

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
City of Miami Beach, Florida

MEETING DATE: September 10, 2021

PROPERTY/FOLIO: **4-6 Star Island Drive**
02-4204-001-0040, 02-4204-001-0050 and
02-4204-001-0060

FILE NO: DRB21-0675

IN RE: An application has been filed requesting Design Review Approval for the construction of a new two-story single-family home with an understory area, including one or more waivers and variances from the understory requirements, from the setback requirements, from the maximum height for an elevator bulkhead and from the maximum height allowed for fences, to replace the two (2) existing residences comprised of multiple structures

LEGAL: Lot 4, of "CORRECTED PLAT OF STAR ISLAND", according to Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 31, at Page 60, Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida; and

Lot 5, of "CORRECTED PLAT OF STAR ISLAND", according to Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 31, at Page 60, Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida; and

Lot 6, of "CORRECTED PLAT OF STAR ISLAND", according to Plat thereof, recorded in Plat Book 31, at Page 60, Public Records of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

APPLICANT: Brian Bilzin as Trustee, 6 Star Island Residence Land Trust Agreement and Trust No. 2401-3302-00

ORDER

The City of Miami Beach Design Review Board makes the following FINDINGS OF FACT, based upon the evidence, information, testimony and materials presented at the public hearing and which are part of the record for this matter:

I. Design Review

- A. The Board has jurisdiction pursuant to Section 118-252(a) of the Miami Beach Code. The property is not located within a designated local historic district and is not an individually designated historic site.
- B. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted is inconsistent with Design Review Criteria 9 and 19 in Section 118-251 of the Miami Beach Code.

- C. Based on the plans and documents submitted with the application, testimony and information provided by the applicant, and the reasons set forth in the Planning Department Staff Report, the project as submitted is inconsistent with Sea Level Rise Criteria 1, 10 and 12 in Section 133-50(a) of the Miami Beach Code.
- D. The project would be consistent with the criteria and requirements of Section 118-251 and/ or Section 133-50(a) if the following conditions are met:
1. Revised elevation, site plan, and floor plan drawings for the proposed new home at 4-6 Star Island Drive shall be submitted, at a minimum, such drawings shall incorporate the following:
 - a. The design of the understory area **shall be** permitted as proposed.
 - b. The proposed (south) interior side open space requirement **shall be** waived as proposed.
 - c. The location of the elevator bulkhead **shall be** waived as proposed.
 - d. URBAN HEAT ISLAND ORDINANCE Sec. 142- 1132. g) Driveways. (4) Driveways and parking areas that are open to the sky within any required yard shall be composed of porous pavement or shall have a high albedo surface consisting of a durable material or sealant, as defined in section 114- 1 of this Code. (5) Driveways and parking areas composed of asphalt that does not have a high albedo surface, as defined in section 114- 1 of this Code, shall be prohibited.
 - e. The final design details and finish of the “board form concrete” exterior material shall be submitted, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Design Review Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - f. The final design details of the exterior materials and finishes shall be submitted, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff consistent with the Design Review Criteria and/or the directions from the Board.
 - g. A copy of all pages of the recorded Final Order shall be scanned into the plans submitted for building permit and shall be located immediately after the front cover page of the permit plans.
 - h. Prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the project Architect shall verify, in writing, that the subject project has been constructed in accordance with the plans approved by the Planning Department for Building Permit.
 2. A revised landscape plan, prepared by a Professional Landscape Architect, registered in the State of Florida, and corresponding plans shall be submitted to and approved by staff. The species, type, quantity, dimensions, spacing, location and overall height of all plant material shall be clearly delineated and subject to the review and approval of staff. At a minimum, such plans shall

comply with Chapter 26-Landscape Requirements of the Miami Beach Code and shall incorporate the following:

