MIAMIBEACH

Finance and Citywide Projects Committee Meeting City Hall, Commission Chambers, 3rd Floor, 1700 Convention Center Drive December 14, 2018 - 12:00 PM

Commissioner Ricky Arriola, Chair Commissioner Mark Samuelian, Vice-Chair Commissioner Micky Steinberg, Member Commissioner John Elizabeth Alemán, Alternate

Visit us at <u>www.miamibeachfl.gov</u> for agendas and video streaming of City Commission Committee Meetings.

A meeting of the Finance and Citywide Projects Committee was held on Friday, December 14, 2018 at 12:00 p.m. in the Commission Chambers, 3rd floor of City Hall. Attendance: Commissioners Ricky Arriola, Mark Samuelian, Micky Steinberg, and John Elizabeth Alemán. Members from the Administration and the public were also attendance.

Meeting began at 12:12 p.m.

OLD BUSINESS

1. SANITATION FEE ADJUSTMENT Public Works

ACTION

Jay Fink, Public Works Assistant Director presented the item. He said we are here to talk about the trash rate. He stated we have a current contract that was awarded in 2010, which was originally a 5 year contract. It ended on August 31, 2015. There were 3, one year term extensions. The current rate is \$25.12 per month per unit. We did go through an RFP process and there was 3 bidders. Waste Management had a price of \$49.95 per unit per month, Progressive Waste had a price of \$32, World Waste \$27.80. In July 2018, the City Commission authorized the Administration to enter into an agreement with Progressive Waste; through negotiations the rate would take effect on January 1, 2019 which is \$28.89, which is about a 10% reduction from the starting point. In September during the budget process, several sanitation fee waste options of increases were presented and discussed to close the funding budget shortfall to close the downturn in the resort tax fund and historic reliance on subsidies which in recent years exceeded \$3 million in the enterprise fund. The Administration was directed to negotiate the contract and return. He said what we are looking to do with what is in front of the Committee now is to pass-through the increase of the per unit per month fee of the new contract to the user, which for the single family home is \$3.07 per unit.

Jay Fink said they are looking for a recommendation from the FCWPC to pass this on to the full Commission for the January 2019 meeting. It would take an ordinance change

and 2 readings. If we are successful at the first reading in January, the second reading would take place in February 2019 with a rate increase to take effect March 1st.

Commissioner Arriola asked if we contemplated a March 1st change in our budget.

John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer said yes. He clarified that during the budget process we talked about possibly raising some fees and we left them alone. We are planning to do the zero based budget exercise with Sanitation because there are revenue and expenditure items to create a plan for the long term funding imbalance. This would keep the gap from getting larger. We didn't assume we would have the expense or the revenue from this contract increase because it was under negotiations. We were hoping that whatever the impact was would be passed through so that the \$896,000 or so that we are upside down in the fund wouldn't get any worse and that discussion regarding the long term fix could take place later when we have the zero balanced budget discussion.

Commissioner Samuelian said he is never a fan of material increases, but it sounds like our costs are going up and we need to keep ourselves whole. He doesn't love having to do it, but he is prepared to support the Administration's recommendation as is because we need to cover our costs.

Commissioner Arriola said he feels the same way, he was ready to do it when we were doing the FY 2019 Budget in the fall.

Jay Fink said the second part that is in front of the Committee is within the contract there are provisions for the contractor to see increases with the CPI, so again with the pass through concept, the second part of it would be that future contractor increases would be an automatic pass through.

Commissioner Samuelian said that is what we need to do so that we don't get into these situations again. He mentioned he also referred an item on CPI for the January agenda.

Jay Fink asked if anyone wants to sponsor the item in January.

Commissioner Arriola volunteered himself to be the sponsor. Commissioner Samuelian said he will co-sponsor it. Commissioner Alemán will also co-sponsor the item

VOTE OF ACCLAMATION TO APPROVE THE ADMINISTRATION'S RECOMMENDATION

 DISCUSSION REGARDING THE FEES CHARGED TO DEVELOPERS TO APPEAR BEFORE THE CITY'S LAND USE BOARDS April 26, 2017 – C4 F Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán Planning

ACTION

Mr. Jerry Libbin, President of the Miami Beach Chamber of Commerce spoke and stated that the application fee to go before the Land Use Boards was \$.50 per square foot capped at a maximum of 10,000 square feet. The issue became apparent when in

2016 a major project was put forth in North Beach and it was over 130,000 square feet, and Russel Galbut's 500-700 Alton Road project was over 400,000 square feet. It has become difficult and expensive to do business in Miami Beach. This land use fee is a great place to start to remove the hurdles and invite businesses back to Miami Beach. The goal should not be for these fees to cover the expenses of the department, but to just cover the expense of the meeting because too many fees are paid before a project even begins.

Commissioner Steinberg stated that she wants to have an intelligent conversation but does not have any information on the fees included in the agenda packet.

Susanne Torriente, Assistant City Manager, added that there will be a presentation. The Committee also expressed that the discussion of 2015 when the max cap was increased took place in October 2015 before the Committee members were sworn into office and do not know what the City's goal was at the time. Ms. Torriente introduced the City's 3rd party consultant who is working with the City to analyze and provide a recommendation on the land use fees. She added that they have worked with other municipalities, developers, and stake holders and they have a presentation for the Committee.

Commissioner Alemán saw the presentation prior to the meeting and added that she is requested more specific details and comparisons to reflect the goals of the City so that the Committee can weigh in next time.

Kristen Nowicki from Keith and Schnars began the presentation.

Commissioner Alemán commented that she believes that the reason for the fees increase was to discourage bad behavior from developers; sometimes developers will present an incomplete project and relied on City Staff for edits, and added that the developer's architects need to be responsible for this work.

Presentation continued.

Commissioner Samuelian asked if she can provide a detailed understanding on what it would look like to develop in the City of Miami. She replied that developers simply need to know what can they develop, where can they develop, and the cost and fees. The City Cones in Miami Beach are complex and are not easy for developers to know what they can and cannot do just based on the City Code. There are issues with the Code that make it inherently unpredictable for the developer community. Developers in Miami Beach have to go through 4 boards while in the City of Miami they only have to go before 2 boards.

Mr. Libbin added that the process of going from board to board delays projects and create more costs which are hurtful for small businesses. Developers do not want to come to Miami Beach, and it is because of the City codes.

Discussion held regarding the City Code, and the Committee agreed that the City Code is affecting business opportunities.

Commissioner Steinberg said that she may not be present for the entirety of the presentation, and added that the data is needed to see what the City was trying to accomplish prior to 2015, and that a workshop will be required to discuss the City Code.

Discussion was held, and presentation continued. Some of the recommendations from the City's consultant are to reduce the number of "exploration" meetings, restructure when the fees are collected, eliminate fee waivers that results from Commissioners initiating major land use projects, and reduce the per-square-foot fee from \$.50 to \$.30 per square foot.

