic Preservation & Architecture Officer Jake Seiberling, Principal Planner

CITY OF MIAMI BEACH HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

Ricardo Lopez, Chair Ray Breslin Barry Klein Nancy Liebman Kirk Paskal Stuart Reed Laura Weinstein-Berman

> October 18, 2022 Adopted on

> > (HPB22-0526)

I. REQUEST

The applicant, Michael Jacobson, as the owner of the property, is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board approve a request for the designation of an existing single-family home as an historic structure.

II. DESIGNATION PROCESS

The process of designation for <u>historic structures</u> is delineated in Section 118-591(f) in the Land Development Regulations of the City Code. An outline of this process is provided below:

- <u>Step One:</u> An application for the individual designation of a single-family home as an historic structure is submitted by the property owner to the Planning Department for recommendation to the Historic Preservation Board. The Board will make a determination as to whether the single-family home may be designated as an historic structure based upon the requirements and criteria of Section 118-592 in the Land Development Regulations of the City Code.
- <u>Step Two:</u> Upon receipt of a completed application package, the Planning Department prepares a Designation Report that will be presented to the Historic Preservation Board at a regularly scheduled meeting. The Designation Report is an historical and architectural analysis of the proposed historic structure.
- <u>Step Three:</u> The Designation Report is presented to the Historic Preservation Board at a public hearing. If the Board finds that the proposed single-family designation application meets the criteria set forth in Section 118-592 of the Land Development Regulations in the City Code, it may formally adopt the single-family home as a local historic structure. No public hearing is required before the Planning Board or City Commission. Upon the designation of a single-family home as an historic structure, the structure is subject to the Certificate of Appropriateness requirements of Article X of the Land Development Regulations in the City Code, with the exception of the interior areas of the structure (which are not be subject to such regulations).

III. RELATION TO ORDINANCE CRITERIA

- 1. In accordance with Section 118-592 in the Land Development Regulations of the City Code, eligibility for designation is determined on the basis of compliance with the listed criteria set forth below.
 - (a) The Historic Preservation Board shall have the authority to recommend that properties be designated as historic buildings, historic structures, historic improvements, historic landscape features, historic interiors (architecturally significant public portions only), historic sites or historic districts if they are significant in the historical, architectural, cultural, aesthetic or archeological heritage of the city, the county, state or nation. Such properties shall possess an integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling or association and meet at least one (1) of the following criteria:

- (1) Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the history of the city, the county, state or nation;
- (2) Association with the lives of persons significant in the city's past history;
- (3) Embody the distinctive characteristics of an historical period, architectural or design style or method of construction;
- (4) Possesses high artistic values;
- (5) Represent the work of a master, serve as an outstanding or representative work of a master designer, architect or builder who contributed to our historical, aesthetic or architectural heritage;
- (6) Have yielded, or are likely to yield information important in pre-history or history;
- (7) Be listed in the National Register of Historic Places;
- (8) Consist of a geographically definable area that possesses a significant concentration of sites, buildings or structures united by historically significant past events or aesthetically by plan or physical development, whose components may lack individual distinction.
- (b) A building, structure (including the public portions of the interior), improvement or landscape feature may be designated historic even if it has been altered if the alteration is reversible and the most significant architectural elements are intact and repairable.
- 2. The single-family residence at 230 Palm Avenue is eligible for designation as an historic structure as it complies with the criteria as specified in Section 118-592 in the Land Development Regulations of the City Code outlined above.

<u>Staff finds that the proposed Historic Single-Family Home located at 230 Palm</u> <u>Avenue possesses integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship,</u> <u>feeling, or association for the following reasons:</u>

Satisfied; The construction of the home located at 230 Palm Avenue in 1938, during the depression era of the 1930s, was clearly significant in the successful development history of the City of Miami Beach. The proposed historic home still possesses the integrity of its original location at 230 Palm Avenue, despite nearly eighty years of hurricanes, storms, and economic crises. Further, the original building still retains many of its historic materials, details, and workmanship as well as the feeling of its 1930s period of construction in Miami Beach.

- (a) Staff finds the proposed historic site to be eligible for historic designation and in conformance with the designation criteria for the following reasons:
 - (3) <u>Embody the distinctive characteristics of an historical period, architectural</u> or design style or method of construction;

The single-family residence at 230 Palm Avenue is charateristic of the Mediterranean Revival-Art Deco Transitional style of architecture, sometimes called "Med-Deco:" a unique synthesis of Mediterranean Revival and Art Deco decorative detail. The 2-story residence features several elements indicative of the Med-Deco style including a hipped roof, shallow arched feature window and horizontal banding. The original design was clearly done with the highest regard to the quality and responds appropriately to the neighborhood, as evidenced by the careful attention to detail expressed throughout the design.

