



93 PALM AVENUE

Historic Preservation Board Hearing

May 10, 2022

The New York Times

*Is Honor Due House That Was Home
to Capone?*

Chicago Tribune

CAPONE HOUSE LANDMARK STATUS FOUGHT

Los Angeles Times

Raze Capone House? A Criminal Idea, Chicagoan
Says



Angelo Bruno House Doesn't Pass Muster with Historical Committee

The advisory committee said the mafia mobster isn't a person of significance

By **Melissa Romero** | Mar 17, 2016, 2:12pm EDT

Members of the committee, who noted that they were stepping into a territory that has **no precedent within Philadelphia or the nation—i.e. deeming a mobster's house historic**—said the case was simply not strong enough for them to recommend historical designation to the historical committee.

10 Most Notorious Criminals In American History



By David Lohr



City of Miami Beach Eligibility Criteria

Sec. 118-592. - Criteria for designation.



(a) The historic preservation board shall have the authority to recommend that properties be designated as historic buildings, historic structures, historic improvements, historic landscape features, historic interiors (architecturally significant public portions only), historic sites, or historic districts if they are significant in the historical, architectural, cultural, aesthetic or archeological heritage of the city, the county, state or nation. Such properties shall possess an integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling or association and meet at least one of the following criteria:

- (1) Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the history of the city, the county, state or nation.
- (2) Association with the lives of persons significant in the city's past history.
- (3) Embody the distinctive characteristics of a historical period, architectural or design style or method of construction.
- (4) Possess high artistic values.
- (5) Represent the work of a master, serve as an outstanding or representative work of a master designer, architect or builder who contributed to our historical, aesthetic or architectural heritage.
- (6) Have yielded, or are likely to yield information important in pre-history or history.
- (7) Be listed in the National Register of Historic Places.
- (8) Consist of a geographically definable area that possesses a significant concentration of sites, buildings or structures united by historically significant past events or aesthetically by plan or physical development, whose components may lack individual distinction.

(b) A building, structure (including the public portions of the interior), improvement or landscape feature may be designated historic even if it has been altered if the alteration is reversible and the most significant architectural elements are intact and repairable.

(c) The historic preservation board shall consider if the historic buildings, historic structures, historic improvements, historic landscape features, historic interiors (architecturally significant public portions only), historic sites, or historic districts comply with the sea level rise and resiliency review criteria in [chapter 133](#), art II, as applicable.

Federal Eligibility Criteria

36 CFR § 60.4 - Criteria for evaluation.

CFR

[prev](#) | [next](#)

§ 60.4 Criteria for evaluation.

The criteria applied to evaluate properties (other than areas of the National Park System and National Historic Landmarks) for the National Register are listed below. These criteria are worded in a manner to provide for a wide diversity of resources. The following criteria shall be used in evaluating properties for nomination to the National Register, by [NPS](#) in reviewing nominations, and for evaluating National Register eligibility of properties. Guidance in applying the criteria is further discussed in the "How To" publications, Standards & Guidelines sheets and Keeper's opinions of the National Register. Such materials are available upon request.

National Register criteria for evaluation. The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and [objects](#) that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association and

- (a) that are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- (b) that are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or
- (c) that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- (d) that have yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

Criteria considerations. Ordinarily cemeteries, birthplaces, or graves of historical figures, properties owned by religious institutions or used for religious purposes, [structures](#) that have been moved from their original locations, reconstructed historic buildings, properties primarily commemorative in nature, and properties that have achieved significance within the past 50 years shall not be considered eligible for the National Register. However, such properties will qualify if they are integral parts of [districts](#) that do meet the criteria of if they fall within the following categories:

- (a) A religious property deriving primary significance from architectural or artistic distinction or historical importance; or
- (b) A [building](#) or [structure](#) removed from its original location but which is significant primarily for architectural value, or which is the surviving [structure](#) most importantly associated with a historic [person](#) or event; or
- (c) A birthplace or grave of a historical figure of outstanding importance if there is no appropriate [site](#) or [building](#) directly associated with his productive life.
- (d) A cemetery which derives its primary significance from graves of [persons](#) of transcendent importance, from age, from distinctive design features, or from association with historic events; or
- (e) A reconstructed [building](#) when accurately executed in a suitable environment and presented in a dignified manner as part of a restoration master plan, and when no other [building](#) or [structure](#) with the same association has survived; or
- (f) A property primarily commemorative in intent if design, age, tradition, or symbolic value has invested it with its own exceptional significance; or
- (g) A property achieving significance within the past 50 years if it is of exceptional importance.

This exception is described further in [NPS](#) "How To" #2, entitled "How to Evaluate and Nominate Potential National Register Properties That Have Achieved Significance Within the Last 50 Years" which is available from the National Register of Historic Places Division, National Park Service, United States Department of the Interior, Washington, D.C. 20240.

FEDERAL GUIDELINES

NATIONAL REGISTER BULLETIN

Technical information on the the National Register of Historic Places:
survey, evaluation, registration, and preservation of cultural resources



U.S. Department of the Interior
National Park Service
Cultural Resources
National Register, History and Education

How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation



“These criteria are standards by which every property that is nominated to the National Register.”

