

MIAMI BEACH

Finance and Citywide Projects Committee Meeting

City Hall, Commission Chambers, 3rd Floor, 1700 Convention Center Drive

June 28, 2019 - 8:00 AM

Commissioner Ricky Arriola, Chair
Commissioner Michael Góngora, Vice-Chair
Commissioner Mark Samuelian, Member
Commissioner Micky Steinberg Alternate

John Woodruff, Liaison
Morgan Goldberg, Support Staff

Visit us at www.miamibeachfl.gov for agendas and video streaming of City Commission Committee Meetings.

A meeting of the Finance and Citywide Projects Committee- Budget Briefing was held on Friday, June 28, 2019 at 8:00 a.m. in the Commission Chambers, 3rd floor of City Hall. Attendance: Commissioners Ricky Arriola, Michael Góngora, Mark Samuelian, John Alemán, and Joy Malakoff. Members from the Administration and the public were also attendance.

Meeting began at 8:06 a.m.

OLD BUSINESS

1. DISCUSSION REGARDING A WATERLESS CARWASH RFP AT GARAGES-UPDATE

October 18, 2017 – C4 E
Parking

ACTION

Saul Frances, Parking Director, presented the item. He said this item is a report back to the Committee regarding the GT Echo car wash pilot. The pilot started back in February at the 17th Street garage, it has worked well. We had requests for additional service at the City Hall garage. They started service here in March every Friday. They are building their clientele. The city receives 8% of gross revenues, while it's not a lot of money, it's a good amenity that we are providing to our users and we're recommending that we extend it to additional garages and receive an endorsement to negotiate a concession agreement for a longer term. George Nemi from the carwash is here in there are any questions.

Commissioner Arriola asked if Saul Frances likes it.

Saul Frances said yes and there is no harm. It is a resilient initiative and is working well.

People like it.

Commissioner Arriola and Commissioner Samuelian are fine with it.

DIRECTION: Extend it to additional garages and negotiate a longer term agreement.

2. **DISCUSSION REGARDING THE ANNEXATION OF NORTH BAY VILLAGE, AND TO REVIEW PROPERTY TAXES, ECONOMIC IMPACT, AND VALUE**

September 12, 2018 – R9 E

Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola

Office of the City Attorney

ACTION

Raul Aguila, City Attorney, presented the item. He said that the last action that we took was obviously at the direction of the FCWPC, we sent both governments letters to their mayors and their town managers. We received no response, following which he believes the subsequent direction of this Committee was that if we received no response to do some kind of outreach and contact them directly. In order to annex, in this case part of the part of the westernmost islands of the Venetian islands and North Bay Village, we need both the consent of this City Commission and the consent of those town councils. Before we initiate any process the next step is outreach. He asked for direction from this from this committee as to what kind of outreach it wants to conduct.

Commissioner Strout, North Bay Village, spoke. She said as a candidate she was here when this item was originally discussed. She said she thinks this information is important for the residents know about; she is not the sole decision maker on this process. She knows the letter was received. She does feel it should be discussed with the North Bay Village Commission, the next meeting is on July 9th if anyone would like to attend regarding what information was obtained or what additional information can be presented to the residents. We can go from there.

Commissioner Arriola said he might be traveling on that day, but he would love to go. He would love to get a dialogue going because it could be years and years if anything were to happen. He thinks in particular with sea level rise, among other things, it is going to be a discussion that a lot of the smaller municipalities will be having. But also he thinks there's a lot of synergistic opportunities for both cities to explore because our kids go to the same schools, use the same parks, etc., from an economic perspective tax base it is worth exploring to benefit both communities. There's no rush but he thinks the economic realities and things like sea level rise in the amount of infrastructure investments that communities want to be making they are better off collaborating than trying to go at it alone.

Commissioner Strout said items that are being discussed right now are things North Bay Village is discussing too. There is a lot of information that can be shared. There are a lot of ways we should collaborate no matter what would be the case regarding the annexation, but she does feel that regarding the economy and what's going on with the residents and also the businesses she wants to see them flourish and this is a discussion that we should be bringing up to them. She doesn't want to be somebody that is going to say yay or nay on, but does feel that if someone can attend the July 9th meeting to discuss it further with the Commission.

Commissioner Arriola said we have been discussing the restaurant crawl with our neighbors in North Bay Village and Miami Beach particularly North Beach, just to have the trolley to go to bar hop and restaurants, so we can explore and support our local businesses up there. He thinks that's kind of stalled, he would like to see somebody in the City Administration pick that up. He is asking City staff to do something with this, it's easy to do.

Commissioner Góngora said he will support that and make the motion. Going back to an earlier point, besides all of the projects that we're talking about there would be a huge cost savings in the services through police and fire which are huge part of both of our budgets. If the communities were to combine he thinks there would be an incredible financial savings in the consolidation of those safety services.

Commissioner Strout said with Treasure Elementary School right now a majority of those residents attending that school are Miami Beach residents and they do bear a cost associated with that. For safety services, she would like to see them collaborate.

Commissioner Samuelian thanked Commissioner Arriola for putting forth this idea. This is thinking big and he thinks the collaboration that we're talking about absolutely makes sense, that's a win-win. We should be proceeding. He thinks the basic economic proposition that one plus one probably gets to three is there. We don't need all the duplication, we could have synergies and that makes a lot of sense. For him the fundamental question is whether there is interest from the other community. It is kind that Commissioner Strout invited the Committee to their meeting, that's the gating factor because we need to know that we have a willing partner that would like to explore this before we spend too much, but he likes the concept and if that partner wanted it, then I think we would need to do serious due diligence around it.

Commissioner Strout said we should be partnering right now sharing resources and sharing knowledge regarding a lot of these topics that are very similar that we're dealing with. And again she invited the Committee to come to the meeting because there will be both residents and the full Commission. We can get a good gauge as to how they will feel about it.

Commissioner Arriola said he cannot make the July 9th meeting and asked if there is another meeting.

Commissioner Strout said there is one on July 23rd.

Commissioner Arriola is going to try and go and Commissioner Góngora said he is happy to go as well. Commissioner Arriola confirmed that Commissioner Góngora made a motion about directing staff to come back with a plan to have a friendly neighborhood restaurant pub crawl to promote local businesses in North Beach and North Bay Village.

Commissioner Arriola asked if we could have a report with the action plan for the next FCWPC meeting.

The North Bay Village Commission meeting on July 23rd is at 6:30 p.m.

Commissioner Samuelian seconded Commissioner Góngora's motion.

MOTION: Commissioner Góngora moved to direct the Administration to plan the pub crawl with North Bay Village and come back to the next FCWPC meeting with an action plan. Commissioner Samuelian seconded. All in favor.