Commissioner Samuelian asked for the total amount in fees collected the prior year.

Carmen Sanchez, Deputy Director of Planning replied that there was a total of \$675,000 in fees.

Presentation concluded.

Ms. Sanchez asked the Committee to move this item to the Planning Board.

Commissioner Alemán stated that before she is ready to vote on this item, she wants to see an updated presentation to include all the changes she had suggested to the consultant. Ms. Sanchez replied that the item can be moved for the purpose of LDR's and once the fees are revised, it can be reintroduced without having to go back before the Planning Board.

Ms. Torriente also suggested moving the fees out of the LDR, and send to Land Use with an amendment to the LDR to continue to discuss. Commissioner Arriola agreed with moving forward for legislative purposes and introducing the fees once the City has revised the numbers.

Commissioner Alemán stated that she is in favor of implementing a temporary cap because is going to take time to complete all the studies and analysis. She sponsored this item over a year ago and should have implemented a temporary cap.

Commissioner Arriola also agreed with a temporary cap until the financials are figured out.

Commissioner Arriola referred back to the approximate \$600,000 in revenue from fees for prior year stating that is not a big amount and it might not be worthwhile to discourage development that in the long run will pay out more in taxes and increase the City's revenue.

Commissioner Samuelian stated that he wants to take action and asked John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer if there is any finance or budgetary concerns if they do a cap on the fees.

Mr. Woodruff replied that he is concerned because he has not seen the report, and it feels a little preliminary.

Commissioner Samuelian asked City Staff if it would be problematic to take action, and in 3 to 6 months after all the analysis are done take further action as needed. Ms. Sanchez replied that it will be an issue.

Discussion was held regarding the policy.

Commissioner Arriola added that the City should try to make revenue from fees but to focus on policy that will make it easier for developers and discourage bad habits. He would like to see a fee schedule that targets misbehavior of using City staff time and resources, but does not want to discourage development.

Commissioner Alemán wants to hear more from the consultant, and have the consultant return to FCWPC with an updated report that is taking into consideration the City's goals. She recommended moving item forward to the Planning Board removing the fees from the LDR. Take immediate action on implementing a temporary cap and at the same time close the Commissioner loophole, refer a complete Cone review analysis to the Land Use Board. Start a detailed analysis of the administrative variance concepts; pull out all the variances that are rubberstamped by the board and put them in an administrative review category.

Commissioner Arriola agreed and added to revise the City Code as well, and bring the revise Code before full City Commission in January.

Discussion continued.

Ms. Torriente stated that the City is also working with Matrix Consulting Group, and they are doing a study on the administrative land use process and will have preliminary findings in January 2019.

Mr. Libbin spoke and stated that he is cautiously optimistic on the timeframe but agrees that a cap needs to be put in place. He suggested considering the developers that paid a lot of money in fees in the past by putting something in place, whether a credit on their next project or something else. Mr. Libbin also thanked the Committee for requesting that the Miami Beach Chamber of Commerce gets involved in fixing this issue as well.

Commissioner Alemán asked what a good amount for the cap is.

Ms. Sanchez replied that 40,000 to 50,000 square feet cap should be reasonable because 90 percent of projects do not reach this amount.

Commissioner Alemán suggested a 40,000 square feet cap and also thanked the Miami Beach Chamber of Commerce for addressing this issue and bringing it to the attention of the City Commission. She added that she supports giving a credit to developers to appear before land use boards in future appearance, and to find a way calculate how much in fees are they entitled receive in credit. She requested that Ms. Sanchez continue to evaluate the cap amount and if she believes it should be lower to please address it and make the recommendation during the January 2019 City Commission meeting.

Commissioner Samuelian agreed, but would like more information on how much is the credit for, and to allow staff time to do the calculations.

Discussion held regarding direction for City staff.

Mr. Woodruff asked the Committee to reiterate the direction for City staff.

Commissioner Arriola stated that the Committee requests for a comprehensive Cone review with inclination to hire a professional City Planner; it would have to go through a bidding process.

Discussion held.

DIRECTION: Refer as a discussion item to the January 2019 City Commission agenda, the following: 1. A Land Development Code analysis, and include the goals and the right framework to address specific sections of the Code as suggested by Commissioner Samuelian; 2. Provide an amendment to Appendix A of the City Code (fee schedule) to create a per square foot fee cap for historic preservation and design review board applications. The initial cap is recommended to be \$40,000, which is to be evaluated by City staff prior to presenting in case it needs to be lower; 3. Provide a framework for a potential credit for anyone who previously paid a per square foot fee in excess of the cap; 4. Recommend that the City Commission refer the Ordinance Amendment pertaining to Zoning Code and Comprehensive Plan Amendment application fees (closure of the Commissioner loophole) to the Planning Board; 5. Begin an analysis for creating an administrative variance procedure and eliminating redundant variances before the applicable land use boards.

3. DISCUSSION REGARDING G.O. BOND

January 17, 2018 – R9J Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Finance

ACTION

John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer, presented the item. He said Maria Hernandez had to leave for an important meeting. He said for the G.O. Bond implementation the City Manager sent out a memorandum that included the organizational chart that was handed out. We created a working group of 4 people and at any given time they call in other resources from Communications or Resiliency and so on. We are basically about halfway meeting with the different departments regarding all of their projects, after next week they would have completed a good portion of the work and then after that they can get into the fine tuning and a lot of the details. There is a lot of good work being done. They are hoping if the G.O. Bond Oversight Committee is in place in January, then in the latter half of January they can start meeting with them on the sequencing plan so that it is ready for Commission review some time in February or March keeping in mind we won't have the cash in hand and the financing until April. We will try to identify some of those quick wins and things we have talked about and we would do our best to let some of the contracts start before we have the cash in hand.

Commissioner Samuelian asked for clarification on the group of 4 people that are working on this.

John Woodruff said the 4 people are Maria Hernandez, Eric Carpenter, Alex Denis, and himself are the small group that is meeting with each department to quickly work through and identify issues, especially with Procurement to make sure we have a good idea of what the issues are in advance. Sometimes the procurement part for moving along the projects could take the most time depending on what it is. He said we are also spending time on the website and what kind of information we want to feature there and

make it as user-friendly and attractive as possible. He said they are hoping within the next few months they will be able to present to the Committee and the Commission.

Commissioner Samuelian said he likes where we are going with this and he likes the program management structure. They already talked about the 72nd Street project earlier in this meeting. He said given how much time we spent and the great momentum we now have around 5th and Alton he wanted to offer his own view. The pedestrian walkway across 5th Street is a natural connection. He would like to have this front loaded as a high priority. It is very exciting to the community.

