

MIAMI BEACH

PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Staff Report & Recommendation

Historic Preservation Board

TO: Chairperson and Members
Historic Preservation Board

DATE: June 15, 2021

FROM: Thomas R. Mooney, AICP
Planning Director



SUBJECT: HPB21-0459, **1144 Marseille Drive.**

An application has been filed requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a multifamily building on a vacant lot and one or more waivers.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness with conditions.

EXISTING SITE

Local Historic District: Normandy Isles

ZONING / SITE DATA

Legal Description: Lots 15 & 17, Block 9, of the Ocean Side Section of Isle of Normandy, according to the Plat Thereof, as Recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 60, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Zoning: RM-1, Residential multifamily, low intensity
Future Land Use Designation: RM-1, Residential multifamily, low intensity

Lot Size: 13,274 S.F. / 1.25 Max FAR
Proposed FAR: 16,160 S.F. / 1.21 FAR
Proposed Height: 40'-6", as represented by the applicant
Existing Use/Condition: Vacant lot
Proposed Use: Affordable workforce housing

THE PROJECT

The applicant has submitted plans entitled "Eleven44", as prepared by Mateu Architecture Inc, dated April 5, 2021.

COMPLIANCE WITH ZONING CODE

The application, as proposed, appears to be consistent with the City Code.

The above noted comments shall not be considered final zoning review or approval. These and all zoning matters shall require final review and verification by the Planning Department prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.

CONSISTENCY WITH 2040 COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

A preliminary review of the project indicates that the proposed mixed use residential and commercial is **consistent** with the Future Land Use Map of the Comprehensive Plan.

COMPLIANCE WITH SEA LEVEL RISE AND RESILIENCY REVIEW CRITERIA

Section 133-50(a) of the Land Development establishes review criteria for sea level rise and resiliency that must be considered as part of the review process for board orders. The following is an analysis of the request based upon these criteria:

- (1) A recycling or salvage plan for partial or total demolition shall be provided.
Not Applicable
- (2) Windows that are proposed to be replaced shall be hurricane proof impact windows.
Not Applicable
- (3) Where feasible and appropriate, passive cooling systems, such as operable windows, shall be provided.
Satisfied
Operable windows have been provided.
- (4) Resilient landscaping (salt tolerant, highly water-absorbent, native or Florida friendly plants) shall be provided, in accordance with Chapter 126 of the City Code.
Satisfied
- (5) The project applicant shall consider the adopted sea level rise projections in the Southeast Florida Regional Climate Action Plan, as may be revised from time-to-time by the Southeast Florida Regional Climate Change Compact. The applicant shall also specifically study the land elevation of the subject property and the elevation of surrounding properties.
Satisfied
In response to projected sea level rise, the parking area is proposed to be located at 7.5' NGVD; more than 3'-0" above the existing grade level.
- (6) The ground floor, driveways, and garage ramping for new construction shall be adaptable to the raising of public rights-of-ways and adjacent land and shall provide sufficient height and space to ensure that the entry ways and exits can be modified to accommodate a higher street height of up to three (3) additional feet in height.
Satisfied
- (7) In all new projects, all critical mechanical and electrical systems shall be located above base flood elevation. Due to flooding concerns, all redevelopment projects shall, whenever practicable, and economically reasonable, move all critical mechanical and electrical systems to a location above base flood elevation.
Satisfied

- (8) Existing buildings shall be, where reasonably feasible and economically appropriate, elevated up to base flood elevation, plus City of Miami Beach Freeboard.
Not Applicable
- (9) When habitable space is located below the base flood elevation plus City of Miami Beach Freeboard, wet or dry flood proofing systems will be provided in accordance with Chapter of 54 of the City Code.
Not Applicable
- (10) In all new projects, water retention systems shall be provided.
Satisfied
Additional information shall be provided at the time of building permit review.
- (11) Cool pavement materials or porous pavement materials shall be utilized.
Satisfied
Additional information shall be provided at the time of building permit review.
- (12) The project design shall minimize the potential for a project causing a heat island effect on site.
Satisfied

COMPLIANCE WITH CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CRITERIA

A decision on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be based upon the following:

- I. Evaluation of the compatibility of the physical alteration or improvement with surrounding properties and where applicable, compliance with the following criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(1) of the Miami Beach Code (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
 - a. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings as revised from time to time.
Not Applicable
 - b. Other guidelines/policies/plans adopted or approved by Resolution or Ordinance by the City Commission.
Satisfied
- II. In determining whether a particular application is compatible with surrounding properties, the Board shall consider the following criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(2) of the Miami Beach Code (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
 - a. Exterior architectural features.
Satisfied
 - b. General design, scale, massing and arrangement.
Satisfied
 - c. Texture and material and color.

