

MIAMI BEACH

PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Staff Report & Recommendation

Design Review Board

TO: DRB Chairperson and Members

DATE: October 02, 2018

FROM: Thomas R. Mooney, AICP
Planning Director



SUBJECT: DRB18-0270
Bus Shelters - Citywide

The applicant, the City of Miami Beach, is requesting Design Review Approval for installation of new bus shelters in various locations throughout the city.

Recommendation:

Approval with conditions

BACKGROUND:

In October of 2001, an agreement between the City and Clear Channel was executed for Clear Channel to construct, operate and maintain bus shelter structures and associated street furniture within the public right-of-way throughout the City. The agreement provides for commercial advertising on the bus shelter and revenue sharing with the City.

At the December 09, 2015 City Commission meeting, the Commission discussed the need to improve the existing bus shelter design and the desire for bus shelters to include enhancements that promote transit ridership.

On March 09, 2016, the City Commission adopted a resolution accepting the recommendation of the Finance and Citywide Projects Committee (FCWPC) to issue a Request for Proposals for the design of new bus shelters. At the following Commission meeting, on April 13, 2016, the City Commission approved the issuance of a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for Architectural and Engineering Design Criteria Professional Services for the new bus shelter design. The ACAI Associates team, which includes the premier design firm of Pininfarina, was contracted by the City on July 19, 2017 for the design of the new "iconic" bus shelters.

The design team generated four (4) preliminary concepts for the bus shelters that were reviewed and narrowed down to two (2) design concepts for recommendation by the Finance and Citywide Projects Committee (FCWPC) at its December 13, 2017 meeting, and later approved for further development by the City Commission at its January 17, 2018 meeting.

The two final shelter concepts were presented at West Avenue Neighborhood Association and Middle Beach Neighborhood Association in early February of this year and both concepts received similar number of favorable votes.

Ultimately, at the March 07, 2018 City Commission Meeting, the City Commission selected the primary design concept for further design development. Once the design process is completed, the City will procure a new contractor to fabricate, install, operate, and maintain the new bus

shelters in the City, including advertising components.

HISTORY:

On July 03, 2018, the Design Review Board (DRB) reviewed the proposed design for the City Wide Bus Shelters and a motion was made and approved by the Board to continue the application to the October 02, 2018 meeting to address design concerns with specific direction to some fundamental elements. Subsequently, the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) reviewed the project at its July 10, 2018 meeting and also, continued the application to its October HPB meeting to address design comments.

THE PROJECT:

The applicant has submitted supplemental plans and renderings entitled "City of Miami Beach Final Submittal Bus Shelters" by ACAI / Pininfarina dated August 24, 2018.

COMPLIANCE WITH ZONING CODE:

A preliminary review of the project indicates that the application, as proposed, appears to be consistent with the City Code. The above noted comments shall not be considered final zoning review or approval. These and all zoning matters shall require final review and verification by the Zoning Administrator prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.

COMPLIANCE WITH DESIGN REVIEW CRITERIA:

Design Review encompasses the examination of architectural drawings for consistency with the criteria stated below with regard to the aesthetics, appearances, safety, and function of the structure or proposed structures in relation to the site, adjacent structures and surrounding community. Staff recommends that the following criteria is found to be satisfied, not satisfied or not applicable, as hereto indicated:

1. The existing and proposed conditions of the lot, including but not necessarily limited to topography, vegetation, trees, drainage, and waterways.
Satisfied
2. The location of all existing and proposed buildings, drives, parking spaces, walkways, means of ingress and egress, drainage facilities, utility services, landscaping structures, signs, and lighting and screening devices.
Satisfied
3. The dimensions of all buildings, structures, setbacks, parking spaces, floor area ratio, height, lot coverage and any other information that may be reasonably necessary to determine compliance with the requirements of the underlying zoning district, and any applicable overlays, for a particular application or project.
Satisfied
4. The color, design, selection of landscape materials and architectural elements of Exterior Building surfaces and primary public interior areas for Developments requiring a Building Permit in areas of the City identified in section 118-252.
Satisfied

