

MIAMI BEACH

Finance and Citywide Projects Committee Meeting

City Hall, Commission Chambers, 3rd Floor, 1700 Convention Center Drive

September 20, 2019 - 8:00 AM

Commissioner Ricky Arriola, Chair
Commissioner Michael Góngora, Vice-Chair
Commissioner Mark Samuelian, Member
Commissioner Micky Steinberg Alternate

John Woodruff, Liaison
Morgan Goldberg, Support Staff

Visit us at www.miamibeachfl.gov for agendas and video streaming of City Commission Committee Meetings.

A meeting of the Finance and Citywide Projects Committee was held on Friday, September 20, 2019 at 8:00 a.m. in the Commission Chambers, 3rd floor of City Hall. Attendance: Commissioners Ricky Arriola, Michael Góngora, Mark Samuelian, John Alemán, Joy Malakoff. Members from the Administration and the public were also attendance.

Meeting began at 8:05 a.m.

OLD BUSINESS

1. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE PLACEMENT OF FARAH SERVICE URBAN SPORTS EQUIPMENT ("USE") AT CITYWIDE PARKS FOLLOWING THE COMPLETION OF A ONE-YEAR PILOT PROGRAM

October 18, 2017 – R7 K

Parks and Recreation

ACTION

John Rebar, Parks and Recreation Director, presented the item. He explained that last November we started a pilot program with these fitness stations in four locations throughout the city. The stations have been extremely successful, and the pilot program has been no cost to the City with no advertising. He said he is recommending expanding the program based on its popularity and its uses, but if we were to expand the advertising would kick in. The advertising is minimal, and examples were shown. The board shows the public how to use the machine and it is a small space on the board where the sponsor would show. If we do the advertising, we could expand to 11 more stations and expand from there as needed.

Commissioner Arriola said the one by his house is well used.

John Rebar mentioned the others and that they are very successful as well.

Commissioner Arriola is okay with it.

Commissioner Góngora mentioned he has typically been against advertising, but he is practical and likes the exercise equipment. What he doesn't want to see is a bait and switch with the advertising. He would like to see it stay the same as shown today since it is minimal.

Commissioner Samuelian said he thinks this is great and doesn't like advertisements either, he will vote yes that we should do this because we don't have money in the budget to pay for these otherwise.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian moved the item to expand the pilot program with the minimal advertisements. Commissioner Góngora seconded. All in favor.

2. DISCUSSION ON MIAMI BEACH COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION AND ITS FINANCIAL CONDITION

April 10, 2019 – C4 D

Sponsored by Commissioner Malakoff

Office of Housing & Community Services

ACTION

Sharhrzad Emami, Advocacy Director of Community Economic Development of Legal Services of Great Miami Inc, spoke. She said their company has been providing legal counsel to Miami Beach Community Development Corporation on an extended basis since January 2018. She said they were last at the FCWPC on June 28th at which time the Committee requested the following from MBCDC and she explained those, which are a leasing update and several components of a business plan. The only outstanding item that was requested as part of the business plan was a strategic plan of the Board of Directors, she said her legal services conducted an all day retreat with the board last week and came up with a detailed strategic plan and it is currently being written by her office and Mr. Martin. She explained what the strategic plan details.

She invited up James Wolcott and Rene Scott from Kauffman Rossin to provide a summary of the financial health of the organization.

Mr. Wolcott said what they have witnessed from working with the MBCDC has been nothing short of amazing. When they started working with them 12 months ago, they conducted a proper restructuring. They are proud to present the progress that was made throughout the past year.

Ms. Scott gave some background on the purpose of their job. She talked about the analysis that was conducted as well as handed out the report. In summary, their analysis showed that the MBCDC continued to improve the financial health of the organization through structural and tactical initiatives. She went into some further detail. She spoke about the presentation that she handed out to the Committee.

Commissioner Samuelian inquired about forecasting what 2020 will look like.

Ahmed Martin said that will be included in last part of the business plan that will be submitted by September 30th.

Commissioner Arriola said we were in a situation earlier this year that was not as positive as this. There was a long history that predated many of the board members where the MBCDC was not performing and hadn't engaged professional services to do the right thing and best practices that any organization should be doing. That has now been done and it is being presented nicely. The question he will have is if it is better for the County to take it over, which was a recommendation made earlier this year, despite the success. He also posed to the board that this is very impressive but asked how this is sustained and avoid being back in the previous situation.

Commissioner Samuelian said he would like to hear from the Administration and hear their perspective, whoever can bring the light with some of the defaults that were highlighted in the memorandum as well.

Ms. Emami said at the time when the County was considering a take over of the portfolio was facing difficulties on an operational level and financial level in addition to a property management level. The take

over plan was suggested because the County was pessimistic that the organization could repair the operational side, nor the financial side. They were concerned that the MBCDC did not have the capacity to do its own property management. The board of directors agreed with all of the those things, but over the last year and a half the board has worked tirelessly with Legal Services, Kauffman Rossin and the Royal American, the Property Management team. Royal American is the same property management team that the County uses. Since the MBCDC has outsourced the property management, there is no argument or need for the County to come in and take over the portfolio. She continued to explain why the County should not take it over and the strength of the MBCDC now. At this point they are going to be focusing on phase 2 which is a complete redevelopment of the portfolio.

Maria Ruiz, Director of Housing and Community Services, spoke. She applauded the MBCDC's efforts. She explained that on the City's side we have some serious concerns and have also been talking to the County on a regular basis and they share the concerns. We did review the information submitted late by the MBCDC, which did not address the issues with regards to the capital needs for each of these buildings. One of the concerns is the amount of resident complaints with maintenance issues at their properties, as they are not minor concerns. The bigger issue is compliance with the way that our HUD funds are used. The default letters that were attached to the memorandum were tied to the fact that the tenants were not properly certified which is the number one rule of HUD, you must ensure that the people in subsidized housing qualify. After giving them an opportunity to cure, we continued to find problems thereafter. For the County and the City, the major issue is that we have yet to reach 100% compliance on any of the properties. We had to pay back a significant amount of money tied to properties that were not being compliant in the past. Our concern is that this exposure is a little more concerning simply because of the debt level that is there. She said we are concerned about all 341 units and the well being of not only the organization to maintain these properties, but to ensure that the people who are living in these units, live in adequate, clean, quality housing. There is a significant concern that this has not been achieved.

Commissioner Góngora said the last point that Maria Ruiz made is the most important to him. For many years he has been a strong advocate for affordable housing and more important than who is managing it, is the quality of life that we are providing for our residents that live there. Earlier this year he was getting a lot of complaints that he referred to her and he is pleased to say he went out there and they have really done a good job at fixing up those buildings, tenants did not have leases, it was a bad situation. He visits a lot of affordable housing properties and he wants to commend the MBCDC because they have done a lot to bring these buildings up. A lot of the people living in these buildings are older and they are afraid that their housing may be transferred to the County, even though they are having problems. They at least know who to deal with and who to call and can also call us at Miami Beach to help. They are scared that if the County takes it over there will be an anonymous person over in Miami-Dade County that they are not going to know or be able to contact and we will be on top of them. He is not a fan of giving over properties to another government entity. We have been the MBCDC longer than any of us have been here probably and he doesn't see any benefit for this going to the County and especially since we learned they are using the same management company. He also thinks we shouldn't punish good behavior, you reward good behavior. These people have come to the table and have come to our meetings, they have brought in a more professional board, they have brought in a professional accounting firm, one of the most reputable ones in South Florida saying they have improved their finances and are in a healthy position. To him it is not who is better the MBCDC or the County, it is about who is going to give a better quality of life to the seniors that live there. He feels comfortable with what the MBCDC is doing, he thinks we need to keep more stringent controls and maintain better oversight of what they are doing, but he would not be in favor of giving the properties over to the County.

Commissioner Arriola asked Maria Ruiz if she was sitting on the dais what would she do.

Maria Ruiz said that it is a tough answer. The truth is from a purely organizational standpoint, we have to look at MBCDC as an entity not the people behind it. The City has faced years of problems with this organization and its latest financial audit has continued to show problems. She found that they did not reconcile this year on a monthly basis. It is very challenging to be on the emotional side of the people that

are living in those buildings, but there is also the legal requirement that we have in making sure the properties are maintained and the ensuring the letter of these agreements that were signed are indeed fulfilled. We shouldn't be issuing so many default letters to one entity and still having the same issue 30 days later after the cure is completed. She is not a fan of government taking over properties. The big issue for her is simply the City's interest best met with regards to the money we put into the buildings. It has been 5 years of the problem and it still persists. Ultimately it will be the Commission's call, but she has to go to HUD and defend why we allowed an agency for 5 years, despite our efforts while some improvement has been made there are still serious quality of life issues in these properties that have not been remedied.

Commissioner Arriola said there has been a change in leadership and asked if Maria Ruiz is confident that this new Administration and the work they are doing is putting them on the path to correcting these mistakes. He said the decision doesn't need to be made today, he is going to recommend we meet again in 90 days or 6 months and check if progress is continuing. He wants to know if Maria Ruiz has confidence that they are heading in the right direction or if in 6 months they will be in a worse state. The goal is to provide adequate, suitable housing for Miami Beach residents, but turn around takes time. Financials are one thing and going into the building and looking at the conditions is another.

