

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
City of Miami Beach, Florida

MEETING DATE: October 4th, 2022

PROPERTY: **4-6 Star Island Drive** **02-4204-001-0040**
 02-4204-001-0050
 02-4204-001-0060

FILE NO: DRB22-0859

IN RE: An application for Design Review Approval for the construction of a new two-story residence with an understory, including a variance to exceed the maximum height allowed for an elevator bulkhead the maximum fence height allowed, and from the understory requirements, to replace all existing structures.

LEGAL: LOTS 4, 5 & 6, CORRECTED PLAT OF STAR ISLAND, ACCORDING TO THE PLAT THEREOF, AS RECORDED IN PLAT BOOK 31, AT PAGE 60, OF THE PUBLIC RECORDS OF MIAMI-DADE COUNTY, FLORIDA, CONTAINING 121,500 (40, 500 PER LOT) SQUARE FEET/2.78 ACRES.

APPLICANT: Brian L. Bilzin as Trustee under Trust No. 2401-3302-00 (4 & 5 Star Island)

ORDER

The City of Miami Beach Design Review Board makes the following FINDINGS OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

I. Design Review

- A. The Board has jurisdiction pursuant to Section 118-252(a) of the Miami Beach Code. The property is not located within a designated local historic district and is not an individually designated historic site.
- B. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted is inconsistent with Design Review Criteria 9 and 19 in Section 118-251 of the Miami Beach Code.
- C. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted is inconsistent with Sea Level Rise Criteria 1 and 10 in Section 133-50(a) of the Miami Beach Code.
- D. The project would be consistent with the criteria and requirements of Section 118-251 and/ or Section 133-50(a) if the following conditions are met:

1. Revised elevation, site plan, and floor plan drawings for the proposed new home at 4-6 Star Island shall be submitted, at a minimum, such drawings shall incorporate the following:
 - a. The design of the understory area **shall be** approved as proposed.
 - b. The final design details and color selection of the lime plaster stucco shall be submitted, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Design Review Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - c. The final design details and color selection of the stone cladding shall be submitted, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Design Review Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - d. The final design details and color selection of the aluminum cladding shall be submitted, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Design Review Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - e. The final design details and color selection of the exterior aluminum screen shall be submitted, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Design Review Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - f. The final design details of the exterior materials and finishes shall be submitted, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Design Review Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - g. Prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the project Architect shall verify, in writing, that the subject project has been constructed in accordance with the plans approved by the Planning Department for Building Permit.
2. A revised landscape plan, prepared by a Professional Landscape Architect, registered in the State of Florida, and corresponding plans shall be submitted to and approved by staff. The species, type, quantity, dimensions, spacing, location and overall height of all plant material shall be clearly delineated and subject to the review and approval of staff. At a minimum, such plans shall comply with Chapter 26-Landscape Requirements of the Miami Beach Code and shall incorporate the following:
 - a. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit a tree protection plan for all trees to be retained on site. Such plan shall be subject to the review and approval of staff, and shall include, but not be limited to a sturdy tree protection fence installed at the dripline of the trees prior to any construction.
 - b. In order to identify, protect and preserve mature trees on site, which are suitable for retention and relocation, a Tree Report prepared by a Certified Tree Arborist shall be submitted for the mature trees on site.