(5) <u>Represent the work of a master, serve as an outstanding or representative</u> work of a master designer, architect or builder who contributed to our historical, aesthetic or architectural heritage;

Harry O. Nelson (1902–unknown) was born in Denmark in 1902 and came to the United States as an infant. In Miami in the 1920s he worked as a draftsman for architect August Geiger. He was especially gifted in the Art Deco style and left a legacy of very fine buildings in Miami Beach, dating from 1930 to 1950, including his own home at 6868 Harding Avenue. Some of his best-known work includes the Park Avenue Hotel (2216 Park Avenue.), the Beacon Hotel (720 Ocean Drive), the Biarritz Hotel (1435 Collins Avenue) and the Broadmoor Hotel (7450 Ocean Terrace).

(b) <u>A building, structure (including the public portions of the interior), improvement or landscape feature may be designated historic even if it has been altered if the alteration is reversible and the most significant architectural elements are intact and repairable.</u>

The single-family residence at 230 Park Avenue maintains a moderate degree of architectural integrity. Most notably, the primary façade was altered in the late 1990s and part of renovations to the home; however, the front façade could fairly easily be restored in the future.

- 3. The historic preservation board shall consider if the historic buildings, historic structures, historic improvements, historic landscape features, historic interiors (architecturally significant public portions only), historic sites, or historic districts comply with the sea level rise and resiliency review criteria in Chapter 133, Article II, as applicable, pursuant to Section 118-592.
 - (a) Criteria for ordinances, resolutions, or recommendations:

(1) Whether the proposal affects an area that is vulnerable to the impacts of sea level rise, pursuant to adopted projections.

The unified sea level rise projection for Southeast Florida updated in 2019 projects the anticipated range of sea level rise from 2000 to 2120. The projection highlights three planning horizons:

Short term: by 2040, sea level is projected to rise 10 to 17 inches above 2000 mean sea level.

Medium term: by 2070, sea level is projected to rise 21 to 54 inches above 2000 mean sea level.

Long term: by 2120, sea level is projected to rise 40 to 136 inches above 2000 mean sea level.

According to the survey provided by the applicant, the structure is located on a site that has an approximate elevation of 4.5' NGVD. The ground floor elevation is located at approximately 5.77' NGVD.

(2) Whether the proposal will increase the resiliency of the City with respect to sea level rise.

In order for the historic single-family home designation to increase the resiliency of the City, substantial alterations of the house and property will likely be required. A suitable level of flexibility will be necessary in reviewing applications for Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, demolition, additions and new construction in order for the properties to meet current and future Building Codes and the City's resiliency standards.

(3) Whether the proposal is compatible with the City's sea level rise mitigation and resiliency efforts.

In order for the historic single-family home designation to be compatible with the City's sea level rise mitigation and resiliency efforts, substantial alterations, adaptive re-use and/or redevelopment of the subject properties will likely be required. A suitable level of flexibility will be necessary in reviewing applications for Certificates of Appropriateness for alterations, demolition, additions and new construction in order for the property to meet current and future Building Codes and to be consistent with the City's resiliency initiatives.

IV. DESCRIPTION OF BOUNDARIES

The subject property is located at 230 Palm Avenue: Lot 6, less the northwesterly 10 feet & the west ½ of Lot 7, Block E 2, of the Riviera 1st and 2nd Addition Amended, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 32 at Page 37, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

V. PRESENT OWNER

The present owners of the subject property are the Judith Wecker Trust and the Samuel Jacobson Irrevocable Trust. A sworn affidavit has been submitted identifying Michael Jacobson as the sole beneficiary of the Trusts.

VI. PRESENT USE

The original and current use of the subject property is single-family residential.

VII. PRESENT ZONING DISTRICT

The subject property is located in the RS-4 Single-family residential zoning district.

VIII. ARCHITECTURAL BACKGROUND

<u>Mediterranean Revival-Art Deco Transitional (Med-Deco)</u> (circa late 1920s to mid-1930s) Med-Deco in Miami Beach was a synthesis of Mediterranean Revival form and Art Deco decorative detail or vice versa. This unique hybrid style became a fascinating bridge between the "familiar" and the "new" as the allure of Art Deco found its way into the City's architectural vocabulary. Clean stepped roof lines and crisp geometric detailing replaced scrolled parapets, bracketed cornices, and Classical features on structures of clear Mediterranean Revival form. Likewise, sloped barrel tile roofs rested gracefully on edifices with spectacular Art Deco entrances and facade treatments.

Some of the most celebrated architects in Miami Beach designed structures in this brief-lived but very significant style, including V. H. Nellenbogen, Henry Hohauser, Russell Pancoast, and T. Hunter Henderson. The predominant exterior material of Med-Deco was smooth stucco with raised or incised details. Featured stucco areas were often patterned or scored. Keystone, either natural or filled and colored, was frequently used to define special elements. Windows ranged from wooden and steel casement to wooden double-hung, and even large single windows in gracefully curved masonry openings.



