Thomas A. Hall, Inc.
1355 Adams Street
Hollywood, FL 33019
954-288-4447
tomhall1234@gmail.com

December 20, 2018

Graham Penn
Bercow Radell Fernandez & Larkin
200 S. Biscayne Boulevard, Suite 850
Miami, FL 33131

RE: 730-814 1st Street Valet Parking Traffic Operations Analysis – Follow Up Study
Project No. 201821.02

Dear Graham:

As you know, on May 22, 2018, my firm completed a valet parking traffic operations analysis as required by Section 18-337(6)a of the City of Miami Beach's Code of Ordinances. The analysis was based on information provided by your firm for the valet parking operation serving the several properties between 730 and 814 First Street in the City of Miami Beach, Florida. On November 6, 2018, the City of Miami Beach's Planning Department requested that additional information be provided on the valet parking operation since it has now been working for several months. That is, they wished to know how the valet operation functions now that it isn't theoretical, but real.

Data Collection
On Saturday, December 15, 2018, we collected data at the valet parking ramp located in front of Milos Restaurant at 730 First Street from 7:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. Saturday evening was selected because, as was noted in our May 22nd report, it is the peak time of trip generation for quality restaurants. The Institute of Transportation Engineers' (ITE) *Parking Generation* manual, 4th Edition, further notes that the hours between 7:00 and 9:00 p.m. are the highest parking demand time and December parking demand is 105 percent of the average monthly parking demand. So, the parking observations were conducted on the peak day of the week at the peak time of day and during a peak month of the year.

Although four businesses and one private residence were identified as users of the parking garage at 800 First Street in the previous study, only Milos Restaurant was in operation during the field observation period. The other restaurants and bar were not open nor did they appear to have been open recently. Milos Restaurant is larger than the other three restaurants and bar combined; therefore, it still offers an excellent insight into actual parking demand for this type of establishment in Miami Beach.

In the May 22nd report, it was assumed that the primary source of parking would be the garage located at 800 First Street; however, throughout the hours of observation, the valet operation relied upon the secondary parking source, the parking garage at 49 Collins

Avenue. It should also be noted that there were three valet parking attendants working during the times of observation.

Data Analysis

Table 1 – Arrivals and Departures at Valet Ramp displays the findings of our observations. As the table shows, 37 vehicles were dropped off at the valet ramp during the two hours of observations (18 between 7:00 p.m. and 8:00 p.m. and 19 between 8:00 p.m. and 9:00 p.m.). Six vehicles were delivered back to restaurant patrons during the two hours of observation (two between 7:00 p.m. and 8:00 p.m. and four between 8:00 p.m. and 9:00 p.m.).

Note that this is far below the number of vehicles expected per ITE trip generation rates, as were described in our May 22nd report. In fact, they are less than the reduced number of trips expected due to the effect of Uber and Lyft. Based on the earlier report, Milos Restaurant was expected to generate a high of 92 vehicle trips in the peak hour and, with the reduction for ridesharing, was expected to generate 46 vehicle trips in the peak hour. Instead, the actual parking demand was only 23 vehicle trips in the peak hour, which was 8:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. So, the actual parking demand was 25 percent of what ITE indicated and 50 percent of what was expected with the reduction due to ridesharing services.

Table 1 also shows the number of restaurant patron arrivals and departures by ridesharing services and arrivals by taxi and local trolley. As the table indicates, there are 43 arrivals and departures by vehicles using the valet parking operation and 26 arrivals and departures using the ridesharing services. This means that Uber and Lyft accounted for 38 percent of the arrivals and departures for Milos Restaurant (26 ridesharers / 71 total arrivals and departures = 0.37 or 37%). If the trolley and taxi traffic are added to the ridesharing population, the percentage rises slightly to 39 percent of arrivals and departures using transportation that doesn't require parking. In either case, this is, of course, less than the estimated 50 percent reduction for ridesharing noted in the earlier report.

Table 2 – Valet Drop Off and Return Times displays the times required for valet attendants to take a car from the valet parking ramp to the off-site parking garage located at 49 Collins Avenue and then return to their valet stand or to leave the valet stand and pick up a car from the off-site parking garage and deliver it to a restaurant patron. The times noted are not the entire drop offs and pick ups during the two-hour observation period, but are those that could be verified from start to finish during that time. As Table 2 shows, the average vehicle drop off time was 2 minutes and 50 seconds while the average pick up time was 2 minutes and 34 seconds. Note that this time does not include the time to receive a vehicle from its owner or the time to hand it back to its owner. On average, these "transactions" required one minute to accomplish.