Commissioner Alemán agreed with Commissioner Samuelian. The timing makes sense with what is happening there. She also mentioned the projects that got left out of the 1999 Bond.

Eric Carpenter, Assistant City Manager, said the 2 projects that didn't get completed were the La Gorce Neighborhood and the North Shore Neighborhood, La Gorce Island being a subset. The other 2 were City facilities.

Commissioner Alemán mentioned that the Par 3 Community Park be in the first round of projects, the Public Safety Radio System for sure, and 72nd Street. She said she is assuming that for the public works projects like the sidewalks and lighting that we would do them in each batch over time.

Commissioner Samuelian echoed Commissioner Alemán's comment about Par 3.

Commissioner Arriola said he would like to break ground on Par 3 in the Spring.

Eric Carpenter said they are hearing the Committee loud and clear about Par 3 being in the first tranche.

John Woodruff said the information we communicated to the community was that of the \$439 million, that approximately \$150 million would be the first tranche, and every 3 years we would do the next \$100 million and another \$100 million, and then whatever is left. We cannot do the next tranche until the prior tranche gets spent in a material way. We need to get it down to about 90% spent until we can borrow the next money. We can let contracts, but we need to keep an eye on everything.

Commissioner Arriola said when it comes time they will look at it and it could be more than \$150 million in the first tranche depending on the projects.

Commissioner Alemán said she would like to see the draft list of projects and to please get on her calendar to discuss.

Commissioner Arriola said it sounds good to do \$150 or \$100 million for the first tranche, but he said not to do that arbitrarily and that if the projects are priorities and we can do them in a reasonable time and they add up to \$200 million then that is okay.

John Woodruff said for clarification that the amount of the tranches impact the millage rate increases, so he would be really careful about it. He said he suspects once we see the plan we will be in very good shape, he doesn't think it will be a big issue. In the January or February timeframe it should really start coming together.

Eric Carpenter said some of the projects we are going to need to put some front end money because they are going to need to some project development before we can think about awarding a construction contract. The 72nd Street being one of them, there is a lot of upfront work to be done. He said maybe we can put 30% of the soft costs in a project that we think we will take a little bit of development time and then we put the hard construction dollars in a future tranche.

Commissioner Arriola said the public safety projects may be low hanging fruit, but the PAL on the other hand if we wait there is a whole generation of kids that don't get the benefit, so we need to take a close look at this stuff.

Commissioner Samuelian said he wanted to underline the website, he said we did a lot of community engagement and we need to continue that momentum. Even if it is a little bit of an update like that we are in the planning mode. The miss is that the community says well what is going on with the G.O. Bond? He said he sees it and he is happy and he is underlining it, communications is a key success factor here. He said to give the thought with Tonya Daniels and her team that the second the G.O. Bond group is together we need to keep the momentum going.

Commissioner Alemán agreed. We can publish the organizational chart and create a profile about Maria Hernandez how she is so capable, and when the oversight committee is established we can profile them a little bit and publish the schedule of meetings. It would be a great way to engage the community and have them be a part of it on an ongoing basis.

DIRECTION: Come back to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting with an update.

4. UPDATE ON ENERGOV PERMITTING SYSTEM

April 26, 2017– C7 M Information Technology

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting.

5. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE PROJECT BUDGET AND SCOPE OF THE 72ND STREET CIVIC COMPLEX PROJECT

January 17, 2017 – C4 AD Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán Office of Capital Improvement Projects

ACTION

Commissioner Alemán opened the item and gave some background on what this project entails. She said we need to kick this project into gear. She said the only part of this project she wishes was different is the location of the swimming pool. She said we have competitive boys and girls swimming at Miami Beach High and Nautilus Middle School. She said the ideal location for the competition swimming pool to her is at Scott Rakow Youth Center. She would like to see us remove the pool that is currently there and put the competition pool on that footprint because of the proximity to the schools. If we take out a pool and add a pool the annual operating costs are probably close. If we create the pool somewhere else we are adding another set of operating costs. If we can

convince the Central Bayshore neighborhood that is okay to do that she still really regrets that it is not on the table. The next best place to put the pool was on 72nd Street after a lot of analysis and the current criteria is that it is on the roof so that we can maximize green space, it is important to go through the criteria now so that we can really juice this project so that we can get going. We have \$54 million in the G.O. Bond to do this project.

Commissioner Samuelian said it was ranked #1. He is all in to kick into gear the project in the G.O. Bond. Because of the size of this project he believes it has one of the larger operating costs impacts, it is roughly \$2.5 million. He said he went back to the one pager for this project in the G.O. Bond and we made a big case for resiliency; he wants to make sure we deliver on it and particularly on the stormwater piece. He knows we are thinking that but he wanted to underline it. He has some specific thoughts around the library/media center. He would like to just make sure what we are contemplating is done and the way to maximize the engagement with the community and value to the community. There is existing land that will become available where the existing library is; he is not sure where we are in our thought process of what happens and how we are going to approach that. He thinks it is an open issue.

Commissioner Alemán said it is an open issue for the City. She doesn't think we need to know what we are going to do with the beachfront lot before we start on this.

Commissioner Samuelian said we don't have to but as the project is moving it is coming.

Commissioner Alemán said she doesn't want that to slow this project down.

Commissioner Arriola said we cannot shut down the library until we have the other library up and running according to the County. He also said as far as priorities this is at the top of his list getting this project done for many reasons. One of which is that North Beach needs some TLC, this is a major boost to them. He is going to recommend this be one of the top priorities that we do in the City. He said to Commissioner Alemán's idea about the pool, he thinks the Scott Rakow location is a great idea and it benefits the most people. As he understands it, we are going to have some legal issues to address particularly with the BayShore Neighborhood Associations. He knows we need to get some kind of approval and there is a 6/7^{ths} vote from the Commission. He asked what the encroachment would be and how much bigger the Scott Rakow Youth Center's footprint would grow. He asked what the harm is and how many feet into the no fly zone will it go.

Commissioner Alemán said the Committee really respects the neighborhood and they aren't trying to jam anything down anyone's throat and she hopes there can be an intelligent dialogue about this.

David Martinez, Capital Improvement Projects Director, said where we left it was that there needs to be room for a warm up pool. He said his intent was to bring back a status to remind everyone because it had been several months since this was discussed. The last time this project was discussed in June we were directed to go back and talk to the Parks and Recreation Facilities Advisory Board, the people who were working on the Ocean Terrace plan, the memorandum shows the summary of their comments and things that are important to them. He said we also had the discussion about going through the G.O. Bond exercise with the Commission. The memorandum summarizes where we left off in terms of scope.

Commissioner Alemán asked if David Martinez wants to take the Committee through what he has as the criteria right now and if they don't agree they will say so. She said for us to try to make some progress on this thing.

