

**From:** [HPB](#)  
**To:** [Bueno, Lizbeth](#); [Fons, Monique](#)  
**Subject:** FW: important to deny this fire station project. MBC Revisit approval? Resubmit to IG?  
**Date:** Tuesday, March 8, 2022 10:18:24 AM

---

Please process.

---

**From:** Johann Moore <johannmoore859@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, March 7, 2022 2:01 PM  
**To:** Clotilde L Luce <clluce@bellsouth.net>; Meridian Court <meridiancourtcommunity@gmail.com>  
**Cc:** AUGER007@aol.com; Beth Dunlop <beth.dunlop@gmail.com>; Christina LaBuzetta <christina@locationresources.com>; David McKinney <daviddmckinney@yahoo.com>; Fernandez, Alex <Alex@miamibeachfl.gov>; Francoise Capdeboscq <francoise.capdeboscq@gmail.com>; Gelber, Dan <DanGelber@miamibeachfl.gov>; Jack Finglass <jackfinglass@gmail.com>; Meiner, Steven <StevenMeiner@miamibeachfl.gov>; Richardson, David <DavidRichardson@miamibeachfl.gov>; Arriola, Ricky <RickyArriola@miamibeachfl.gov>; Rosen Gonzalez, Kristen <Kristen@miamibeachfl.gov>; Samuelian, Mark <Mark@miamibeachfl.gov>; Scott Needelman <san1455@att.net>; HPB <HPB@miamibeachfl.gov>; nina worth <ninanevanu@gmail.com>  
**Subject:** Re: important to deny this fire station project. MBC Revisit approval? Resubmit to IG?

**[ THIS MESSAGE COMES FROM AN EXTERNAL EMAIL - USE CAUTION WHEN REPLYING AND OPENING LINKS OR ATTACHMENTS ]**

Dear neighbours, Mayor Gelber and esteemed Commissioners and Members of HPB,

We cannot agree more with the below assessment but fear that as per the City Attorney's Office, much of the below lies outside of the purview of HPB and we therefore respectfully request that the Miami Beach Commission revisit its decision(s) in furtherance of this ill-sited fire-station and that the Inspector General's Office review its finding of no violation of the public-right-to-know law. While some of the immediate neighbours-as well as others-find the redesign of the fire-station to be less oppressive and while some feel reassured by the as yet vague assurances of temporary relocation of the childcare centre, there remain significant outstanding issues as yet unaddressed, including mitigation of parking space losses; a proposed pervious, greened parking plaza to the south of the proposed station and the seemingly fiscally responsible municipal purchase of a permanent, convenient site for a childcare facility in proximity to 5th street and its transportation options as well as to beloved community-anchoring businesses.

Additionally, we would caution against proceeding with this project in the absence of comprehensive flood-prevention/mitigation infrastructure, likely including catchment basins/reservoirs with pumps under an adjacent essential road-raising project such as the access and egress routes between the proposed fire-station and the causeway. Only then should construction of a new fire-station begin. We note that the above seemingly essential large-scale excavation work would likely cut through and expose approximately 2000 years of possible bio-anthropological and archaeological material, potentially including culturally significant objects and possible human remains which of course trigger federal protections as well as oversight by related surviving Indigenous Nations. We would continue to urge CMB to pursue purchase of a 5th street site such as a redundant gas-station but are open to the proposed site at Alton and 4th street, assuming that neighbourhood's consent.

MCC remains open to pursuing mitigations related to the 6th street site should that proposal move forward.

MCC remains open to support of motions in FPNA regarding the above requests to revisit the currently proposed project as well as questions regarding infrastructure and sequence of events in case the current project proceeds.

Thank you,  
Johann

On Mon, Mar 7, 2022 at 12:23 PM Clotilde L Luce <[clluce@bellsouth.net](mailto:clluce@bellsouth.net)> wrote:

To the HPB

Esteemed HPB members

The preservation issues revolving around this building are obvious and have been well-stated by widely regarded architectural historians and experts. But those are not the only considerations here.

Please consider three fundamental (and common sense) reasons for denying the fire station project before you.

1. A series of bad planning decision, barely discussed in public--even though they entail the expenditure of a considerable amount public money-- that have produced a proposed building with incompatible massing and design to be thrust on a low-scale very pedestrian neighborhood disrupting the architectural harmony of the district.
- 2- The choice of this site would also cause havoc: fire engines rushing to emergencies, would make wide turns into narrow streets before reaching wider streets endangering some lives (it is a pedestrian district) as they rush off to save others,. It is not too late to reverse a poor planning decision made two years ago and pushed through with insufficient transparency.
- 3 - The third reason for denying this project concerns a flawed process from insufficient notice to parents and residents (whose lives will be disrupted) to the city's evasions on comparing costs of replacing the daycare center and playground. Left undiscussed, at least in public, are the true costs of demolition (not to mention the environmental impact) compared to costs of far better alternative sites. The flaws in the process include the city's failure to post public comment sent to the HPB from respected authorities on preservation, to a very perfunctory review of better alternative sites which would allow saving money, saving a public facility, and of course saving the architecturally important Lapidus ensemble and playground. The city even barred an architectural photographer, with previous published photos of Lapidus in his own design environment, from taking photos of the building's interiors.... in sum, months of eluding the public right to know.

