



April 6, 2018

Historic Preservation Board
City of Miami Beach
1700 Convention Center Drive
Miami Beach, FL 33139

RE: Collins Park Parking Garage
HPB18-0200
340 23rd Street
Subj: Responses to First Submittal Comments

Dear HPB:

Below are responses to the HPB review comments on the First Submittal:

HPB Plan Review – James Seiberling x2795

First submittal: March 19, 2018

Comments issued: March 30, 2018

Final submittal (CAP & Paper): April 6, 2018

Notice to proceed issued: April 16, 2018

Agenda finalized & all fees paid by: April 18, 2018

Tentative HPB meeting agenda date: June 11, 2018 SUBJECT: HPB18-0200, 340 23rd Street

1. DEFICIENCIES IN ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION

- a. Identify Museum Historic District in map. **Refer to attached responses from Shulman + Associates.**
- b. Remove pages 18 & 23 from the set of plans **Refer to attached responses from Shulman + Associates.**
- c. Provide a Letter of Intent **LOI is attached and has been submitted.**
- d. Provide a written narrative explaining the lighting intent, plans are currently difficult to fully understand how lighting is going to function **Refer to attached responses from Shulman + Associates.**
- e. Provide a site plan for the Liberty Ave option **Refer to attached responses from Shulman + Associates.**
- f. Provide gross area for new construction; current gross square footage noted seems to be FAR **Refer to attached responses from Shulman + Associates.**

2. DESIGN/APPROPRIATENESS COMMENTS

- a. Staff recommends exploring continuing the paving from Collins Park walkways into the pedestrian promenade in lieu of the Miami Beach red concrete **Refer to attached responses from Shulman + Associates.**

b. Staff recommends further study of the south façade, introduction of a grid pattern, more movement **Refer to attached responses from Shulman + Associates.**

c. Staff recommends further study of the driveway entrance arrow colors **Refer to attached responses from Shulman + Associates.**

d. Staff recommends exploring a better more seamless integration of the red and green garage signage into the grid/perforated panels. **Refer to attached responses from Shulman + Associates.**

File Naming All PDF files must be named with the submittal deadline date and the type of document in the following format 'MM-DD-YYYY Document Name'. For example, if the deadline for first submittal is October 29, 2017 the file name would be '10-29-2017 Application'. Use this naming format for first and final CAP submittals. The uploaded file retains the name as it has been saved on your computer. The file name cannot be changed and the file cannot be deleted once it is uploaded. Please use names for the most common types of files. **All PDF file names have been revised and uploaded.**

If the document type is not listed below, please use a document name that clearly identifies the file.

Document Name Description

Application Completed Land Use Board Application form including Exhibit A

LOI Letter of Intent

Checklist Pre-application Checklist

Labels Mailing Labels,

List of Property Owners,

Certified Letter and Map

BTR Copies of Previous Business Tax Receipts **Not required. Listed in naming convention instructions for informational purposes only.**

Survey Recent Signed and Sealed Survey Plans

Architectural Plans and Exhibits

Landscape Landscaping Plans and Exhibits

HRR Historic Resources Report

Microfilm Building Card and Microfilm

Traffic Traffic Study

Sound Sound Study **Not required. Listed in naming convention instructions for informational purposes only.**

All pages of a document must be uploaded in one PDF file. Do not upload individual pages of a document.

Documents that have not been revised from first to final submittal do not have to be re-uploaded.

Landscape – Ricardo Guzman

General Correction

- 1- Provide a tree list as part of the Tree Disposition Plan with disposition. Please note that any non-invasive trees with a 3" DBH or greater would require a Tree Removal Permit from CMB Urban Forestry. Please address tree mitigation requirements as part of the proposed landscape plan. **Refer to attached responses from landscape architect.**
- 2- The proposed landscape plan should to satisfy minimum landscape code requirements as prescribed by CMB Code Chapter 126 inclusive of street trees on all frontages. Include standard Landscape Legend on plans. **Refer to attached responses from landscape architect.**
- 3- The use of Silva Cells or approved equal should be included for canopy shade trees planted in areas where rooting space may be limited. Please provide a min. 1000 CUFT of good quality plating soil per tree or 500 CUFT when trees are proposed in close proximity and may be sharing rooting volume. **Refer to attached responses from landscape architect.**