David Martinez said we are in the process of the prioritization phasing of how the G.O. Bond projects will be sequenced. He went through where the Committee left off in June and what the Commission agreed to have on the G.O. Bond scope of work. He went through his list, which includes, the 500 space parking garage with convertibility in the future, reinforcing commercial corridor along 72nd Street, the 5,000-10,000 square foot full blown library was mandatory, an active park which would be the remainder which is approximately 56,000 square feet when you consider the elimination of the skate park on the site, the rooftop community pool with all amenities which included movable bulk heads and movable floor to make it flexible for different uses, in addition to that the rooftop warm up pool and the dimensions are shown in the memorandum, the rooftop community meeting room up to 5.000 square feet, approximately 20.000 square feet of ground floor active liner, which could be any use civic or commercial or whatever is necessary. The adult focus is an upscale fitness gym and a running track and it was discussed at the FCWPC at that time maybe the track should be at ground level as opposed to an elevated track. Lastly, as Commissioner Samuelian reinforced is incorporating the resiliency strategies which were incorporated as part of the G.O. Bond exercise. He talked about the results coming back from the Parks and Recreation Facilities Advisory Board and from the Ocean Terrace Urban Design Plan, he said mostly everything adds up, but they do have a couple of things that they made some additional recommendations on. The scope that he listed before was where the Commission and the FCWPC had left it off the last time.

Commissioner Arriola said we are sticking to all of what David Martinez said except for the pool. He said maybe we should get an assessment of what it would look like at the Scott Rakow Youth Center to make sure it is a viable option as far as space. Also, what the constraints of the legal covenant are that we have with the Bayshore community and then schedule a meeting with them to present this as an alternative.

Commissioner Alemán said she doesn't want to say whether the running track should be elevated or on the ground, she doesn't want to say it has to be in one place or another.

David Martinez said the one item that will start to move forward after the prioritization is the active component the, park use, which will require a lot of feedback. He said right now we have it as an active park, to be determined.

Commissioner Alemán said we are looking to create the baseball quad to the west of this site, she is not looking for it to be an athletic field for a certain type of use, and she wants it to be multipurpose, a greenspace.

Commissioner Arriola and Commissioner Samuelian agreed.

Commissioner Arriola said he wants it to be useful and not to make it for a single purpose, for example, don't just put a baseball or soccer field there.

Commissioner Arriola asked if we were to do a competition swimming pool at the Scott Rakow Youth Center if we have the land mass to do it and what would be entailed there.

John Rebar, Parks and Recreation Director, said when we were looking for a home for this pool we looked at different sites. The Planning Department came up with land massing and he handed out what was put together and it shows what the pool would look like on this site. It has not been looked at by CIP, so it would need to be looked at further. What is not presented on there is a warm up pool, but what is there is the Olympic size swimming pool placed on that site. It looks like it would start to encroach on the banyan tree there, so we would need to take a closer look to see how this would fit on the site.

Commissioner Arriola confirmed that it encroaches a little bit where the Par 3 will be designed. He said it might become a significant issue. If it is a slight encroachment it could be okay, but if it is more than a little he is not sure he wants to go down this path.

John Rebar said that he would want David Martinez and his team to take a closer look because we did gain some more active recreation area as part of Scott Rakow Youth Center as part of the last amendment we made and he would want to consider where that is and then see what spills over beyond that.

Commissioner Samuelian asked when the last in depth dialogue took place around this issue.

John Rebar said most likely at the time of approval of the master plan, over a year ago.

David Martinez said right now that area is in developed plans as a playground in that general vicinity.

Commissioner Arriola said he thinks it was more than a year ago, this location for the swimming pool was never on the table until now.

Commissioner Alemán said she doesn't know if this is the only configuration of a layout. She said hopefully we have built a lot of trust with this neighborhood and they know how committed the Commission is to implementing the Par 3 park in the first tranche of the projects of the G.O. Bond. They also have blessed the Savino Miller plan which is beautiful. They know how serious we are about getting that park done as soon as we can. She still does feel that we are not trying to shove this down their throats at all we are just trying to have a mature community discussion if this will fit here. She asked how long it will take to put together a realistic Scott Rakow Youth Center option that we can show the neighborhood.

David Martinez said the current consultant that we have retained working on the 72nd Street site, in his opinion, wouldn't have the authority to work on that site because of the type of the procurement they have which is working specifically on mixed use garages. He said he would have to engage Savino Miller to look at it and in order to do that he would need an amendment to their contract, which means going back to Commission to bring back the amendment for discussion.

Commissioner Alemán asked if we can just invite them to have a discussion.

David Martinez said yes we can do that.

Commissioner Alemán said Mr. Miller lives there and he will have a gut feeling about whether his neighbors will be open to this at all and if his park design will be able to accommodate these intrusions at all.

Commissioner Arriola said it doesn't hurt to have a discussion about it and then make a decision whether it will work. He asked if it would work on Indian Beach because we did have a discussion about that before.

John Rebar said it fits there, but it is a very busy parking lot outside of a busy park area.

Commissioner Arriola asked if it fits with the warm up pool.

John Rebar said it encroaches into the parking lot and then it would become a parking garage there.

David Martinez said it wasn't as large of a garage.

Commissioner Alemán said we should have a quick conversation with Savino Miller about the things we talked about and depending on whether that looks promising or not issue the revised criteria package, if doesn't go well with the pool at 72nd Street.

Commissioner Arriola said unless there is a 3rd option.

John Rebar said he and David Martinez will sit down and do what they did a few years back.

David Martinez recapped the conversation. He said the priority in terms of the park is 72^{nd} Street and reevaluate as necessary the swimming pool situation once we get things rolling and we get the G.O. Bond going.

Commissioner Samuelian asked once we sort through the priorities he asked what the next block of work would be for this project.

David Martinez said currently the consultant we have engaged is a consultant that is prepared to put together a design criteria package to further the project, which means that once it is fully scoped and we know exactly what we are asking he would compile the documents necessary for a design builder to issue their proposal to design and construct it.

Commissioner Alemán asked if we would accept a turnkey proposal or are we only looking at us issuing a design build.

David Martinez said currently we are only looking at a design build project if we go the other route it becomes a private, public, partnership which would be an RFP and it would be a different delivery. At that point someone would be looking at it like what it is in it for them, but that would be a different discussion and a whole different delivery on the project.

Commissioner Arriola said he looks at this as a civic center and he likes P3's, but among the many things that appeal to him about this project is the retail that we control,

in his mind it will allow us to protect mom and pop shops. If we turn it over to a private entity they are going to go for the highest rent they can. He would love for city owned property to curate art galleries or mom and pops that cannot afford rents for a long term home. So much of this project is civic in nature, he can be persuaded to go the P3 route, but he would have to see what the losses would be to us to do it that way.

Commissioner Samuelian said he is leaning towards the design build, once we have made the big scope decisions; he really wants to engage the community. More opportunity to community engagement leads him to the current path.