As the attached January 22 email a group of us sent to the Commission stated, residents had urged the HPB " to question the murky pattern of clearly inadequate notification of residents, parents, plus evasiveness on true costs of replacing the daycare center and playground. " Not only were parents not noticed and local residents not noticed, while the project was being pushed, but no public meeting was even called until shortly before the Commission was to vote, and only at the urging of one commissioner were the high costs of renting a space for the daycare finally provided.

Far safer 'turn ratio' conditions can be found in other sites, one being the City-owned empty lot at the NE corner of 4th and Alton, offering wide open fire truck exits immediately onto a 4 - lane thoroughfare.

A win/win solution would be to 1 - not pay to demolish the Lapidus center and the lovely and irreplaceable outdoor playground, thus saving both history AND money by 2 - choosing the City-owned empty lot for a new well-designed station, the lot providing sufficient space and proximity to city parking, for fire fighters to park their own vehicles. The lot abuts empty retail and our two biggest north south/east west streets. As is being implemented in Europe, sirens can go quiet at night.

This would be a WIN for the fireman's union, a WIN for preservationists, for parents, for reduced public costs, for real sustainability not the gratuitous demolition of a Lapidus, and a real WIN/WIN for the city's public relations image.

Yours truly,

Beth Dunlop  
Jack Finglass  
Christina Labuzetta  
Clotilde Luce  
Nina Worth

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** Clotilde L Luce <[clluce@bellsouth.net](mailto:clluce@bellsouth.net)>  
**Subject:** questions of process for HPB 21-0483 833 6th St item tomorrow  
**Date:** January 10, 2022 at 11:45:50 AM EST  
**To:** Jack Finglass  
<[jackfinglass@gmail.com](mailto:jackfinglass@gmail.com)>, [HPB@miamibeachfl.gov](mailto:HPB@miamibeachfl.gov)  
**Cc:** "Rosen Gonzalez, Kristen" <[kristen@miamibeachfl.gov](mailto:kristen@miamibeachfl.gov)>,

"Meiner, Steven" <[stevenmeiner@miamibeachfl.gov](mailto:stevenmeiner@miamibeachfl.gov)>, Mark Samuelian <[mark@miamibeachfl.gov](mailto:mark@miamibeachfl.gov)>, "Gonzalez, Jessica" <[JessicaGonzalez@miamibeachfl.gov](mailto:JessicaGonzalez@miamibeachfl.gov)>, David MCKINNEY <[david.d.mckinney416@gmail.com](mailto:david.d.mckinney416@gmail.com)>

To:

HPB Chairman Jack Finglass

c/c Commissioners Rosen Gonzalez Meiner Samuelian

c/c Jessica Gonzalez

c/c David McKinney

re: why the omission of David McKinney's and Professor Wilson's public comments for item HPB 21-0483 833 Sixth Street?

Dear Chairman Finglass,

On the agenda my name is cited among those whose public comments appear in your File for Tuesday's meeting. In fact ours was a group statement signed by Beth Dunlop, Nina Worth, Franziska Medina, David Grieser, Patrick Breshike, Christina Labuzetta, and David McKinney, in which we urge the Board to question the murky pattern of clearly inadequate notification of residents, parents, plus evasiveness on true costs of replacing the daycare center and playground.

Thank you for again reviewing our suggestions on obtaining a far better outcome.

But are you and other Board members aware that the most seriously researched public comments were for some reason not included in the package, nor online?

Highly pertinent comments sent in from David McKinney and Professor Richard Guy Wilson, of the **National Landmarks Committee**, had been omitted.

Was this due to some oversight?

Even if this has now been rectified, we must ask, is there a protocol allowing Staff to edit out and discard public comment?

Would this not compromise 'the public right to know' — including your Board's right to know ?

Failure to sufficiently notice residents and parents on a major upheaval in their lives, then not posting McKinney and Prof. Wilson's fully researched information, raises questions on protocols for

serving the public interest.

And again, said public interest would be far better served with a far safer fire station location, and retention of an essential services hub designed above grade by our most important architect.

Yours truly,  
Clotilde Luce  
Miami Beach

--

Johann Moore  
7 Reed Road  
New Hamburg, NY 12590

mobile phone +1 845 705 4022