

MIAMI BEACH

PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Staff Report & Recommendation

Historic Preservation Board

TO: Chairperson and Members
Historic Preservation Board

DATE: July 10, 2018

FROM: Thomas R. Mooney, AICP
Planning Director



SUBJECT: HPB18-0204, **4441 Collins Avenue – Fontainebleau Hotel.**

The applicant, Fontainebleau Florida Hotel, LLC, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for modifications to the lobby bar area.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness with conditions

EXISTING STRUCTURE

Local Historic District:

Morris Lapidus / Mid 20th Century

Status:

Contributing

Original Construction Date:

1954

ZONING / SITE DATA

Legal Description:

Lot 'A', AND Lots 1 & 2, and the South ½ of Lot 3, of the Amended Plat of "The Indian Beach Corporation's Subdivision," according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 8, page 61 of the Public Records of Dade County, Florida, AND the Northerly 125 feet of that certain tract marked and designated "R.P. Van Camp", AND all that certain tract of land designated as "J.H. Snowden," less the south 64.55 feet thereof, AND an exclusive easement over, across, and through the north 60 feet of lots 1 and 2, Block 40, on amended Map of Ocean Front Property of the Miami Beach Improvement Company, as recorded in Plat Book 5, pages 7 and 8, of the public records of Dade County, Florida.

Zoning:

RM-3, Residential, high intensity

Future Land Use Designation:

RM-3, Residential, high intensity

THE PROJECT

The applicant has submitted plans entitled "A New Bleau Fontainebleau" as prepared by Norberto Rosenstein Architect, dated May 4, 2018.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the modifications to the

garden lobby bar area.

COMPLIANCE WITH ZONING CODE

A preliminary review of the project indicates that the application, as proposed, appears to be consistent with the City Code.

The above noted comments shall not be considered final zoning review or approval. These and all zoning matters shall require final review and verification by the Zoning Administrator prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.

CONSISTENCY WITH 2025 COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

A preliminary review of the project indicates that the **hotel with accessory commercial use** appears to be **consistent** with the Future Land Use Map of the Comprehensive Plan.

COMPLIANCE WITH CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CRITERIA

A decision on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be based upon the following:

- I. Evaluation of the compatibility of the physical alteration or improvement with surrounding properties and where applicable, compliance with the following criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(1) of the Miami Beach Code (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
 - a. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings as revised from time to time.
Satisfied
 - b. Other guidelines/policies/plans adopted or approved by Resolution or Ordinance by the City Commission.
Satisfied
- II. In determining whether a particular application is compatible with surrounding properties, the Board shall consider the following criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(2) of the Miami Beach Code (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
 - a. Exterior architectural features.
Not Applicable
 - b. General design, scale, massing and arrangement.
Satisfied
 - c. Texture and material and color.
Satisfied
 - d. The relationship of a, b, c, above, to other structures and features of the district.
Not Applicable
 - e. The purpose for which the district was created.

Satisfied

- f. The relationship of the size, design and siting of any new or reconstructed structure to the landscape of the district.

Satisfied

- g. An historic resources report, containing all available data and historic documentation regarding the building, site or feature.

Satisfied

- h. The original architectural design or any subsequent modifications that have acquired significance.

Satisfied

- III. The examination of architectural drawings for consistency with the criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(3) of the Miami Beach Code and stated below, with regard to the aesthetics, appearances, safety, and function of any new or existing structure, public interior space and physical attributes of the project in relation to the site, adjacent structures and properties, and surrounding community. The criteria referenced above are as follows (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):

- a. The location of all existing and proposed buildings, drives, parking spaces, walkways, means of ingress and egress, drainage facilities, utility services, landscaping structures, signs, and lighting and screening devices.

Not Applicable

- b. The dimensions of all buildings, structures, setbacks, parking spaces, floor area ratio, height, lot coverage and any other information that may be reasonably necessary to determine compliance with the requirements of the underlying zoning district, and any applicable overlays, for a particular application or project.

Satisfied

- c. The color, design, surface finishes and selection of landscape materials and architectural elements of the exterior of all buildings and structures and primary public interior areas for developments requiring a building permit in areas of the city identified in section 118-503.