Front elevation drawing, Harry O. Nelson, 1838

230 Palm Avenue

The single-family residence at 230 Palm Avenue was built in 1938 and designed by prominent local architect Henry O. Nelson in the Mediterranean Revival-Art Deco Transitional style of architecture. The Building Permit Card (#9205) indicates that the original owner was Millco Investment Company and the cost of construction is listed as \$15,000.

Staff has located two sheets of original building permit plans (#18801) that consist of all exterior elevations and floor plans. Based upon these plans, the home appears to have been built as a three-bedroom, three-bathroom, 2-story concrete block structure with an attached 1-car garage.

In 1999, a building permit was issued (B9903949) for the substantial renovation of the home by architect E. A. Calil. Notable modifications included the conversion of the garage to a study, the removal of the gable roof structure above garage and replacement with a flat roof deck and the vertical extension of the existing foyer creating a new entry tower feature along the front façade.

The property, located in a prominent residential single-family area of the city, is complemented by its setting and relationship with numerous other single-family homes of similar scale in various design styles. Its distinctive architecture contributes greatly to the character of the residential neighborhood. The original Med-Deco design was carefully executed in harmony with the surrounding landscape. The buildings proportion, scale, massing and use of materials are reflective of Miami Beach Med-Deco architecture.

X. PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. <u>Criteria for Designation:</u> Based upon the evidence presented and the historical and architectural significance of the single-family residence located at 230 Palm Avenue, and in accordance with Chapter 118, Article X, Division 4, of the Land Development Regulations of the City Code, the staff of the City of Miami Beach Planning Department recommends that the Historic Preservation Board adopt the subject property as a local historic structure.
- Site Boundaries: The Planning Department recommends that the boundaries of the historic site consist of the entire property located at 230 Palm Avenue: Lot 6, less the northwesterly 10 feet & the west ½ of Lot 7, Block E 2, of the Riviera 1st and 2nd Addition Amended, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 32 at Page 37, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.
- 3. <u>Areas Subject to Review:</u> The Planning Department recommends that the proposed historic site shall be subject to Section 118-591(f) of the Land Development Regulations of the City Code.
- 4. <u>**Review Guidelines:**</u> The Planning Department recommends that a decision on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be based upon Section 118-591(f) of the Land Development Regulations of the City Code.

XI. CURRENT PHOTOGRAPHS OF THE SUBJECT PROPERTY



Front Elevation (North)



Side Elevation (East)

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD City of Miami Beach, Florida

MEETING DATE: October 18, 2022

PROPERTY/FOLIO: 230 Palm Avenue / 02-4205-002-0800

- FILE NO: HPB22-0526
- APPLICANT: Michael Jacobson
- IN RE: An application has been filed requesting the Historic Preservation Board to approve the designation of the existing home as an individual historic single-family residence.
- LEGAL: Lot 6, less the northwesterly 10 feet & the west ½ of Lot 7, Block E 2, of the Riviera 1st and 2nd Addition Amended, according to the Plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 32 at Page 37, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

The applicant, Michael Jacobson, is requesting that the Historic Preservation Board approve a request for the designation of an existing single-family home as an historic structure.

The City of Miami Beach Historic Preservation Board makes the following FINDING OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, the testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Designation Report, the single-family residence at 230 Palm Avenue eligible for designation as an historic structure as it complies with the requirements and criteria specified in Section 118-592 of the Land Development Regulations of the City Code.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing finding of fact, the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, and the designation report and analysis, which are adopted herein, including the staff recommendations, that the single-family residence at 230 Palm Avenue is DESIGNATED as an HISTORIC STRUCTURE. Such designation is conditioned upon the following:

 Any future additions, modifications, improvements or alterations to the subject property, including, but not limited to, demolition, shall require a Certificate of Appropriateness in accordance with Chapter 118, Article X of the Land Development Regulations of the City Code.

Dated this ______ day of ______, 20____.

Page 2 of 2 HPB22-0526 Meeting Date: October 18, 2022

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA

BY:

DEBORAH TACKETT HISTORIC PRESERVATION & ARCHITECTURE OFFICER FOR THE CHAIR

STATE OF FLORIDA))SS COUNTY OF MIAMI-DADE)

The foregoing instrument was acknowledged before me this _____ day of ______ 20____ by Deborah Tackett, Historic Preservation & Architecture Officer, Planning Department, City of Miami Beach, Florida, a Florida Municipal Corporation, on behalf of the corporation. She is personally known to me.

NOTARY PUBLIC Miami-Dade County, Florida My commission expires:

)

Approved As To Form: City Attorney's Office:

Filed with the Clerk of the Historic Preservation Board on _____ ()