Susy Torriente, Assistant City Manager/Chief Resiliency Officer, said that Maria Ruiz has raised a flag to the City Manager and to her a few times over the last month or two. They have had at least 2 conversations with the City Manager and the County Housing Director. Coming into this meeting today and seeing the paperwork that they have seen, while they are impressed with the progress, the confidence is not quite there yet. She suggested since a decision does not need to be made today, perhaps over the next month maybe have a meeting with the City Manager with the County, all of us together and see if we can build on that confidence and see if we can see the complaints going down and work on something. Today the confidence isn't there, but that doesn't mean we can't get there.

Ms. Emami said the MBCDC completely understands that based on the history of the organization and the fact the rebuilding process began in January of last year, they are completely amenable, the board, the staff, the legal team, the accounting team, the property management team of coming back every 30, 45, or 60 days and providing an update to the Committee. She as an attorney and an affordable housing advocate and someone who is a professor of affordable housing and who has been engaged in this area for 13 years, she has never seen an organization such as this do so many things in a limited amount of time. She continued to describe what the organization has done. She said a nonprofit cannot be judged based on what the organization had done 5, 10, or 15 years ago. A nonprofit is judged based on its existing staff, existing board and directors, consultant, and strategic plan into the future.

Commissioner Góngora said the County is not all that great either unlike everyone else. He campaigned over the causeway and visited numerous affordable housing facilities over in Miami on the County side, they are not better than what we are doing. We are going to move to another problem organization, so let's fix our problems here in Miami Beach.

Ms. Emami thanked Commissioner Góngora and said they have an entire division that represents tenants and they see tenants from Miami-Dade County in their office all of the time. As far as compliance, which is what Maria Ruiz is talking about, they completely agree. The files need to be kept into compliance, they now have a property management company that is competent and is doing that. Compliance takes time. She would like to invite Royal American up, she would like for them to tell the Committee what they are doing as far as handling tenant complaints and the compliance issues.

Commissioner Samuelian complimented the group. Situations like this require this type of effort to have a fighting chance. Our interests are two fold, one the people living in these buildings are our residents, two to mitigate any liability or risk that the City has for any commitments we made to other parties. He thinks the next step is that the stakeholders need to come together, we need to see a clear plan around the issues that were teed up, capital needs, maintenance needs, and compliance. We need a plan, we need to see some milestones. We all need to be on the same page and then report to the Committee to gain

confidence that this is happening. He thinks the next time we have this conversation it needs to be one where we are looking at the same set of facts. He thinks we need to stay focused on this.

Commissioner Arriola said that he wanted to just commend everyone on their work and doing what was asked.

Commissioner Alemán asked Maria Ruiz if she thinks that the County is going to do something different. She asked if the Administration's recommendation because they think we are going to get a very different result or is it because we want to shift liability to the County and away from the City.

Maria Ruiz said there are two points with regards to that. The first is the issue of compliance.

Commissioner Alemán said she doesn't want to go back 5 years with the problems.

Maria Ruiz said that HUD doesn't see it that way. The funds came from HUD.

Maria Ruiz said the second issue is the quality of the stock, they are experiencing what we did when we took over the 5 properties. They had poor workmanship, poor quality materials, aftermarket, and they are in historic buildings. There is a huge investment of money to bring these buildings to a standard that we would consider quality for the tenants and that is regardless of who comes in. The problem is also that the one asset that provided the MBCDC leverage was sold and now there is debt and very little of which to go forward on when you have major investments. She gave examples of problems that will be recurring that are going to take a lot of money.

It is about shifting liability, but it doesn't seem that giving it to the County to take it is going to get a different result.

Commissioner Arriola said he would like to give everyone time to address the deficiencies and come back to see how they are doing.

Commissioner Góngora suggested having this item as a quarterly item. Every 3 months they will come back and report and we will know what is going on. If things are getting worse he will be convinced to transfer to the County.

Ms. Emami said every 3 months gives time to set benchmarks. Also, the County is going to use the same financing mechanism as them. She continued to talk about the assets and the debt. Most of the properties have forgivable debt. They have enough money in reserves to take care of things that are ongoing. They have also already been working with firms to renovate the buildings that need a bigger job and working with lenders. She continued to explain how they would put a plan together.

Commissioner Samuelian seconded the motion for them to come back every 90 days to the FCWPC. He said they should be meeting with the Administration about the longer term plans soon about what success looks like when they come back and have a very clear action plan and next steps. He thinks the parties need to work together to have a clearer communication. He would like a shared view on what the basis are.

Commissioner Arriola said that their plan they referenced would take about 9 months to put all of the properties back on solid footing, which is essential. The benefit of the MBCDC is that they are small and nimble and will move quicker than the County. The downside is that the County has deeper pockets. He would like to know next time they come how they will have continuity on their board so we don't find ourselves in this same spot a few years from now.

Ms. Emami said one of the goals in the strategic plan is to increase the number of board members so when there is attrition there are competent board members that are there already that have been learning.

MOTION: Commissioner Góngora motioned for the MBCDC to come back in 90 days with an update on the progress. Commissioner Samuelian seconded. All in favor.

3. **DISCUSSION REGARDING THE BIGBELLY PROGRAM AND POTENTIAL WAYS TO SUBSIDIZE ITS COST**

October 17, 2018 – C4 I

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola

Public Works

ACTION

Jay Fink, Public Works Assistant Director, presented the item. He said that this stems from a long time ago. After the implementation of the BigBelly units there was discussion on how to bring the cost down. There were some options proffered by the representative of BigBelly. He introduced Rafael Andrade.

Rafael Andrade, representative of BigBelly, spoke. He said there were 2 proposals submitted to the City. One was advertising, but for purposes of efficiency today, he will not talk about advertising. Right now the agreement only allows us to use the stations for trash. If the City were to amend the agreement to allow them to offer the stations as a small cell placement location, they would then reach out to carriers gauge their interest. If there was interest there would be a revenue share with the City as well as it would all still be subject to land use board approval. This amendment in itself only gives the opportunity for them to go out and offer this to carriers, it doesn't mean the poles will be showing up everywhere as an alternative of what is going on now with people digging up sidewalks, etc. His client agrees to not have small cell siting in the vicinity of schools like others have done. Whatever buffer the City thinks is appropriate they will adhere to.

Commissioner Góngora said that there is a lot of this that is attractive. The 5G cells scare a lot of our parents. It was discussed at the Commission meeting about where the poles are located and we are actually scheduling a public meeting on this, tentatively October 1st at 5 p.m. He thinks everyone on the Commission would like to have more ability to regulate this type of technology and poles. He is going to push to have these poles away from the schools. He asked if BigBelly would be partnering with this type of technology to put it on the BigBelly containers.

Mr. Andrade said yes. He went into explaining how this would work.

Discussion was held.

Commissioner Góngora suggested BigBelly come to the public meeting to propose this.

Commissioner Alemán said she doesn't think there are any health risks that she has read about.

Commissioner Samuelian asked if the Administration has a recommendation.

Jay Fink said it offers an option, it is not a miracle option. What is presently being done with the current providers, we have been pushing them to do an in-kind installation of their antenna, which is why they are on the light poles. From a street furniture point of view it doesn't add to the street furniture. The antenna would go in the middle of the BigBelly. If Planning is okay with this, he doesn't necessarily have an issue with it. It will involve some level of construction, taking the signal from the fiber and electrical feed to the telebelly. There are some things to work out. The other thing we also want to look at, it doesn't necessarily amend the contract, but it does have some positives in that it takes away cost per unit that we currently see with the stations. It is worthwhile to look into and continue the discussions.

Commissioner Góngora said he doesn't know that this is something the Commission can control, but he moves that BigBelly comes to the meeting on Tuesday, October 1st at 5 p.m. in the Chambers, offer this alternative to those companies and see if it is something they are interested and if they are, he is fine with the next step for this to come before the full Commission to present it.

Jay Fink said if we amend the contract, they would go to full Commission anyway.

DIRECTION: BigBelly to present at the October 1st public meeting and if providers are interested go to the full Commission on October 16th.

4. **DISCUSSION REGARDING THE LOCATION OF A STORAGE FACILITY AND NEW RESTROOMS FOR SOUNDSCAPE PARK**

January 16, 2019 – C4 I
Tourism and Culture

ACTION

Matt Kenny, Tourism and Culture Director, presented the item. He explained this item has come to the Committee a few times and this is a final iteration. We have been working with the New World Symphony to locate a storage facility for their LED screens and restrooms as part of the G.O. Bond funding. We are going to bifurcate the item since we aren't there yet with the restrooms. We have come up with a solution and plan for the storage facility for the LED screens in the Pennsylvania garage. He said there is a diagram to show what it will look like. This will allow New World Symphony to purchase the LED screens that are movable.

Commissioner Góngora asked what the motion would need to be made by the Committee.

Matt Kenny said it would be for the agreement to build this storage facility in the garage as shown.

MOTION: Commissioner Góngora moved the item as described for the storage facility. Commissioner Samuelian seconded. All in favor.

5. **DISCUSSION REGARDING ESTABLISHING A HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND**

April 11, 2018 – C4 O
Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola
Finance/Planning

ACTION

Kristen Nowicki, KCI Technologies, presented the item. She gave background on the item and who she has met with and said she will be meeting with Commissioner Arriola's office further. They are doing some additional research and pulling some data. There will be further information at the next meeting.

Daniel Ciraldo, Miami Dade Preservation League, said that this is great and this all came from the Master Plan.

Commissioner Arriola said we have to identify funding streams to build a pool over a long period of time. With the historic preservation community, we have to be very adult about it because we cannot save every building in the City forever. We have to start creating criteria and prioritizing the buildings.