- c. Prior to any site demolition work, a tree protection fence following the City standard shall be installed for trees scheduled to remain subject to the review and approval of the City Urban Forester.
- d. Any necessary root and tree branch pruning with a diameter at breast height (DBH) of 2" or greater shall be approved by the City Urban Forester prior to any tree work.
- e. Any tree identified to be in good overall condition shall be retained, and protected in its current location if not in conflict with the proposed home, or they shall be relocated on site, if determined feasible, subject to the review and approval of staff. A tree care and watering plan also prepared by a Certified Arborist shall be submitted prior to the issuance of a Building Permit or Tree Removal/Relocation Permit. Subsequent to any approved relocation, a monthly report prepared by a Certified Arborist shall be provided to staff describing the overall tree performance and adjustments to the maintenance plan in order to ensure survivability, such report shall continue for a period of 18 months unless determined otherwise by staff.
- f. Existing trees to be retained on site shall be protected from all types of construction disturbance. Root cutting, storage of soil or construction materials, movement of heavy vehicles, change in drainage patterns, and wash of concrete or other materials shall be prohibited.
- g. The proposed and existing trees located within the swale shall be subject to the review and approval of Green Space and CIP.
- h. Street trees shall be required within the swale at the front of the property if not in conflict with existing utilities, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by the Public Works Department.
- i. Any proposed new street trees shall be of a planting species consistent or similar with existing street trees in the immediate area or consistent with any master street tree plan for the area, subject to the review and approval of the City Urban Forester.
- j. Any existing plant material within the public right-of-way may be required to be removed, as the discretion of the Public Works Department.
- k. A fully automatic irrigation system with 100% coverage and an automatic rain sensor in order to render the system inoperative in the event of rain. Right-of-way areas shall also be incorporated as part of the irrigation system.
- l. The utilization of root barriers and Silva Cells, as applicable, shall be clearly delineated on the revised landscape plan.
- m. Prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the Landscape Architect or the project architect shall verify, in writing, that the project is consistent

with the site and landscape plans approved by the Planning Department for Building Permit.

In accordance with Section 118-262, the applicant, or the city manager on behalf of the City Administration, or an affected person, Miami Design Preservation League or Dade Heritage Trust may seek review of any order of the Design Review Board by the City Commission, except that orders granting or denying a request for rehearing shall not be reviewed by the Commission.

II. Variance(s)

- A. The applicant filed an application with the Planning Department for the following variance(s), which were either approved by the Board or denied:
1. A variance from Sec. 142-105(b)(4)(d)(1) to allow the understory to be substantially enclosed on the east side when 50% is required to be open. **[Variance Approved]**
 2. A variance from Sec. 142-105(b)(4)(d)(10) to reduce the required 5'-0" setback from each side of the underneath of the slab of the first habitable floor above for all decking, gravel, pavers, non-supporting breakaway walls, open-wood lattice work, louvers or similar architectural treatments to a 0' 0" setback on each side. **[Variance Approved]**
 3. A variance to exceed by 3'-0" the maximum height allowed of 10'-0" feet above the roofline in order to construct an elevator bulkhead up to 13'-0" above the roofline. **[Variance Approved]**
 4. A variance to exceed by 2'-1" the maximum allowed height of 7'-0" for a fence in order to construct a fence along the interior side yard up to 9'-1" above an adjusted grade elevation of 7.88' NGVD. **[Variance Denied]**
- B. The applicant has submitted plans and documents with the application that the Board has concluded satisfy Article 1, Section 2 of the Related Special Acts allowing the granting of variance #1 if the Board finds that practical difficulties exist with respect to implementing the proposed project at the subject property.

The applicant has submitted plans and documents with the application that the Board has concluded comply with the following hardship criteria, as they relate to the requirements of Section 118-353(d), Miami Beach City Code:

That special conditions and circumstances exist which are peculiar to the land, structure, or building involved and which are not applicable to other lands, structures, or buildings in the same zoning district;

That the special conditions and circumstances do not result from the action of the applicant;

That granting the variance requested will not confer on the applicant any special

privilege that is denied by this Ordinance to other lands, buildings, or structures in the same zoning district;

That literal interpretation of the provisions of this Ordinance would deprive the applicant of rights commonly enjoyed by other properties in the same zoning district under the terms of this Ordinance and would work unnecessary and undue hardship on the applicant;

That the variance granted is the minimum variance that will make possible the reasonable use of the land, building or structure;

That the granting of the variance will be in harmony with the general intent and purpose of this Ordinance and that such variance will not be injurious to the area involved or otherwise detrimental to the public welfare, and

That the granting of this request is consistent with the comprehensive plan and does not reduce the levels of service as set forth in the plan.

