

MIAMI BEACH

PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Staff Report & Recommendation

Historic Preservation Board

TO: Chairperson and Members
Historic Preservation Board

DATE: July 10, 2018

FROM: Thomas R. Mooney, AICP
Planning Director



SUBJECT: HPB18-0206, **Citywide Bus Shelters**.

The Applicant, City of Miami Beach, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the design of citywide bus shelters.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness with conditions

BACKGROUND

In October, 2001, an agreement between the City and Clear Channel was executed for Clear Channel to construct, operate and maintain bus shelter structures and associated street furniture within the public right-of-way throughout the City. The agreement provides for commercial advertising on the bus shelter and revenue sharing with the City.

At the December 9, 2015 City Commission meeting, the Commission discussed the need to improve the existing bus shelter design and the desire for bus shelters to include enhancements that promote transit.

On March 9, 2016, the City Commission adopted a resolution accepting the recommendation of the Finance and Citywide Projects Committee (FCWPC) to issue a Request for Proposals for the design of new bus shelters. At the following Commission meeting, on April 13, 2016, the City Commission approved the issuance of a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for Architectural and Engineering Design Criteria Professional Services for the new bus shelter design. The ACAI Associates team, which includes the design firm of Pininfarina, was contracted by the City on July 19, 2017 for the design of the new bus shelters.

The design team generated four preliminary concepts for the bus shelters that were reviewed and narrowed down to two design concepts for recommendation by the Finance and Citywide Projects Committee (FCWPC) at its December 13, 2017 meeting, and later approved for further development by the City Commission at its January 17, 2018 meeting.

The two final shelter concepts were presented at West Avenue Neighborhood Association and Middle Beach Neighborhood Association in early February of this year and both concepts received similar number of favorable votes.

At the March 7, 2018 City Commission Meeting, the City Commission selected the primary design concept for further design development. Once the design process is completed, the City

will procure a new contractor to fabricate, install, operate, and maintain the new bus shelters in the City, including advertising components.

EXISTING SITES

Local Historic Districts: Multiple, citywide

THE PROJECT

The applicant has submitted plans and renderings entitled "City of Miami Beach Final Submittal Bus Shelters" by ACAI / Pininfarina dated May 4, 2018.

COMPLIANCE WITH ZONING CODE

A preliminary review of the project indicates that the application, as proposed, appears to be consistent with the City Code. The above noted comments shall not be considered final zoning review or approval. These and all zoning matters shall require final review and verification by the Zoning Administrator prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.

CONSISTENCY WITH 2025 COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

A preliminary review of the project indicates that the proposed bus shelters appears to be **consistent** with the Future Land Use Map of the Comprehensive Plan.

COMPLIANCE WITH CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CRITERIA

A decision on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be based upon the following:

- I. Evaluation of the compatibility of the physical alteration or improvement with surrounding properties and where applicable, compliance with the following criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(1) of the Miami Beach Code (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
 - a. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings as revised from time to time.
Satisfied
 - b. Other guidelines/policies/plans adopted or approved by Resolution or Ordinance by the City Commission.
Satisfied
- II. In determining whether a particular application is compatible with surrounding properties, the Board shall consider the following criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(2) of the Miami Beach Code (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
 - a. Exterior architectural features.
Satisfied
 - b. General design, scale, massing and arrangement.
Satisfied
 - c. Texture and material and color.

Satisfied

- d. The relationship of a, b, c, above, to other structures and features of the district.
Satisfied
- e. The purpose for which the district was created.
Satisfied
- f. The relationship of the size, design and siting of any new or reconstructed structure to the landscape of the district.
Satisfied
- g. An historic resources report, containing all available data and historic documentation regarding the building, site or feature.
Not Applicable
- h. The original architectural design or any subsequent modifications that have acquired significance.
Not Applicable

III. The examination of architectural drawings for consistency with the criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(3) of the Miami Beach Code and stated below, with regard to the aesthetics, appearances, safety, and function of any new or existing structure, public interior space and physical attributes of the project in relation to the site, adjacent structures and properties, and surrounding community. The criteria referenced above are as follows (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):