3. **DISCUSSION REGARDING THE ANNEXATION OF THE WESTERNMOST ISLANDS OF THE VENETIAN ISLANDS AND MAKING THEM A PART OF MIAMI BEACH, AND TO REVIEW PROPERTY TAXES, ECONOMIC IMPACT, AND VALUE**

September 12, 2018 – R9 F

Sponsored by Commissioner Góngora
Office of the City Attorney

ACTION

Commissioner Góngora said this is in the same spirit as the previous item, except rather than the entire city, it is the westernmost Venetian islands that are presently part of the City of Miami that so many people think are a part of Miami Beach. He thinks the only difference between the two items because it's a small portion, he doesn't think it requires a voter referendum, but he thinks it still requires our Commission to vote, City of Miami's Commission to vote, the County Commission to approve it. He would like to go forward with that, he doesn't think there will be an appetite in Miami, but he knows that the residents, at least the majority of them, would like to become Miami Beach residents. Perhaps we could have the same level of outreach if we could reach out to the City of Miami and see if we can get on an agenda and see if

there's an appetite there to do this.

Raul Aguila, City Attorney, said that he did the same thing and has not heard back from them so that at this point the next step was to do some outreach. Maybe it should be at a higher level City Manager to City Manager. The rationale is that those islands are significant part of their tax base and they don't want to give them up.

Commissioner Arriola said he fully supports this, it is an easier no-brainer than the prior discussion and he thinks to his knowledge the residents there overwhelmingly look to be a part of a Miami Beach from a service perspective and other things. He can't imagine the City of Miami enthusiastically endorsing losing this asset that contributes so much money and consume so little in city services, but for us this this makes a lot of sense. He would love to do this.

Commissioner Góngora would love to do it too. Maybe the residents can help push it a little bit as well. He thinks there are two associations and his aide is the president of one of them and he went to one of the meetings and they are very enthusiastic. Most of them put Miami Beach on their address; they consider themselves residents of Miami Beach. Our millage rate is actually lower than Miami's so their property taxes would be less. It is a win-win for them.

Commissioner Góngora said maybe the City Manager should reach out to the City Manager there and see the level of interest.

Commissioner Arriola said let's direct Jimmy Morales to make the ask.

Commissioner Góngora said that will be the motion. Commissioner Samuelian seconded.

MOTION: Commissioner Góngora motioned to direct our City Manager to reach out to the City of Miami's City Manager to see what the level of interest is and report back to the Committee. Commissioner Samuelian seconded. All in favor.

4. **DISCUSSION REGARDING THE BUDGET ADVISORY COMMITTEE MOTION THAT THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH COMPLETE A FACILITY CONDITION ASSESSMENT**

December 12, 2018 – C4 H

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Property Management

ACTION

Adrian Morales, Property Manager Director, presented the item. He said this is an update. He said we are in the process of conducting facility condition assessments per the recommendation of the Budget Advisory Committee (BAC). They are scheduled to start after Fourth of July; it will take a couple months. What we will get is an updated facility condition assessment and we currently have one that what was done in 2014 and industry standards dictates that we should be doing every five years. As new facilities come online, they should be added to give us an updated FCI or facility condition index, which is how we base our capital budget. We are in the market right now for a new work order management system which will all integrate and tie together to allow us to be better at capital budget planning.

Commissioner Samuelian asked what we might be doing, what are the best practices in terms of multiyear capital budget planning?

John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer, said he worked with the Budget Advisory Committee on this item and he thinks what we are really talking about here is his helping decision-makers, such as City Administration and the City Commission be able to see what is the right number in order to properly maintain the assets of the city. So when you say the assets of the city that covers a lot of ground and little

by little we have been working through our inventory of assets to try get a handle on what is that condition, what the useful life is. If you try to extrapolate this out over time determine what would be a good average amount of money to set aside in order to properly maintain the facilities. At this moment in time it's pretty obvious that we fund only the highest priorities and so there's a lot of deferred maintenance from the past, that we're trying to get caught up on and we used to have much more funding, but during the recession a lot of that funding got cut and so we have been trying to slowly build it back up, but it's been slow going. He think the direction from the BAC is even if we can't fund it today, let's make sure everyone understands what the delta really is so that that way as fiscal conditions improve in the future we can make a good business case for setting aside additional funding for that purpose.

Commissioner Arriola said we will talk about it more at the budget meeting, but it is his understanding that at one time we had a dedicated millage rate for repair and replacement, for things like city streets and sidewalks that we discontinued maybe after the recession and now are starting to see the effects of that. We can't repair our sidewalks and streets because we don't have dedicated funding sources. So that is why the G.O. Bond is allowing us to catch up on some of those projects and he would ask as part of the presentation during the budget meeting to talk to us about what that repair and replacement millage rate used to be and what it might look like under today's budget. He will probably be favorably disposed to looking at it because all we're doing is deferring and the problem is the city looks like crap and then 10 years from now you need to pass a huge millage rate increase. We need to have discipline, it's a small amount we have to a set aside and that way our city looks new all the time. It is like a special assessment in a condominium.

Commissioner Malakoff said she thinks it's very important that it is done each year and that really the loss of that extra millage to do this on an annual basis has really hurt the city. People complain and say they feel like they are in a third world city, which should never be. She thinks we need to do that to be budget wise.

Commissioner Samuelian said he strongly echoes his colleagues' comments and he thinks Commissioner Arriola put it best, if you think about folks in the condos they set aside money each year based on expected needs, his sense right now is that we're not doing that and we need to build that discipline. He said he supports the Administration's recommendation for the technology tools. In addition to Commissioner Arriola's request, what he would like to see as part of this year's budget is what projects are we not funding that we're pretty sure we need to do at least next year, like a one-year look, and then what he'd like to add to that is as we approach the fiscal year 2021 budget that we have an improved multiyear capital plan. That would be his motion.

Commissioner Arriola said we have so many great things going in the city and to be criticized for cracked sidewalks and streets that are bumpy, it is because we didn't have the guts to keep millage rates where they really needed to be, we have underinvested in the city. We had to do this massive G.O. Bond to catch up, because as politicians we want to be known as someone who reduced the millage rate every year, but then future Commissioners inherit the mess.

Commissioner Samuelian said he agreed with Commissioner Arriola. We were bold with the G.O. Bond and thankfully the community came around. He asked what would happen if they didn't, and second what a golden opportunity now to reset the clock because as we think about the G.O. Bond projects, they will also need capital renewal, so the last thing we would do this is not get this right. Now is the time to get our hands around this.

