

# MIAMI BEACH

## PLANNING DEPARTMENT

### Staff Report & Recommendation

### Historic Preservation Board

TO: Chairperson and Members  
Historic Preservation Board

DATE: May 10, 2016

FROM: Thomas R. Mooney, AICP  
Planning Director



SUBJECT: HPB File No. 7623, **429 Espanola Way – Hosteria Romana**.

The applicant, Hosteria Romana, Inc., is requesting an After-the-Fact Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of speakers, fans, light fixtures and decorative elements on the front façade of the existing building.

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Denial of the Certificate of Appropriateness

#### **EXISTING STRUCTURE**

Local Historic District:	Espanola Way
Status:	Contributing
Original Construction Date:	1925
Original Architect:	Robert A. Taylor

#### **ZONING / SITE DATA**

Legal Description:	Lots 1-6, each less the south 3 feet, Block 3A of Espanola Villas 1st Addition, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 9, Page 147 of the public records of Miami Dade County, Florida.
--------------------	--

Zoning:	CD-2, Commercial medium intensity
Future Land Use Designation:	CD-2, Commercial medium intensity

#### **THE PROJECT**

The applicant has submitted plans entitled "Hosteria Romana" as prepared by L.I.M. Design Group, dated March 3, 2016.

**The applicant is requesting an After-the-Fact Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of speakers, fans, light fixtures and decorative elements on the front façade of the existing building.**

#### **COMPLIANCE WITH ZONING CODE**

A preliminary review of the project indicates that the application, as proposed, appears to be consistent with the City Code.

The above noted comments shall not be considered final zoning review or approval. These and all zoning matters shall require final review and verification by the Zoning Administrator prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.

#### **CONSISTENCY WITH 2025 COMPREHENSIVE PLAN**

A preliminary review of the project indicates that the proposed **restaurant use** appears to be **consistent** with the Future Land Use Map of the Comprehensive Plan.

#### **COMPLIANCE WITH CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CRITERIA**

A decision on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be based upon the following:

- I. Evaluation of the compatibility of the physical alteration or improvement with surrounding properties and where applicable, compliance with the following criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(1) of the Miami Beach Code (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
  - a. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings as revised from time to time.  
**Satisfied**
  - b. Other guidelines/policies/plans adopted or approved by Resolution or Ordinance by the City Commission.  
**Not Satisfied**  
**The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.**
- II. In determining whether a particular application is compatible with surrounding properties, the Board shall consider the following criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(2) of the Miami Beach Code (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
  - a. Exterior architectural features.  
**Not Satisfied**  
**The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.**
  - b. General design, scale, massing and arrangement.  
**Not Satisfied**

The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.

- c. Texture and material and color.

**Not Satisfied**

The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.

- d. The relationship of a, b, c, above, to other structures and features of the district.

**Not Satisfied**

The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.

- e. The purpose for which the district was created.

**Not Satisfied**

The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.

- f. The relationship of the size, design and siting of any new or reconstructed structure to the landscape of the district.

**Not Applicable**

- g. An historic resources report, containing all available data and historic documentation regarding the building, site or feature.

**Not Satisfied**

- h. The original architectural design or any subsequent modifications that have acquired significance.

**Not Satisfied**

The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way

**Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.**

III. The examination of architectural drawings for consistency with the criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(3) of the Miami Beach Code and stated below, with regard to the aesthetics, appearances, safety, and function of any new or existing structure, public interior space and physical attributes of the project in relation to the site, adjacent structures and properties, and surrounding community. The criteria referenced above are as follows (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):

- a. The location of all existing and proposed buildings, drives, parking spaces, walkways, means of ingress and egress, drainage facilities, utility services, landscaping structures, signs, and lighting and screening devices.

**Not Satisfied**

**The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.**

- b. The dimensions of all buildings, structures, setbacks, parking spaces, floor area ratio, height, lot coverage and any other information that may be reasonably necessary to determine compliance with the requirements of the underlying zoning district, and any applicable overlays, for a particular application or project.