Satisfied

- d. The relationship of a, b, c, above, to other structures and features of the district.

Partially Satisfied

While the proposed design acknowledges the historic development pattern of the neighborhood, minor modifications are recommended in order to be more compatible with the surrounding properties.

- e. The purpose for which the district was created.

Partially Satisfied

While the proposed design acknowledges the historic development pattern of the neighborhood, minor modifications are recommended in order to be more compatible with the surrounding properties.

- f. The relationship of the size, design and siting of any new or reconstructed structure to the landscape of the district.

Partially Satisfied

While the proposed design acknowledges the historic development pattern of the neighborhood, minor modifications are recommended in order to be more compatible with the surrounding properties.

- g. An historic resources report, containing all available data and historic documentation regarding the building, site or feature.

Not Applicable

- h. The original architectural design or any subsequent modifications that have acquired significance.

Not Applicable

- III. The examination of architectural drawings for consistency with the criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(3) of the Miami Beach Code and stated below, with regard to the aesthetics, appearances, safety, and function of any new or existing structure, public interior space and physical attributes of the project in relation to the site, adjacent structures and properties, and surrounding community. The criteria referenced above are as follows (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):

- a. The location of all existing and proposed buildings, drives, parking spaces, walkways, means of ingress and egress, drainage facilities, utility services, landscaping structures, signs, and lighting and screening devices.

Satisfied

- b. The dimensions of all buildings, structures, setbacks, parking spaces, floor area ratio, height, lot coverage and any other information that may be reasonably necessary to determine compliance with the requirements of the underlying zoning district, and any applicable overlays, for a particular application or project.

Satisfied

- c. The color, design, surface finishes and selection of landscape materials and architectural elements of the exterior of all buildings and structures and primary public interior areas for developments requiring a building permit in areas of the city identified in section 118-503.
Satisfied
- d. The proposed structure, and/or additions to an existing structure is appropriate to and compatible with the environment and adjacent structures, and enhances the appearance of the surrounding properties, or the purposes for which the district was created.
Partially Satisfied
While the proposed design acknowledges the historic development pattern of the neighborhood, minor modifications are recommended in order to be more compatible with the surrounding properties.
- e. The design and layout of the proposed site plan, as well as all new and existing buildings and public interior spaces shall be reviewed so as to provide an efficient arrangement of land uses. Particular attention shall be given to safety, crime prevention and fire protection, relationship to the surrounding neighborhood, impact on preserving historic character of the neighborhood and district, contiguous and adjacent buildings and lands, pedestrian sight lines and view corridors.
Partially Satisfied
While the proposed design acknowledges the historic development pattern of the neighborhood, minor modifications are recommended in order to be more compatible with the surrounding properties.
- f. Pedestrian and vehicular traffic movement within and adjacent to the site shall be reviewed to ensure that clearly defined, segregated pedestrian access to the site and all buildings is provided for and that any driveways and parking spaces are usable, safely and conveniently arranged and have a minimal impact on pedestrian circulation throughout the site. Access to the site from adjacent roads shall be designed so as to interfere as little as possible with vehicular traffic flow on these roads and pedestrian movement onto and within the site, as well as permit both pedestrians and vehicles a safe ingress and egress to the site.
Satisfied
- g. Lighting shall be reviewed to ensure safe movement of persons and vehicles and reflection on public property for security purposes and to minimize glare and reflection on adjacent properties and consistent with a City master plan, where applicable.
Satisfied
- h. Landscape and paving materials shall be reviewed to ensure an adequate relationship with and enhancement of the overall site plan design.
Satisfied