DIRECTION: Have a conversation with Savino Miller about the swimming pool and report back to the Committee. Make the 72nd Street project a priority in the G.O. Bond implementation process and reevaluate as necessary the swimming pool situation once things get rolling and the G.O. Bond going gets going.

NEW BUSINESS

DISCUSSION REGARDING THE PRODUCTION INDUSTRY COUNCIL MOTION TO PROMOTE A CAMPAIGN HIGHLIGHTING THE RETURN OF THE FILM PRODUCTION INDUSTRY TO MIAMI BEACH November 14, 2018 – C4 E

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development

ACTION

Commissioner Samuelian presented the item. He said we all know the Production Industry Council is very important and dedicated \$100,000 for funding and incentives. He put this on as a referral to this Committee based on a specific motion that we saw from our resident committee. His personal view is that if the committee puts something on an agenda, we should at least have a conversation. The gist of the conversation is that this is an important industry for us, that the GMCVB is doing some marketing already and we want to make sure that Miami Beach is tied into it as best as possible and that the good work being done on Miami Beach is highlighted.

Bruce Orosz, Co-Production Industry Council and Chair of the GMCVB, spoke. He said if we consider the production industry being television and film has done for this community over the past 50 plus years dating back to the Jackie Gleason days, this is bedrock and it is part of the foundation and part of the sophistication that has developed and evolved in Miami Beach. This industry is the unspoken marketing that happens around the world, thanks to great projects that have brought, produced, and shot made to happen on Miami Beach. Miami Beach has over the years been recognized through shows that have continued to run like Miami Vice. It brings immediate and disposable income through our City in all different channels. It impacts every single aspect of this community. In their opinion from the GMCVB and the PIC, they have formed a nice unified team and working in an effort to make sure that the message that gets out to the world globally is the same, that we want film production in our community. The GMCVB has decided and embarked on a tremendous campaign with everyone's consideration to help the evolution of the conversation to the community. They have done ads and will be looking for testimonials from producers that have shot in Miami Beach and Miami-Dade County. They are starting with NAPTE that is a huge conference here; they bring 6,000-8,000 into our community for the 5 days. They are also going to Sundance; they

are traveling around the globe to promote one message and one voice. They would like the point people in the Communications Department and Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development to work with the GMCVB closely so they can have a quick rapid response on social media. It has to be people that understand the industry so that if someone has a question or a need it can be responded to. The GMCVB is willing to house this and own it, but they will need partnerships that will be able to feed the content and the information to the GMCVB and to Sandy Lighterman who runs the Film Commission downtown.

Commissioner Samuelian confirmed that Mr. Orosz is requesting some sort of liaison from the City of Miami Beach from what good stuff that is happening in the field relating to the production industry and channeling to the GMCVB so that we speak with a single voice. He asked if Heather Shaw and Melissa Berthier are okay with this from their departments' point of view.

Heather Shaw, Acting Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development Director, said they are working in collaboration with the GMCVB and PIC to make sure we have the collaborative effort. The fourth partner is Sandy Lighterman. She said they agree with making sure that we have the resources and agree to channel the resources to the GMCVB and work with them to have one consistent message. She brought the GMCVB plan and a number of articles that support what Mr. Orosz was saying.

Commissioner Steinberg asked if she understands that the GMCVB is running point because they are the marketing arm and we are just basically making sure we are sharing information. Mr. Orosz confirmed. Commissioner Steinberg said she is okay with that.

Mr. Orosz said the ask is for the collaboration for the City of Miami Beach to figure out when the new Film and Production Manager position gets filled that they become the point person to assist the GMCVB with getting the information back and forth, so there is a good information sharing process.

Commissioner Samuelian suggested to get an update on 90 days to see how this is going.

Commissioner Arriola mentioned that the State of Georgia has been very successful in film production. He suggested studying what Georgia did to be so successful and maybe help lobby the State of Florida and maybe copy Georgia at a micro level some of those things here locally.

Mr. Orosz said Georgia came up with an incredible incentive like we used to have. Miami-Dade County has an incentive, small, but positive. Miami Beach has an incentive, North Miami Beach is coming up with an incentive and they can be bundled. This is an important message because of perception, which is very important in this regard. With the State of Florida, we are starting to see that tax watch came up with an opinion that the tax incentive is a very good tool to bring economic energy to our State. It is very good because is a very highly regarded division within Tallahassee. The new Governor DeSantis said he didn't leave the door closed and is open to discussion. He said they are trying anyway, but we should also try to reengage at the state level and see how we can bring back the incentive. Commissioner Steinberg said she wouldn't wait until next session if all of Miami-Dade County and the GMCVB gets together and have other cities and counties up the coast get together and go to Tallahassee.

Mr. Orosz said they are actively pushing this already. They recognize the importance because half of their crews are fleeing to Georgia.

DIRECTION: Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development and Communications to work with the GMCVB and provide resources to help with the effort of the industry.

7. DISCUSSION ON THE CONE OF SILENCE ORDINANCE

November 14, 2018 – C4 R Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Procurement/Office of the City Attorney

<u>ACTION</u>

Alex Denis, Procurement Director, presented the item. He said that this item is a result from an email they received, which is attached to the agenda item.

Rafael Paz, First Assistant City Attorney, said this is the Cone of Silence ordinance that a lawyer Mr. Tachmes made a suggestion and as the Committee adopts procurement recommendations to change the Cone to consider changing the ordinance for the Cone to terminate earlier. The Cone of silence is a code of conduct that governs the conduct of communications between lawyers and lobbyists and vendors with City staff including evaluation committees, the City Manager and his staff and the Mayor and Commissioners. Right now the Cone terminates not only when the City Manager makes his recommendation to the City Commission in an agenda, but when the City Commission actually awards the procurement. In other jurisdictions the Cone terminates earlier. We have a broad exception in the Cone when the Cone of silence does not apply at all to written communications, provided that you copy the City Clerk. We are not precluding all communications, just regulating verbal communications outside of public hearings or in the public records context. Because this is in chapter 2 and it is a Cone of conduct ordinance, our charter in section 1.15 provides that any Cone of conduct ordinance that is lessened has to go out to the voters and be approved by the majority of the voters in a citywide referendum. If the recommendation is to make the changes today and we take the recommendation to Commission the ordinance can be developed, but right now the next election would be November 2019.

Commissioner Alemán asked what problems we are trying to solve and would like some recent examples provided.

Alex Denis said he is not aware of any besides the email that is attached to the item. There were no specific problems cited and he personally doesn't know of any.

Commissioner Arriola said he recalls the most recent one was back in the Fall with the digital kiosk.