Satisfied

- d. The proposed structure, and/or additions to an existing structure is appropriate to and compatible with the environment and adjacent structures, and enhances the appearance of the surrounding properties, or the purposes for which the district was created.

Not Applicable

- e. The design and layout of the proposed site plan, as well as all new and existing buildings and public interior spaces shall be reviewed so as to provide an efficient arrangement of land uses. Particular attention shall be given to safety, crime prevention and fire protection, relationship to the surrounding

neighborhood, impact on preserving historic character of the neighborhood and district, contiguous and adjacent buildings and lands, pedestrian sight lines and view corridors.

Not Applicable

- f. Pedestrian and vehicular traffic movement within and adjacent to the site shall be reviewed to ensure that clearly defined, segregated pedestrian access to the site and all buildings is provided for and that any driveways and parking spaces are usable, safely and conveniently arranged and have a minimal impact on pedestrian circulation throughout the site. Access to the site from adjacent roads shall be designed so as to interfere as little as possible with vehicular traffic flow on these roads and pedestrian movement onto and within the site, as well as permit both pedestrians and vehicles a safe ingress and egress to the site.

Not Applicable

- g. Lighting shall be reviewed to ensure safe movement of persons and vehicles and reflection on public property for security purposes and to minimize glare and reflection on adjacent properties and consistent with a City master plan, where applicable.

Not Applicable

- h. Landscape and paving materials shall be reviewed to ensure an adequate relationship with and enhancement of the overall site plan design.

Not Applicable

- i. Buffering materials shall be reviewed to ensure that headlights of vehicles, noise, and light from Structures are adequately shielded from public view, adjacent properties and pedestrian areas.

Not Applicable

- j. Any proposed new structure shall have an orientation and massing which is sensitive to and compatible with the building site and surrounding area and which creates or maintains important view corridor(s).

Not Applicable

- k. All buildings shall have, to the greatest extent possible, space in that part of the ground floor fronting a sidewalk, street or streets which is to be occupied for residential or commercial uses; likewise, the upper floors of the pedestal portion of the proposed building fronting a sidewalk street, or streets shall have residential or commercial spaces, or shall have the appearance of being a residential or commercial space or shall have an architectural treatment which shall buffer the appearance of a parking structure from the surrounding area and is integrated with the overall appearance of the project.

Not Applicable

- l. All buildings shall have an appropriate and fully integrated rooftop architectural treatment which substantially screens all mechanical equipment, stairs and elevator towers.

Not Applicable

- m. Any addition on a building site shall be designed, sited and massed in a manner which is sensitive to and compatible with the existing improvement(s).
Not Applicable
- n. All portions of a project fronting a street or sidewalk shall incorporate an amount of transparency at the first level necessary to achieve pedestrian compatibility.
Not Applicable
- o. The location, design, screening and buffering of all required service bays, delivery bays, trash and refuse receptacles, as well as trash rooms shall be arranged so as to have a minimal impact on adjacent properties.
Not Applicable

COMPLIANCE WITH SEA LEVEL RISE AND RESILIENCY REVIEW CRITERIA

Section 133-50(a) of the Land Development establishes review criteria for sea level rise and resiliency that must be considered as part of the review process for board orders. The following is an analysis of the request based upon these criteria:

- (1) A recycling or salvage plan for partial or total demolition shall be provided.
Not Satisfied
A recycling or salvage plan has not been provided.
- (2) Windows that are proposed to be replaced shall be hurricane proof impact windows.
Not Applicable
- (3) Where feasible and appropriate, passive cooling systems, such as operable windows, shall be provided.
Not Applicable
- (4) Whether resilient landscaping (salt tolerant, highly water-absorbent, native or Florida friendly plants) will be provided.
Not Applicable
- (5) Whether adopted sea level rise projections in the Southeast Florida Regional Climate Action Plan, as may be revised from time-to-time by the Southeast Florida Regional Climate Change Compact, including a study of land elevation and elevation of surrounding properties were considered.
Not Applicable
- (6) The ground floor, driveways, and garage ramping for new construction shall be adaptable to the raising of public rights-of-ways and adjacent land.
Not Applicable
- (7) Where feasible and appropriate, all critical mechanical and electrical systems shall be located above base flood elevation.
Not Applicable