- a. The location of all existing and proposed buildings, drives, parking spaces, walkways, means of ingress and egress, drainage facilities, utility services, landscaping structures, signs, and lighting and screening devices.
Satisfied
- b. The dimensions of all buildings, structures, setbacks, parking spaces, floor area ratio, height, lot coverage and any other information that may be reasonably necessary to determine compliance with the requirements of the underlying zoning district, and any applicable overlays, for a particular application or project.
Satisfied
- c. The color, design, surface finishes and selection of landscape materials and architectural elements of the exterior of all buildings and structures and primary public interior areas for developments requiring a building permit in areas of the city identified in section 118-503.
Satisfied
- d. The proposed structure, and/or additions to an existing structure is appropriate to and compatible with the environment and adjacent structures, and enhances the appearance of the surrounding properties, or the purposes for which the district was created.

Satisfied

- e. The design and layout of the proposed site plan, as well as all new and existing buildings and public interior spaces shall be reviewed so as to provide an efficient arrangement of land uses. Particular attention shall be given to safety, crime prevention and fire protection, relationship to the surrounding neighborhood, impact on preserving historic character of the neighborhood and district, contiguous and adjacent buildings and lands, pedestrian sight lines and view corridors.

Satisfied

- f. Pedestrian and vehicular traffic movement within and adjacent to the site shall be reviewed to ensure that clearly defined, segregated pedestrian access to the site and all buildings is provided for and that any driveways and parking spaces are usable, safely and conveniently arranged and have a minimal impact on pedestrian circulation throughout the site. Access to the site from adjacent roads shall be designed so as to interfere as little as possible with vehicular traffic flow on these roads and pedestrian movement onto and within the site, as well as permit both pedestrians and vehicles a safe ingress and egress to the site.

Satisfied

- g. Lighting shall be reviewed to ensure safe movement of persons and vehicles and reflection on public property for security purposes and to minimize glare and reflection on adjacent properties and consistent with a City master plan, where applicable.

Satisfied

- h. Landscape and paving materials shall be reviewed to ensure an adequate relationship with and enhancement of the overall site plan design.

Satisfied

- i. Buffering materials shall be reviewed to ensure that headlights of vehicles, noise, and light from Structures are adequately shielded from public view, adjacent properties and pedestrian areas.

Satisfied

- j. Any proposed new structure shall have an orientation and massing which is sensitive to and compatible with the building site and surrounding area and which creates or maintains important view corridor(s).

Satisfied

- k. All buildings shall have, to the greatest extent possible, space in that part of the ground floor fronting a sidewalk, street or streets which is to be occupied for residential or commercial uses; likewise, the upper floors of the pedestal portion of the proposed building fronting a sidewalk street, or streets shall have residential or commercial spaces, or shall have the appearance of being a residential or commercial space or shall have an architectural treatment which shall buffer the appearance of a parking structure from the surrounding area and is integrated with the overall appearance of the project.

Not Applicable

- l. All buildings shall have an appropriate and fully integrated rooftop architectural treatment which substantially screens all mechanical equipment, stairs and elevator towers.
Not Applicable
- m. Any addition on a building site shall be designed, sited and massed in a manner which is sensitive to and compatible with the existing improvement(s).
Satisfied
- n. All portions of a project fronting a street or sidewalk shall incorporate an amount of transparency at the first level necessary to achieve pedestrian compatibility.
Satisfied
- o. The location, design, screening and buffering of all required service bays, delivery bays, trash and refuse receptacles, as well as trash rooms shall be arranged so as to have a minimal impact on adjacent properties.
Not Applicable

COMPLIANCE WITH SEA LEVEL RISE AND RESILIENCY REVIEW CRITERIA

Section 133-50(a) of the Land Development establishes review criteria for sea level rise and resiliency that must be considered as part of the review process for board orders. The following is an analysis of the request based upon these criteria:

- (1) A recycling or salvage plan for partial or total demolition shall be provided.
Not Satisfied
A recycling plan has not been submitted.
- (2) Windows that are proposed to be replaced shall be hurricane proof impact windows.
Not Applicable
- (3) Where feasible and appropriate, passive cooling systems, such as operable windows, shall be provided.
Not Applicable
- (4) Whether resilient landscaping (salt tolerant, highly water-absorbent, native or Florida friendly plants) will be provided.
Not Applicable
- (5) Whether adopted sea level rise projections in the Southeast Florida Regional Climate Action Plan, as may be revised from time-to-time by the Southeast Florida Regional Climate Change Compact, including a study of land elevation and elevation of surrounding properties were considered.
Satisfied
Sea level rise projections were taken into account and the shelters have been designed in a manner that could easily be removed and introduced within elevated sidewalks.