Roy Coley, Public Works Director, said that pavement seems to be one of the most popular conversations in the community with him right now. Everywhere he goes people want to talk about pavement, he had the opportunity yesterday to go through all the area of Meridian Avenue that the G.O. Bond recently funded repaving from 5th to 15th and it's quite a beautiful sight. Everyone says the same thing, but to put this in some kind of perspective, if we repaved every street in our city every 15 years, that's what we believe it would take to have really nice looking streets all the time, it is going to cost us \$7-8 million a year into

perpetuity. The G.O. Bond committed \$30 million in total but that just gets us started. It would take a long term commitment with a lot of money if we want the Meridian Street look to be citywide. It does look great and it's a policy decision, if we are told that is what is wanted, we certainly have the capacity and the ability to do the work, it is just a lot of money. Another thing is maintaining some of our newer assets that aren't in bad shape yet as in stormwater, we spent a couple hundred million dollars in the last few years on stormwater assets and they're going to have to have aggressive maintenance. If we allow these assets to function until they fail, they may fail in a flood event. We are going to have to aggressively maintain this equipment if we don't want to face failure. Today we have 40 stormwater pump stations and if what we have prepared that is going to be brought forward very soon is what we're calling a predictive maintenance plan, we've identified every major component in the system and how long it should live, what its useful life is and replace it at that point, not wait until it fails in the middle of a storm and that's going to require a lot of dedicated funding for stormwater too. We have an outside consultant doing that for our water and sewer systems. We believe the water and sewer systems, from decades of deferred maintenance have very significant needs and will bring that to you late in the fall when we get those numbers and we're trying to prepare ourselves for stormwater, but everything being talked about is what he and John Woodruff have been working on and he thinks when the numbers are revealed they are going to be big.

Commissioner Samuelian said as we are making the city better and more beautiful we are expanding the infrastructure base, so this problem is getting exponentially bigger so we need to get on with it, maybe not for today, but we do need to talk about creative funding, how we allocate the right amount of money, how we start maybe opening the discussion at some point if we do proceed, for example, with sponsorship for the Convention Center. Maybe we would take dedicated funding for that. He knows we've set aside the minimum rent for the Convention Center Hotel, but there will be additional rents there, but we need to find some creative funding sources here. He is open to creative ideas, but he thinks we have to get on with this.

Commissioner Arriola agreed. He said he wants to encourage all of us when we think about money the expenses of the investment, the maintenance and yes, that's the cost element. One of the major reasons that he was so strong for the G.O. Bond is it is truly his opinion that it's an investment in our city that is going to have a return on investment. A lot of people think all it is just a cost, an expense; however, the cost of doing nothing is declining quality of life, declining property values, and sort of a race to the bottom. By investing in our parks, our infrastructure, and public safety, it would increase property values increase quality of life, and so the revenue will increase as well. He just wants us to be mindful and that is why he champions programming and things that will bring more tourism and resort taxes. The costs are going to go up regardless because that is the environment we live in, but we need to think on the revenue side, how do we increase property values as the taxes as well as resort taxes and the investment in our tourists and residents.

Commissioner Samuelian said he is in vehement agreement with Commissioner Arriola. He thinks the \$439 million G.O. Bond investment was a remarkable investment. He thinks it's fabulous for the community and he does believe over the longer term, we will get returns from enhanced property values that relates to property taxes. One addition he would make to Commissioner Arriola's comments, we have to show the discipline to take a piece of that and put it back in to keep those assets living. We just need to direct some of those funds.

Commissioner Arriola said he will bring this up at the budget discussions. He told John Woodruff to think about what millage rate we need to set to maintain all of our assets. We have a job to do; part of it is fiscal responsibility.

DIRECTION: Think about what millage rate needs to be set to maintain all of our assets and be ready to discuss at the budget hearings.

5. **DISCUSS THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MOTION MADE ON APRIL 5 BY THE HISPANIC AFFAIRS COMMITTEE**

April 10, 2019 – C4 AF

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Marketing and Communications

ACTION

Commissioner Samuelian said the recommendation from the Administration makes sense. This was something that came from the Hispanic Affairs Committee. The next step as stated in the memorandum is that the Marketing and Communications Department will talk to the Hispanic Affairs Committee to determine the right people. He said it looks great and yes to proceed.

The Committee asked what this is.

Commissioner Samuelian said this was recommendation to conduct two interviews that will be aired on MBTV during Hispanic Heritage month.

Tonya Daniels, Marketing and Communications, confirmed that the Committee wants us to do two interviews on MBTV during Hispanic Affairs month and do it every year. We can absolutely do this and is happy to move forward.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian moved to approve to air the two interviews during Hispanic Affairs month every year. All in favor.

6. DISCUSS A COMPOSTING PROGRAM IN NORTH BEACH SIMILAR TO THE PROGRAM AT THE MIAMI BEACH BOTANICAL GARDEN

May 8, 2019 – C4 E

Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán
Environment & Sustainability

ACTION

Elizabeth Wheaton, Environment and Sustainability Director, presented the item. She said that this came to the Committee last month for discussion and it was first heard at the Sustainability and Resiliency Committee (SRC). The idea would be to establish a pilot composting program in North Beach, similar to what is done at the Botanical Gardens. It was the recommendation of the SRC to start a program with the Miami Beach Botanical Gardens as the manager of the pilot. We've been working closely with them to identify the right site that would be accessible to the residents. We found that the parking lot just south of 85th Street has enough space to start a program which would service approximately 100 residents and it also has that parking component. As the program was developed we estimated that it would cost about \$75,000 to get it up and running. Currently there is \$75,000 allocated for a mechanical composter as part of the North Beach Yard project. She said it would be our recommendation that the project be unfunded and reallocated through the operating budget to establish a manual composting program with the Botanical Gardens.

Commissioner Arriola asked what the anticipated benefit of this is in terms of the produce and things that might come from this.

Elizabeth Wheaton said through the composting site there will be the creation of soil that's very high and rich in nutrients and that soil would be available that residents can come and pick up and utilize within their own gardens and homes.

Commissioner Malakoff asked how the compost pile is protected from for-profit businesses coming in taking the soil to use like gardeners.

Elizabeth Wheaton said this project would include that city install a fence around the site, we would put messaging on that fence to let people know that we have a composting site behind it, the composting site would be locked and there would be set hours in which the Botanical Gardens would have it open. We would have a box outside the locked area where people drop off the compost, but in order to come and pick up the soil you have to come during the set hours or go to the Botanical Garden and prove residency.

Commissioner Arriola confirmed that the cost is \$75,000 to get it up and running and then asked what the annual cost to maintain it is. He said it says there are two staff members working 10 to 20 hours per week.

Elizabeth Wheaton said those are two staff members from the Botanical Garden and that's one of the reasons why we would be looking for them to be the managers. So we're not utilizing staff that doesn't have that background. She said she will ask Sana and Sandy to come up who can give more specifics on the maintenance of a program once it's established.