- (8) Existing buildings shall be, where reasonably feasible and appropriate, elevated to the base flood elevation.
Not Applicable
- (9) When habitable space is located below the base flood elevation plus City of Miami Beach Freeboard, wet or dry flood proofing systems will be provided in accordance with Chapter of 54 of the City Code.
Not Applicable
- (10) Where feasible and appropriate, water retention systems shall be provided.
Not Applicable

STAFF ANALYSIS

Staff has met with the applicant and designers on several occasions to develop an appropriate renovation strategy for the bar area located within the original sunken garden lobby of the Morris Lapidus designed Fontainebleau Hotel. Staff would note that in 2006, the Board reviewed and approved a major renovation and expansion of the property (HPB 3684). The approved project, which was completed in 2009, included modifications to the subject interior space. Specifically, a new monochromatic illuminated blue glass floor and circular bar were introduced.

The applicant is currently proposing to again renovate this space, in order to accommodate the changing requirements of the hotel operations. The modifications requested include the removal of the existing glass floor and circular bar element and the introduction of a new terrazzo floor, a new bar structure and decorative screen features along the perimeter of the space. Staff believes that the design of these new elements is highly respectful of the Morris Lapidus original design concept and the Post War Modern period of architecture and recommends approval, as noted below.

Staff has also included a condition in the draft Order in order to ensure compliance with a Board of Adjustment Order issued on June 6, 2008 (BOA File No. 3362). In this regard, the applicant voluntarily proffered to participate in the completion of the City's public beach walk project at the 46th Street Parking facility. However, to date the applicant has yet to fulfill this obligation.

RECOMMENDATION

In view of the foregoing analysis, staff recommends the application be **approved** subject to the conditions enumerated in the attached draft Order.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD
City of Miami Beach, Florida

MEETING DATE: July 10, 2018

FILE NO: HPB18-0204

PROPERTY: 4441 Collins Avenue

APPLICANT: Fontainebleau Florida Hotel, LLC

LEGAL: Lot 'A', AND Lots 1 & 2, and the South $\frac{1}{2}$ of Lot 3, of the Amended Plat of "The Indian Beach Corporation's Subdivision," according to the Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 8, page 61 of the Public Records of Dade County, Florida, AND the Northerly 125 feet of that certain tract marked and designated "R.P. Van Camp", AND all that certain tract of land designated as "J.H. Snowden," less the south 64.55 feet thereof, AND an exclusive easement over, across, and through the north 60 feet of lots 1 and 2, Block 40, on amended Map of Ocean Front Property of the Miami Beach Improvement Company, as recorded in Plat Book 5, pages 7 and 8, of the public records of Dade County, Florida.

IN RE: The application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for modifications to the lobby bar area.

ORDER

The City of Miami Beach Historic Preservation Board makes the following FINDINGS OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

I. Certificate of Appropriateness

- A. The subject site is located within the Morris Lapidus / Mid 20th Century Local Historic District.
- B. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted:
 - 1. Is consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(1) of the Miami Beach Code.
 - 2. Is consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(2) of the Miami Beach Code.
 - 3. Is consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(3) of the Miami Beach Code.
 - 4. Is not consistent with Sea Level Rise and Resiliency Review Criteria (1) in Section 133-50(a) of the Miami Beach Code.

- C. The project would remain consistent with the criteria and requirements of section 118-564 if the following conditions are met:
1. Prior to the issuance of any building permit for the work approved herein, the applicant shall fully comply with all applicable provisions pertaining to the public beach walk, as more specifically contained in the Order for BOA File No. 3362, dated June 6, 2008.
 2. Revised elevation, site plan and floor plan drawings shall be submitted and, at a minimum, such drawings shall incorporate the following:
 - a. Final design and details of the new bar counter, flooring, interior railings and decorative screens, including material and finish samples shall be provided, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.

In accordance with Section 118-537, the applicant, the owner(s) of the subject property, the City Manager, Miami Design Preservation League, Dade Heritage Trust, or an affected person may appeal the Board's decision on a Certificate of Appropriateness to a special master appointed by the City Commission.

II. Variance(s)

- A. The applicant has not request any variances as part of this application.

