

# MIAMI BEACH

## PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Staff Report & Recommendation

Historic Preservation Board

TO: Chairperson and Members  
Historic Preservation Board

DATE: September 12, 2017

FROM: Thomas R. Mooney, AICP  
Planning Director



SUBJECT: HPB17-0117, **400-1099 Lincoln Road - Lincoln Road Master Plan**.

The applicant, City of Miami Beach, is requesting modifications to a previously issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the design of the Lincoln Road Master plan. The area for the proposed master plan is located within the public right-of-way generally bounded by Lincoln Lane North to the north, Lincoln Lane South to the south, Collins Avenue to the east, and West Avenue to the west. Specifically, the applicant is requesting approval for design modifications and lighting modifications.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness with conditions

### **BACKGROUND**

On September 10, 2014, pursuant to RFQ 2014-050-SR, City Commission approved James Corner Field Operations, LLC, to prepare a Master Plan for Lincoln Road.

On February 9, 2015, James Corner Field Operations, a City consultant commenced work in the development of the "Lincoln Road District Master Plan", a design project that will serve as the basis for future improvements on Lincoln Road, from Lincoln Lane North to Lincoln Lane South, and from West Avenue to Collins Avenue, as well as connecting side streets.

On June 24, 2015, the preliminary master plan concept was presented at a public workshop where input from the community was obtained.

On September 8, 2015, the Lincoln Road Master Plan was presented to the Historic Preservation Board members. Comments from the Board were incorporated into the final design.

On September 30, 2015, the City Commission held a public workshop at which time the Lincoln Road Master Plan was presented.

On October 14, 2015, the City Commission adopted a resolution (no. 2015-29183) approving, in concept, the Master Plan for Lincoln Road, for the refurbishment of the Lincoln Road pedestrian mall, from Washington Avenue to Lenox Avenue, as well as connecting roads from the convention center complex to Lincoln Road (17<sup>th</sup> street from Pennsylvania Avenue to

Washington Avenue; Drexel Avenue; Pennsylvania Avenue; and Meridian Avenue) (collectively, the project); which project was designed by James Corner Field Operations, and includes improvements to the hardscape, landscape, street lighting, and street furnishings.

On November 10, 2015, the Board reviewed and approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the design of the Lincoln Road Master Plan.

On June 19, 2017, the Board reviewed and approved modifications to the previously issued Certificate of Appropriateness and continued the final design for the 400 block gateway structure, Euclid Oval hardscape and folly lighting to a date certain of September 12, 2017.

### **EXISTING STRUCTURE**

Local Historic District: Flamingo Park

### **ZONING / SITE DATA**

Legal Description: A portion of the public-right-of-ways bounded by Lincoln Lane North to the north, Lincoln Lane South to the south, Collins Avenue to the east, and West Avenue to the west, all lying and being in the City of Miami Beach, Florida.

### **THE PROJECT**

The applicant has submitted plans entitled “Lincoln Road District Improvements”, as prepared by James Corner Field Operations, dated August 7, 2017.

**The applicant is requesting approval for the final design of the gateway structure located within the 400 block, folly lighting and Euclid Oval hardscape plan.**

### **COMPLIANCE WITH ZONING CODE**

A preliminary review of the project indicates that the application, as proposed, appears to be consistent with the City Code.

The above noted comments shall not be considered final zoning review or approval. These and all zoning matters shall require final review and verification by the Zoning Administrator prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.

### **COMPLIANCE WITH CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CRITERIA**

A decision on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be based upon the following:

- I. Evaluation of the compatibility of the physical alteration or improvement with surrounding properties and where applicable, compliance with the following criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(1) of the Miami Beach Code (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
  - a. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings as revised from time to time.  
**Satisfied**

- b. Other guidelines/policies/plans adopted or approved by Resolution or Ordinance by the City Commission.  
**Satisfied**
- II. In determining whether a particular application is compatible with surrounding properties, the Board shall consider the following criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(2) of the Miami Beach Code (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
- a. Exterior architectural features.  
**Satisfied**
  - b. General design, scale, massing and arrangement.  
**Satisfied**
  - c. Texture and material and color.  
**Satisfied**
  - d. The relationship of a, b, c, above, to other structures and features of the district.  
**Satisfied**
  - e. The purpose for which the district was created.  
**Satisfied**
  - f. The relationship of the size, design and siting of any new or reconstructed structure to the landscape of the district.  
**Satisfied**
  - g. An historic resources report, containing all available data and historic documentation regarding the building, site or feature.  
**Satisfied**
  - h. The original architectural design or any subsequent modifications that have acquired significance.  
**Satisfied**
- III. The examination of architectural drawings for consistency with the criteria pursuant to Section 118-564(a)(3) of the Miami Beach Code and stated below, with regard to the aesthetics, appearances, safety, and function of any new or existing structure, public interior space and physical attributes of the project in relation to the site, adjacent structures and properties, and surrounding community. The criteria referenced above are as follows (it is recommended that the listed criteria be found Satisfied, Not Satisfied or Not Applicable, as so noted):
- a. The location of all existing and proposed buildings, drives, parking spaces, walkways, means of ingress and egress, drainage facilities, utility services, landscaping structures, signs, and lighting and screening devices.  
**Satisfied**