**Satisfied**

- c. The color, design, surface finishes and selection of landscape materials and architectural elements of the exterior of all buildings and structures and primary public interior areas for developments requiring a building permit in areas of the city identified in section 118-503.

**Not Satisfied**

**The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.**

- d. The proposed structure, and/or additions to an existing structure is appropriate to and compatible with the environment and adjacent structures, and enhances the appearance of the surrounding properties, or the purposes for which the district was created.

**Not Applicable**

- e. The design and layout of the proposed site plan, as well as all new and existing buildings and public interior spaces shall be reviewed so as to provide an efficient arrangement of land uses. Particular attention shall be given to safety,

crime prevention and fire protection, relationship to the surrounding neighborhood, impact on preserving historic character of the neighborhood and district, contiguous and adjacent buildings and lands, pedestrian sight lines and view corridors.

**Not Satisfied**

**The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.**

- f. Pedestrian and vehicular traffic movement within and adjacent to the site shall be reviewed to ensure that clearly defined, segregated pedestrian access to the site and all buildings is provided for and that any driveways and parking spaces are usable, safely and conveniently arranged and have a minimal impact on pedestrian circulation throughout the site. Access to the site from adjacent roads shall be designed so as to interfere as little as possible with vehicular traffic flow on these roads and pedestrian movement onto and within the site, as well as permit both pedestrians and vehicles a safe ingress and egress to the site.

**Not Applicable**

- g. Lighting shall be reviewed to ensure safe movement of persons and vehicles and reflection on public property for security purposes and to minimize glare and reflection on adjacent properties and consistent with a City master plan, where applicable.

**Not Satisfied**

**The speaker devices, misting fans, floodlight style lighting fixtures, wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decorations attached to the primary façade of the 'Contributing' structure adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.**

- h. Landscape and paving materials shall be reviewed to ensure an adequate relationship with and enhancement of the overall site plan design.

**Not Applicable**

- i. Buffering materials shall be reviewed to ensure that headlights of vehicles, noise, and light from Structures are adequately shielded from public view, adjacent properties and pedestrian areas.

**Not Applicable**

- j. Any proposed new structure shall have an orientation and massing which is sensitive to and compatible with the building site and surrounding area and which creates or maintains important view corridor(s).

**Not Applicable**

- k. All buildings shall have, to the greatest extent possible, space in that part of the ground floor fronting a sidewalk, street or streets which is to be occupied for residential or commercial uses; likewise, the upper floors of the pedestal portion of the proposed building fronting a sidewalk street, or streets shall have residential or commercial spaces, or shall have the appearance of being a residential or commercial space or shall have an architectural treatment which shall buffer the appearance of a parking structure from the surrounding area and is integrated with the overall appearance of the project.

**Satisfied**

- l. All buildings shall have an appropriate and fully integrated rooftop architectural treatment which substantially screens all mechanical equipment, stairs and elevator towers.

**Not Applicable**

- m. Any addition on a building site shall be designed, sited and massed in a manner which is sensitive to and compatible with the existing improvement(s).

**Not Applicable**

- n. All portions of a project fronting a street or sidewalk shall incorporate an amount of transparency at the first level necessary to achieve pedestrian compatibility.

**Satisfied**

- o. The location, design, screening and buffering of all required service bays, delivery bays, trash and refuse receptacles, as well as trash rooms shall be arranged so as to have a minimal impact on adjacent properties.

**Not Applicable**

### **STAFF ANALYSIS**

On December 12, 2014, Code Compliance issued Violation No. CE15002897 for “Altering facade without a Certificate of Appropriateness (i.e. speakers; light fixtures; fans; awning extensions; signage; security cameras; etc.)”. Subsequently, the case was sent to the Special Master, Case No. JC5000585, due to non-compliance. The Special Master has given four 45-day extensions in order for the applicant to come into compliance and/or obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The applicant is requesting an after-the-fact approval for the installation of speakers, fans, light fixtures and decorative elements on the primary (Espanola Way) façade of the existing 2-story ‘Contributing’ structure. This highly significant building was constructed in 1925 and designed by Robert A. Taylor in the Mediterranean Revival style of architecture. The applicant’s restaurant occupies the entire ground floor of this building.