In the May 22nd report, it was estimated that dropping off a car in the 49 Collins Avenue parking garage would require six minutes and 30 seconds. In actuality, even with the addition of one minute to the drop off and pick up times, they only require three minutes

and 50 seconds to drop off a vehicle in the off-site garage and return to the valet stand and they only require three minutes and 34 seconds to pick up a vehicle and deliver it to its owner. So, the actual time required to drop off or pick up a vehicle is approximately 52 percent of the time previously estimated.

Note that the three valet attendants initially strolled to or from the off-site parking garage, but, as the number of arriving vehicles increased, they were observed to jog to and from the parking garage, thus decreasing the time required for dropping off or picking up vehicles substantially.

Conclusions

Based on the findings reported above, the estimated valet parking traffic operations assumed in the May 22nd report by this firm were very conservative. In actuality, there are fewer vehicles requiring parking than were originally estimated and the time required to park them or retrieve them is nearly half of that originally assumed. It is concluded that, with the appropriate number of valet attendants, the valet parking operation is well maintained and does not violate any of the requirements of Section 18-337(6)a of the City of Miami Beach's Code of Ordinances.

Very truly yours,

Thomas A. Hall
President

Freddie Vargas, P.E.
FL Registration No. 35941
814 S. Military Trail
Deerfield Beach, FL 33442

Enclosures

TAH/kh

Table 1
730-814 1st Street Valet Parking Traffic Operations Analysis
Follow-Up Study Data Collection
Arrivals and Departures at Valet Ramp
Saturday, December 15, 2018

Arrival Time (PM)	Valet Drop Off	Valet Pick Up	Uber/Lyft Drop Off	Uber/Lyft Pick Up	Trolley	Taxi	Total
7:00	1						1
7:07	2						2
7:10	1	1	1		1		4
7:16	1						1
7:17			1				1
7:20			1				1
7:25	1		1				2
7:26	1						1
7:29	1						1
7:30	1						1
7:32	1						1
7:34	2						2
7:37	1						1
7:40	1			1			2
7:41			1				1
7:43	1		2				3
7:48				1			1
7:49			1				1
7:51			1				1
7:54	1		1				2
7:56		1					1
7:57	1		1				2
7:59	1						1
8:02	1						1
8:04			1				1
8:06		1					1
8:08	2		1				3
8:11	2		1				3
8:13		1					1
8:15	1						1
8:18			1				1
8:19	1						1
8:20	1						1
8:24	1						1
8:28	1						1
8:29	1					1	2
8:33	1		2				3
8:34	1						1
8:35	2						2
8:40			1				1
8:42	1						1
8:44		1					1
8:47			1				1
8:53			1	1			2
8:54	1			1			2
8:56	1						1
8:59	1	1	2				4
Total	**37**	**6**	**22**	**4**	**1**	**1**	**71**

Table 2
730-814 1st Street Valet Parking Traffic Operations Analysis
Follow-Up Study Data Collection
Valet Drop Off and Return Times
Saturday, December 15, 2018

Valet Drop Off Time			Valet Pick Up Time		
Start Time (PM)	End Time (PM)	Drop Off Duration	Start Time (PM)	End Time (PM)	Pick Up Duration
			7:05:20	7:10:30	0:05:10
7:07:50	7:15:45	0:07:55			
7:13:00	7:15:50	0:02:50			
7:16:25	7:18:50	0:02:25			
7:26:30	7:28:50	0:02:20			
7:29:40	7:31:15	0:01:35			
7:32:45	7:34:00	0:01:15			
7:33:30	7:34:30	0:01:00			
7:36:35	7:41:40	0:05:05			
7:38:30	7:42:48	0:04:18			
			7:53:30	7:55:40	0:02:10
7:56:10	7:58:30	0:02:20			
7:58:45	8:01:05	0:02:20			
8:00:10	8:03:10	0:03:00			
			8:03:10	8:06:10	0:03:00
8:09:40	8:13:40	0:04:00			
			8:11:00	8:13:15	0:02:15
8:19:05	8:21:40	0:02:35			
8:20:35	8:22:10	0:01:35			
8:22:10	8:25:05	0:02:55			
8:25:45	8:28:15	0:02:30			
8:28:15	8:29:30	0:01:15			
8:29:50	8:32:30	0:02:40			
			8:41:40	8:44:00	0:02:20
8:55:00	8:57:45	0:02:45			
			8:59:00	8:59:30	0:00:30
Average Drop Off		**0:02:50**	**Average Pick Up**		**0:02:34**