- (6) The ground floor, driveways, and garage ramping for new construction shall be adaptable to the raising of public rights-of-ways and adjacent land.
Not Applicable
- (7) Where feasible and appropriate, all critical mechanical and electrical systems shall be located above base flood elevation.
Satisfied
- (8) Existing buildings shall be, where reasonably feasible and appropriate, elevated to the base flood elevation.
Not Applicable
- (9) When habitable space is located below the base flood elevation plus City of Miami Beach Freeboard, wet or dry flood proofing systems will be provided in accordance with Chapter of 54 of the City Code.
Not Applicable
- (10) Where feasible and appropriate, water retention systems shall be provided.
Not Applicable

STAFF ANALYSIS

The City of Miami Beach Transportation Department has submitted an application to the Historic Preservation Board seeking approval for the design of bus shelter prototypes to replace the existing bus shelters at various locations within local historic districts. A similar application has been submitted to the Design Review Board for approval of the same prototype designs for areas of the city that are located outside local historic districts.

At the December 9, 2015 City Commission meeting, the Commission discussed the need to improve the existing bus shelters and to include enhancements that would promote the use of transit. The Transportation Department has outlined in their Letter of Intent several deficiencies in the design of the existing bus shelters including but not limited to minimal protect from the elements, high cost of installation/removal, incompatibility with technologies for Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) and Real-Time Transit Information.

After four preliminary concepts were presented by the design team, ACAI/Pininfarina, and reviewed at several public meetings, the City Commission selected the proposed design at its March 7, 2018 meeting for further development. The new innovative bus shelter design includes USB/wireless charging stations and real-time bus arrival information that will enhance the transit experience for passengers. In its simplest form, the shelter is comprised of two vertical posts that support a butterfly roof. A real-time information bar acts as the spine of the inverted gabled roof, which is a composition of solar panel and glass infused with a stained ceramic frit. The posts and roof frame are constructed of white powder-coated aluminum, while transparent tempered glass panels, which are inset with laminated mylar film to block UV rays, are assembled between the posts to form a back wall to the shelter. The design offers optional glass side panels and digital display / ad panels.

The modular nature of the design allows for the bus shelter to be installed at multiple sites throughout the City while retaining a singular architectural identity. The design team has devised

four shelter types. These types include an enhanced shelter that is installed at major transfer points with high numbers of users; a standard shelter; a minimal shelter to be installed at sites with low ridership, narrow right-of-ways, or adjacent to single family residential areas; and a temporary shelter to be used at locations that are affected by construction.

The project also includes a design for related furniture and pavement features. Fixed seating is proposed as concrete round stools freely placed within the shelter. For minimal and temporary shelters with constrained right-of-way space, the design proposes a leaning rail set within the vertical posts. Additionally, the design of the shelter incorporates pavement markings detailed with the City of Miami Beach logo, to define the ground space associated with the bus stop.

With respect to sea level rise, the design has incorporated resilient strategies. These include simple installation processes to facilitate the raising of streets, locating critical electrical components at the roof level, water-tight enclosure for lower electrical components, and salt water resistant materials.

RECOMMENDATION

In view of the foregoing analysis, staff recommends the application be approved as to the Certificate of Appropriateness request, subject to the conditions enumerated in the attached draft Order, which address the inconsistencies with the aforementioned Certificate of Appropriateness criteria.

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
City of Miami Beach, Florida**

MEETING DATE: July 10, 2018

FILE NO: HPB18-0206

PROPERTY: Citywide

APPLICANT: The City of Miami Beach

IN RE: The Application for an after-the-fact Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a retractable awning structure attached to the east façade of the building.

ORDER

The City of Miami Beach Historic Preservation Board makes the following FINDINGS OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

I. Certificate of Appropriateness

- A. The subject sites are located within multiple local historic districts.
- B. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted:
 1. Is consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(1) of the Miami Beach Code.
 2. Is consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(2) of the Miami Beach Code.
 3. Is consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(3) of the Miami Beach Code.
 4. Is not consistent with Sea Level Rise and Resiliency Review Criteria (1) & (5) in Section 133-50(a) of the Miami Beach Code.
- C. The project would remain consistent with the criteria and requirements of section 118-564 and 133-50(a) if the following conditions are met:
 1. Revised elevation, site plan and floor plan drawings shall be submitted and, at a minimum, such drawings shall incorporate the following:
 - a. Final details of all exterior surface finishes and materials, including samples, shall be provided, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.