5. The proposed site plan, and the location, appearance and design of new and existing Buildings and Structures are in conformity with the standards of this Ordinance and other applicable ordinances, architectural and design guidelines as adopted and amended periodically by the Design Review Board and Historic Preservation Boards, and all pertinent master plans.
Satisfied
6. The proposed Structure, and/or additions or modifications to an existing structure, indicates a sensitivity to and is compatible with the environment and adjacent Structures, and enhances the appearance of the surrounding properties.
Satisfied
7. The design and layout of the proposed site plan, as well as all new and existing buildings shall be reviewed so as to provide an efficient arrangement of land uses. Particular attention shall be given to safety, crime prevention and fire protection, relationship to the surrounding neighborhood, impact on contiguous and adjacent Buildings and lands, pedestrian sight lines and view corridors.
Satisfied
8. Pedestrian and vehicular traffic movement within and adjacent to the site shall be reviewed to ensure that clearly defined, segregated pedestrian access to the site and all buildings is provided for and that all parking spaces are usable and are safely and conveniently arranged; pedestrian furniture and bike racks shall be considered. Access to the Site from adjacent roads shall be designed so as to interfere as little as possible with traffic flow on these roads and to permit vehicles a rapid and safe ingress and egress to the Site.
Not Applicable
9. Lighting shall be reviewed to ensure safe movement of persons and vehicles and reflection on public property for security purposes and to minimize glare and reflection on adjacent properties. Lighting shall be reviewed to assure that it enhances the appearance of structures at night.
Satisfied
10. Landscape and paving materials shall be reviewed to ensure an adequate relationship with and enhancement of the overall Site Plan design.
Satisfied
11. Buffering materials shall be reviewed to ensure that headlights of vehicles, noise, and light from structures are adequately shielded from public view, adjacent properties and pedestrian areas.
Satisfied
12. The proposed structure has an orientation and massing which is sensitive to and compatible with the building site and surrounding area and which creates or maintains important view corridor(s).
Satisfied

13. The building has, where feasible, space in that part of the ground floor fronting a street or streets which is to be occupied for residential or commercial uses; likewise, the upper floors of the pedestal portion of the proposed building fronting a street, or streets shall have residential or commercial spaces, shall have the appearance of being a residential or commercial space or shall have an architectural treatment which shall buffer the appearance of the parking structure from the surrounding area and is integrated with the overall appearance of the project.
Not Applicable
14. The building shall have an appropriate and fully integrated rooftop architectural treatment which substantially screens all mechanical equipment, stairs and elevator towers.
Not Applicable
15. An addition on a building site shall be designed, sited and massed in a manner which is sensitive to and compatible with the existing improvement(s).
Not Applicable
16. All portions of a project fronting a street or sidewalk shall incorporate an architecturally appropriate amount of transparency at the first level in order to achieve pedestrian compatibility and adequate visual interest.
Not Applicable
17. The location, design, screening and buffering of all required service bays, delivery bays, trash and refuse receptacles, as well as trash rooms shall be arranged so as to have a minimal impact on adjacent properties.
Not Applicable
18. In addition to the foregoing criteria, subsection [118-]104(6)(t) of the city Code shall apply to the design review board's review of any proposal to place, construct, modify or maintain a wireless communications facility or other over the air radio transmission or radio reception facility in the public rights-of-way.
Not Applicable
19. The structure and site complies with the sea level rise and resiliency review criteria in Chapter 133, Article II, as applicable.
Not Satisfied; see below

COMPLIANCE WITH SEA LEVEL RISE AND RESILIENCY REVIEW CRITERIA

Section 133-50(a) of the Land Development establishes review criteria for sea level rise and resiliency that must be considered as part of the review process for board orders. The following is an analysis of the request based upon these criteria:

- (1) A recycling or salvage plan for partial or total demolition shall be provided.
Not Satisfied
A recycling plan shall be provided as part of the submittal for a demolition/building permit to the building department.
- (2) Windows that are proposed to be replaced shall be hurricane proof impact windows.

Not Applicable

- (3) Where feasible and appropriate, passive cooling systems, such as operable windows, shall be provided.

Not Applicable

- (4) Whether resilient landscaping (salt tolerant, highly water-absorbent, native or Florida friendly plants) will be provided.

Not Applicable

- (5) Whether adopted sea level rise projections in the Southeast Florida Regional Climate Action Plan, as may be revised from time-to-time by the Southeast Florida Regional Climate Change Compact, including a study of land elevation and elevation of surrounding properties were considered.

Not Satisfied

Sea Level Rise projections were not taken into account.

- (6) The ground floor, driveways, and garage ramping for new construction shall be adaptable to the raising of public rights-of-ways and adjacent land.

Not Applicable

- (7) Where feasible and appropriate, all critical mechanical and electrical systems shall be located above base flood elevation.

Satisfied

- (8) Existing buildings shall be, where reasonably feasible and appropriate, elevated to the base flood elevation.

Not Applicable

- (9) When habitable space is located below the base flood elevation plus City of Miami Beach Freeboard, wet or dry flood proofing systems will be provided in accordance with Chapter of 54 of the City Code.