MIAMIBEACH Ricardo Guzman, Senior Planner PLANNING DEPARTMENT 1700 Convention Center Drive, Miami Beach, FL 33139 Tel: 305-673-7000 x6113 / Fax: 305-673-7559/ www.miamibeachfl.gov

HPB Administration – Jessica Gonzalez

Comments Issued 3/30/18

- Page 4 needs to be signed. **Page 4 has been signed.**
- Affidavit needs to be complete, signed and notarized. **Affidavit has been completed, signed, and notarized.**
- Page 9 applicant affidavit must be complete and signed. **Page 9 has been completed, signed, and notarized.**

The following fees are outstanding and will be invoiced prior to the Final CAP and Paper submittal deadline April 6, 2018:

1. Advertisement - \$1,500 **CIP to pay fee.**
 2. Posting - \$100 **CIP to pay fee.**
 3. Mail Label Fee (\$4 per mailing label) – 3,108 Total Outstanding Balance = \$ 2,500 In addition to the fees, the following shall be provided to the Department no later than the Final CAP and Paper submittal deadline April 6, 2018 **CIP to pay fee.**
- One (1) original application (Proper signed and notarized affidavits and Disclosures must be provided). **Original application has been provided.**
 - One (1) original Letter of Intent. **Original LOI has been provided.**
 - One (1) original set of architectural plans signed, sealed and dated. **Original architectural plans have been provided.**

- One (1) original signed, sealed and dated Survey. **Original survey has been provided.**
- Two (2) sets of Mailing labels must be provided including Letter certifying the labels, radius map, gummed labels, and Labels CD done with the proper Excel format specified by the Planning Department. **CIP to provide.**
- Any additional information/documents provided (i.e. traffic studies, concurrency, etc., etc.).
- 14 collated sets including copies of all the above: application form, letter of intent, plans, survey and any additional information/documents provided. **14 sets of copies has been submitted.**
- A CD/DVD containing a digital version of the documents and plans submitted. The CD must be in the proper format specified by the Planning Department (Each document must be less than 15MB). **CD has been submitted.**

NOTE: Please make sure you identify the final submittal by the file number at time of drop off.

Should you have any questions, please feel free to contact me. 305-673-6562 and victornunez@miamibeachfl.gov.

Thanks you.

Sincerely,

Rafael Labrada, R.A.
Assistant Director of Architecture

cc: Carla Dixon, CIP
WA File

Subject: Comment Response - Revision One HPB18-0200, 340 23rd Street

HPB Plan Review

Deficiencies in Architectural Presentation

- a. Identify Museum Historic District in Map

Response: See revised G-1.013 Zoning and Historic District Map identifying the Museum Historic District.

- b. Remove pages 18 & 23 from the set of plans

Response: G-1.17 Existing Context Photos p. 18 and G-1.22 Existing Context Photos p.23 have been removed from the set.

- c. Provide Letter of Intent

Response: Letter of Intent to be provided by Carla Dixon of Capital Improvements Projects Office

- d. Provide a written narrative explaining the lighting intent, plans are currently difficult to fully understand how lighting is going to function

Response: See response attached memo from the lighting designer.

- e. Provide a site plan for the Liberty Ave option

Response: See page 8 G-1.07 Proposed Liberty Avenue Site Plan

- f. Provide gross area for new construction; current gross square footage noted seems to be FAR

Response: See total gross area for the new construction of the garage indicated on G-1.01 Zoning Data and Drawing List as well as G-1.08 Proposed FAR Diagrams

Architecture
Interior Design
Urban Design
Graphic Design

100 NE 38 Street
Miami, FL 33137
T 305 438 0609
F 305 438 0170
shulman-design.com
AA 26001090

Design/Appropriateness Comments

- a. Staff recommends exploring continuing the paving from Collins Park walkways into the pedestrian promenade in lieu of the Miami Beach red concrete.