Sandy Shapiro, Executive Director of the Botanical Gardens, spoke. She said they have been very successful with their composting program and what we found recently is how wonderful the garden itself is responding to it. They are working to promote and then show people the results of stewardship. We have some regular composters right here. The idea was because we have the experience and Sana and Cassidy Fry are very passionate about composting and the intention and bringing it to the community so because they have the expertise on staff it would give them the opportunity to branch out as well to the northern end of the city. It is about education. This is really the seed to start what could be a broader program throughout the city at different locations to make it more convenient for people and its awareness and education, which actually has a great return on investment because we get to use it and see the results. It gives people an opportunity to become part of the community, they become rooted into what they're doing and they can teach other people and bring it home. There's also a revenue opportunity, they sold 36 gallons yesterday.

Commissioner Arriola asked how much it is sold for.

Sana said there are different grades, whether it is unsifted or chunky. For the unsifted it sells for \$1.33 a gallon. It is very good because it is organic good soil that grows produce.

Commissioner Alemán said she did put a post on social media about this North Beach compost potential and the North Beach community was really very excited about it. She was surprised by how much interaction she got on that post of people saying how good it will be that they won't have to ride their bike with their compost all the way to the Botanical Garden. She does believe that participation is going to be very healthy.

Sana said the mechanical composter doesn't really benefit much more than that particular restaurant. She said there can be one for the same price that will serve the entire community, so she doesn't see why not.

Commissioner Arriola asked if they have to add payroll to the Botanical Garden's staff in order to run this.

Sandy Shapiro said Sana is full time staff and she has added Cassidy to their payroll already and he feels that he can divide his time between what he's doing for the garden in fertility and compost and be able to split his time to manage both properties. We are already doing a program right now with WeWork, where he is going and picking up their waste and putting it into their compost. She said they are running out of space. About 100 people on a monthly basis are visiting the compost and they are running out of room.

Sandy Shapiro said they are doing a lot of education. Every Saturday morning he's available for conversation. The classes can also be scheduled for North Beach as well.

Commissioner Arriola said the reason North Beach Yard has a compost component to it is because there is a lot of food being served there and the scraps are there on site. There is also an organic garden that will

be growing food to be used in the yard, so therefore if they had soil that was coming out of the compost it all makes sense. As a standalone to have it up there feels great but economically the cost to maintain it and the yield from it in terms of what you might sell the soil for, this is an expense. This is not something that is synergistic like it was for the yard. As a standalone it is expensive, we are not going to make money on this.

Commissioner Alemán said this is not to make money; this is to provide an amenity to the residents, to the public of North Beach who want it. She said the Botanical Garden has a compost they don't really advertise to everyone to come compost, which, if they did, they wouldn't be able to service it out of the South Beach location plus you have residents from an entire city going to 18th Street, which is not probably what we want. So she sees it as an amenity for residents, many North Beach people want it. It is the right thing to do. It keeps material, which can provide an incredible addition of nutrients and health to our topsoil out of the landfill where it's just taking up space and not even degrading at a proper pace. She really hopes the Committee supports it. It is a minor amount we have the money, it is an amenity for our residents, people are excited about it.

Commissioner Góngora said he thought that the motion that the Committee made last time was to give it a positive opinion from the Committee, but to put it at the budget time when they were looking at enhancements, but he just read that the motion was to reach out to North Beach Yard and see if they were going to do it or not, or if that money was going to be used. He said he guesses North Beach Yard is not happening anytime soon.

Commissioner Arriola said he is still optimistic. He said he is going to have to push to move some things to make it happen, but they're interested and there are just a lot of moving parts there. The issue is if we do this it will benefit the North Beach Yard or whatever version of it will come back to us, so the reason this is even there was because it was part of an overall project. He worries about this being a standalone, but because he is optimistic that the North Beach Yard is going to happen, he is supportive of this. If the North Beach Yard was not going to happen, as a standalone it is hard for him to get excited about it, it is more of a feel good thing.

Commissioner Samuelian said he is supportive of this as well, they heard this at the SRC. He would like to move forward, he understands we have the upfront cost. He asked if we have ballparked of what we are talking about on an annual operating cost basis.

Elizabeth Wheaton said the cost will be minimal to the city. We would have to make sure that we have funding to maintain the fence if there is to be any damage to that of course the box and keep the signage up. From the city's end once we have those items installed that would be complete.

Commissioner Samuelian said he would like to move forward with this particularly if we are optimistic on the North Beach Yard, but even on a standalone it could have value. He thinks the one thing he would like is some periodic reporting on how it's being utilized, part of this is it's a community amenity. It is not about making money in any way, but we want to make sure we are getting utilization and if by chance we are getting great utilization, we'll celebrate and if not then we will take other action. He thinks that would be the one thing, is some sort of reporting on the utilization, but he will support this and he will move it.

Commissioner Arriola said he would like reporting periodically on usage. If it is not being used we can move it because you could deconstruct and move it.

Sandy Shapiro said it will take some marketing on both the City and the Botanical Garden.

Commissioner Arriola said he would ask that there be no increase in payroll to run this thing. This works in dense cities where it is easy to get the scraps, there are restaurants participating, composts are used in rural areas. As a standalone sitting on the West lots he worries this will not be effective, so, yes marketing is part of it, but also getting people to drive their food scraps to a composting facility. These are real

challenges and he worries about this being a standalone project. He doesn't know if it makes sense, but he is willing to give it a go.

Commissioner Góngora said it's good for the environment and willing to give it a try, he said to definitely keep tabs on it and report back because if it is not being used, we don't want to just have it for no reason. So he'll second the motion with a report back six months after the program initiation, so we know what's going on.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian motioned to approve funding this and asks for a report back in 6 months after the programs initiation to see how it is going. Commissioner Góngora seconded. All in favor.

NEW BUSINESS

7. DISCUSS HERITAGE TREE DESIGNATION, AWARENESS CAMPAIGN AND INCENTIVE PROGRAM

April 10, 2019 – C4 H

Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán and Co-Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Malakoff
Environment & Sustainability