Rafael Paz said in that instance the procurement terminated when the Commission recommended 2 bidders for final consideration and then at that point the procurement was over and vendors and lobbyists were free to conduct any and all communications, which is similar to what is being proposed here. The feedback we got from that

procurement from individual commissioners was that they didn't want to be bombarded by constant communications without having the structure that the Cone of Silence ordinance provides. That would be an instance that would recommend against making a change to the ordinance.

Commissioner Arriola said in that situation none of the commissioners could weigh in or get additional information, but they were asked at the end of the day to confirm the City Manager's recommendation. They are not in a position to decide that day because they are at a disadvantage. He said we spend months after getting the information needed. It is a matter of preference.

Alex Denis said Miami-Dade County and City of Miami's Cone terminates at the time of award recommendation. We are the only jurisdiction that he knows of in Miami-Dade County that has it like this. Broward County's Cone is like ours and so is City of Hollywood's.

Commissioner Arriola said none of us enjoy being bombarded, but it is part of our job whether it is by vendors or residents. It is better to make decisions with access to information. His preference would be that we want to have the best procurements as possible and the free flow of information is an important part of that process. It is possibly more work for the Commissioners, but if it leads to better outcomes he would advocate giving the opportunity to hear people's appeals. He said they can always say no and not listen if they want.

Commissioner Samuelian asked if we have any feedback from the vendor community. He asked if they are asking for more access.

Alex Denis said that this is not something he is hearing from the vendors.

Commissioner Samuelian asked if the Administration either has a recommendation and/or strong pros and cons that would help inform the Committee.

Alex Denis said there is no state provision for the Cone of Silence; it is something local governments do on their own.

Commissioner Alemán said her concern with this is that the vendors will treat this as an opportunity to shift the real negotiations away from the Director of Procurement and the City Manager and towards the Commissioners. That is not a burden she would like see shifting to the Commissioners. She said they would go through the procurement process, but save some information and propose them outside of the Sunshine to the Commissioners right before the meeting. She thinks it tips the procurement process in a way that makes her uncomfortable. It really takes the authority out and away from Procurement and they are professionally trained for this. She doesn't like the shift and doesn't like that it is outside of the Sunshine.

Commissioner Alemán read an excerpt from Mr. Tachmes' email about bidders. She said the bidder can put whatever they want in writing and send it to the City Clerk and then everyone gets it and it is in the Sunshine.

Alex Denis said we get very few bid protests.

Commissioner Steinberg said from the get-go she is not in favor of going this route. She said we have hired expertise that does their job. She doesn't want to water down our code of conduct.

Commissioner Arriola said he doesn't think it is watering down our Cone of conduct, but he is curious to see if this would lead to better procurements. He said we have a great City Manager, but he wants to make sure people have the avenue to speak to the Commissioners if there is funny business going on.

Commissioner Alemán said we have a great Commission and are very experienced with Procurement, but that is not always the case. She is not sure what this is fixing and if we could cause other problems. We do have the IG coming and if anyone at any point smells funny business, anyone can queue up an analysis for that person.

Commissioner Arriola said he thinks as elected officials people should be able to lobby them and if we don't want the meetings we can always say no. He would encourage his colleagues to give this some thought, because he has seen injustice occur with some vendors. We are criticized for not getting competitive bids and if we want to improve our procurement process, this is one of the tools we should look at.

Commissioner Samuelian said he came open minded for this discussion. He said he does like Commissioner Alemán's point of the fact that the Inspector General is coming and if vendors feel troubled they could have this other outlet. He said if this is an idea that we continue to pursue, given that procurement is a key focus of the Inspector General, as that individual learns a bit more and suggests a better process and encourages the Commission to open the door, it would move him pretty quickly.

Commissioner Arriola said he just wanted to speak from experience.

Commissioner Alemán suggested putting this item on hold until the Inspector General is up and running and then pose it as a question if our model is the best or if we can improve it.

Commissioner Steinberg said Commissioner Arriola isn't wrong when he says this is not a perfect system and they have been discussing for 4 years what we can do to expand on it. That is why our Procurement Director went out and did a survey. There are some really great recommendations that will move the needle without opening up the process that may make people feel uncomfortable like her included, that we can see how the needle moves. This was direct feedback from an entire community that not only do business with our City, but all over. There was a recurring theme, but this was not it.

Commissioner Arriola said as he sits here, he received 3 different text messages from lobbyists that asked to remove this law.

Commissioner Samuelian said to recap, that we have the Inspector General coming, we are going to start tabling some ideas, and maybe we tee up this specific question and will revisit it with the Inspector General.

DIRECTION: Put this item on hold until the Inspector General comes on.

8. DISCUSSION ON EVALUATION COMMITTEES FOR CITY EMPLOYEES FOR CITY COMPETITIVE SOLICITATIONS

November 14, 2018 – C4 S Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Procurement/Office of the City Manager

ACTION

Alex Denis, Procurement Director presented the item. He said there is no state law or City policy or Cone. By practice in the City of Mimi Beach, the City Manager has always appointed the evaluation committee members and noticed the Commission by Letter to Commission (LTC). He made an important distinction between our city and others, we have evaluation committees and other cities have selection committees. We have an evaluation committee that provides information to the City Manager who does his due diligence and makes award recommendations. In other places the results of selection committee results goes straight to Commission, there is none of that due diligence by the CEO.

Commissioner Arriola said the issue in his mind is how the evaluation committees are structured. He has been on many and presented to many. Too frequently for his liking, the people on the evaluation committee have no business being on there. The evaluation committees carry a lot of weight. What he would like to do and maybe we can give this to the Inspector General as well, how we can put together a better structure. He said there are instances where the Director is put on the committee and then it is passed down to a lower person because they cannot make it and it is not successful. His recommendation is to look at the people that sit on these committees and the training they get to evaluate.

Alex Denis said the City Manager appoints the evaluation committee members. He said when the RFP goes to issuance to the Commission it already has the committee on there, there are also alternates listed on there if an appointed person cannot participate. This change has been done in the last few months. Prior to this an LTC would be sent out with the members.

Commissioner Samuelian said this is important and if we can do better we should. Training is always a good idea, he is comfortable with that. He asked if Alex Denis had any additional thoughts to potential improvements.

Alex Denis said as we train internal staff, Directors, Assistant Directors, etc, we provide several trainings a year, we cannot do that with outside people, and it is very difficult.

Commissioner Arriola said this is something they can give to the Inspector General to opine on, but his recommendation is that this is not something that when the City Manager appoints someone he signs off on who will actually sit on the evaluation committee and that if there is going to be a delegation of that duty that the City Manager authorizes that delegation.

Alex Denis said if it goes outside of the people that we name to the Commission, they will get notified through an LTC.

Discussion continued.

Commissioner Arriola said he was open to changing the Cone of Silence and opening the window because you get run away evaluation committees that penalize someone that should have been an awarded a contract and they cannot talk to anyone, only though writing. He said that is a problem. He would encourage the Administration to reconsider opening a window with that avenue.