- b. The dimensions of all buildings, structures, setbacks, parking spaces, floor area ratio, height, lot coverage and any other information that may be reasonably necessary to determine compliance with the requirements of the underlying zoning district, and any applicable overlays, for a particular application or project.  
**Satisfied**
- c. The color, design, surface finishes and selection of landscape materials and architectural elements of the exterior of all buildings and structures and primary public interior areas for developments requiring a building permit in areas of the city identified in section 118-503.  
**Satisfied**
- d. The proposed structure, and/or additions to an existing structure is appropriate to and compatible with the environment and adjacent structures, and enhances the appearance of the surrounding properties, or the purposes for which the district was created.  
**Satisfied**
- e. The design and layout of the proposed site plan, as well as all new and existing buildings and public interior spaces shall be reviewed so as to provide an efficient arrangement of land uses. Particular attention shall be given to safety, crime prevention and fire protection, relationship to the surrounding neighborhood, impact on preserving historic character of the neighborhood and district, contiguous and adjacent buildings and lands, pedestrian sight lines and view corridors.  
**Satisfied**
- f. Pedestrian and vehicular traffic movement within and adjacent to the site shall be reviewed to ensure that clearly defined, segregated pedestrian access to the site and all buildings is provided for and that any driveways and parking spaces are usable, safely and conveniently arranged and have a minimal impact on pedestrian circulation throughout the site. Access to the site from adjacent roads shall be designed so as to interfere as little as possible with vehicular traffic flow on these roads and pedestrian movement onto and within the site, as well as permit both pedestrians and vehicles a safe ingress and egress to the site.  
**Satisfied**
- g. Lighting shall be reviewed to ensure safe movement of persons and vehicles and reflection on public property for security purposes and to minimize glare and reflection on adjacent properties and consistent with a City master plan, where applicable.  
**Satisfied**
- h. Landscape and paving materials shall be reviewed to ensure an adequate relationship with and enhancement of the overall site plan design.  
**Satisfied**

- i. Buffering materials shall be reviewed to ensure that headlights of vehicles, noise, and light from Structures are adequately shielded from public view, adjacent properties and pedestrian areas.  
**Satisfied**
- j. Any proposed new structure shall have an orientation and massing which is sensitive to and compatible with the building site and surrounding area and which creates or maintains important view corridor(s).  
**Satisfied**
- k. All buildings shall have, to the greatest extent possible, space in that part of the ground floor fronting a sidewalk, street or streets which is to be occupied for residential or commercial uses; likewise, the upper floors of the pedestal portion of the proposed building fronting a sidewalk street, or streets shall have residential or commercial spaces, or shall have the appearance of being a residential or commercial space or shall have an architectural treatment which shall buffer the appearance of a parking structure from the surrounding area and is integrated with the overall appearance of the project.  
**Satisfied**
- l. All buildings shall have an appropriate and fully integrated rooftop architectural treatment which substantially screens all mechanical equipment, stairs and elevator towers.  
**Satisfied**
- m. Any addition on a building site shall be designed, sited and massed in a manner which is sensitive to and compatible with the existing improvement(s).  
**Satisfied**
- n. All portions of a project fronting a street or sidewalk shall incorporate an amount of transparency at the first level necessary to achieve pedestrian compatibility.  
**Satisfied**
- o. The location, design, screening and buffering of all required service bays, delivery bays, trash and refuse receptacles, as well as trash rooms shall be arranged so as to have a minimal impact on adjacent properties.  
**Not Applicable**

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR DEMOLITION EVALUATION CRITERIA:**

Section 118-564 (f)(4) of the Land Development Regulations of the Miami Beach Code provides criteria by which the Historic Preservation Board evaluates requests for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition. The following is an analysis of the request based upon these criteria:

- a. The Building, Structure, Improvement, or Site is designated on either a national or state level as a part of an Historic Preservation District or as a Historic Architectural Landmark or Site, or is designated pursuant to Division 4, Article X, Chapter 118 of the Miami Beach Code as a Historic Building, Historic Structure or Historic Site, Historic Improvement, Historic Landscape Feature, historic interior or the Structure is of such

historic/architectural interest or quality that it would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for such designation.