ACTION

Elizabeth Wheaton, Environment and Sustainability Director, presented the item. She said this item was co-sponsored by Vice-Mayor Malakoff and Commissioner Alemán. The intent was to come up with some recommendations for implementation of a heritage tree designation, awareness campaign, and incentive program. In 2015 the city created the first tree ordinance which allowed us to regulate trees within city property before that it was the responsibility of Miami-Dade County. This allows us to charge fees for when trees do need to be removed and have that mitigation be invested back into the city. This ordinance does include language for heritage trees, giving special recognition to those trees or groupings of trees that are considered historic or have intrinsic value to the community. One thing looking at that language, we would recommend that when we update the tree ordinance that we change some of the language to be more specific for what type of trees can be designated as heritage. So for example, of a given species what is the size so that it's clear, it's not just a subjective determination. We are going to be bringing a first reading of proposed ordinance amendments in July, so we would include that language. After meeting with Commissioner Malakoff and Commissioner Alemán we came up with a number of items for discussion. First would be the potential of creating an annual maintenance allowance for private property owners, they would maintain their trees and do an annual maintenance that would keep those trees healthy. Second would be to create a program that highlights properties that have been designated that have a heritage tree designated on their property. We already have a GIS inventory, so we can add heritage trees on private property to that inventory because our inventory only includes public property. We also have our MB Rising Above mobile app and we can highlight heritage trees on the app. Third, right now there's a \$272 review fee and inspection fee if a private property wants to designate a tree as heritage. This fee potentially could be waived. A number of trees such as the banyan trees are a prohibited species by Miami-Dade County. In order to keep these trees on your property you are required to get a variance from the County. We could look at the city on covering those costs. Next would be to develop a specialized plaque that private properties could showcase at their front door or by their mailbox, similar to what some municipalities have done with historic preservation. Finally, having a special tree plaque here at City Hall, this would commemorate trees that have been designated as heritage trees. Right now we have the tree preservation trust fund where we collect the money from the tree permitting program. We have a fund balance of \$409,000. This money is used annually for a number of programs including pruning of young trees that have already been installed as part of the projects, in order to make sure that these trees get to an older age, it's very important that pruning early on occurs. We also use that money for education and outreach, our annual GIS inventory, programming and were also now considering needing to use that money for additional pruning of Pine Tree Drive if we do not get money in the operating budget for next year. It is imperative if we want to keep the pine trees that we do annual maintenance so they will remain strong.

Commissioner Malakoff said she hasn't seen the commemorative tree program advertised recently mentioned the commemorative tree program and hasn't seen it advertised particularly recently. She asked if there are still sales of trees going on or whether it can be promoted, perhaps in a video advertisement or some other way so that residents know that they can in fact purchase a tree in honor of somebody or to celebrate a special occasion and watch that tree growing in a public area near where they live.

Elizabeth Wheaton said they can definitely work with Communications to see about getting out additional material related to the commemorative tree program. We do get a number a year. We had one recently at graduation. We get a lot of graduations and anniversaries of people interested.

Commissioner Malakoff mentioned that it's listed here that some of the funds are going to that, but that doesn't make sense because the tree sales should carry itself that shouldn't be a cost, it should be a way of getting more income.

Omar Leon, Urban Forester, said that we noticed that due to the maintenance cost of some of the commemorative trees there's an additional funding aspect that we are trying to address. Trees need to grow in a healthy way with structural pruning at a young age, so the cost associated with the planting of the commemorative tree is only meeting the significant funding to plant those trees, but the actual maintenance costs associated with the structure pruning that's needed is not able to be funded through the commemorative tree fee. In addition, we are getting a couple of requests for commemorative trees per year. This year we've gotten three requests as of yet, but we've also look at ways of streamlining the application process through online.

Commissioner Malakoff said it needs to be made simple. If the \$500, \$1,500, \$3,000 isn't covering it we can look at increasing it, it should be in addition so we get more trees in the city.

Commissioner Samuelian said he likes this program and congratulates his colleagues what they are putting together. He sees that we have funding that's there. It looks like they're six opportunities to enhance. He asked if staff needs a recommendation and asked what action staff would like from the Committee today.

Elizabeth Wheaton said they are looking for direction on how the Committee would like to see an incentive program be structured. One thing she wants to know if the Committee would like to create a program where the city would be giving private properties money in order to maintain trees on private property because that was one of the items. A number of the items such as highlighting heritage trees, that is something that we can do already, but if the Committee wants them to look at waiving fees or providing additional funds to private property, they would need that direction.

Commissioner Samuelian said that he certainly would support the things that have no cost to the city like the highlighting and he looks to his colleagues about which of the economic ones they would recommend.

Commissioner Alemán said we can do this for the public trees, no problem and she is sure we will. Designating the private property specimen tree, a heritage tree is like designating historic home, so it does come with some limitations. The reason we do it is because we are more likely to protect that tree. This is something that she personally has been working on for three years because of the residents coming to her when new single-family homes are being developed and are seeing very old, very large specimen trees being removed. There's something about an old tree that even though we have very robust mitigation rules, and they have to plant a bunch little trees, it somehow is never good enough when you lose one of these very old spectacular trees, so we want to provide even more incentives. She thinks for private property owner to accept the limitations that come with the heritage designation that that tree really does have to be protected. So we need to inspire them to do that we need incentive them to do that. She is in favor of all of these, any particular heritage tree only needs to be pruned every three years, so it's not like every single tree could receive even the financial benefit every year. She is in favor of all 6 of the ones that are nonfinancial. Item one where we would create an annual maintenance allowance for private property owners is probably the one that has the most material, financial implications, if you wanted to start with

even a small cap that the Committee is comfortable with that the Committee feels is easy to absorb. She would be thrilled and we can always evaluate it every year.

Commissioner Samuelian asked what we have as a ballpark of all the economic ones annual cost into the cap, he asked what might be a reasonable cap to get us going?

Elizabeth Wheaton said a reasonable cap would be about \$30,000, we could see how many people respond, they estimate that there is anywhere from 100 to 200 heritage trees within the city. Of course, not everyone who has a heritage tree would want to designate. She said they know a number of people that would. And she thinks about getting about 20 to 25 people in the first year would be a goal and that would give us room also for those waiving of review fees and paying the County when variance is needed.

Commissioner Alemán pointed how the heartache in the community that was caused when the invasive Melaleucas that were ill were removed from Flamingo Park, a tremendous amount of community upset. Those are public trees so we can control what happens with any public tree, but that same heartache comes with the removal of a private tree. We don't have any authority to tell an owner whether they can or cannot remove a tree as long as they comply with the mitigation. However, these heritage tree designations are more significant and that is allowing us to provide much better protections.

Commissioner Malakoff said it takes so many years, 30-50 years to get a heritage tree to the size that it becomes a heritage tree. It's not something that you plant today and five years later it is a heritage tree, it takes many years and because of that there are so many single-family homes being sold, that the homes are raised and new homes are built, they are built higher up and are resilient, but part of it is there are these gorgeous trees that they then remove and in order to get the machinery in to build a new house and that's what's causing so much angst.

Commissioner Samuelian said he thinks this is a reasonable investment to protect our heritage. He likes the idea of having a first year cap, using the Administration's \$30,000.

Commissioner Arriola said a \$30,000 cap is fine.

Commissioner Samuelian moved to approve the \$30,000 cap. Commissioner Arriola seconded.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian moved to approve the \$30,000 cap to help with fees. Commissioner Arriola seconded. All in favor.

8. **DISCUSSION REGARDING A CELEBRITY BEACH SOCCER MATCH BENEFITING BEST BUDDIES ON NOVEMBER 23, 2019 REGARDING CITY PERMITTING AND FEES**

April 10, 2019 – C4 AI

Sponsored by Commissioner Góngora
Tourism and Culture

ACTION

Matt Kenny, Tourism and Culture Director, presented the item. He said the request from Best Buddies is a VCA grant of \$30,000 and they are seeking a \$50,000 sponsorship. North Bay Village is contributing \$10,000 as of now.