Commissioner Steinberg said going back to the Cone of Silence, we cannot try something else out because it triggers a referendum. She said it lowers down the cone of conduct because it is triggering to go as a referendum. She does believe firmly that if a person is not willing to put something in writing and only in person then they are not willing to stand behind it in writing. Writing is a public record. She believes it has worked. She believes the Inspector General should look at this if her colleagues feel strongly about this. She said while the City Manager makes a recommendation on the evaluation committee, it is still ultimately the Commission's decision. She said they want to empower the City Manager and staff's recommendation, but there are occasions when the Commission feels that after hearing the presentation, they feel slightly different.

The Committee would like to add the topic of the evaluation committees to the Inspector General's list.

DIRECTION: Add the topic of the evaluation committees to the Inspector Generals' list of things to look into.

DEFERRED ITEMS

9. DISCUSSION ON THE STORMWATER UTILITY RATES Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting.

10. DISCUSSION TO REVIEW THE CITY'S FORTHCOMING STORMWATER MANAGEMENT BUDGET AS WELL AS RELATED UTILITIES, ABOVE GROUND, AND OTHER ASSOCIATED COSTS September 12, 2018 – C4 G Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Samuelian Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer until update on the stormwater program has been provided from Johnson Controls.

11. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE PARKING GARAGE/RETAIL DEVELOPMENT PROPOSAL, INVOLVING CITY-OWNED PARKING LOTS IN NORTH BEACH, SUBMITTED BY NORTH BEACH TOWN CENTER DEVELOPMENT, LLC, AN AFFILIATE OF PACIFIC STAR CAPITAL, LLC April 11, 2018 – R7 A Office of the City Manager/Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending economic impact study and update proposal by developer.

12. DISCUSSION TO CONSIDER REVISING THE "SPECIAL EVENT REQUIREMENTS AND GUIDELINES", BY AMENDING THE FOLLOWING SECTIONS: "MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS," "EXTERNAL REVIEW PROCEDURE," "BOOKING POLICY," "USE OF PUBLIC PROPERTY," "SPECIAL EVENT FEE SCHEDULE, AND "SPECIAL EVENT CLASS MATRIX", HEREBY PERMITTING AND RESTRICTING FURTHER USES ON PUBLIC PROPERTY AND RECONCILING SPECIAL EVENT FEES TO MATCH RECENT INCREASES ASSOCIATED WITH OTHER PUBLIC RENTAL USES October 18, 2017 – C4 F

Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting.

13. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE REVIEW OF CITY STREETS THAT NEED TO BE FIXED

October 17, 2018 – R9 Z Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán and Commissioner Samuelian Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer until CIP's Prairie Avenue Project is completed (approximately end of December). Public Work to bring back the item with an analysis of remaining streets that need fixing for further direction.

14. DISCUSSION ON THE PROPOSED MOBILITY FEE PROGRAM

July 25, 2018 – C4 U Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán Transportation

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting.

15. DISCUSSION REGARDING ESTABLISHING A PILOT PROGRAM FOR DOCKED ELECTRIC ASSISTED BICYCLE SHARING SERVICES October 17, 2018 – C4 J

Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Transportation

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the February 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending further discussion at the NCAC meeting.

16. DISCUSSION ON ACTIVATING VACANT STOREFRONTS INCLUDING THE PURCHASE OF NEW COVERS AND EXPLORING NEW DESIGNS THAT REFLECT NORTH BEACH, MID-BEACH, AND SOUTH BEACH AND IDENTIFYING FUNDS FOR THE PURCHASE

April 11, 2018 – C4 J Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola and Co-sponsored by Vice-Mayor Samuelian Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting.

17. DISCUSS ENGAGING IN A PILOT WITH CAMINO PERMITTING SOFTWARE

September 12, 2018 – C4 N Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Building/Information Technology

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the March 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending the issuance of an RFP and the continued studying of the City's processes.

18. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE RECYCLING FEE AND BACKYARD SERVICE COST

September 12, 2018 – R5 M Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting.

19. DISCUSSION REGARDING ESTABLISHING A HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND

April 11, 2018 – C4 O Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Finance/Planning

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending LUDC discussion.

20. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE FINANCIAL IMPACT OF MAINTAINING TREES LOCATED IN THE SWALE

May 16, 2018 – C4 AA Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending pilot study on sites and potential funding.

21. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE FUTURE USE OF THE CORAL ROCK HOUSE, CONSISTING OF APPROXIMATELY 1,307 SQUARE FEET, LOCATED AT 1701 NORMANDY DRIVE April 11, 2018 – C4 A Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending response from UNIDAD.

22. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE COSTS RELATED TO HAVING MIAMI BEACH COMMIT TO ENSURING THAT ALL GOVERNMENT BUILDINGS WILL BE POWERED BY 100% RENEWABLE ELECTRICITY May 17, 2017 – R9 AB Sponsored by Commissioner Rosen Gonzalez Environment & Sustainability/Property Management

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to a future FCWPC meeting, pending Sustainability and Resiliency Committee direction.

23. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE BIGBELLY PROGRAM AND POTENTIAL WAYS TO SUBSIDIZE ITS COST

October 17, 2018 – C4 I Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to a future FCWPC meeting until meeting with BigBelly and Public Works has taken place.

24. QUARTERLY REPORT TO THE FINANCE AND CITYWIDE PROJECTS COMMITTEE FOR DISCUSSION REGARDING THE REVIEW OF THE BEACH EXPRESS NORTH BUS EXPRESS RAPID TRANSIT (BERT) DEMONSTRATION PROJECT May 16, 2018 – C4 R Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Samuelian Transportation

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending quarterly report from Miami-Dade County on the progress of the new BERT service.

25. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE MIAMI BEACH ROWING CLUB LEASE

June 6, 2018 – C4 E Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development/ Office of the City Attorney

<u>ACTION</u>

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending discussions with Miami Beach Rowing Club.

26. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE ANNEXATION OF NORTH BAY VILLAGE, AND TO REVIEW PROPERTY TAXES, ECONOMIC IMPACT, AND VALUE September 12, 2018 – R9 E Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola Office of the City Attorney

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting after obtaining feedback.

27. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE ANNEXATION OF THE WESTERNMOST ISLANDS OF THE VENETIAN ISLANDS AND MAKING THEM A PART OF MIAMI BEACH, AND TO REVIEW PROPERTY TAXES, ECONOMIC IMPACT, AND VALUE September 12, 2018 – R9 F Sponsored by Commissioner Góngora Office of the City Attorney

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting after obtaining feedback.