**Satisfied**

**The existing site is located within the Flamingo Park Local Historic District, and is individually listed as an historic site on the National Register of Historic Places.**

- b. The Building, Structure, Improvement, or Site is of such design, craftsmanship, or material that it could be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.

**Satisfied**

**The existing ‘Contributing’ structures would be difficult and inordinately expensive to reproduce.**

- c. The Building, Structure, Improvement, or Site is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the country, or the region, or is a distinctive example of an architectural or design style which contributes to the character of the district.

**Satisfied**

**The existing ‘Contributing’ structures are several of the last remaining examples of their kind and are distinctive examples of an architectural or design style which contributes to the character of the district.**

- d. The building, structure, improvement, or site is a contributing building, structure, improvement, site or landscape feature rather than a noncontributing building, structure, improvement, site or landscape feature in a historic district as defined in section 114-1, or is an architecturally significant feature of a public area of the interior of a historic or contributing building.

**Satisfied**

**The structures are designated as ‘Contributing’ in the Miami Beach Historic Properties Database.**

- e. Retention of the Building, Structure, Improvement, Landscape Feature or Site promotes the general welfare of the City by providing an opportunity for study of local history, architecture, and design or by developing an understanding of the importance and value of a particular culture and heritage.

**Satisfied**

**The retention of the ‘Contributing’ structures is critical to developing an understanding of an important Miami Beach architectural style.**

- f. If the proposed demolition is for the purpose of constructing a parking garage, the Board shall consider it if the parking garage is designed in a manner that is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, U.S. Department of the Interior (1983), as amended, and/or the design review guidelines for that particular district.

**Not Applicable**

**The demolition proposed in the subject application is not for the purpose of constructing a parking garage.**

- g. In the event an applicant or property owner proposes the total demolition of a contributing structure, historic structure or architecturally significant feature, there shall be definite plans presented to the board for the reuse of the property if the proposed

demolition is approved and carried out.

**Not Applicable**

**The applicant is not proposing total demolition.**

- h. The Dade County Unsafe Structures Board has ordered the demolition of a Structure without option.

**Not Applicable**

**The Miami-Dade County Unsafe Structures Board has not ordered the demolition of any part of the subject building.**

**STAFF ANALYSIS**

On November 10, 2015, the Board reviewed and approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for design of the Lincoln Road Master Plan. The approved Master Plan encompasses the Lincoln Road pedestrian mall, from Washington Avenue to Lenox Avenue, as well as connecting roads from the convention center complex to Lincoln Road (17<sup>th</sup> Street from Pennsylvania Avenue to Washington Avenue; Drexel Avenue; Pennsylvania Avenue; and Meridian Avenue). The project was designed by James Corner Field Operations, and includes improvements to the hardscape, landscape, street lighting, and street furnishings.

As part of the Certificate of Appropriateness approval, the Board imposed the following conditions:

Condition C.1.a:

*The gateway structure located at the 400 block of Lincoln Road shall be further developed. The final design and details, including materials, dimensions and finishes shall be provided, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by the Board, prior to the issuance of a building permit for this structure.*

Condition C.1.e:

*The design for the Euclid Oval shall be further developed, and the applicant shall explore a larger area for the active portion. The final design and details, including materials, dimensions and finishes shall be provided, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by the Board, prior to the issuance of a building permit for this structure.*

The applicant is currently requesting approval for the final designs of the gateway structure located within the 400 block and the Euclid Oval as well as the lighting design for the folly structures located along the 600, 800 and 1000 blocks of Lincoln Road.

- **New gateway structure at the 400 Block**

The 400 block of Lincoln Road was significantly altered as part of the renovations that occurred in the mid-1990s. The original Lapidus kiosk structure and flag masts were replaced with new landscape and a contemporary sculpture designed by architect Carlos Zapata, completed in 1999. The approved Master Plan includes the removal of the Zapata sculpture and the introduction of a new distinctive gateway structure. Since the June 19<sup>th</sup> meeting, the design for the louvered trellis gateway structure has been further developed in response to concerns expressed by the Board. Modifications to the design include the enlargement of the trellis fin depth, increase in the depth of the trellis beams

and increase in the diameter of the supporting columns. The currently proposed design has a greater visual presence when viewed from Washington Avenue which staff believes successfully addresses the concerns expressed by the Board.