- i. Buffering materials shall be reviewed to ensure that headlights of vehicles, noise, and light from Structures are adequately shielded from public view, adjacent properties and pedestrian areas.
Satisfied
- j. Any proposed new structure shall have an orientation and massing which is sensitive to and compatible with the building site and surrounding area and which creates or maintains important view corridor(s).
Satisfied
- k. All buildings shall have, to the greatest extent possible, space in that part of the ground floor fronting a sidewalk, street or streets which is to be occupied for residential or commercial uses; likewise, the upper floors of the pedestal portion of the proposed building fronting a sidewalk street, or streets shall have residential or commercial spaces, or shall have the appearance of being a residential or commercial space or shall have an architectural treatment which shall buffer the appearance of a parking structure from the surrounding area and is integrated with the overall appearance of the project.
Satisfied
- l. All buildings shall have an appropriate and fully integrated rooftop architectural treatment which substantially screens all mechanical equipment, stairs and elevator towers.
Satisfied
- m. Any addition on a building site shall be designed, sited and massed in a manner which is sensitive to and compatible with the existing improvement(s).
Satisfied
- n. All portions of a project fronting a street or sidewalk shall incorporate an amount of transparency at the first level necessary to achieve pedestrian compatibility.
Satisfied
- o. The location, design, screening and buffering of all required service bays, delivery bays, trash and refuse receptacles, as well as trash rooms shall be arranged so as to have a minimal impact on adjacent properties.
Satisfied

STAFF ANALYSIS

The applicant, the Housing Authority of the City of Miami Beach, is proposing to construct a 4-story multifamily residential building for affordable workforce housing on the subject vacant parcel. The new structure consists of a community room and terrace, 12 parking spaces and 1 residential unit at the ground level and 21 residential units distributed amongst the upper 3 levels.

Staff is highly supportive of the application and would commend the applicant for proposing to construct a high-quality structure on the existing vacant lot. Over time, this undeveloped site has had an increasing negative impact on the residential context and character of Marseille Drive, as well as the surrounding neighborhood. Staff is supportive of the overall contemporary design language of the proposed structure, which incorporates variations in surface finishes and changes

in plane that breakdown the scale of the building. Further, the distribution of architectural forms has resulted in a new multifamily residential building that is compatible with the neighboring buildings and the surrounding historic district. In this regard, the building has been designed with 2 and 3-story volumes fronting Marseille Drive and the 4-story portion has been setback an additional approximately 30'-0" from the primary façade. This plan responds well to the historic development pattern of the neighborhood that consists mostly of independently developed, approximately fifty-foot-wide lots.

Staff believes that with minor adjustments, the project could be even more compatible with the historic district. To this end, staff recommends that the eastern 2-story volume and access driveway be shifted approximately 5'-0" to the east. The shifting of massing in combination with the elimination of the projecting fin element would allow for the introduction of landscaping (including a feature tree) between the two front volumes. Staff believes that this scheme would more clearly emphasize the original development pattern of this area and result in a more successful design.

Finally, the applicant is seeking approval for two waivers. The first waiver is related to the height of the front portion of the building. The North Beach National Register Conservation District Overlay allows for a maximum building height of 45'-0". However, within the first 25'-0" of building depth the height is limited a maximum of 32'-0". Notwithstanding the above, the Board may allow up to 45'-0" in height within the first 20'-0" of building depth. The applicant is proposing to construct a partially enclosed walkway located 20'-0" west of the front façade and is requesting the Board approve this structure at a height of 40'-6". As presently configured, this element creates excessive bulk at the fourth level, giving the appearance that the fourth floor is setback much less than proposed. Further, this request is contrary to the overlay district's purpose to ensure that the scale and massing of new development is consistent with the established context of the existing residential neighborhoods. As such, staff recommends that the waiver be denied.

The second waiver is related to the height of the covered parking area. The North Beach National Register Conservation District Overlay requires a minimum height of 12'-0" when parking is located below the first habitable level. While the Board may waive up to 2'-0" in height, the applicant is requesting a waiver of only 0'-6". Staff is supportive of this request as this minor reduction in height at the ground level area furthers the purpose of the overlay district to ensure compatibility with the existing Contributing buildings.

In summary staff is highly supportive of the proposed project and is confident that the above noted concern can be addressed administratively and recommends approval as noted below.

RECOMMENDATION

In view of the foregoing analysis, staff recommends the application be **approved** subject to the conditions enumerated in the attached draft Order, which address the inconsistencies with the aforementioned Certificate of Appropriateness criteria.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
City of Miami Beach, Florida

MEETING DATE: June 15, 2021

PROPERTY/FOLIO: 1144 Marseille Drive / 02-3210-013-1110

FILE NO: HPB20-0431

IN RE: An application has been filed by the Housing Authority of the City of Miami Beach requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a multifamily building on a vacant lot and one or more waivers.