Commissioner Julianna Strout, North Bay Village, said they could be able to change their budget, but based upon the requirements of how the event happened last year and additional things they are requesting of the residents and what they wanted to have. She said they are also looking at this as a way to have an annual sporting event with inclusion. It is also free for the residents to get in with general admission. Because of some of the changes they needed to incur some more cost associated.

Matt Kenny said after looking through this it looks like there is a strong sponsorship contingent to this event. They are currently speaking to the VCA and he also spoke to the VCA and they are in the process of securing a potential \$30,000 grant for this event. The Administration is recommending waiving their permit fees and having them continue to go through the VCA process for the \$30,000 grant and not a \$50,000 sponsorship.

Commissioner Góngora asked when this is going through the VCA.

Matt Kenny said October is when they award final grants.

Commissioner Góngora said the event is great, he went last year, and he thinks Best Buddies is an amazing organization; he commended Commissioner Strout on her work in supporting them all these years. He said he will make the motion to do the waiver of permitting fees and go through VCA process with an expression from this Committee that we want them to support the event. He said if something goes wrong with the VCA to call him.

Commissioner Samuelian said he is also supportive and it is a wonderful event. He said the key word of the event is being free for residents; he said to make sure we really get the message out from a communications standpoint that we are putting money forward in a good way, but our residents should really have the opportunity. He said hopefully it has a big community turnout and he seconded the motion.

MOTION: Commissioner Góngora moved to approve the permitting fee waiver for the event. Commissioner Samuelian seconded. All in favor.

9. **DISCUSS A PROPOSAL TO ESTABLISH A MONUMENT OR COMMEMORATIVE PLAQUE AT THE RAINBOW CROSSWALK LOCATED AT 12TH STREET AND OCEAN DRIVE**

May 8, 2019 – C4 H

Sponsored by Commissioner Góngora
Parks and Recreation

ACTION

Commissioner Góngora said this has been heard at the Neighborhood/Community Affairs Committee a couple of times. The concept started the day that we did the ribbon cutting of the rainbow crosswalk on Ocean Drive and 12th Street. In a discussion with former Assistant City Manager Kathie Brooks, they discussed some way of acknowledging and formerly recognizing why 12th Street became the center of gay beach. It got referred to the LGBTQ Advisory Committee and it went back to the NCAC, the NCAC had discussions on what would be appropriate for recognizing this. There are two options that came back to the Committee in the agenda. Option one which is less expensive, is a little less than \$3,000 and would be to put a commemorative plaque on the wall that exists, that wall is approximately 3 feet high. So if you were putting a plaque, it would be approximately 6 inches to 24 inches off the ground. You would have to be literally on your knees or laying on the sidewalk to read the plaque, so he's not a big fan of that idea. Option two is more expensive unfortunately, but it would be to put a freestanding pedestal with some kind of commemorative plaque that would be about \$15,000. In his opinion, if we're going to do what we do it right or not at all. He doesn't really want to do the \$3,000 plaque he thinks it makes no sense. He personally would like to do this, he loves the rainbow crosswalk, but it's for whatever reason it doesn't pop. It's a little bit muted colors. It's more artsy than the traditional rainbow pop that you see in other communities that do a rainbow display or rainbow crosswalk. He thinks doing something that explains it would be nice. He would support the pedestal, but if we're not going to do the pedestal he doesn't want to do the plaque as a fallback and rather just not do it. He would like to hear what thoughts of the Committee are on this item.

Commissioner Arriola said he would rather to do it right. He is comfortable with the pedestal.

Commissioner Samuelian said he will move to fund the second option which is the pedestal. Commissioner Góngora seconded it.

Commissioner Alemán said that she thinks the Committee is on the right track and agrees with what they are saying, she doesn't vote here, but she'll vote when it comes up. She said in option 2, the idea of the mosaic pedestal is that the mosaic would match the pattern in the crosswalk so intuitively you look at the pedestal and realize it resonates with the crosswalk. The use of the word pastel, the color selection should match the crosswalk.

Commissioner Góngora agreed. He said to please incorporate that.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian motioned to fund option 2 for \$15,000, which is the pedestal and the colors should match the crosswalk. Commissioner Góngora seconded. All in favor.

10. **DISCUSSION REGARDING CAPITAL APPROPRIATIONS FOR THE PROPERTY MANAGEMENT EMERGENCY GENERATOR**

June 5, 2019 – C4 A
Property Management

ACTION

Adrian Morales, Property Management Director, presented the item. He said they have a project that has been funded and the process before we go to a capital budget amendment would be moving funds from savings from previous projects. This is to get the facility in Sunset Harbour a permanent generator, which we don't have right now to be able to serve the community or City staff in the event of a storm. The project has been designed, the generator has been ordered, there was some additional mechanical, structural scope that needed to be added and this does include a contingency line item that they don't expect to use. The cost of the generator is \$241,000 and an additional \$95,000. With proper maintenance because it is an enclosure, the useful life is about 15 years.

John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer, said at some point we were asked that when we do capital budget amendments, that it would be good if we go through most of the projects that aren't time sensitive in the FCWPC meeting. He said this is becoming a little time consuming. He proposed that if there is a project that Property Management is asking for that is renewal and replacement where we are just moving savings from a completed project into another project that it could go straight to a capital budget amendment where it can still be reviewed by the City Commission. They seem like routine items and we seem to be tying up valuable time here.

Commissioner Arriola supports that, because it just makes sense. The last thing he wants the Administration to be doing is administrative stuff that takes up time, at the end of the day it is an obvious recommendation.

Commissioner Malakoff supports that.

Commissioner Samuelian is fine with it too.

John Woodruff said if there are any sensitive items we would run them through the Committee.

Commissioner Arriola said he wants to encourage staff to make these kinds of recommendations to the Commission.

DIRECTION: Proceed with the item as described.

11. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE INITIAL FUNDING FOR UNDERGROUNDING OF UTILITIES IN THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH

June 5, 2019 – C4 C

Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán
Public Works

ACTION

Roy Coley, Public Works Director, presented the item. He said the item before the Committee is one component of the undergrounding process that requires us to have an exact quote from FPL before we can go to a binding referendum in any community. What this item does is set up a way for the city to initially pay for that binding quote from FPL, they will give us a ballpark estimate for our preliminary discussions with the community, but they will not give us a binding cost estimate without some engineering fees. What this simply does is allows the city to pay for that upon City Commission approval and our CFO has recommended that it come from contingency funding on a case-by-case basis.

Commissioner Arriola asked how much it is.

Roy Coley said it's anywhere from \$10-\$15,000 per neighborhood, depending on the overall size and scope of work.