ADDENDUM

28. DISCUSS THE DESIGN AND PLAN CONCPT FOR THE OCEAN TERRACE NEIGHBORHOOD URBAN DESIGN PLAN BY THE CORRADINO GROUP FOR PRIORITIZATION AND POTENTIAL FUNDING OPTIONS December 12, 2018 – C7 AE Tourism, Culture, and Economic Development

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the January 2019 FCWPC meeting.

29. DISCUSSION AND UPDATE ON THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH INTELLIGENT TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM AND SMART PARKING SYSTEM PROJECT December 12, 2018 – C4 G Transportation

ACTION

Jose Gonzalez, Transportation Director, presented the item. He said the purpose of this item is to provide an update on the Intelligent Transportation System and Smart Parking System Project and in particular to present as strategy that they hope will fully fund the operations and maintenance for the duration of the project. He introduced Josiel Ferrer Diaz, Assistant Transportation Director.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz, Assistant Transportation Director, went through the presentation and explained that this project has been in the works for some time. The presentation can

be made available. He said they do the community satisfaction survey and traffic is one of the items that the community is most unhappy about. He gave some Commission action background that is in the presentation. He explained the current traffic management plan. He went over the Intelligent Transportation System and the details of the new state of the art system. He said this would improve work zone management and clear incidents a little bit quicker and inform motorists a lot quicker.

Discussion was held regarding the current technology.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz explained the technology, for example, how they piloted with cell phones along with working with police, etc.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz spoke about how traffic conditions are still a problem for the community.

Commissioner Alemán said if the transit times have improved and it is material on some corridors, she thinks we should tell the public about the good work. If we have been able to gain progress, the public would be encouraged with the results.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz would be happy to put out an LTC about that.

Commissioner Samuelian mentioned the 2016 Community Satisfaction survey and we are looking to put out the one for 2019 and if that is moving the needle we are looking for the results that indicate that.

Kathie Brooks, Assistant City Manager said unfortunately with the work on the MacArthur Causeway occurring just before that we probably wouldn't see that improvement, which is the most recent condition.

Commissioner Alemán asked if we can package up the date analysis about the transit times.

Kathie Brooks said we can do something with Communications.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz continued with the presentation and spoke about the Traffic Management Center. He also spoke about the Smart Parking System.

Commissioner Alemán liked the sign on the right in the presentation slide because if the garage is full it would direct you to another garage that has available parking.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz continued with the presentation and spoke about Corridor Phasing, including phases 1 and 2 and also phases 3-6. We would be able to deploy the entire project as far as design and construction is concerned.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz also went through the details of the ITS/SPS project details. We would be enhancing the corridors significantly.

Commissioner Alemán asked about the order of the corridors in the prioritization. She would much rather the priority be the residents getting to work rather than near the convention center and getting home to their families at the end of the day.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz said the other main corridors are covered under the different phases and they are listed in the powerpoint presentation.

Commissioner Alemán asked about the green line on the map and which phase it is in.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz said it is in phase 5; it can be pushed up to a sooner phase. It encompasses how the North Beach residents travel.

Commissioner Alemán does like that the Causeways are a priority though.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz spoke about the design and construction and the funding. He said in phases 1 and 2 they were able to lower the design and construction costs by 43.1%.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz spoke about operations and maintenance and spoke about the strategy to follow for the next fiscal year and beyond, so there will be no budget amendment this year. The strategy was developed to try and fund the gap.

Kathie Brooks said that the operating dollars have a gap, the capital dollars are fully funded. The \$600,000 that we have this year if we give the go ahead on the contract, some of those improvements start coming online this year, so we do have incremental funding needs this year, but that is fully budgeted. In addition, next year because we got the grant from the State for the South Beach Local of \$1.25 million, which will reduce the trolley costs next year, for fiscal year 2019/2020 we have only a very small gap that we would need to address. It is the years beyond that we really want to make sure that we have a strategy that the Committee approves for. Once they get the go ahead they can enter into the contract, they don't want to do that unless the Committee is comfortable.

Commissioner Arriola said besides sea level rise, traffic is a main priority.

Kathie Brooks said that something important to mention is that we have very limited ability to do things where vehicle traffic is concerned. We have some things that are being worked out, but this is probably the biggest bang for buck that we are going to get for vehicles.

Commissioner Arriola asked what is being asked and if the Administration is asking for commitment from the Committee to fund this for the coming years.

Kathie Brooks said that we get funding from resort taxes, from PTP, the citizen's trust, and from parking. She explained on the next slide which is a potential to use additional parking funds to fund that \$1 million gap.

Commissioner Arriola confirmed that a portion of the convention center hotel funds are for traffic mitigation.

Kathie Brooks confirmed. She also said there is a possibility we may be eligible for additional grants for the South Beach Local in coming years and we can apply and we not need any of these funds, but it is not something we can bank on. With the changes we have done in Parking they are looking to throw off about \$6 million a year. \$1.15 million already goes to transportation, there is a current transfer this year to the general fund for \$1.17 million, but the goal is to go to \$0 next year. They do recommend that at least \$3 million is set aside for renewal and replacement for parking lots and garages. It

leaves about \$1.15 million and they need about \$1.1 million which is cutting it pretty close. She said they recommend continuing the trolley advertising pilot and some portion of that be determined through the budget process to go towards this and the rest from the parking funds.

Commissioner Arriola said he hasn't hear anything negative about the advertising in the trolleys.

Commissioner Samuelian said there are very muted reactions, but he did hear from someone. He is comfortable with this.

Kathie Brooks said it could end up being half trolleys and \$500,000 from the parking fund, but they will work through the budget process depending if we may need to use some of those trolley funds from the general fund. They are recommending we continue with the trolley advertising pilot and leaving some surplus in the parking fund.

Commissioner Alemán moved the entire recommendation from the Administration on the discussion. Commissioner Samuelian seconded.

Commissioner Samuelian said he liked Commissioner Alemán's suggestion on communicating what we have done thus far. Also, ongoing measurement and keep them posted by LTC or something else, this is a big program. He asked in regards to the technology if new technology is emerging if we are exploring other solutions.

Josiel Ferrer Diaz said this is a project where we are working with a very recognized firm that works with FDOT and if new technology does come about and it actually has come about through the negotiations process and saved us some money. We will be open to new technology as it comes along.

The Committee praised the great work.

John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer, pointed out that this is an example of a capital project that has a significant operating impact and this is the kind of the discussion that we probably need to have so that when we are looking ahead to a facility opening that all eyes are wide open to know what it will take to fund something. Especially if we get ambitious with more than one big program coming online at the same time, what it means is no new programs for at least a year or so until we absorb costs.

Commissioner Arriola wanted the record to reflect that the exact same number of items were discussed at the NCAC and FCWPC, so it is not true that more items are referred to the FCWPC more so than the NCAC.

MOTION: Commissioner Alemán moved to approve Administration's recommendation as is. Commissioner Samuelian seconded. All in favor.