LEGAL: Lots 15 & 17, Block 9, of the Ocean Side Section of Isle of Normandy, according to the Plat Thereof, as Recorded in Plat Book 25, Page 60, of the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

ORDER

The City of Miami Beach Historic Preservation Board makes the following FINDINGS OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

I. Certificate of Appropriateness

- A. The subject site is located within the Normandy Isles Local Historic District.
- B. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted:
 - 1. Is consistent with Sea Level Rise and Resiliency Review Criteria in Section 133-50(a) of the Miami Beach Code.
 - 2. Is consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(1) of the Miami Beach Code.
 - 3. Is consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(2) of the Miami Beach Code.
 - 4. Is consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(3) of the Miami Beach Code.
- C. The project would remain consistent with the criteria and requirements of section 118-564 and 133-50(a) if the following conditions are met:
 - 1. Revised elevation, site plan and floor plan drawings shall be submitted and, at a minimum, such drawings shall incorporate the following:

- a. The eastern 2-story front volume and access driveway shall be shifted approximately 5'-0" to the east and the projecting fin element (located between the 2 front volumes) shall be eliminated in order to introduce landscaping to include a feature tree, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - b. Final details of all exterior surface finishes and materials, including samples, shall be submitted, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - c. All roof-top fixtures, air-conditioning units and mechanical devices shall be clearly noted on a revised roof plan and elevation drawings and shall be screened from view, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff, consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
2. A revised landscape plan, prepared by a Professional Landscape Architect, registered in the State of Florida, and corresponding site plan, shall be submitted to and approved by staff. The species type, quantity, dimensions, spacing, location and overall height of all plant material shall be clearly delineated and subject to the review and approval of staff. At a minimum, such plan shall incorporate the following:
 - a. The proposed landscape plan shall satisfy minimum landscape code requirements as prescribed by CMB Code Chapter 126.
 - b. All hedge and ground cover plantings within the front yard shall not exceed 36" in height at maturity.
 - c. A fully automatic irrigation system with 100% coverage and an automatic rain sensor in order to render the system inoperative in the event of rain.
 - d. The project design shall minimize the potential for a project causing a heat island effect on site.
 - e. Cool pavement materials or porous pavement materials shall be utilized.
 - f. The use of Silva Cells or approved equal should be specified for canopy shade trees planted in areas where rooting space may be limited, inclusive of street trees, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff, consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
3. In accordance with Section 142-870.15(c)(1) of the City Code, the request pertaining to a waiver of the maximum building height within the required front setback, is hereby DENIED.
4. In accordance with Section 142-870.15(d)(1)(a) of the City Code, the request pertaining to a reduction of 6" of the minimum height of the ground floor parking area, is hereby waived.

In accordance with Section 118-537, the applicant, the owner(s) of the subject property, the City Manager, Miami Design Preservation League, Dade Heritage Trust, or an affected person may appeal the Board's decision on a Certificate of Appropriateness to a special master appointed by the City Commission.

II. Variance(s)

- A. No variances have been applied for as part of this application.

The decision of the Board regarding variances shall be final and there shall be no further review thereof except by resort to a court of competent jurisdiction by petition for writ of certiorari.

III. General Terms and Conditions applying to both 'I. Certificate of Appropriateness' and 'II. Variances' noted above.

- A. The applicant agrees and shall be required to provide access to areas subject to this approval (not including private residences or hotel rooms) for inspection by the City (i.e.: Planning, Code Compliance, Building Department, Fire Safety), to ensure compliance with the plans approved by the Board and conditions of this order.
- B. The issuance of a building permit is contingent upon meeting Public School Concurrency requirements. Applicant shall obtain a valid School Concurrency Determination Certificate (Certificate) issued by the Miami-Dade County Public Schools. The Certificate shall state the number of seats reserved at each school level. In the event sufficient seats are not available, a proportionate share mitigation plan shall be incorporated into a tri-party development agreement and duly executed. No building permit may be issued unless and until the applicant obtains a written finding from Miami-Dade County Public Schools that the applicant has satisfied school concurrency.
- C. The relocation of any tree shall be subject to the approval of the Environment & Sustainability Director and/or Urban Forester, as applicable.
- D. The applicant shall comply with the electric vehicle parking requirements, pursuant to Sec. 130-39 of the City Code.
- E. Where one or more parcels are unified for a single development, the property owner shall execute and record a unity of title or a covenant in lieu of unity of title, as may be applicable, in a form acceptable to the City Attorney.
- F. All applicable FPL transformers or vault rooms and backflow prevention devices shall not be located within a required yard and, with the exception of the valve (PIV), shall not be visible from the street.
- G. A copy of all pages of the recorded Final Order shall be scanned into the plans submitted for building permit and shall be located immediately after the front cover page of the permit plans.