Commissioner Alemán said she sponsored this and said she has been following closely in trying to grease skids, for the North Bay Road neighbors who as we all know really would like to underground their utilities as part of the neighborhood infrastructure projects. She said we helped them with their petition and this is really the next step, so the idea is to really assist the residents with this step, which is a little bit tricky. This is inconsistent from neighborhood to neighborhood how robust the homeowners association is, how much membership is really active, the Association is responsible for this payment, which is a critical path step. They have to go secure this \$11,000 from their neighbors. To her this is just very resident friendly thing to do to set up this grant fund, we'll pay for it, and if it proceeds we will get paid back. To the extent that these projects do go forward, it is self-funding; we are just advancing the number to the neighborhood. She hopes the Committee will support it. She mentioned one change in the memo that she talked to Mr. Woodruff about yesterday is really just about creating a little bit more bureaucracy than she thinks is necessary, of course she defers to the Committee in their recommendation. She referenced page 39 where it says the Administration's recommendation is to avoid a separate line item, and instead have the proposed funding source be general fund contingencies with each expense approved by the City Commission. She would say up to a certain number per year, the City Manager can provide that approval and only over the threshold should it need to come back to the Commission.

Commissioner Góngora asked what amount Commissioner Alemán was thinking.

Commissioner Alemán said for the total fund she was saying \$100,000 but it was arbitrary, that would be 9 neighborhoods. She doesn't think we would ever get there within one year really; it would be very unlikely that it would be more than two. So if the Committee wanted to low the number she doesn't think it really changes it.

Commissioner Samuelian said he is really supportive of this, undergrounding is good for the community. He thinks it fits under the umbrella of resiliency, he wished we could be doing more, its good in terms of the aesthetic so and in a word, he thinks this is excellent. It is small sort of seed funding so he would support that and would support increasing the threshold and limiting the bureaucracy as well.

Commissioner Góngora seconded.

Mayra Diaz-Buttacavoli, resident spoke. She said she is a homeowner on Alton Road and she introduced David Sullivan as well. She said they have been trying to do undergrounding prior to 2000 and they have

meeting notes with FDOT where they have been trying to do this before street raising was even an issue, but that being the case, they are scheduled, supposedly, as of today to have FDOT redo the street in 2023. FDOT would be opening the street and closing it, which reduces the cost of undergrounding for Alton Road, which is the main arterial main evacuation route and only road in the city of Miami Beach with a hospital. They've met with FPL and are now waiting for city staff to have a further meeting with FPL. The gentleman that handles undergrounding for FPL is stationed in Juno Beach and he's going to come down and meet with them, so they are waiting on that meeting, but the thing they need to meet about is where we put these transformers because they can't go on the swale or median because of hazardous conditions in case of an accident. They do have a proposal for FPL and would like to move forward because it obviously would be the time to do it when the street is redone. They have some other issues that they met with FDOT on and any support that the City can give them would be very helpful. We do have a preliminary estimate from FPL, which is quite lower than what its cost and other neighborhoods simply because FDOT is going to take care of some of the costs as part of their project.

Commissioner Alemán said maybe Ms. Diaz- Buttacavoli can confirm or comment on this aspect as well, one of the benefits of undergrounding on Alton road is that all down Alton Road, we have these 80-90 year old fully mature mahogany trees, they're not really allowed to develop into a full shaped canopy. What we understand, she thinks, is that if the Alton Road overhead utilities are not undergrounded and that is a state road and the city does not own those swales or have responsibility of those swales that FDOT will not replant mahogany's. They intend to plant back smaller ornamental type trees that would not grow to a mature height that would interfere with the overhead utilities and she thinks from an emotional, cultural, human standpoint that's going to be very upsetting to our community, to take out this mature, beautiful, old humongous mahogany's and replace them with smaller ornamental trees. She doesn't think the community is going to swallow that very well. Because the project is not until 2023 and we are very organized and deliberate about this and we do underground the utilities, it is not just the benefit which Ms. Diaz- Buttacavoli accurately stated about evacuation routes and so forth, and the aesthetics is also the shade canopy, but being able to reestablish Alton Road after the project the way it has always been with large mahogany shade trees and she thinks we can save a lot of future heartache if we do the right thing now.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian moved to supports the \$100,000 for the fund and increasing the threshold to limit the bureaucracy. Commissioner Góngora seconded. All in favor.

DIRECTION: Change each expense being approved by the City Commission to being approved by the City Manager.

12. **DISCUSS THE RENEWAL OF THE AGREEMENT WITH THE FRANCHISE WASTE CONTRACTOR**

June 5, 2019 – C4 D
Public Works

ACTION

Commissioner Góngora said one of the contractors contacted him to meet and they are out of the state and they requested to defer this item to give them time to meet with the Commissioners.

Jay Fink, Public Works Assistant Director, said he had not heard that, he know one of the companies could not be here, but the other company is here. We have had some preliminary discussions with these companies; they are interested in renewing the franchise agreement. He said he thinks they probably want to be here if there was any objection to the renewal or if we get into a real heated discussion with regard to the terms set for the services. He said he will defer to the Committee, but if the general direction here is that we're going to go ahead and renew it he is sure they will be happy to continue in the direction because this contract will expire come the end of September.

Commissioner Góngora said he thinks with this item, we are looking to get more public benefit aspect from them and this other company has some ideas that they want to bring to meet with them separately to present to them before discussing it at a public meeting.

Jay Fink said there are two components, there is franchise agreement which we look to renew and then there's a services agreement which would spell out the different provisions, benefits, and things like that. We don't want to get too far down the road if it is this committee's recommendation to go to renew those contracts, he would love to hear that so we can really have both vendors appear with whatever public benefits that they may want proffer.

Commissioner Arriola said before he were to make a recommendation on something like this he wants to hear about it with a presentation, he is not going to say that he's inclined to renew or not until it's been presented.

Commissioner Góngora gave a brief history. He said we have two companies we had as many as five. What happens ever since before he served on the Commission until now, the big ones upped the little ones until we go down in the amount of companies that we have to provide the services and there's good things and bad things about having less and more. If we are going to have less he thinks they need to present more public benefits in exchange for having less competition and they get that and they know that, they want to present some ideas to us that he thinks will make their contract better for Miami Beach, which is why he thinks deferring it to hear what their ideas are is a good thing.

Jay Fink said okay, worst case scenario, we extend the existing contract until the new one gets signed.

DIRECTION: Defer to the July 31, 2019 FCWPC meeting to allow the other companies to present.