II. Variance(s)

- A. No variance(s) were filed as part of this application.

III. General Terms and Conditions applying to both 'I. Certificate of Appropriateness' and 'II. Variances' noted above.

- A. Where one or more parcels are unified for a single development, the property owner shall execute and record an unity of title or a covenant in lieu of unity of title, as may be applicable, in a form acceptable to the City Attorney.
- B. A copy of all pages of the recorded Final Order shall be scanned into the plans submitted for building permit, and shall be located immediately after the front cover page of the permit plans.
- C. The Final Order shall be recorded in the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.
- D. Satisfaction of all conditions is required for the Planning Department to give its approval on a Certificate of Occupancy; a Temporary Certificate of Occupancy or Partial Certificate of Occupancy may also be conditionally granted Planning Departmental approval.
- E. The Final Order is not severable, and if any provision or condition hereof is held void or unconstitutional in a final decision by a court of competent jurisdiction, the order shall be returned to the Board for reconsideration as to whether the order meets the criteria for approval absent the stricken provision or condition, and/or it is appropriate to modify the remaining conditions or impose new conditions.
- F. The conditions of approval herein are binding on the applicant, the property's owners, operators, and all successors in interest and assigns.
- G. Nothing in this order authorizes a violation of the City Code or other applicable law, nor allows a relaxation of any requirement or standard set forth in the City Code.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing findings of fact, the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, and the staff report and analysis, which are adopted herein, including the staff recommendations, which were amended and adopted by the Board, that the application is GRANTED for the above-referenced project subject to those certain conditions specified in Paragraph I, II, III of the Findings of Fact, to which the applicant has agreed.

PROVIDED, the applicant shall build substantially in accordance with the plans entitled The applicant has submitted plans and renderings entitled "City of Miami Beach Final Submittal Bus Shelters" by ACAI / Pininfarina dated May 4, 2018, and as approved by the Historic Preservation Board, as determined by staff.

When requesting a building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order. No building permit may be issued unless and until all conditions of approval that must be satisfied prior to permit issuance, as set forth in this Order, have been met.

The issuance of the approval does not relieve the applicant from obtaining all other required Municipal, County and/or State reviews and permits, including final zoning approval. If adequate handicapped access is not provided on the Board-approved plans, this approval does not mean that such handicapped access is not required. When requesting a building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order.

If the Full Building Permit for the project is not issued within eighteen (18) months of the meeting date at which the original approval was granted, the application will expire and become null and void, unless the applicant makes an application to the Board for an extension of time, in accordance with the requirements and procedures of Chapter 118 of the City Code; the granting of any such extension of time shall be at the discretion of the Board. If the Full Building Permit for the project should expire for any reason (including but not limited to construction not commencing and continuing, with required inspections, in accordance with the applicable Building Code), the application will expire and become null and void.

In accordance with Chapter 118 of the City Code, the violation of any conditions and safeguards that are a part of this Order shall be deemed a violation of the land development regulations of the City Code. Failure to comply with this Order shall subject the application to Chapter 118 of the City Code, for revocation or modification of the application.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 20__.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA

BY: _____
DEBORAH TACKETT
CHIEF OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION
FOR THE CHAIR

STATE OF FLORIDA)
)SS
COUNTY OF MIAMI-DADE)

The foregoing instrument was acknowledged before me this _____ day of _____, 20__ by Deborah Tackett, Chief of Historic Preservation, Planning Department, City of Miami Beach, Florida, a Florida Municipal Corporation, on behalf

of the corporation. She is personally known to me.

NOTARY PUBLIC
Miami-Dade County, Florida
My commission expires: _____

Approved As To Form:
City Attorney's Office: _____ ()

Filed with the Clerk of the Historic Preservation Board on _____ ()

F:\PLAN\HPB\18HPB\07-10-2018\Draft Orders\HPB18-0206_Citywide Bus Shelters.Jul18.FO.DRAFT.docx