- H. The Final Order shall be recorded in the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.
- I. Satisfaction of all conditions is required for the Planning Department to give its approval on a Certificate of Occupancy; a Temporary Certificate of Occupancy or Partial Certificate of Occupancy may also be conditionally granted Planning Departmental approval.
- J. The Final Order is not severable, and if any provision or condition hereof is held void or unconstitutional in a final decision by a court of competent jurisdiction, the order shall be returned to the Board for reconsideration as to whether the order meets the criteria for approval absent the stricken provision or condition, and/or it is appropriate to modify the remaining conditions or impose new conditions.
- K. The conditions of approval herein are binding on the applicant, the property's owners, operators, and all successors in interest and assigns.
- L. Nothing in this order authorizes a violation of the City Code or other applicable law, nor allows a relaxation of any requirement or standard set forth in the City Code.
- M. Upon the issuance of a final Certificate of Occupancy or Certificate of Completion, as applicable, the project approved herein shall be maintained in accordance with the plans approved by the board and shall be subject to all conditions of approval herein, unless otherwise modified by the Board. Failure to maintain shall result in the issuance of a Code Compliance citation, and continued failure to comply may result in revocation of the Certificate of Occupancy, Completion and Business Tax Receipt.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing findings of fact, the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, and the staff report and analysis, which are adopted herein, including the staff recommendations, which were amended and adopted by the Board, that the application is GRANTED for the above-referenced project subject to those certain conditions specified in Paragraph I, II, III of the Findings of Fact, to which the applicant has agreed.

PROVIDED, the applicant shall build substantially in accordance with the plans entitled **"Eleven44", as prepared by Mateu Architecture Inc, dated April 5, 2021**, as approved by the Historic Preservation Board, as determined by staff.

When requesting a building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order. No building permit may be issued unless and until all conditions of approval that must be satisfied prior to permit issuance, as set forth in this Order, have been met.

The issuance of the approval does not relieve the applicant from obtaining all other required Municipal, County and/or State reviews and permits, including final zoning approval. If adequate handicapped access is not provided on the Board-approved plans, this approval does not mean that such handicapped access is not required. When requesting a building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order.

If the Full Building Permit for the project is not issued within eighteen (18) months of the meeting date at which the original approval was granted, the application will expire and become null and void, unless the applicant makes an application to the Board for an extension of time, in accordance with the requirements and procedures of Chapter 118 of the City Code; the granting of any such extension of time shall be at the discretion of the Board. If the Full Building Permit for the project should expire for any reason (including but not limited to construction not commencing and continuing, with required inspections, in accordance with the applicable Building Code), the application will expire and become null and void.

In accordance with Chapter 118 of the City Code, the violation of any conditions and safeguards that are a part of this Order shall be deemed a violation of the land development regulations of the City Code. Failure to comply with this **Order** shall subject the application to Chapter 118 of the City Code, for revocation or modification of the application.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 20____.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA

BY: _____
DEBORAH TACKETT
HISTORIC PRESERVATION AND ARCHITECTURE OFFICER
FOR THE CHAIR

STATE OF FLORIDA)
)SS
COUNTY OF MIAMI-DADE)

The foregoing instrument was acknowledged before me this _____ day of _____ 20____ by Deborah Tackett, Historic Preservation and Architecture Officer, Planning Department, City of Miami Beach, Florida, a Florida Municipal Corporation, on behalf of the corporation. She is personally known to me.

NOTARY PUBLIC
Miami-Dade County, Florida
My commission expires: _____

Approved As To Form:
City Attorney's Office: _____ ())

Filed with the Clerk of the Historic Preservation Board on _____ ())