- a. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit a tree protection plan for all trees to be retained on site. Such plan shall be subject to the review and approval of staff, and shall include, but not be limited to a sturdy tree protection fence installed at the dripline of the trees prior to any construction.
- b. In order to identify, protect and preserve mature trees on site, which are suitable for retention and relocation, a Tree Report prepared by a Certified Tree Arborist shall be submitted for the mature trees on site.
- c. Prior to any site demolition work, a tree protection fence following the City standard shall be installed for trees scheduled to remain subject to the review and approval of the City Urban Forester.
- d. Any necessary root and tree branch pruning with a diameter at breast height (DBH) of 2" or greater shall be approved by the City Urban Forester prior to any tree work.
- e. Any tree identified to be in good overall condition shall be retained, and protected in their current location if they are not in conflict with the proposed home, or they shall be relocated on site, if determined feasible, subject to the review and approval of staff. A tree care and watering plan also prepared by a Certified Arborist shall be submitted prior to the issuance of a Building Permit or Tree Removal/Relocation Permit. Subsequent to any approved relocation, a monthly report prepared by a Certified Arborist shall be provided to staff describing the overall tree performance and adjustments to the maintenance plan in order to ensure survivability, such report shall continue for a period of 18 months unless determined otherwise by staff.
- f. Existing trees to be retained on site shall be protected from all types of construction disturbance. Root cutting, storage of soil or construction materials, movement of heavy vehicles, change in drainage patterns, and wash of concrete or other materials shall be prohibited.
- g. Street trees shall be required within the swale at the front of the property if not in conflict with existing utilities, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by the Public Works Department.
- h. The proposed and existing trees located within the swale shall be subject to the review and approval of Green Space and CIP
- i. Any proposed new street trees shall be of a planting species consistent or similar with existing street trees in the immediate area or consistent with any master street tree plan for the area, subject to the review and approval of the City Urban Forester.

- j. Any existing plant material within the public right-of-way may be required to be removed, as the discretion of the Public Works Department.
- k. A fully automatic irrigation system with 100% coverage and an automatic rain sensor in order to render the system inoperative in the event of rain. Right-of-way areas shall also be incorporated as part of the irrigation system.
- l. The utilization of root barriers and Silva Cells, as applicable, shall be clearly delineated on the revised landscape plan.
- m. The applicant shall verify, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit, the exact location of all backflow preventors and all other related devices and fixtures. The location of backflow preventors, Siamese pipes or other related devices and fixtures, if any, and how they are screened with landscape material from the right-of-way, shall be clearly indicated on the site and landscape plans, and shall be subject to the review and approval of staff.
- n. The applicant shall verify, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit, the exact location of all applicable FPL transformers or vault rooms. The location of any exterior transformers and how they are screened with landscape material from the right-of-way shall be clearly indicated on the site and landscape plans and shall be subject to the review and approval of staff.
- o. Prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy, the Landscape Architect or the project architect shall verify, in writing, that the project is consistent with the site and landscape plans approved by the Planning Department for Building Permit.

In accordance with Section 118-262, the applicant, or the city manager on behalf of the City Administration, or an affected person, Miami Design Preservation League or Dade Heritage Trust may seek review of any order of the Design Review Board by the City Commission, except that orders granting or denying a request for rehearing shall not be reviewed by the Commission.

II. Variance(s)

- A. The applicant filed an application with the Planning Department for the following variance(s) which were either approved by the Board with modifications, or denied:

The following variances were approved by the Board:

- 1. A variance to exceed by 3'-0" the maximum height allowed of 10'-0" feet above the roofline in order to construct an elevator bulkhead up to 13'-0" above the roofline.
- 2. A variance to eliminate the requirement to provide 50% open walls on all sides for enclosed understory areas.

3. A variance to eliminate the requirement to provide an understory edge of 5'-0" from each side of the underneath of the slab of the first habitable floor above.