The granting of the variance will result in a structure and site that complies with the sea level rise and resiliency review criteria in chapter 133, article II, as applicable.

- C. The Board hereby **Approves** Variance requests #1, #2 and #3 and **Denies** variance #4 and imposes the following conditions based on its authority in Section 118-354 of the Miami Beach City Code:
1. Substantial modifications to the plans submitted and approved as part of the application, as determined by the Planning Director or designee, may require the applicant to return to the Board for approval of the modified plans, even if the modifications do not affect variances approved by the Board.

The decision of the Board regarding variances shall be final and there shall be no further review thereof except by resort to a court of competent jurisdiction by petition for writ of certiorari.

III. General Terms and Conditions applying to both 'I. Design Review Approval and 'II. Variances' noted above.

- A. The final building plans shall meet all other requirements of the Land Development Regulations of the City Code.
- B. The Final Order shall be recorded in the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.
- C. Satisfaction of all conditions is required for the Planning Department to give its approval on a Certificate of Occupancy; a Temporary Certificate of Occupancy or Partial Certificate of Occupancy may also be conditionally granted Planning Departmental approval.

- D. The Final Order is not severable, and if any provision or condition hereof is held void or unconstitutional in a final decision by a court of competent jurisdiction, the order shall be returned to the Board for reconsideration as to whether the order meets the criteria for approval absent the stricken provision or condition, and/or it is appropriate to modify the remaining conditions or impose new conditions.
- E. The conditions of approval herein are binding on the applicant, the property's owners, operators, and all successors in interest and assigns.
- F. Nothing in this order authorizes a violation of the City Code or other applicable law, nor allows a relaxation of any requirement or standard set forth in the City Code.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing findings of fact, the evidence, information testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, and the staff report and analysis, which are adopted herein, including the staff recommendations, which were amended and adopted by the Board, that the **application** is GRANTED for the above-referenced project subject to those certain conditions specified in Paragraph I, II, III of the Finding of Fact, to which the applicant has agreed.

PROVIDED, the applicant shall build substantially in accordance with the plans, entitled "4, 5, 6 Star Island Drive, Miami Beach, Florida ", as designed by **Domo Architecture + Design**, signed, sealed, and dated August 8th, 2021, and as approved by the Design Review Board, as determined by staff.

The issuance of the approval does not relieve the applicant from obtaining all other required Municipal, County and/or State reviews and permits, including final zoning approval. If adequate handicapped access is not provided on the Board approved plans, this approval does not mean that such handicapped access is not required. When requesting Building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order.

If the Full Building Permit for the project is not issued within eighteen (18) months of the meeting date at which the original approval was granted, the application will expire and become null and void, unless the applicant makes an application to the Board for an extension of time, in accordance with the requirements and procedures of Chapter 118 of the City Code, the granting of any such extension of time shall be at the discretion of the Board. If the Full Building Permit for the project shall expire for any reason (including but not limited to construction not commencing and continuing, with required inspections, in accordance with the applicable Building Code), the application will expire and become null and void.

In accordance with Chapter 118 of the City Code, the violation of any conditions and safeguards that are a part of this Order shall be deemed a violation of the land development regulations of the City Code. Failure to comply with this **Order** shall subject the application to Chapter 118 of the City Code, for revocation or modification of the application.

Dated _____.

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA

BY: _____
Michael Belush, AICP
Chief of Planning and Zoning
For Chairman

STATE OF FLORIDA)
)SS
COUNTY OF MIAMI-DADE)

The foregoing instrument was acknowledged before me this _____ day of _____ 20__ by Michael Belush, Chief of Planning and Zoning of the City of Miami Beach, Florida, a Florida Municipal Corporation, on behalf of the Corporation. He is personally known to me.

Notary:
Print Name
Notary Public, State of Florida
My Commission Expires:
Commission Number:

{NOTARIAL SEAL}

Approved As To Form:
City Attorney's Office: _____ ()

Filed with the Clerk of the
Design Review Board on _____ ()