### **Speakers**

The existing speaker devices have been installed on the Espanola Way façade and underneath the ground floor awnings. These highly visible devices and their exposed wiring adversely impact the character of the ‘Contributing’ building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.

Staff recommends that all speakers be removed including all exposed wiring and that all speakers be limited to the interior of the building. Interior speakers may be approved administratively and would not require the review and approval of the Historic Preservation Board.

### **Fans**

The existing misting fans are installed on the Espanola Way façade and underneath the ground floor awnings. These highly visible fixtures and their associated exposed conduit and water lines adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.

Staff recommends that all of the existing fans be removed including all exposed conduit and water lines and that any new fans not be permitted to be placed on the exterior walls of attached to the underside of the awnings.

### **Lighting**

The existing floodlight style fixtures with colored lights have been installed in numerous locations along the Espanola Way façade including between the awnings, underneath the awnings and within the barrels located above the awnings. These highly visible fixtures and their associated exposed conduit adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.

Staff recommends that all of the existing floodlight style fixtures be removed, including all exposed conduit and that any new lighting fixtures be similar to the ones currently installed on the adjacent buildings, as shown in the image below. Additionally, staff recommends that the color of the lights be a warm white. This may be approved administratively and would not require the review and approval of the Historic Preservation Board.



*Lighting fixture installed at 428 Espanola Way*

**Wooden barrels and other miscellaneous decoration**

The existing decorative wooden barrels have been installed along the Espanola Way façade including between and above the awning structures. Additionally, the applicant is requesting approval to display a mounted deer head on the exterior of the structure. These highly visible decorations adversely impact the character of the 'Contributing' building and the surrounding Espanola Way Historic District and result in a degradation of the quality of the pedestrian experience.

Staff recommends that all of the barrels and other miscellaneous decorations be removed and that no new decorations be installed on the exterior of the structure.

Finally, staff is seriously concerned that approval of this application would likely result in a proliferation of similar requests throughout the City's historic commercial districts. Consequently, staff recommends that the application be denied.

**RECOMMENDATION**

In view of the foregoing analysis, and the inconsistencies with the aforementioned Certificate of Appropriateness criteria, staff recommends the application be **DENIED**.

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD**  
**City of Miami Beach, Florida**

MEETING DATE: May 10, 2016

FILE NO: 7623

PROPERTY: 429 Espanola Way

LEGAL: Lots 1-6, each less the south 3 feet, Block 3A of Espanola Villas 1st Addition, according to the plat thereof recorded in Plat Book 9, Page 147 of the public records of Miami Dade County, Florida.

IN RE: The Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for an After-the-Fact Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of speakers, fans, light fixtures and decorative elements on the front façade of the existing building.

**ORDER**

The City of Miami Beach Historic Preservation Board makes the following FINDINGS OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

- A. The subject structure is classified as a 'Contributing' structure in the Miami Beach Historic Properties Database, and is located within the Espanola Way Local Historic District.
- B. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted:
  - 1. Is not consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria 'b' in Section 118-564(a)(1) of the Miami Beach Code.
  - 2. Is not consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria 'a', 'b', 'c', 'd', 'e', 'g' & 'h' in Section 118-564(a)(2) of the Miami Beach Code.
  - 3. Is not consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria 'a', 'c', 'e' & 'g' in Section 118-564(a)(3) of the Miami Beach Code.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing findings of fact, the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, and the staff report and analysis, which are adopted herein, including the staff recommendation, that the Certificate of Appropriateness is DENIED for the above-referenced project.

Dated this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 20\_\_\_\_.