The following variances were denied by the Board:

4. A variance to exceed by 6'-0" the maximum driveway width of 18'-0" to provide a driveway width of 24'-0".
5. A variance to reduce by 23'-2" the minimum required interior side setback of 30'-6" in order to construct a new single family home and retain a non-conforming side setback of 7'-4" on the north side.
6. A variance to reduce by 23'-2" the minimum required sum of the side setbacks of 75'-0" in order to construct a new single family home providing a sum of the side setbacks of 51'-10".
7. A variance to exceed by 0.43' the maximum allowed height of 7'-0" for a fence in order to construct a fence along the north interior side yard up to 7.43' (14.85' NGVD) above adjusted grade elevation of 7.42' NGVD.
8. A variance to exceed by 0.43' the maximum allowed height of 7'-0" for a fence in order to construct a fence along the south interior side yard up to 7.43' (14.85' NGVD) above adjusted grade elevation of 7.42' NGVD.

- B. The applicant has submitted plans and documents with the application that satisfy Article 1, Section 2 of the Related Special Acts, only as it relates to variances #1, #2, and #3 allowing the granting of a variance if the Board finds that practical difficulties exist with respect to implementing the proposed project at the subject property.

The applicant has submitted plans and documents with the application that the Board has concluded comply with the following hardship criteria, as they relate to the requirements of Section 118-353(d), Miami Beach City Code only as it relates to variances #1, #2, and #3:

That special conditions and circumstances exist which are peculiar to the land, structure, or building involved and which are not applicable to other lands, structures, or buildings in the same zoning district;

That the special conditions and circumstances do not result from the action of the applicant;

That granting the variance requested will not confer on the applicant any special privilege that is denied by this Ordinance to other lands, buildings, or structures in the same zoning district;

That literal interpretation of the provisions of this Ordinance would deprive the applicant of rights commonly enjoyed by other properties in the same zoning district under the terms of this Ordinance and would work unnecessary and

undue hardship on the applicant;

That the variance granted is the minimum variance that will make possible the reasonable use of the land, building or structure;

That the granting of the variance will be in harmony with the general intent and purpose of this Ordinance and that such variance will not be injurious to the area involved or otherwise detrimental to the public welfare; and

That the granting of this request is consistent with the comprehensive plan and does not reduce the levels of service as set forth in the plan.

C. The Board hereby **Approves** the variance request(s), #1, #2, and #3 and **Denies** variances #4, #5, #6, #7 and #8 and imposes the following conditions based on its authority in Section 118-354 of the Miami Beach City Code:

1. Substantial modifications to the plans submitted and approved as part of the application, as determined by the Planning Director or designee, may require the applicant to return to the Board for approval of the modified plans, even if the modifications do not affect variances approved by the Board.
2. Revised lot coverage and unit size calculations and diagrams shall be submitted at the time of the building permit to ensure the project complies with the maximum allowed.
3. Details of the existing fence to be retained on the south side shall be submitted at the time of the building permit.

III. General Terms and Conditions applying to both 'I. Design Review Approval and 'II. Variances' noted above.

- A. Where one or more parcels are unified for a single development, the property owner shall execute and record an unity of title or a covenant in lieu of unity of title, as may be applicable, in a form acceptable to the City Attorney.
- B. Upon the issuance of a final Certificate of Occupancy or Certificate of Completion, as applicable, the project approved herein shall be maintained in accordance with the plans approved by the board, and shall be subject to all conditions of approval herein, unless otherwise modified by the Board. Failure to maintain shall result in the issuance of a Code Compliance citation, and continued failure to comply may result in revocation of the Certificate of Occupancy, Completion and Business Tax Receipt.
- C. During construction work, the applicant shall maintain gravel at the front of the construction site within the first 15'-0" of the required front yard to mitigate disturbance of soil and mud by related personal vehicles exiting and entering the site. All construction materials, including dumpsters and portable toilets, shall be located behind the construction fence and not visible from the right-of-way. All construction vehicles shall either park on the private property or at alternate overflow parking sites with a shuttle service to and from the property. The applicant shall