- **Lighting**

Since the June meeting, the applicant has made the following modifications to the lighting design for the Lapidus follies:

600 block

The previously proposed wall mounted channels and perimeter channel lighting have been removed. The applicant is currently proposing to introduce a wall mounted linear light feature that closely recalls the original lighting feature for this folly as seen in historical photographs.

800 block

The previously proposed lighting channels have been removed and replaced with small, radial light fixtures mounted to the underside of the roof slab.

1000 block

The previously proposed lighting channels along the perimeter of the flat roof structure have been removed and less visible channels are proposed to be installed at the vaulted portion of the follies only.

Staff believes that the currently proposed folly lighting is consistent with Morris Lapidus' vision for Lincoln Road and does not believe that the lighting will have any adverse impact on the historic resources or surrounding historic district.

- **Euclid Oval**

At the June 19<sup>th</sup> meeting, the Board requested that the applicant explore the use of a paving material softer than the proposed glazed ceramic tile with the intention of preventing injuries to children who currently play within the oval. The project designers have explored several different options including the retention of artificial turf and the introduction of a rubberized material. At this time, the City is requesting approval for the ceramic glazed tile presented to the Board on June 19<sup>th</sup>, for reasons outlined in a letter from the Office of Capital Improvement Projects, dated August 7, 2017. These reasons include the approved use and program for the space, concerns related to maintenance, and public input.

**RECOMMENDATION**

In view of the foregoing analysis, staff recommends the application be **approved** subject to the conditions enumerated in the attached draft Order.



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD  
City of Miami Beach, Florida**

MEETING DATE: September 12, 2017

FILE NO: HPB17-0117

PROPERTY: 400-1099 Lincoln Road

APPLICANT: City of Miami Beach

LEGAL: A portion of the public-right-of-ways bounded by Lincoln Lane North to the north, Lincoln Lane South to the south, Collins Avenue to the east, and West Avenue to the west, all lying and being in the City of Miami Beach, Florida.

IN RE: The application for modifications to a previously issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the design of the Lincoln Road Master plan. The area for the proposed master plan is located within the public right-of-way generally bounded by Lincoln Lane North to the north, Lincoln Lane South to the south, Collins Avenue to the east, and West Avenue to the west. Specifically, the applicant is requesting approval for design modifications and lighting modifications.

**CONSOLIDATED ORDER**

The City of Miami Beach Historic Preservation Board makes the following FINDINGS OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

**I. Certificate of Appropriateness**

- A. The subject site is located within the Flamingo Park Local Historic District.
- B. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted:
  - 1. Is consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(1) of the Miami Beach Code.
  - 2. Is consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(2) of the Miami Beach Code.
  - 3. Is consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria in Section 118-564(a)(3) of the Miami Beach Code.
  - 4. Is consistent with Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria for Demolition in Section 118-564(f)(4) of the Miami Beach Code.

- C. The project would remain consistent with the criteria and requirements of section 118-564 if the following conditions are met:
1. Revised elevation, site plan and floor plan drawings shall be submitted and, at a minimum, such drawings shall incorporate the following:
    - a. The gateway structure located at the 400 block of Lincoln Road shall be further developed and the final design and details, including materials, dimensions and finishes shall be provided, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by the Board, prior to the issuance of a building permit for this structure.
    - b. The new street and directory signage shall be of a design, material and color(s) more consistent with the character and quality of the 'Contributing' structures within historic district, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
    - c. The digital directory sign structure shall be significantly reduced in size, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
    - d. There shall be no general advertising permitted to be displayed on the digital directory signage.
    - e. ~~The design for the Euclid Oval shall be further developed, and the applicant shall explore a larger area for the active portion. The introduction of a softer paving material shall be explore for the active surface of the Euclid Oval shall and the~~ The final design and details of the Euclid Oval, including materials, dimensions and finishes shall be provided, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by the Board, staff consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board, prior to the issuance of a building permit for this structure.
    - f. The final design and details of all exterior paving, including materials, dimensions and finishes shall be provided, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
    - g. The final design and details of the folly lighting, including materials and finishes shall be provided, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by the Board staff consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board, prior to the issuance of a building permit for the lighting elements.
  2. The phased development schedule shall be approved in accordance with the timeframe set forth for Phase 1 through Phase 3, as submitted by the applicant.