Commissioner Samuelian said he likes this and he would like to have everyone keep in mind the word resiliency. As we talk about funding sources he would be interested in the use of funds. He would more inclined to be supportive if there is a heavy resiliency component and that is the driver.

DIRECTION: Come back to the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting with the recommendations.

NEW BUSINESS

6. DISCUSSION REGARDING BIGBELLY FINANCIAL ANALYSIS

October 17, 2018 – C4 I
Public Works

ACTION

Jay Fink, Public Works Assistant Director, presented the item. He said this stemmed from the zero based budgeting discussion with regards to the BigBelly contract being a component of the sanitation fund. This started as a pilot program and it morphed into a 3 year contract with two 1 year renewals. There were fixed costs and a way to keep the initial costs down, the amount of money that would need to be amortized for their capital investment was put in over the 5 years and the terms of the contract state if we were to terminate that contract before the 3 year period was up, we would have to pay some of those costs. He said this item shows snapshots of what those costs would be for different times should we terminate the contract. In addition to the actual amounts that are listed the other item that needs to be taken into consideration if we were to remove the items from the right of way as trash receptacles we would need to put something back in those places. Where we are with the sanitation budget currently, it is Administration's recommendation at this point not to terminate the contract at this time because it would net cost more than continuing to finish the contract term.

Rafael Andrade, representative of BigBelly, spoke. He said that he agrees with staff's recommendation not to terminate.

DIRECTION: Finish the contract term.

7. DISCUSSION REGARDING STORMWATER CONNECTION FEES FOR COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES

July 17, 2019 – C4 E
Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán
Public Works

ACTION

Jay Fink, Public Works Assistant Director, presented the item. We have a couple of large new development properties that have tied in to the city's stormwater system and are looking for some acknowledgement that we are going to go ahead as we do with other stormwater fees which is to have a rate consultant take a look at it and then come up with some options and bring it back to this Committee and say what those fees would be for them to pay their equitable share.

Commissioner Alemán said she completely agrees. The idea of the stormwater tie in for residential properties is not being touched with a fee. For commercial properties she absolutely agrees that we ought to be deriving a stormwater connection fee and Public Works should hire a consultant, figure out what the fees should be and bring it back to this Committee.

Commissioner Arriola and Commissioner Samuelian will co-sponsor the item.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian moved for Public Works to hire a consultant to come up with fees for commercial properties and bring the proposed fees back to the FCWPC. Commissioner Arriola seconded.

8. DISCUSSION TO EXPLORE INCREASED FUNDING FOR HOUSING FOR THE MOST VULNERABLE WHO ARE HOMELESS OR LIKELY TO BECOME HOMELESS

July 31, 2019 – C4 A

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Police

ACTION

Commissioner Samuelian said that Commissioner Arriola really championed this issue and gave it great visibility. From our community survey by both residents and businesses, this is the number one issue where we need to improve. He wants to broaden the discussion and take it to the next level.

Wayne Jones, Deputy Chief of Police, presented the item. He said the number one issue is homelessness. He said they are collaborating with the homeless outreach team and he is proud of the work they do together. He said we cannot arrest our way out of homelessness. One of the ways we thought about addressing this issue is attacking underlying causes of people's homelessness, which in many cases is drugs and alcohol abuse. That is where the Marchman Act comes into play. The Marchman beds are funded through a statewide process, where people are served on a first come first serve basis. He continued to explain the process. we are running into issues where we don't have any beds at all because they are all booked up. The ask is to fund a minimum of 3 beds annually that will always be available to Miami Beach participants.

The recommendation of what was needed is \$183,000 and it is in the budget. We also have in the budget money for the victim advocates.

Deputy Chief Jones said we have 6 victim advocates, they provide services to many victims a year. We prefer to place those that cannot go back to where they live in a hotel for up to 7 days or in a place like Lotus House, which is his preference. That is what the \$21,000 will be spent on. They are really grateful for it. In discussion with the victim advocates they feel this money is sufficient for now, if that changes they will make another ask.

Discussion was held.

Commissioner Arriola said his understanding was that to get services you have to be homeless for at least 30 days. He also said we especially don't want women on the streets before our services kick in. He asked how we close that gap.

Lori Bakkum from the Homeless Committee spoke. She explained at their Committee they voted to push that forth to the Commission and it didn't get taken up by any Commissioner. They feel the 30 day window isn't good for any cases. She gave some examples of scenarios. After that 30 days it becomes a lifestyle, the sooner we can get people off the street the better. She said this is something the Committee would really like to see changed.

Valerie Navarette said after about a week the people are no longer afraid of the street, so it is much harder later on to get the people off the street.

Commissioner Góngora said if we are actually going to help people we need to kick in the benefits much quicker, so people don't get comfortable on the street. He thinks the 30 day policy has to change.

Ms. Bakkum said the Committee has voted in the past and has supported getting rid of the 30 days policy.

Maria Ruiz, Director of Housing and Community Services, said as a point of clarification, someone who comes into our city who is homeless is in fact offered relocation services. There is no time limit on connecting a person to a family member or another place where they can be provided assistance. The big challenge with not having a time table is that when someone goes to Miami and doesn't get services will walk over to Miami Beach, what we will see is an influx of services needed and we will be overwhelmed. It

is important for municipalities to be able to address the issues they have within their boundaries. She would caution us because 95% of our homeless started some place else.

Ms. Navarrete said we have also have people that go from Miami Beach to Miami that are asking for help. It balances it out.

Commissioner Samuelian said this is a helpful discussion, it is good to know we have some money in the budget for beds, the 30 day policy needs to be addressed. The other thing that prompted this is the concept of going mobile. He would like to see us look at some of our processes around this to increase the amount of outreach we are doing. He would like us to be more out in the field. He would like to know how we can get increased outreach.

Deputy Chief Jones said he will let Maria Ruiz talk about the outreach part, but he will say that the work our homeless outreach team does in collaboration with the Police Department is unlike anywhere else in South Florida. He said his officers go around the country and talk about the Marchman Act program and how successful it has been.

Maria Ruiz spoke about our data. She said people who come from other areas tend to stay in our city for less than 60 days, they are walking away from shelter during that time frame. She said we have relocated 200 people this year so far, which is a record for us, the vast majority of them stayed less than 60 days and half of them went back to an area they didn't come from. They chose to go some place else. They were homeless before they came to Miami Beach. She said there are a core group of people that tend to stay here and addiction and mental health are a part of that problem and they don't get served by shelter.

Vicky Mallette, Miami-Dade County Homeless Trust Executive Director, spoke. She said this is a very transient population and as stated they do move back and forth from across the bridge. She said she thinks Miami Beach is doing a pilot after the Lazarus project that took place in Miami-Dade County that has psychiatric nurse practitioners. They have also partnered with behavioral health network, they have dispatched on the streets of Miami and Miami Beach. She said they supported the Marchman program as well. She continued to described what they have done. She thinks when we are having this conversation it cannot just be about outreach or shelter beds and transitional programs. If you don't have the final piece of the continuum which is permanent housing interventions, you will not create a system. We will continue to put undue stress on the temporary housing system and never have an outlet.

Commissioner Samuelian asked Ms. Mallette what services the Homeless Trust will be providing and how we can measure the results.

Ms. Mallette said she is not sure if it passed yet, but she thinks there was staff recommendation for \$250,000 to be given to the Homeless Trust from short term rental fines. In this coming fiscal year possibly another \$250,000. She said they would like the chance to look at this holistically. She spoke about other money they have received and are committed to received annually. She said their focus is unsheltered since adults 72% are males. They are also concerned about the senior community, 62 years+.

Commissioner Samuelian said we would like to see how the funds are going to be applied and see the results we are getting.

Ms. Bakkum thanked Commissioner Arriola for his efforts. She said they are happy about the LTC with the 2 buckets of money. She said Miami Beach Police and Office of Housing and Community Services does an excellent job. She also spoke about some properties that are available for housing for homeless.

Ms. Navarrete said investing in housing would save us money.

John Deutzman, resident, spoke. He said this is not an easy problem to solve by throwing money at it. This is a resident priority, but not a City priority. He is not sure anyone has the answers. He spoke about

committing crimes and how homeless people commit very serious crimes. He continued to give his opinions and what works and what doesn't. He suggested maybe passing a right to shelter law, which is a law in New York State.

Discussion continued.

Matis Cohen, business owner, spoke. He said charity starts at home and we need to create a budget to be able to create potential solutions. We need to bring money and ideas together to solve this. We need to manage the budget ourselves.

Commissioner Arriola said it is a funding problem.

Commissioner Samuelian said the community is speaking loud and clear that we need to do better. He touched on the money we have already allocated. He would like to continue this discussion, he made some points and asked that it be brought back. Number 1 the policy of 30 days be brought back and assessed and get a recommendation, number 2 we explore additional ways to maximize outreach including but not limited to the Lazarus project, number 3 we see how the \$250,000 that we already set aside for the Homeless Trust will be used, number 4 he thinks we need to get closer to measures and would like to see a little more reporting to this Committee on the progress, number 5 if we have any ideas if incremental beds can move the needle. He would like it to come back to this Committee. Let's see what works and if there is specific things that we can fund then he is going to support them. Commissioner Góngora seconded the motion.

Commissioner Alemán said the comments about adding Lazarus project makes sense. Given the discussion about the nomadic nature of the population. We have to address this the same way we address transportation. She said they cannot solve on this dais the transportation woes, it is a regional issue. Homeless management is the same. We need better coordination with Miami Beach, Miami, and the County. We cannot be the sole funding source to address homelessness for the County, everyone needs to do their part. She would ask for the Administration to meet with the County and Miami and have more of a regional coordinated effort on the issue.