- ensure that the contractor(s) observe good construction practices and prevent construction materials and debris from impacting the right-of-way.
- D. Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit for the existing home, a construction fence shall be installed along all property lines, in accordance with Section 142-876 of the City Code, "Vacant and abandoned properties and construction sites." However, along the front property line, such fence shall consist of an opaque screening, a minimum of eight (8') feet tall, which may include plywood or aluminum panels, or the equivalent solid construction on a wood or metal frame, with a continuous color finish, and concrete foundations. Only rolling gates or rigid folding panels shall be permitted. Swinging gates shall not be permitted.
 - E. If applicable, a Construction Parking and Traffic Management Plan (CPTMP) shall be approved by the Parking Director pursuant to Chapter 106, Article II, Division 3 of the City Code, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.
 - F. A recycling/salvage plan shall be provided as part of the submittal for a demolition/building permit, in a manner to be reviewed and approved by staff.
 - G. All applicable FPL transformers or vault rooms and backflow prevention devices shall be located within the building envelope with the exception of the valve (PIV) which may be visible and accessible from the street.
 - H. A copy of all pages of the recorded Final Order shall be scanned into the plans submitted for building permit, and shall be located immediately after the front cover page of the permit plans.
 - I. The Final Order shall be recorded in the Public Records of Miami-Dade County, prior to the issuance of a Building Permit.
 - J. Satisfaction of all conditions is required for the Planning Department to give its approval on a Certificate of Occupancy; a Temporary Certificate of Occupancy or Partial Certificate of Occupancy may also be conditionally granted Planning Departmental approval.
 - K. The Final Order is not severable, and if any provision or condition hereof is held void or unconstitutional in a final decision by a court of competent jurisdiction, the order shall be returned to the Board for reconsideration as to whether the order meets the criteria for approval absent the stricken provision or condition, and/or it is appropriate to modify the remaining conditions or impose new conditions.
 - L. The conditions of approval herein are binding on the applicant, the property's owners, operators, and all successors in interest and assigns.
 - M. Nothing in this order authorizes a violation of the City Code or other applicable law, nor allows a relaxation of any requirement or standard set forth in the City Code.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, based upon the foregoing findings of fact, the evidence, information testimony and materials presented at the public hearing, which are part of the record for this matter, and the staff report and analysis, which are adopted herein, including the staff

recommendations, which were amended and adopted by the Board, that the **application** is GRANTED for the above-referenced project subject to those certain conditions specified in Paragraph I, II, III of the Finding of Fact, to which the applicant has agreed.

PROVIDED, the applicant shall build substantially in accordance with the plans, entitled "4, 5 & 6 Star Island Drive Residence" as designed by **Scott Mitchell Studio** and **Studio Mc+G Architecture** ", signed, sealed, and dated May 10, 2021, and as approved by the Design Review Board, as determined by staff.

When requesting a building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions of approval that must be satisfied prior to permit issuance, as set forth in this Order, have been met.

The issuance of the approval does not relieve the applicant from obtaining all other required Municipal, County and/or State reviews and permits, including final zoning approval. If adequate handicapped access is not provided on the Board approved plans, this approval does not mean that such handicapped access is not required. When requesting Building permit, the plans submitted to the Building Department for permit shall be consistent with the plans approved by the Board, modified in accordance with the conditions set forth in this Order.

If the Full Building Permit for the project is not issued within eighteen (18) months of the meeting date at which the original approval was granted, the application will expire and become null and void, unless the applicant makes an application to the Board for an extension of time, in accordance with the requirements and procedures of Chapter 118 of the City Code, the granting of any such extension of time shall be at the discretion of the Board. If the Full Building Permit for the project shall expire for any reason (including but not limited to construction not commencing and continuing, with required inspections, in accordance with the applicable Building Code), the application will expire and become null and void.

In accordance with Chapter 118 of the City Code, the violation of any conditions and safeguards that are a part of this Order shall be deemed a violation of the land development regulations of the City Code. Failure to comply with this **Order** shall subject the application to Chapter 118 of the City Code, for revocation or modification of the application.

Dated _____.

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA

BY: _____
Michael Belush, AICP
Chief of Planning and Zoning
For Chairman