FEDERAL GUIDELINES

NATIONAL REGISTER BULLETIN

Technical information on the the National Register of Historic Places:
survey, evaluation, registration, and preservation of cultural resources



U.S. Department of the Interior
National Park Service
Cultural Resources
National Register, History and Education

How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation



SIGNIFICANT PERSONS

“Persons ‘significant in our past’ refers to individuals whose activities are **demonstrably important** within a local, State, or national historic context.” (14)

FEDERAL GUIDELINES

NATIONAL REGISTER BULLETIN

Technical information on the the National Register of Historic Places:
survey, evaluation, registration, and preservation of cultural resources



U.S. Department of the Interior
National Park Service
Cultural Resources
National Register, History and Education

How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation



DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS

“‘Distinctive characteristics’ are the physical features or traits that commonly recur in individual types, periods, or methods of construction.

To be eligible, a property must clearly contain enough of those characteristics to be **considered a true representative** of a particular type, period, or method of construction.”

1. WAS AL CAPONE A “SIGNIFICANT PERSON” IN MIAMI BEACH HISTORY?

- Part-time resident for two years between 1929-1931
- Returned in March 1940; he was partially paralyzed and his brain was rotted by neurosyphilis.
 - “Al is nutty as a fruitcacke”
 - “Functionally a 12-year-old”
- Not “demonstrably important” to the history of Miami Beach.

2. IS THIS A “TRUE REPRESENTATIVE” OF MEDITERRANEAN REVIVAL?

What is Mediterranean Revival

Mediterranean Revival buildings evoke an Old World image, featuring decorative columns, arched windows, clay barrel tile roofs, rough stucco walls, wrought iron and spindle gates guarding picturesque courtyards. These buildings are a whimsical interpretation of the old world, combining elements from differing Mediterranean styles resulting in a “fantasy” architecture adopted by early 1920s Miami Beach developers, as well as elsewhere in Florida and California. The Spanish Village along Española Way is an excellent area to study the style.

What to look for

Bell towers, archways, awnings, porches, balconies, carved stonework, rough stucco walls, clay tiles roofs, wrought iron fixtures.



2. IS THIS A “TRUE REPRESENTATIVE” OF MEDITERRANEAN REVIVAL?

What is Mediterranean Revival

Mediterranean Revival buildings evoke an Old World image, featuring decorative columns, arched windows, clay barrel tile roofs, rough stucco walls, wrought iron and spindle gates, guarding picturesque courtyards. These buildings are a whimsical interpretation of the old world, combining elements from differing Mediterranean styles resulting in a “fantasy” architecture adopted by early 1920s Miami Beach developers, as well as elsewhere in Florida and California. The Spanish Village along Española Way is an excellent area to study the style.

What to look for

Bell towers, archways, awnings, porches, balconies, carved stonework, rough stucco walls, clay tiles roofs, wrought iron fixtures.



Example of Mediterranean Revival Style



- ✓ Decorative columns
- ✓ Arched windows
- ✓ Clay barrel tile roofs
- ✓ Rough stucco walls
- ✓ Wrought iron & spindle gates
- ✓ Bell towers
- ✓ Scrolled or tile parapet walls
- ✓ Archways
- ✗ Porches
- ✗ Awnings
- ✓ Balconies
- ✓ Carved stonework
- ✓ Articulated door surrounds
- ✓ Spanish Baroque decorative motifs

93 Palm Avenue



- Decorative columns
- Arched windows
- Clay barrel tile roofs
- Rough stucco walls
- Wrought iron & spindle gates
- Bell towers
- Scrolled or tile parapet walls
- Archways
- Porches
- Awnings
- Balconies
- Carved stonework
- Articulated door surrounds
- Spanish Baroque decorative motifs

EXCERPTS FROM DESIGNATION REPORT

- *“Unremarkable”* (19)
- *“Not a noteworthy example of the Mediterranean Revival Style.”* (19)
- *“Lack of architectural merit.”* (19)
- *“Lacks the architectural detailing, massing, and proportioning characteristic of this celebrated style.”* (19)
- *“Lacks the detailing and ornamentation of the more noteworthy examples of this style.”* (15)

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

- Barely visible from the public right-of-way

VIEW FROM PUBLIC RIGHT-OF-WAY



ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

- Main home is barely visible from the right-of-way
- No architect of record
- Structure is extremely vulnerable to sea level rise
 - HPB must consider whether the buildings comply with sea level rise and resiliency review criteria in Chapter 133 of the City Code
 - “[N]ew habitable floor area is required to be constructed at a minimum of 10.0’ NGVD, approximately 3’-6’ above the current first floor level.” (19)

King Tide Video



CONCLUSION

- 93 Palm does not meet the eligibility criteria for historic designation
 - Not associated with a “significant person” in the City’s history
 - Not a “true representative” or “embodiment” of the Mediterranean Revival Style
- 93 Palm is not consistent with City’s sea level rise policies
- 93 Palm cannot be designated historic under the eligibility criteria set forth in the City Code