Commissioner Malakoff brought up the plight of women on our streets, they shouldn't have to wait 30 days. She wants to make sure we have the funding for Lotus House beds to help them.

Commissioner Alemán said she hopes we will be generous when talking about affordable housing when we get to item 9.

Commissioner Arriola said it is important to keep it as a topic of discussion, people are in rough economic times.

Commissioner Góngora thanked the Committee members that came to speak and mentioned Alex Fernandez from the Citizens Police Committee was also present to support this.

Ms. Mallette said the Homeless Trust fully supports what the Committee said, they are a regional body and they work with all of the bodies in Miami-Dade County and are more eager to work closely with the City of Miami Beach. The second highest concentration of homelessness is Miami Beach. She thinks the City of Miami Beach also needs to be aware you get a tremendous value from the County wide food and beverage tax. It is paying for the short to mid term rental subsidies. When the Marchman clients go into housing, that is being paid through that tax as well.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian made the following motion: Number 1 the policy of 30 days be brought back and assessed and get a recommendation, number 2 we explore additional ways to maximize outreach including but not limited to the Lazarus project, number 3 we see how the \$250,000 that we already set aside for the Homeless Trust will be used, number 4 he thinks we need to get closer to

measures and would like to see a little more reporting to this Committee on the progress, number 5 if we have any ideas if incremental beds can move the needle. He would like it to come back to this Committee. Let's see what works and if there are specific things that we can fund then he is going to support them. Commissioner Góngora seconded the motion. All in favor.

DIRECTION: Come back to the Committee and address the 5 points that were made by Commissioner Samuelian.

9. **DISCUSSION TO EXPLORE WAYS THE CITY CAN ASSIST THE HOUSING AUTHORITY OF THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH TO DEVELOP ITS PROPERTIES IN NORTH BEACH TO CREATE AFFORDABLE AND WORKFORCE HOUSING**

May 8, 2019 – C7 E

Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán

Office of Housing and Community Services

ACTION

Commissioner Góngora said that he is fine with waiving the parking requirement if we are creating affordable housing because it is mostly retired seniors. He is not in favor today, although he may be convinced for the workforce housing.

Commissioner Alemán agreed with Commissioner Góngora.

MOTION: Commissioner Góngora moved to waive the parking and impact fees only for affordable housing, not workforce housing. Commissioner Arriola seconded. All in favor.

10. **DISCUSSION REGARDING IMPLEMENTING TACTICAL URBANISM PROJECTS THROUGHOUT THE CITY**

July 17, 2019 – C4 I

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola

Economic Development

ACTION

Beth Edwards, Miami Beach Senior High School PTSA, spoke. She thanked the City for the collaboration. She gave some background on how this came to be. She and other members of the PTSA provided some vision boards to explain how this would help with safety, culture, and other aspects in different areas around the school.

Another member of the PTSA spoke about the boards that were presented to explain the proposals.

Ms. Edwards said they are present solely today to support the City's tactical urbanism, but they felt that it would be remiss if they didn't show what they were doing inside their school. They put \$20,000 towards it and they are pretty good at raising money. They are not asking for money today, they just wanted to let the City know what they are doing and possibly work together since there is a shared path.

Commissioner Arriola said an idea is for crosswalks is to implement 3D art that looks like a barricade, so you slow down when driving.

The PTSA members continued to describe what they have been working on and that the school board is allowing them. It is turning into a silver knight project.

Commissioner Alemán suggested keeping the Commissioners up to speed on what the gap is so they can look for opportunities to assist.

The PTSA will be having a fundraiser next Friday night September 27th at 6 p.m. at Sweet Liberty.

Amy Hershkowitz spoke and thanked the Committee for approving the 15 mph flashing lights from the last time she was here. She also mentioned the 3D crosswalks are definitely an eye catcher and will slow people down.

Commissioner Góngora thanked the PTSA ladies for being so involved.

Gedel Merzius, Economic Development Specialist spoke and introduced Tony Garcia, Principal of Street Plans Collaborative and said he is here to give a presentation on the feasibility of the quick build program. This tactical urbanism piece was referred from the July 17th Commission meeting.

Tony Garcia spoke, introduced himself and provided some information on tactical urbanism. He then went through the presentation and went into more depth on tactical urbanism including what could be done and what they would cost. Information was included in the agenda packet as well.

The Committee is supportive of this concept.

Commissioner Samuelian suggested choosing one of the options and running with it. He moved that we get a positive recommendation and direct City Administration to meet with Mr. Garcia to find a project that we can move quickly on and come back with a specific recommendation.

Commissioner Góngora said he would support that motion, but he suggested maybe bringing back 3 options.

Commissioner Samuelian agreed, he just wanted a sense of urgency.

Commissioner Arriola said it doesn't sound like it is a ton of money and we can set aside a budget to help implement this. He asked for the company to come back with some ideas, Miami Beach High is a priority, he loves the 41st Street idea and something in North Beach, places we are trying to spur economic activity. He would like some concepts so then they can put together a budget and move forward with this.

The PTSA members said they love him and would like to connect with Mr. Garcia.

Commissioner Alemán said she would include Transportation in the discussion because if we want it to be quick it needs to be a City street maybe a County street. We need to look at streets where there are speeding issues, bike issues, etc, yes for beauty and general impact, but we also need to use this to address a specific issue like a safety issue.

Mr. Garcia said they would avoid the State roads entirely, and the County they work with them often so they can figure something out.

Commissioner Arriola said for staff to start working and asked for them to come back and if a month is enough time.

Bo Martinez, Economic Development Director, requested at least 60 days.

DIRECTION: Come back to the November 22, 2019 FCWPC meeting with proposals, unless something is ready sooner with Miami Beach Senior High School.

11. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE ANIMAL WELFARE COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION TO ESTABLISH A COMMUNITY PET WASHING STATION

July 17, 2019 – C4 L

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola and Co-Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Public Works

ACTION

Sara de los Reyes, Vice-Chair of the Animal Welfare Committee spoke. She said they have a strategy of educating the community of issues we are having with our abandoned and stray animals in regard to legislation and the City resources they need that will help them move forward. She introduced the team.

Jay Fink, Public Works Assistant Director, spoke. He said this item and item 12 are companion items that did go in front of the Animal Welfare Committee and the Commission did receive a list of their motions and recommendations. This item is a pet washing facility specifically for dogs. They have had some discussions internally with the Parks and Recreation Department as far as locations. There are a few models. There is a specific cost component and there will be some installation costs as well. One option is a stationary item free for the public and the other would be a more elaborate sharing cost use situation.

Commissioner Samuelian thanked the Animal Welfare Committee and staff for doing great with new issues. The Administration's recommendation is for a pilot program.

Jay Fink said the various models in exhibit A range from \$1,300 up to \$3,000. If it becomes something that involves electricity, then we need permits and that would add cost. If we were to look at a funding source for up to \$5,000 he thinks we ought to be able to afford it.

Commissioner Samuelian moved the item as recommended by the Administration and that we engage the neighborhoods to get a sense to see who will like to have it.

Commissioner Góngora said he will second the motion, but he doesn't think Belle Isle will want this in their little park, if he were choosing a spot, he would choose Flamingo Park because they have such a great dog park there, he thinks it will get a lot of use.

Jay Fink said he will defer location selection to the Parks and Recreation Department.

Commissioner Arriola likes it. We can do it park by park and if it is successful then we can expand it.

Commissioner Malakoff suggested North Shore Oceanside Park since there is a little dog and big dog park.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian moved to engage in the pilot program for up \$5,000. Commissioner Góngora seconded.

12. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE ANIMAL WELFARE COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION TO FUND A PET ADOPTION FACILITY

July 17, 2019 – C4 N

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola and Co-Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Public Works

ACTION

Jay Fink, Public Works Assistant Director, presented the item. He explained what the memorandum indicated about what has transpired regarding the finding of a donor for the potential site. Unfortunately, that site has since fallen through. It brought to light a need and a desire.

Mary Thingelstad, Animal Welfare Committee member, spoke. She said they are at 10 years since she has been involved with the cat program. She thinks our community has developed into a place where we need a building now. She provided some background on the situation. She said we really need this building. A donor has provided a trailer, but it is not fitting the needs anymore, we are growing. It is something that is never going to go away.

Commissioner Samuelian thanked Mary on behalf of the Commission and the community. He said the need is for TNR as well as adoption. It sounds like in an ideal world we are going to get a building and he understands that there is likely private funding available and that the County wants to help in some way maybe with the operations. He thinks we should keep looking for a building, but he would also like the staff to see if there is an interim approach while we are looking. Look for the long term, something in the short term that is mobile, and leverage the private and County funding. He would like staff to figure out how to make this happen and then bring it back.

Ms. Thingelstad said we do have a mobile unit that was purchased by FUMA. They are doing things in certain neighborhoods that have low income. They have taken them under their wing and why there is a nice donation for a new building. She is also working with some community residents that will also probably give more donations.

Commissioner Arriola said it gets his attention that there are already donors, so it is not just City money. He thinks that we should start setting aside some money in our capital budget so that once we find a property, we can close on it.

Commissioner Samuelian said they are going to move forward with a favorable recommendation, if there is a location available we should be jumping on it and we should explore locations. In the interim if we can enhance our mobile services, he would like the Administration to look at that leveraging private funding and the County and when we have something a little more concrete bring it back to this Committee.