3. The Board recommends that the applicant explore placing utilities underground within the Master Plan area to the greatest extent possible, subject to the review and approval of the Public Works Department.
4. A revised landscape plan, prepared by a Professional Landscape Architect, registered in the State of Florida, and corresponding site plan, shall be submitted to and approved by staff. The species type, quantity, dimensions, spacing, location and overall height of all plant material shall be clearly delineated and subject to the review and approval of staff. At a minimum, such plan shall incorporate the following:
  - a. All existing, healthy canopy trees shall be retained to the greatest extent possible, subject to the review and approval of the City's Greenspace Management Department.
  - b. The utilization of root barriers and/or Silva Cells, as applicable, shall be clearly delineated on the final revised landscape plan.
  - c. A fully automatic irrigation system with 100% coverage and an automatic rain sensor in order to render the system inoperative in the event of rain. Right-of-way areas shall also be incorporated as part of the irrigation system.
  - d. A canopy tree shall be introduced within the planter located west of the Euclid Oval seating feature, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Certificate of Appropriateness Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.

**In accordance with Section 118-537, the applicant, the owner(s) of the subject property, the City Manager, Miami Design Preservation League, Dade Heritage Trust, or an affected person may appeal the Board's decision on a Certificate of Appropriateness to a special master appointed by the City Commission.**

## **II. Variance(s)**

- A. No variances have been requested as part of the application.

## **III. General Terms and Conditions applying to both 'I. Certificate of Appropriateness' and 'II. Variances' noted above.**

- A. This Final Order consolidates all conditions and requirements for Certificate of Appropriateness and Variance approval as same as are contained herein, in the original Order dated November 10, 2015 and the Order dated June 19, 2017. Accordingly, this Order shall serve as the Final Order for the proposed project and, in the event of conflict between the provisions hereof and those of the September 12, 2017 Order, the provisions hereof shall control.

- B. A Construction Parking and Traffic Management Plan (CPTMP) shall be approved by the Parking Director pursuant to Chapter 106, Article II, Division 3 of the City Code, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.
- C. Where one or more parcels are unified for a single development, the property owner shall execute and record a unity of title or a covenant in lieu of unity of title, as may be applicable, in a form acceptable to the City Attorney.
- D. All applicable FPL transformers or vault rooms and backflow prevention devices shall be located within the building envelope with the exception of the valve (PIV) which may be visible and accessible from the street.
- E. A copy of all pages of the recorded Final Order shall be scanned into the plans submitted for building permit, and shall be located immediately after the front cover page of the permit plans.
- F. The Final Order shall be recorded in the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.
- G. Satisfaction of all conditions is required for the Planning Department to give its approval on a Certificate of Occupancy; a Temporary Certificate of Occupancy or Partial Certificate of Occupancy may also be conditionally granted Planning Departmental approval.
- H. The Final Order is not severable, and if any provision or condition hereof is held void or unconstitutional in a final decision by a court of competent jurisdiction, the order shall be returned to the Board for reconsideration as to whether the order meets the criteria for approval absent the stricken provision or condition, and/or it is appropriate to modify the remaining conditions or impose new conditions.
- I. The conditions of approval herein are binding on the applicant, the property's owners, operators, and all successors in interest and assigns.
- J. Nothing in this order authorizes a violation of the City Code or other applicable law, nor allows a relaxation of any requirement or standard set forth in the City Code.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing findings of fact, the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, and the staff report and analysis, which are adopted herein, including the staff recommendations, which were amended and adopted by the Board, that the application is GRANTED for the above-referenced project subject to those certain conditions specified in Paragraph I, II, III of the Findings of Fact, to which the applicant has agreed.

PROVIDED, the applicant shall build substantially in accordance with the plans entitled "Lincoln Road District Master Plan", as prepared by James Corner Field Operations, dated August 28,



The foregoing instrument was acknowledged before me this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 20\_\_ by Deborah Tackett, Chief of Historic Preservation, Planning Department, City of Miami Beach, Florida, a Florida Municipal Corporation, on behalf of the corporation. She is personally known to me.

\_\_\_\_\_  
NOTARY PUBLIC  
Miami-Dade County, Florida  
My commission expires: \_\_\_\_\_

Approved As To Form:  
City Attorney's Office: \_\_\_\_\_ ( )

Filed with the Clerk of the Historic Preservation Board on \_\_\_\_\_ ( )

~~Strike-Thru~~ denotes deleted language  
Underscore denotes new language