III. General Terms and Conditions applying to both 'I. Certificate of Appropriateness' and 'II. Variances' noted above.

- A. A recycling/salvage plan shall be provided as part of the submittal for a demolition/building permit, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff.
- B. Where one or more parcels are unified for a single development, the property owner shall execute and record a unity of title or a covenant in lieu of unity of title, as may be applicable, in a form acceptable to the City Attorney.
- C. All applicable FPL transformers or vault rooms and backflow prevention devices shall be located within the building envelope with the exception of the valve (PIV) which may be visible and accessible from the street.
- D. A copy of all pages of the recorded Final Order shall be scanned into the plans submitted for building permit, and shall be located immediately after the front cover page of the permit plans.
- E. The Final Order shall be recorded in the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.

- F. Satisfaction of all conditions is required for the Planning Department to give its approval on a Certificate of Occupancy; a Temporary Certificate of Occupancy or Partial Certificate of Occupancy may also be conditionally granted Planning Departmental approval.
- G. The Final Order is not severable, and if any provision or condition hereof is held void or unconstitutional in a final decision by a court of competent jurisdiction, the order shall be returned to the Board for reconsideration as to whether the order meets the criteria for approval absent the stricken provision or condition, and/or it is appropriate to modify the remaining conditions or impose new conditions.
- H. The conditions of approval herein are binding on the applicant, the property's owners, operators, and all successors in interest and assigns.
- I. Nothing in this order authorizes a violation of the City Code or other applicable law, nor allows a relaxation of any requirement or standard set forth in the City Code.
- J. Upon the issuance of a final Certificate of Occupancy or Certificate of Completion, as applicable, the project approved herein shall be maintained in accordance with the plans approved by the board, and shall be subject to all conditions of approval herein, unless otherwise modified by the Board. Failure to maintain shall result in the issuance of a Code Compliance citation, and continued failure to comply may result in revocation of the Certificate of Occupancy, Completion and Business Tax Receipt.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing findings of fact, the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, and the staff report and analysis, which are adopted herein, including the staff recommendations, which were amended and adopted by the Board, that the application is GRANTED for the above-referenced project subject to those certain conditions specified in Paragraph I, II, III of the Findings of Fact, to which the applicant has agreed.

PROVIDED, the applicant shall build substantially in accordance with the plans "A New Bleau Fontainebleau" as prepared by Norberto Rosenstein Architect, dated May 4, 2018, as approved by the Historic Preservation Board, as determined by staff.

When requesting a building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order. No building permit may be issued unless and until all conditions of approval that must be satisfied prior to permit issuance, as set forth in this Order, have been met.

The issuance of the approval does not relieve the applicant from obtaining all other required Municipal, County and/or State reviews and permits, including final zoning approval. If adequate handicapped access is not provided on the Board-approved plans, this approval does not mean that such handicapped access is not required. When requesting a building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order.

If the Full Building Permit for the project is not issued within eighteen (18) months of the meeting

date at which the original approval was granted, the application will expire and become null and void, unless the applicant makes an application to the Board for an extension of time, in accordance with the requirements and procedures of Chapter 118 of the City Code; the granting of any such extension of time shall be at the discretion of the Board. If the Full Building Permit for the project should expire for any reason (including but not limited to construction not commencing and continuing, with required inspections, in accordance with the applicable Building Code), the application will expire and become null and void.

In accordance with Chapter 118 of the City Code, the violation of any conditions and safeguards that are a part of this Order shall be deemed a violation of the land development regulations of the City Code. Failure to comply with this **Order** shall subject the application to Chapter 118 of the City Code, for revocation or modification of the application.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 20____.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA

BY: DEBORAH TACKETT
CHIEF OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION
FOR THE CHAIR

STATE OF FLORIDA)
)SS
COUNTY OF MIAMI-DADE)

The foregoing instrument was acknowledged before me this _____ day of _____ 20__ by Deborah Tackett, Chief of Historic Preservation, Planning Department, City of Miami Beach, Florida, a Florida Municipal Corporation, on behalf of the corporation. She is personally known to me.

NOTARY PUBLIC
Miami-Dade County, Florida
My commission expires:

Approved As To Form:
City Attorney's Office: _____ (

Filed with the Clerk of the Historic Preservation Board on _____ ()

Page 5 of 5
HPB18-0204
Meeting Date: July 10, 2018

F:\PLAN\HPB\18HPB\07-10-2018\Draft Orders\HPB18-0204_4441 Collins Av.Jul18.FO.DRAFT.docx