Not Applicable

- (10) Where feasible and appropriate, water retention systems shall be provided.

Not Satisfied

STAFF ANALYSIS:

The Department of Transportation submitted an application to the Design Review Board seeking approval for the design of a bus shelter prototype to replace the existing bus shelters at various sites throughout the City of Miami Beach. At the December 09, 2015 City Commission meeting, the Commission discussed the need to improve the existing bus shelters and to include enhancements that would promote transit. The Transportation Department has noted that the existing shelters have several deficiencies that include minimal protection from the elements, high cost of installation/removal, incompatible with technologies for Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) and Real-Time Transit Information, insufficient number of facilities that do not meet the transit demand for the City, nor promote the use of transit, and right-of-way constraints with the existing design.

From four preliminary design concepts and several reviews by committees and residents, the City Commission selected a primary design at its March 07, 2018 meeting for further design development. The design team of ACAI / Pininfarina focused on the selected bus shelter prototype and further refined into additional types for application Citywide.

The applicant presented the selected design to the Design Review Board on July 03, 2018 and subsequently the Historic Preservation Board on July 10, 2018. Both Boards motioned and approved the continuance of the application to address design comments. The following revisions have been made by the design team to address both Boards' comments:

- The inclusion of small temporary shelter to be equivalent to the 10'-3' minimal shelter type.
- A gutter has been added at the intersection of the butterfly roof, which will carry precipitation water to one of the columns for drainage.
- The solar paneled roof system will be a Building Integrated Photovoltaic System (BIPV) with a glazed roof of integrated translucent or transparent PV cells.
- The shelter seating has been redesigned to include fixed, ergonomic singular and two-person benches. Cast in stone, the seating is designed as monolithic volumes with contouring and a low back rest to provide orthopedic seating.
- The design has removed the differentiated paving around the shelter but will retain the paving marker of a solid white line to identify the shelter area.
- The rear glass back panel of the shelter has been modified to not span the entirety the shelter to allow for front to back movement.

The proposed new bus shelter design includes an innovative design and technology, such as USB/wireless charging stations and real-time bus arrival information that will enhance the transit experience for passengers. In its simplest form, the shelter is comprised of two vertical posts that support a butterfly roof. A real-time information bar acts as the spine of the inverted gabled roof, which is a composition of solar panel and glass infused with a stained ceramic frit. The posts and roof frame are constructed of white powder-coated strip aluminum, while transparent tempered glass panels, which are inset with laminated mylar film to block UV rays, are assembled between the posts to form a back wall to the shelter. The design offers optional glass side panels and digital display / ad panels.

The design for the bus shelters also proposes right-of-way furniture and pavement design. For minimal and temporary shelters with constrained right-of-way space, the design proposes a leaning rail set within the vertical posts. Additionally, the design of the shelter incorporates pavement markings, in the form of a white stripe, to define the ground space associated with the bus stop.

The modular nature of the design allows for the bus shelter to be installed at multiple sites throughout the City while retaining a singular architectural identity. The design team has devised four shelter types. These types include an enhanced shelter that is installed at major transfer points with high numbers of users; a standard shelter; a minimal shelter to be installed at site with low ridership, narrow right-of-ways, or adjacent to single family residential areas; and a temporary shelter to be used at locations that are affected by construction.

With respect to sea level rise, the design has incorporated resilient strategies. These include

simple installation processes to facilitate the raising of streets, locating critical electrical components at the roof level, water-tight enclosure for lower electrical components, and materials, such as aluminum, that mitigate the effect of salt water exposure.

RECOMMENDATION:

In view of the foregoing analysis, staff recommends the application be **approved**, subject to the conditions enumerated in the attached Draft Order, which address the inconsistencies with the aforementioned Design Review criteria.

TRM/JGM/FSC

F:\PLAN\DRB\DRB18\10-02-2018\OCT 18 Staff Recommendations\DRB18-0270 Citywide Bus Shelters.OCT18.doc

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
City of Miami Beach, Florida

MEETING DATE: October 02, 2018

FILE NO: DRB18-0270

PROPERTY: **Bus Shelters - Citywide**

APPLICANT: The City of Miami Beach

IN RE: The Application for Design Review Approval for installation of new bus shelters in various locations throughout the city.