Jay Fink said they will be back next month with some other Animal Welfare Committee items which will include more information about the funding of the TNR and what we are going to do to replace the Pets Mart charities.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian moved the item with a favorable recommendation, if there is a location available, we should be jumping on it and we should explore locations. In the interim if we can enhance our mobile services, he would like the Administration to look at that leveraging private funding and the County and when we have something a little more concrete bring it back to this Committee. Commissioner Góngora seconded the motion. All in favor.

13. **DISCUSSION REGARDING FUNDING AYUDA**

July 17, 2019 – C4 M

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola

Office of Housing and Community Services

ACTION

Diana Susi, CEO of Ayuda, presented. She explained that Ayuda has provided services to the community for over 40 years and they used to provide services to Miami-Dade County, but have minimized and have concentrated on Miami Beach specifically. They provide services for people from infancy to the last day of life. In this case she presented a need for families that are low income, looking for a job, that have one or more children and cannot obtain a job because they have children to take care of. This would be a temporary situation where they would help parents for a period of anywhere from a month and a half – 3 months, maximum 6 months if it is really a family with many children. This would help the people successfully obtain and retain a job with day care at a reduced price. She said they are a one stop center for families because they refer them to different services. Most of their families come from North Beach and

sometimes South Beach. They are proposing to serve 17-34 families and they are asking for \$35,000. These would be people who are unable to obtain scholarships from anywhere else.

Commissioner Arriola said that the impact of the families is quite large in these situations. This is a low dollar investment per kid, so that parent can take a job. The impact to the family unit is quite large. These are strictly Miami Beach residents.

Commissioner Góngora asked if Ayuda is staying in its location throughout the Town Center change.

Ms. Susi said they are eventually going to have to move, so she was hoping the City could help guide her in where they could find land where they could put modulars on, where they could actually move the school over. They are all about surviving.

Commissioner Góngora said he loves Ayuda. He is willing to support this request, but he wants to make sure this is being done in Miami Beach.

Ms. Susi said they don't serve the rest of Miami-Dade County anymore.

Matis Cohen, business owner, said this organization is one of the unsung heroes in the community. He said they have a problem with fundraising. He suggested the City creating a small grant because Ayuda is competing with very large organizations for funding. He recommended a challenge grant.

Commissioner Arriola said we want to move forward with the \$35,000.

Matis Cohen said when Ayuda goes to other organizations to request money, it would be great if she can say that for every \$1,000 they give her that the City will match that. He suggested another \$35,000 cap. That would give her \$100,000 in funding, which was the initial ask.

Commissioner Góngora said he thinks they need to vote on the amount that was requested, but he would certainly consider that in next year's budget cycle.

Commissioner Samuelian said it sounds like there is a favorable recommendation but would like to hear from the Administration.

Maria Ruiz, Director of Housing and Community Services, spoke. She said subsidized childcare is great to help low income families to get stable and move up the food chain. She said she was approached by other childcare companies that would also be interested to provide childcare under a voucher system. She has known Ayuda for as long as she has been with the City. She said they are great, but other services are interested if this would be a competitive process because they also have families who work in South Beach but live in North Beach.

Ms. Susi asked if there will be a competitive process, if it can be after they are awarded the \$35,000 because they have people on a waiting list.

VOTE OF ACCLAMATION TO AWARD THE \$35,000 TO AYUDA

14. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE MAYOR'S PANEL ON OCEAN DRIVE MOTION TO DEVELOP AN IMPROVED LIGHTING PLAN FOR SAFETY FOR LUMMUS

July 17, 2019 – C4 F

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian

Office of the City Manager/Public Works

ACTION

Once this item was called, students from the Cleo Institute spoke about climate change. They thanked the Commission for allowing them to let them do the strike outside of City Hall and for their strong solidarity.

Commissioner Arriola commended the students for standing up for what they believe in.

Commissioner Góngora commended the students as well and spoke about what the Cleo Institute does.

Commissioner Alemán shared for everyone to vote.

The students thanked the Committee to allowing them to share their thoughts and feelings because not many politicians that actually care, like them.

The original item was then brought up again.

Commissioner Samuelian said both of our subcommittees from the Ocean Drive Panel would like to see lighting in Lummus Park in a few different time frames, immediately, a little bit longer, and then longer term. He wanted to hear the status, when would we get something in place, and if there is anything staff needs from the Committee.

Amy Mehu, Special Assistant to the City Manager, spoke. She said in regard to the Ocean Drive subcommittee's request for Ocean Drive and the need for having lighting for the short term and long term. She said for the long term, Public Works will touch on the lighting plan consultant and how they are going to be looking at citywide lighting standards. For the short term, while putting in temporary installations for holiday lighting is always on the radar for Lummus Park for the past few years and they are working with Parks and Recreation to address the tripping hazards that we have from subsequent years, we need to speak with the Super Bowl. The Committee wanted to have it in place for the Super Bowl. Anything we put in may impact them.

Rudy De La Torre, Public Works Infrastructure Division Director, spoke. He said in reference to the long-term lighting in our efforts to bring adequate lighting to Lummus Park, he will have to go back 2 years ago and explain how the former Chief of Police came to Public Works and asked for their help in fighting crime in Lummus Park. The ask was to provide adequate lighting that would address the park's public safety and security issues. They worked with the Environment and Sustainability Department and the effort basically led to the retrofitting of the lighting at Lummus Park. The acorn lighting was replaced with the existing lighting poles, which seems to have made a big improvement in police efforts. Since that installation Florida, Fish and Wildlife Conservation, the agency that regulates lighting along coastal lines has been a bit critical of the installation. Therefore, there lies the challenges of lighting at Lummus Park. Since that time, we have engaged Johnson Controls to help with preparation with a smart street lighting master plan to set lighting standards citywide and help us address situation along the coastal lines. That phase of the project will be completed towards the end of October.

Amy Mehu said during the last Meeting of the Whole, the Commission wanted to look at artistic design as well. There is the safety need, which Police would like to have addressed as well. There are a lot of concerns, we have a noncompliance letter from the State of Florida. In order to try to accomplish the artistic component in a temporary way, we are going to with a group from Columbia University to come up with some design plans for lighting in Lummus Park. We are meeting with staff and the group from Columbia University to see how we can get them on board and what their needs are in order for them to work with us. They would need to work closely with Public Works, Parks and Recreation, and Property Management.

Commissioner Samuelian said he sees we are thinking for the long term, but in the short term he would like to highlight the urgency to make some progress. He gave an example of holiday lighting. Lummus Park is the focus and maybe this goes in the long-term plan and maybe engage Art in Public Places. While Lummus Park should be the focus, maybe we can engage with the Ocean Drive Association. What we have right now isn't working.

Commissioner Alemán agreed with Commissioner Samuelian. Multiple parties need to come together. We want to help with safety, but it is Ocean Drive and it needs to be beautiful. She had given the City Manager a vendor contact and of course we have to do competitive bidding, she is not suggesting otherwise. There was a lighting vendor in Tampa that manufactures all of the lighting and bulbs in Tampa, so at least it is a local vendor. Their specialty is creative lighting in multiple colors. There is a spectrum of turtle friendly colors that are beautiful. She thinks we should talk to the vendor and ask them for a concept plan. Maybe we bid out delivery of the concept plan. She is not against having Columbia University and she would support that also, she thinks we should do something more practical like this with people who already do this for a living.

Commissioner Samuelian suggested the item come back next month and focus on the short term, whether it is the vendor that Commissioner Alemán mentioned, Columbia University, year-round holiday lights, maybe engage ODA and check in at the next meeting. Commissioner Góngora seconded the motion.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian motioned for staff to focus on the short-term goal whether it is the vendor that Commissioner Alemán mentioned, Columbia University, year-round holiday lights, maybe engage ODA and check in at the next meeting. Commissioner Góngora seconded the motion. All in favor.

DIRECTION: Come back to the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting with an update on the short-term goal.

15. DISCUSSION OF SALSA LA PLAYA TO BE HELD IN THE NORTH BEACH BANDSHELL

July 17, 2019 – C4 C

Sponsored by Commissioner Góngora

Tourism and Culture

ACTION

Commissioner Góngora said they are looking to take the Salsa La Playa from a free park to the North Beach Bandshell, which brings on somewhere around \$5,000 in costs. He would like to get it off of the agenda and make a motion that they meet with Matt Kenny and he makes a recommendation and it gets pushed to the full Commission.

Commissioner Samuelian said he will second with a favorable recommendation assuming there are community benefits and value, local vendors, and all goodness for us. They need to work with Matt Kenny for a deal that makes sense.

MOTION: Commissioner Góngora moved that the organization meets with Matt Kenny and he makes a recommendation and then goes to the full Commission. Commissioner Samuelian seconded. All in favor.

16. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE SPONSORSHIP OF PRO FOOTVOLLEY TOUR

July 17, 2019 – C4 D

Tourism and Culture

ACTION

The Pro FootVolley organization will come back in the new year with another version of their request.

DIRECTION: Withdraw

17. DISCUSSION REGARDING CIRCUIT FESTIVAL MIAMI

July 17, 2019 – C4 J

Sponsored by Commissioner Góngora

Tourism and Culture

ACTION

Commissioner Góngora opened the item. He provided some background. He said that the White Party has existed for many years and is an AIDS fundraiser. Along with that party there is a beach festival and several events. Handling these events no longer became viable because the White Party is expensive to produce and difficult for them to put on and they outsourced it to the people who were running Score, a formal LGBT bar that unfortunately closed like many other businesses in Miami Beach. During Thanksgiving weekend they do a series of parties, one of which is on the beach, the big Sunday night party. This weekend we do extended hours. He said they met with Matt Kenny to request a waiver of approximately \$13,000 to help the event be more viable. They emailed him yesterday and provided some additional information but doesn't know if the other members of the Committee or Matt received it. He asked them what the benefit will be for Miami Beach when you are asking for waivers, they need to be able to substantiate that somehow. They said their event is adding at least 600 hotel room nights during this weekend. This is one of the signature weeks in the LGBT community, there is typically Winter Party, Pride, and what used to be White Party and now is now Circuit Festival Miami.