Response: See proposed G-1.06 Proposed Site Plan indicating an alternating pattern of MB red concrete and CP walkway pavers.

- b. Staff recommends further study of the south façade, introduction of a grid pattern, more movement

Response: See revised A-2.01 Proposed North and South Elevation. A grid following the constraints of the pre-cast concrete is indicated along with vertical and diagonal geometries relating to the adjacent facades.

- c. Staff recommends further study of the driveway entrance arrow colors

Response: See revised A-2.02 Proposed West and East Elevations. Suggested arrows are pixelated in a shade of pink.

- d. Staff recommends further study of the driveway entrance arrow colors

Response: The proposed red and green signage is to be integrated within the perforated metal panel facades. Refer to G-1.24 Materials and G-1.25 Lighting Intent.



DESIGN LIGHTING CONSULTANTS, INC.

April 5, 2018

SHULMAN + ASSOCIATES
100 NE 38 Street · Miami, FL 33137

RE: Collins Park Garage Façade Illumination

This parking garage building is clad with a perforated aluminum skin, as illustrated. In addition to an X-Y matrix of holes we are showing alphanumeric characters depicted in the perforations. These characters will; in some cases, become actual words depicting names or places of historical significance to the City. In addition; there will be the words "PARKING GARAGE" etc. which are part of the function of this structure. Please refer to the architectural renderings for the graphical representations of these concepts.

These letters will be illuminated in different ways depending on their significance; as follows in order:

- 1) Is the use of a 2x2 light box with a stenciled letter, mounted to the back side of the perforated metal skin. This box will be fastened directly to the back of the panel and will provide a positive and clear definition of the letter. The LED light source can be any color that we choose. This method will be used for information and may be used for important names.
- 2) Is to use the "can opener" perforations with the metal rotated from the top down toward the canopy mounted up light. As the letters are formed by this method of perforation they will be visible day and night, by their nature and by our illumination, respectively. The façade illumination will serve to highlight those perforations and the metal will act as a reflector and delineate the letter.
- 3) The random letters; which are of interest, but of less importance, will have a continuous LED light strip and or piece of frosted acrylic fastened to the back side of the panel directly behind the letter. These materials will act as the medium for the capture and reflection of light, there by making the letters visible day and night.

These are the solutions that we are pursuing, they can and will be judged by the efficacy of the design and by the cost to implement them.

Michael G. Asmar, IES, LC



April 5, 2018

Ricardo Guzman
Senior Planner
City of Miami Beach Planning Department
1700 Convention Center Drive
Miami Beach, Florida 33139

Re: HPB Plan Review - Response to Landscape Comments

Dear Mr. Guzman,

Below please find our responses to the comments provided by you on March 30, 2018 regarding the Collins Park Garage HPB Plan Review Submittal.

Comment #1: *"Provide a tree list as part of the Tree Disposition Plan with disposition. Please note that any non-invasive trees with a 3" DBH or greater would require a Tree Removal Permit from CMB Urban Forestry. Please address tree mitigation requirements as part of the proposed landscape plan."*

Response: *A tree list is now shown on sheet L-200 – Tree Disposition. Tree mitigation requirements are shown on sheet L-400 – Landscape Plan.*

Comment #2: *"The proposed landscape plan should to satisfy minimum landscape code requirements as prescribed by CMB Code Chapter 126 inclusive of street trees on all frontages. Include standard Landscape Legend on plans."*

Response: *A City of Miami Beach Landscape Legend is included on the Landscape Plan.*

Comment #3: *"The use of Silva Cells or approved equal should be included for canopy shade trees planted in areas where rooting space may be limited. Please provide a min. 1000 CUFT of good quality plating soil per tree or 500 CUFT when trees are proposed in close proximity and may be sharing rooting volume."*

Response: *Refer to note added on sheet L-400 – Landscape Plan, specifying a minimum of 500 CUFT of planting soil in the tree cut-outs along 23rd Street and Liberty Avenue.*



Please let us know if additional information is required.

Very truly yours,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "George E. Puig", enclosed within a blue oval.

KIMLEY-HORN AND ASSOCIATES, INC.

George E. Puig, PLA #0001706

Senior Project Manager