ORDER

The City of Miami Beach Design Review Board makes the following FINDINGS OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

I. Design Review

- A. The Board has jurisdiction pursuant to Section 118-252(a) of the Miami Beach Code. The property is not located within a designated local historic district and is not an individually designated historic site.
- B. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted is consistent with Design Review Criteria in Section 118-251 of the Miami Beach Code.
- C. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted is consistent with Sea Level Rise Criteria in Section 133-50(a) of the Miami Beach Code.
- D. The project would be consistent with the criteria and requirements of Section 118-251 and/or Section 133-50(a) if the following conditions are met:
 1. Revised elevation, site plan and floor plan drawings shall be submitted and, at a minimum, such drawings shall incorporate the following:
 - a. The final design and details of all exterior lighting shall be provided, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Design Review Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - b. The final design, including materials and finishes for the all proposed shelters shall be provided, subject to the review and approval of Planning and the Department of Transportation.

- c. The final design, including materials and finishes, for the all right-of-way furniture shall be provided, subject to the review and approval of Planning and the Department of Transportation.
- d. The final design, including finishes and colors, of right-of way concrete and pavement markings associated with the shelters shall be subject to the review and approval of Planning and the Department of Transportation.
- e. The final design, including materials and finished, of the digital display AD panels shall be subject to the review and approval of Planning and the Department of Transportation.
- f. A copy of all pages of the recorded Final Order shall be scanned into the plans submitted for building permit, and shall be located immediately after the front cover page of the permit plans.
- g. Prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the project Architect shall verify, in writing, that the subject project has been constructed in accordance with the plans approved by the Planning Department for Building Permit.

In accordance with Section 118-262, the applicant, or the city manager on behalf of the City Administration, or an affected person, Miami Design Preservation League or Dade Heritage Trust may seek review of any order of the Design Review Board by the City Commission, except that orders granting or denying a request for rehearing shall not be reviewed by the Commission.

II. Variance(s)

- A. No variance(s) were filed as part of this application.

III. General Terms and Conditions applying to both 'I. Design Review Approval and II. Variances' noted above.

- A. The Final Order shall be recorded in the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.
- B. The Final Order is not severable, and if any provision or condition hereof is held void or unconstitutional in a final decision by a court of competent jurisdiction, the order shall be returned to the Board for reconsideration as to whether the order meets the criteria for approval absent the stricken provision or condition, and/or it is appropriate to modify the remaining conditions or impose new conditions.
- C. The conditions of approval herein are binding on the applicant, the property's owners, operators, and all successors in interest and assigns.
- D. Nothing in this order authorizes a violation of City Code or other applicable law, nor allows a relaxation of any requirement or standard set forth in the City Code.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing findings of fact, the evidence, information,

testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, and the staff report and analysis, which are adopted herein, including the staff recommendations, which were amended and adopted by the Board, that the **application** is **GRANTED** for the above-referenced project subject to those certain conditions specified in Paragraph I,II,III of the Findings of Fact, to which the applicant has agreed.

PROVIDED, the applicant shall build substantially in accordance with the plans entitled "City of Miami Beach Final Submittal Bus Shelters" by ACAI / Pininfarina dated May 04, 2018, and as approved by the Design Review Board, as determined by staff.

When requesting a building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order. No building permit may be issued unless and until all conditions of approval that must be satisfied prior to permit issuance, as set forth in this Order, have been met.

The issuance of the approval does not relieve the applicant from obtaining all other required Municipal, County and/or State reviews and permits, including final zoning approval. If adequate handicapped access is not provided on the Board-approved plans, this approval does not mean that such handicapped access is not required. When requesting a building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order.

If the Full Building Permit for the project is not issued within eighteen (18) months of the meeting date at which the original approval was granted, the application will expire and become null and void, unless the applicant makes an application to the Board for an extension of time, in accordance with the requirements and procedures of Chapter 118 of the City Code; the granting of any such extension of time shall be at the discretion of the Board. If the Full Building Permit for the project should expire for any reason (including but not limited to construction not commencing and continuing, with required inspections, in accordance with the applicable Building Code), the application will expire and become null and void.

In accordance with Chapter 118 of the City Code, the violation of any conditions and safeguards that are a part of this Order shall be deemed a violation of the land development regulations of the City Code. Failure to comply with this **Order** shall subject the application to Chapter 118 of the City Code, for revocation or modification of the application.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 20_____.

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA

BY: _____
JAMES G. MURPHY
CHIEF OF URBAN DESIGN

The foregoing instrument was acknowledged before me this _____ day of _____, 20____ by James G. Murphy, Chief of Urban Design, Planning Department, City of Miami Beach, Florida, a Florida Municipal Corporation, on behalf of the Corporation. He is personally known to me.

Filed with the Clerk of the Design Review Board on _____ ()