Matt Kenny, Tourism and Culture Director, spoke. He said that they haven't had a chance to meet yet, but he understands that they are applying to the VCA for funding as well, so it looks like they can get up to \$30,000 from the VCA which is fantastic, in order to move forward the Circuit Festival would just need to apply for the event permit. The information looks correct, but they just haven't received it in their office yet.

Commissioner Arriola said the motion needs to be to work with Tourism and Culture so we understand the economic impact when granting the fee waivers. As long as Matt Kenny is satisfied, the Committee would be inclined to give the waivers up to the \$13,000. He said if for some reason Matt Kenny thinks something is not right feel free to voice the concern.

VOTE OF ACCLAMATION TO APPROVE THE FEE WAIVERS AFTER MEETING WITH TOURISM AND CULTURE

18. DISCUSS PARTIALLY FUNDING A BLOCK PART IN HONOR OF MICKY WOLFSON'S 80TH BIRTHDAY; THE WOLFSONIAN IS REQUESTING THE CITY TO CONTRIBUTE \$25,000 TO HELP UNDERWRITE THE \$52,702 EXPENSE

September 11, 2019 – C4 D

Sponsored by Commissioner Malakoff
Tourism and Culture

ACTION

Tim Rogers, Director of the Wolfsonian, spoke. He thanked the Committee for considering the request. He spoke about the birthday party and when it will take place. He also provided some background on Micky Wolfson. Details about the party are in the memorandum.

Commissioner Malakoff said she is on the advisory board for the Wolfsonian and she also provided some background on Micky Wolfson. She said this money would be to help underwrite the cost for the party. This is a one-time funding only.

Commissioner Góngora said he is a big supporter of events and he remembers parties we used to have here when he moved to Miami Beach. He said Micky Wolfson is an important part of the history of Miami Beach, he also provided some background. He thinks they should support this. He moved the item.

Commissioner Arriola said he is supportive because it is a cultural anchor. He brought up the optics on homelessness. The Wolfsonian is a wonderful partner for our city.

Commissioner Samuelian said he will support it. He said it makes a difference that we are part of the solution as oppose to a full ask.

Commissioner Alemán said she wants to address what Commissioner Samuelian said, she doesn't want people to think we will just give half of the money to anyone that comes, it is more about the history.

VOTE OF ACCLAMATION TO APPROVE THE ITEM

19. DISCUSSION REGARDING GRANTING AN AERIAL EASEMENT OVER OCEAN COURT BETWEEN THE CLEVELANDER AND ESSEX HOTELS IN FAVOR OF THE JESTA GROUP PURSUANT TO SECTION 82-37 OF THE CITY CODE TO ENABLE A PEDESTRIAN BRIDGE TO LINK BOTH PROPERTIES

June 5, 2019 – C4 F

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola

Public Works

ACTION

Jay Fink, Public Works Assistant Director, presented the item. He said what is before the Committee is an aerial easement over Ocean Court. As a matter of course an appraisal was done of what that value would be. In the printing of the memorandum there is an abridged version, but there is a full report online in the novus agenda. The proposal that has been proffered is there.

Alex Tachmes, counsel to the Essex Hotel and Clevelander, spoke. He said this is following the same model as the Betsy and the Tides. An appraisal was done for \$135,000, the Administration had asked for a green fund proffer. They proffered \$25,000 in addition to that. He said his client is doing a major renovation of the Essex House, pouring millions of dollars into that as well as the Clevelander. As part of the overall enhancement, connecting the bridge will improve a lot of the functionality of the property. They are also branding both properties as the Clevelander, it will make more sense to have the properties viewed as one.

Commissioner Malakoff asked how the appraiser appraised this for \$135,000.

Jay Fink said it was done on a simple appraisal for the square footage of the area and the value it was creating. There is also a public benefit component on it that extends beyond the appraised value. He brought up the example of the Betsy in regard to public art and the other aspects.

Discussion was held regarding what other properties paid.

Commissioner Arriola asked if the client would be interested in proffering some additional money to beautify the alley to benefit the City and their property.

Commissioner Samuelian asked what the client is going to be contributing in total to the project.

The client's representative said \$10 million.

Commissioner Góngora said he doesn't think we should go down from what we charged before.

Commissioner Arriola said whatever number we come up with he thinks the money should stay in the area.

Discussion continued.

The Committee likes \$250,000 as the number.

Commissioner Arriola suggested the client to get up to a \$250,000 number and what we would do with that money for the alley.

Jay Fink suggested staff working with the hotel group and look at what their investment may be with the construction pedestrian bridge and maybe some improvements being done in the alley and they look at that being a financial contribution as well as a monetary contribution made in that area for something going forward.

Commissioner Malakoff suggested tactical urbanism.

Commissioner Arriola said maybe they can partner with that firm that presented earlier to come up with some concepts.

Jay Fink suggested maybe taking some of the money from pedestrian path that links Ocean Drive to Lincoln Road.

Commissioner Arriola liked that idea.

Mitch Novick, resident, spoke. He believes the greatest public benefit we can achieve out of this proposal is place a condition that the Clevelander contain their noise. In his opinion they are the most egregious noise maker. He thinks it contributes to the spring break dilemma they witness all year long. He thinks placing a condition on the Clevelander will be great for the whole community.

DIRECTION: Staff to work with the client to meet in the middle for the funds and go to the October 16, 2019 Commission meeting.

20. UPDATE FROM THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT REGARDING STEPS TAKEN TO STREAMLINE THE BUSINESS PERMITTING PROCESS, IMPROVE BUSINESS RETENTION, AND ATTRACT NEW BUSINESSES

December 12, 2018 – C4 E

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola

Economic Development

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

21. DISCUSSION REGARDING AN AMENDMENT NO. 1 TO AGREEMENT OF LEASE (AMENDMENT) BY AND BETWEEN THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH (CITY OR OWNER) AND CLPF-LINCOLN, LLC (CLARION OR TENANT), INVOLVING THE MIXED-USE PROJECT LOCATED AT 1691 MICHIGAN AVENUE, MIAMI BEACH, FLORIDA A/K/A THE LINCOLN (PROJECT), CONTAINING A PARKING GARAGE, OFFICE SPACE AND GROUND FLOOR RETAIL SPACE (IMPROVEMENTS); SAID AMENDMENT PROVIDING CLARION THE OPPORTUNITY TO CREATE A VERTICAL SUBDIVISION OF THE IMPROVEMENTS INTO THREE PARCELS COINCIDING WITH THE CURRENT THREE USES OF THE IMPROVEMENTS, NAMELY, A GARAGE PARCEL, AN OFFICE PARCEL AND A RETAIL PARCEL

Economic Development

ACTION

Rafael Paz, Deputy City Attorney, presented the item. He gave some background. He said in 1999 we entered into a ground lease at 1691 Michigan Avenue. The developer financed and structured the improvements now know as the Lincoln. It had 3 components, an office building, ground floor retail, and a 709 space parking garage. In 2018 the City received rent payments of \$500,000. The lease provides the

tenant with the ability to create a lease hold condominium for up to 3 units, an office condo unit, a retail, condo unit, and a garage condo unit. The lease hold condominium is subject to the ground lease, so the expiration of the ground lease, the lease hold condo units would expire. What the tenant is requesting is an alternative method of subdivision. A subdivision by way of a vertical subdivision would be the same for the objectives, but not require the tenant to adhere to the requirements of chapter 718 condominium act. The benefit to the tenant is that it provides the tenant much more flexibility and operational control over the common areas. They would not have to turn over and relinquish control to a condominium association within the timeframe specified by the act. He said we prepared an amendment, the tenant would have to create a master declaration and the master declaration would be subject to the City's review to ensure the terms of the lease are complied with and the City's interests are protected. The City is not out of pocket in any way as part of this review. Legal and the Administration are good with this with the one open policy issue if the Committee wants to require a financial consideration for the amendment. He outlined in the memorandum if the Committee would want to require City participation in the proceeds of the sale of these vertical subdivision units.

Raul Aguila, City Attorney, wanted to supplement what Rafael said, which was an excellent summary. The last point that Rafael made, is that these are ground leases that we did to incentivize public parking in certain areas of the city. Typically, under the ground lease structure now, when these projects are transferred or sold, the City has a right of first refusal and right of approval. What the City does not get and we have subsequently corrected in our Convention Center Hotel lease, when these projects are sold or transferred we do not get a percentage of the proceeds of the sale, we essentially get nothing. Legally we are comfortable with the structure of creating the vertical subdivision and we don't think it will affect the terms of the ground lease. The final policy question that he directs to the Committee in approving this since it will require a lease amendment, do we want to add additional financial incentive condition for the City, where in the event of a future sale or transfer, the City would somewhat benefit of the proceeds of the sale?

Rafael Paz said in regard to the Convention Center Hotel is that for the first 3 sales of the hotel project and there are specified hurdles, if they sell the project for more than 120% of what it cost to build the project he believes we get the greater of \$2 million or 2.5%.

Raul Aguila said historically we have approved multiple sales of these projects and they have broken records in terms of sale of commercial projects in the city.

Commissioner Góngora said what he is having a hard time with this as it is complex and didn't receive the information with enough time.

Commissioner Malakoff said that she understands the concept of the vertical separation, but she thinks we need to build into these agreements financial consideration for the future.

Raul Aguila said the complexity of the item is that we have never done a vertical subdivision structure as opposed to a condominium structure. As Rafael said they are very comfortable with the legal structure and are prepared to recommend it as is the Administration. The policy question is whether or not since we are opening up the lease to the amendment if we want to include financial consideration for the City in the future.

Commissioner Góngora confirmed that if they are terminating the condo association because as Commissioner Malakoff said it allows you to sell the separate vertical separations apart.

Alex Tachmes, representative of the tenant, spoke. He pointed out they have been trying to get this rather simple amendment done since February of this year. The Administration discussed a possibility of some financial consideration and then dropped the issue. For the first time they heard again yesterday they wanted to condition this on some financial consideration. He doesn't think this is appropriate, because they wouldn't have had their client spend the legal fees as well as the City's outside counsel fees, if they knew

about the financial consideration. He doesn't think it is right to bring this up now. He also sent to everyone yesterday that vertical projects around South Florida are being done. This is a non-substantive technical amendment that is routine in projects all over South Florida. If the City is going to tie this to a transfer fee that is going to cost the client millions of dollars they will drop it.

Raul Aguila said it is a negotiation, we are reopening the lease. Mr. Tachmes can call it a non-substantive technical amendment, but it is an accommodation. Everything is a negotiation. It is brought up as a policy matter.

The Committee discussed the policy matter on making the lease change.

This project sold in 2006 for \$74 million and the current tenant purchased it in 2016 for \$109 million. The City has not participated in any of those sales.

Discussion regarding the percentage for financial consideration was held.

Commissioner Arriola said that bringing things up at the 11th hour is not good negotiation tactics. He doesn't know if that happened here, but let's just not do that.

Mr. Tachmes said they would like to hear what a proposed number will be by the City and his client will consider it.

Rafael Paz said there are a number of things we can do in regard to a formula to come up with a percentage. He gave some examples.

Commissioner Arriola said to come up with a structure and bring this item back. He asked how the Committee feels about any value that is made for it to stay in the area.

Commissioner Samuelian said that he understands the logic and he would be open for part of the money to be dedicated, but he thinks about our needs for PAYGO, resiliency, historic preservation fund. He would hate to lock up 100%.

Mr. Tachmes said he spoke to his client yesterday about this and the client was pretty angry about after 7 months hearing it for the first time. He also mentioned that the rents on Lincoln Road are not very attractive these days and there is also a decrease in demand for parking. The project is not doing super well, so the client thought it was odd that this is being requested in the framework of that environment. They would need to see what the City has in mind. If it is a modest compensation sure, but if it is going to be in the millions of dollars, he doesn't think it will make any sense.

Mr. Tachmes will meet with Susy Torriente and Rafael Paz.

DIRECTION: Come back to the next FCWPC meeting with some frameworks.

22. DISCUSSION TO CONSIDER A PROPOSED AMENDMENT TO CHAPTER 2 OF THE CITY CODE, TO REQUIRE THE ADMINISTRATION AS PART OF THE REQUIRED ANALYSIS ACCOMPANYING ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS PLACE ON CITY COMMISSION AGENDA, TO SPECIFICALLY DISCLOSE THE FISCAL AND/OR FINANCIAL IMPACTS ASSOCIATED WITH THE PROPOSED ITEM

July 17, 2019 – C4 G

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Office of the City Attorney

ACTION

Commissioner Samuelian opened the item and said we are living in an increasingly tough budget environment and all this is doing is asking for a little more financial and fiscal information with items.

Rafael Paz, Deputy City Attorney, spoke on the item. It would amend chapter 2 of the code which governs meeting agenda procedures that would require a separate stand alone section in commission memorandums with resolutions and ordinances, briefly stating the fiscal impact of the revenues and expenditures of the City. The idea is to codify much of what the Administration already does in many of their commission memorandums, but to require a specific statement. It also identifies additional criteria that would give the Administration flexibility to provide additional background information. The idea is to create a burden on staff so it would not apply to anything that is covered in a previously approved budget and anything that is identified with a budget code. With a materiality threshold so that the requirements of the section would only apply to items having a fiscal impact of over \$5,000.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian moved the item. Commissioner Góngora seconded. All in favor.

23. DISCUSSION ON REVISIONS TO THE EVENT SPONSORSHIP GUIDELINES

September 11, 2019 – C4 A
Tourism and Culture

ACTION

DIRECTION: Defer to the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

24. DISCUSSION TO CONTINUE THE MID-BEACH FREEBEE ON-DEMAND TRANSIT SERVICE

September 11, 2019 – R9 K
Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán
Transportation and Mobility

ACTION

Commissioner Góngora said he likes the concept, but would like to know the level of advertising.

Commissioner Alemán said for the Mid-Beach pilot there is no advertising. The other ones operating in the city have advertising. She explained that Transportation isn't fully convinced that Mid-Beach would benefit having the full trolley system based on ridership. She finds it silly that people say it is preposterous to having advertising on the free bees. There is media everywhere. There is no reason in her mind that we shouldn't offset the City's cost of providing free transportation for residents because we are squeamish about a few ads.

Commissioner Góngora asked what the cost is if we don't allow the advertising.

Milos Majstorovic, Transportation Manager, said the advertising offsets the cost by about 25%. The original enhancement request was for \$300,000 if we were to operate 7 days a week service without advertisement, with advertisement it would be around \$225,000.

Commissioner Góngora said he would rather pay the extra \$75,000 and not have the advertising.

Commissioner Malakoff asked if we approve the ads.

Tonya Daniels, Marketing and Communications Director, said as we do with the trolley and parking garage ads we would have a chance to approve them and make sure they are tasteful and educational.

Commissioner Góngora said he is going to vote no because of the advertising, he would rather look for other funding. He likes the freebee concept, though.

Commissioner Samuelian said that he understands the concern, he thinks the freebee is a great service, \$75,000 is a real number compared to the total cost and his experience with the advertising on the trolleys he doesn't hear many complaints. He thought at the Commission meeting they directed to go with the advertising.

Tonya Daniels said the freebees are already in our city with ads, this is a chance for us to begin making money off of the advertising that we don't already.

Commissioner Arriola said his understanding is right now the advertising is Baptist Health.

The representative said the current advertising is Baptist Health and also Yard House has expressed interest.

Commissioner Arriola said he is not concerned with those.

Jose Gonzalez said the additional month gives an opportunity to tweak the program and make it even better, one of the things we were struggling with was the amount of cancellations. We only had one vehicle and now the Commission has given the opportunity with 3 and he will go back to Commission with updated data. The one vehicle in service was used 70% of the time. We conducted a user survey and noticed we took car trips off the road and this can also serve as a pedestrian accelerator.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian moved the item. Commissioner Arriola seconded.

25. DISCUSSION PERTAINING TO A FUTURE PLAN FOR THE PARKING LOT ON THE NORTH SIDE OF 75TH STREET BETWEEN COLLINS AVENUE AND OCEAN TERRACE

June 5, 2019 – C4 E
Economic Development

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item withdrawn.

DEFERRED ITEMS

26. UPDATE ON THE CITY'S BLUEWAYS MASTER PLAN

July 17, 2019 – C4 K
Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola
Parks and Recreation

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

27. DISCUSS TERMINATING THE CITY'S CONTRACT WITH COCA-COLA

July 17, 2019 – R9 I
Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola
Marketing & Communications

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

28. DISCUSS A COMPOSTING PROGRAM IN NORTH BEACH SIMILAR TO THE PROGRAM AT THE MIAMI BEACH BOTANICAL GARDEN

May 8, 2019 – C4 E

Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán
Environment & Sustainability

ACTION

DIRECTION: Update to be provided 6 months after initiation of program.

29. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE REVIEW OF THE JULIA TUTTLE BUS RAPID TRANSIT DEMONSTRATION PROJECT

May 16, 2018 – C4 R

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Transportation

ACTION

DIRECTION: Update to be provided at the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

30. UPDATE ON THE PROGRESS OF THE TRAFFIC MITIGATION STRATEGY TO HELP REDUCE TRAFFIC IMPACTS OF THE CONNECTING MIAMI CONSTRUCTION PROJECT

UPDATE ON FDOT AND CITY CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS AND TRAFFIC MITIGATION STRATEGIES

March 13, 2019 – R7 G and June 5, 2019 – R9 E

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian and Commissioner Góngora
Transportation

ACTION

DIRECTION: Update to be provided at the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

31. DISCUSSION ON UPDATING MINIMUM WAGES ON CITY FUNDED CONSTRUCTION CONTRACTS

January 16, 2019 – C4 M

Sponsored by Commissioner Steinberg
Procurement/CIP

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred to the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

32. DISCUSSION TO EXPLORE IMPROVING CAPITAL ASSET CONDITIONS (E.G., STREETS, SIDEWALKS, BUILDINGS) BY INCREASING ANNUAL FUNDING FOR PAY-AS-YOU-GO (PAYGO) FUND

July 31, 2019 – C4 B

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Office of Management and Budget

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the November 22, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

33. DISCUSSION REGARDING IMPLEMENTING A TOTAL BAN ON SINGLE-USE PLASTICS ON MIAMI BEACH PENDING THE FLORIDA RETAIL FEDERATION'S LITIGATION AGAINST THE CITY OF CORAL GABLES

July 17, 2019 – R9 J

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Ariola, Co-Sponsored by Mayor Gelber, Commissioners Góngora, Malakoff and Steinberg

Environment & Sustainability/Office of the City Attorney

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting, after the Sustainability and Resiliency Committee.

34. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE ANNEXATION OF THE WESTERNMOST ISLANDS OF THE VENETIAN ISLANDS AND MAKING THEM A PART OF MIAMI BEACH, AND TO REVIEW PROPERTY TAXES, ECONOMIC IMPACT, AND VALUE

September 12, 2018 – R9 F

Sponsored by Commissioner Góngora

Office of the City Attorney

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred to the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending discussions with City of Miami.

35. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE ANNEXATION OF NORTH BAY VILLAGE, AND TO REVIEW PROPERTY TAXES, ECONOMIC IMPACT, AND VALUE

September 12, 2018 – R9 E

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola

Office of the City Attorney

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred to the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending discussions with North Bay Village.

36. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE JUNE 18, 2019 ANIMAL WELFARE COMMITTEE MOTIONS ON EXTENDING THE CAT FEEDER AND WATERING PROGRAM AS WELL AS INCREASING THE FUNDING FOR THE TRAP, NEUTER, AND RELEASE (TNR) PROGRAMS

September 11, 2019 – C4 C

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian

Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

37. DISCUSSION REGARDING SPONSORSHIP OF THE AMERICAN BLACK FILM FESTIVAL

September 11, 2019 – C4 E

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Arriola

Tourism and Culture

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

38. DISCUSSION REGARDING CITY'S HOMELESS WALK-IN CENTER

September 11, 2019 – R9 O

Office of Housing and Community Services

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the October 25, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

ADDENDUM

39. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE MIAMI CITY BALLET

ACTION

Commissioner Arriola added this item. He said for some reason this item didn't make the agenda, but there was a lengthy discussion at the Commission meeting last week about bring this to the FCWPC, there was no formal motion made, but there was agreement for this to be discussed for funding.

The Committee agreed to talk about the item.

Commissioner Arriola explained that there was a request by the Miami City Ballet for an annual contribution of \$500,000.

John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer explained that where we are at in the budget process is nearly at the end, next Wednesday, September 25th we will have the second public hearing on the budget and adopt the budget, since the fiscal year starts October 1st. This request comes in very late and we basically balanced the budget at this point and unless we are talking about one time funding it is going to be rather difficult at this point in time to accommodate the request. \$500,000 is a high amount in comparison to other requests we have received. More than likely it would come from the resort tax fund and one of the things we are struggling with is what Spring Break costs will look like, which is one of the highest priorities of the Administration.

Commissioner Arriola confirmed that the request of \$500,000 is a recurring request.

Kristi Jernigan, Miami City Ballet spoke. She said the request comes out of conversations that they had with the Commissioners and Mayor. They appreciated that process. She said they spoke about how the Ballet has grown since partnering with the City of Miami Beach and the different programs that have grown within the Ballet. She said that the Commission expressed interest in having more of the Ballet on the Beach. They approached the Colony Theater. They have secured dates to perform at the Colony Theater and they are also collaborating with the New World Symphony. She continued to speak about the progress and what they have done. They believe they are providing a great amenity to Miami Beach. They do their share of heavy fundraising, but they are asking for the City's support. She said if it cannot be a recurring item, they would like to explore the one time funding this year.

Commissioner Malakoff said she met a few times with the Miami City Ballet and feels they are an important component of our cultural icons. She hopes we can find some room in our budget to put them in this year and on a recurring basis. She said that the Miami City Ballet presented what they were going to do for Miami Beach.

Commissioner Samuelian said he met with the Miami City Ballet as well. We are late in the budget process, and going into the budget at this point as a recurring item might be a heavy lift, but a one-time funding might be a little more palatable. He is open to doing something, he would like the Administration to have

the opportunity a little more formally to meet with the Miami City Ballet to understand our relationship including the community benefits. He would like to see a more formal proposal. He would be supportive to try this on a one time basis and allow our budget process to proceed and coming into next year maybe look at a recurring item. He thinks we should look for something on a time basis with a more formalized proposal from the Miami City Ballet with the Administration and look at the next budget cycle to see how we want to proceed.

Commissioner Góngora said he normally doesn't like these last-minute requests, with that said he is flexible because he does love the Miami City Ballet. He is going to support this, but he doesn't think this is a good way of doing it. He thinks we should find one-time funding for this year and then next year have Miami City Ballet go through the process with all of the other groups.

Commissioner Arriola said he knows the Miami City Ballet quite well. He wanted to make it clear what we do and already have done for the Miami City Ballet. It sounds like we are not doing enough, and if that is the impression they are trying to convey he would strongly disagree and encourage the Miami City Ballet to be more cautious in their words. We bought the building.

Raul Aguila, City Attorney, said when the Miami City Ballet was in danger of going under, we bought the building and leased it back to them at a nominal sum. They are also one of our cultural anchors in prioritizing funding in the Cultural Arts Council.

Discussion continued on what we are doing for the Miami City Ballet.

The City has historically been one of the largest contributors to the Ballet.

Commissioner Arriola said he is a no on this, because he is not going to prioritize a \$500,000 grant when we are trying to solve for homelessness. He would like to see if we are going to be as generous to the homeless as we are being to the Ballet.

Commissioner Góngora asked what funds we would have available if we were to do a ramp up of getting the Ballet some one-time funding and then put them in budget cycle for next year.

John Woodruff said one-time funding is more flexible, we are basically using our savings account to fund something on a one off basis to buy time to see if we do need to add it to our recurring budget. If we did do anything we would try to build it into the budget before next Wednesday.

Michael Llorente, Llorente and Heckler, spoke on behalf of the Miami City Ballet. He said they met with the Commissioners and the Mayor and their goal is not to say that the City is not doing anything for the Ballet. There is a strong partnership. He also addressed some of the other things that were mentioned earlier. He said they are asking today for financial support. He spoke about the donors that the Miami City Ballet has been working on getting. They are asking for support from the City to strengthen the partnership.

Commissioner Góngora asked what the maintenance costs for the building are.

Kristi Jernigan said the rent goes to the maintenance costs and the capital reserve. Anything that happens to the building they are paying for it. There is wonderful support in the G.O Bond for a new roof, she thanked the City. She continued to speak about the maintenance of the building.

Commissioner Góngora said he would like to do some type of reasonable contribution to the Ballet because he understands the benefits to the community. He said they would need to bring more performances to Miami Beach and strengthen our community partnerships. He said he would be inclined to do a one-time funding of \$120,000 because he can tie it to the building we own and maintain. Then we can look next year to see if we can do something more when we go through the regular budget cycle.

Commissioner Samuelian said he agrees a lot with Commissioner Góngora, we are probably not in the best position to do anything in this budget. If we are thinking more one time, we have a little more flexibility time wise. He would like to see some things in writing, the benefits to the community and the incremental ask, also what we have been getting and what are going to get that is new and different. He supports what Commissioner Góngora said, but he doesn't know he wants to tie us to the number until we allow professional staff to sit with the Miami City Ballet, come back with those specifics that will bring the Miami City Ballet to us in a more close way and a recommendation from the Administration of the level of funding. He would like to direct staff to do that.

Commissioner Malakoff said she thinks we should invest in our cultural anchors. She personally asked the Miami City Ballet to do some performances in Miami Beach. She spoke about the programs they are putting on. They are concentrating on the lower income people in Miami Beach, etc. She said she would like to see us fund more like \$250,000.

Commissioner Góngora said he agrees with a lot of what Commissioner Malakoff said. He said if this Committee feels comfortable with setting a number today he would support it, but if not he would at least like this to leave the Committee with a positive affirmation that the City will do something this year and have the Administration to figure out what that amount is and bring it back to the Commission.

Commissioner Samuelian said he agrees with commissioner Góngora with sending it out of the Committee with a positive affirmation and having the Administration meet with the Miami City Ballet and come back to Commission with a recommendation. He also said we had some time to decide on that number if it is a one-time funding.

John Woodruff said that is correct, but we do need to know a number because as we approach big ticket items like Spring Break when we are trying to come up with numbers like \$1.5 million for programming, it is helpful to know the scale of what we are talking about. \$100,000 is much more doable than \$500,000 or \$250,000.

Commissioner Góngora doesn't mind going up to \$200,000 and tying it to better public benefits.

Kristi Jernigan said they did provide the Administration the program information and collaborations they have with other entities. She also wanted to make it clear that they do value the relationship with the City. She has looked at this as the opportunity to evolve the relationship. They are extremely grateful for everything the City has done for the Ballet.

Commissioner Góngora said that he would like to send this to the full Commission with a positive affirmation and for the Miami City Ballet to meet with the Administration and come back with a number to the full commission.

The rent is \$97,000.

Commissioner Arriola said that is already pretty generous. The City does a lot.

Discussion continued.

Commissioner Samuelian said he supports Commissioner Góngora's motion with a friendly amendment that it come back to the FCWPC.

Commissioner Góngora amended his motion to make a positive affirmation and for Miami City Ballet to meet with the Administration to find one time funding and bring it back to the FCWPC. Commissioner Samuelian seconded.

MOTION: Commissioner Góngora moved for a positive affirmation and for the Miami City Ballet to meet with the Administration to find one time funding and bring it back to the FCWPC with a number. Commissioner Samuelian seconded.