13. DISCUSS THE MAY 21, 2019 YOUTH COMMISSION MOTION OF PARTICIPATING IN THE LEGISLATIVE ACTION DAYS YOUTH COUNCIL

June 5, 2019 – C4 G

Sponsored by Commissioner Góngora

Organizational Development Performance Initiatives

ACTION

Dr. Leslie Rosenfeld, Chief Learning Officer, presented the item. She said the Youth Commission, which is going into its third year of existence, has requested support to participate in the legislative action days that take place usually in Tallahassee in January-March timeframe. It is a two day event. We have 7 youth commissioners, each appointed by the Commission. Each year there is some turn over because many of the youth commissioners graduate and go to college. Some of the issues that they have tackled and received support from the Commission include the youth job fair that is doing very well.

MOTION: Commissioner Samuelian moved to approve the \$5,000 for the trip. All in favor.

14. DISCUSSION REGARDING A BIOSWALE PILOT PROJECT FOR 59TH STREET WEST OF ALTON ROAD

June 5, 2019 – C4 J

Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán

Public Works

ACTION

Roy Coley, Public Works Director, presented the item. He explained this item is the duplicate companion item that we carried to the Sustainability and Resiliency Committee as a recommendation for a bioswale project at 59th Street and Alton Road, which also includes a public right-of-way that goes from North Bay

Road to the water's edge. The item first came about after the La Gorce project was delayed and he introduced the gentlemen at the podium with him and said they are property owners at 59th Street and Alton Road who came to the Commission with concerns about regular flooding there. What we've done is met with them and we've looked at installing bioswales adjacent to their property and their neighbors and have identified what the benefits are and the limitations of this bioswale. Due to the elevation of the property the bioswales would be capable of managing an inch and a half of rainfall for them, that would do a tremendous amount of pollution control, but it hydraulically is limited, it will eliminate nuisance flooding and the puddling from little rain that comes by. When we do have very serious extreme rain events, this bioswale will not prevent flooding. It will long-term help with pollution control and that's its number one benefit from his viewpoint. The second benefit is it's a pilot, there are three different types of design within this project and that would allow the city to study those long-term to determine which one of those is most efficient and desirable for future projects throughout the city. We have the project designed by one of our consultant engineers and they have estimated this to be a cost of \$850,000. He explained the picture shows all greenway, but after we received this from our consultants, our staff Green Space Manager Rodney Knowles identified a list of trees that would flourish in this area based on the soil conditions and location to water. We've also shared those species with the homeowners here and he will let them speak and they could actually choose some of the pallets of what plants go there. What we're here for today from the Committee is to seek authorization on the authorizing financing of \$850,000 for the project.

The resident said he would like to bring up the point that they have been to multiple meetings here and we've all heard the frustrations of residents in the Lake Shore and Lake View neighborhoods and they don't want their street raised. He said maybe this is a viable alternative for them and other neighborhoods that don't want their street raised, so this is a test case so they can visit our neighborhood and see if it's working. This is a much cheaper alternative for the other neighborhoods going forward. They know this is not a permanent fix but if it helps, it helps and maybe it would help them as well too. He said we have all these people that are saying to fix or alleviate the flooding, he said let's give it a try. It is not going to get better, it is going to get worse if nothing is done.

Commissioner Arriola said the resident was probably part of a lot of those meetings we had a year and half ago before we did the pause and a lot of the neighbors were protesting and saying their houses don't flood. That is not factual.

The resident said 59th Street floods.

Commissioner Arriola said because of the pause we still have homeowners like this resident here who are desperate and we now have to spend money to test things whereas we have a remedy that we know does work. There are some side effects that we're dealing with, but it does work. We are going to be spending \$850,000 on a street end, it will help, but it is not the long term solution. That is the cost of the pause in his opinion.

Discussion was held regarding residents not wanting their streets raised.

Commissioner Góngora said that from what he read online bioswales are used more often for contaminants to remove them from the water and he thinks what the residents really need help with is the flooding. He said they are going to support this because they want to help the residents, but he agrees that it is very expensive and it's a Band-Aid it's not the solution that we need. On the residents level they are going to support this to help the neighborhood, kind of on the bigger level, they have talked a lot about the pause on the dais and that vote was over a year ago. He asked if we know what is going on. He said it has been a year and a half. He said maybe not today but he thinks this body needs to send a message to the Administration that they want to know what's going on. A year a half to redo the RFP is way too long, so he agrees that if there was a pause a year and a half ago, whether it was agreed upon by everybody on the

body or not, he thinks they are unified that the pause is over and they need to know what's going on and make sure that the process is moving forward.

Commissioner Samuelian said he likes this concept and he knows we want to get into the benefits, it was recommended by ULI, the green and blue infrastructure. He thinks they should have a little more discussion around the alternatives and the cost, it is a big number, but we want to help. He said he did want to comment on a couple things. First, this concept of that all the residents that don't want their roads raised is because of their life cycle or time, he doesn't think that's accurate. He thinks there are residents that have legitimate concerns about the impact on private property. They have seen some of the projects and they want to feel more comfortable. They think there are other approaches. He is sure there are some people that would rather just sort of see it go away, but he doesn't want to dismiss that there's a segment of people that have very legitimate concerns. And if he's hearing the testimony from the residents present today right, that most their neighbors don't want the streets raised.

The resident said he was speaking from 59th Street to 63rd Street.

Commissioner Samuelian said he is not sure about the term pause that everyone is using, but we have almost an \$80 million project on West Avenue. We have work going on Indian Creek, we're about to get going down on 1st Street. We are active on Palm and Hibiscus and he sees activity in Venetian Way. So can we do more? We are working towards that. But the idea that there's nothing happening in the city and that we're not doing anything does not seem to be fully accurate.

Commissioner Arriola said that when the residents are saying their neighbors don't want their roads raised, they generally don't want any construction on the street either.

Commissioner Samuelian spoke about campaigns and said he absolutely ran on the platform that sea level rise is a scientific fact, that he supports our efforts to address it, and that we need to get it right and for him getting it right includes outside perspectives. He's delighted to have sponsored the Urban Land Institute. He thinks their recommendations on blue and green infrastructure is exactly in the line with what we are trying to do. He is delighted that we have Jacobs Engineering. He is very pleased that our residents are getting a voice and pleased that we are implementing projects, the five or six that are list, while we try and improve. He wouldn't use the term pause to describe what has been done, he would call it incremental adaptation and we're making it better as we go.

Commissioner Alemán said the more we talk about this the better because it is our most important challenge. To posture the item that is here today, the bioswale pilot, the reason that she sponsored it is because it is looking to get it right. This is new, we haven't embraced bioswales to date in Miami Beach. It is absolutely one of the recommendations of ULI, they said we like the grey infrastructure that you're doing, but from a human impact standpoint if you adopt also complementary green and blue infrastructure then it will be more palatable for the community. Because first of all, it's more beautiful with talking about landscaping and tree for the green and water for the blue, but also because our community is very concerned exactly what Commissioner Góngora mentioned, which are the contaminants. The community is very concerned about the quality of the storm water that is discharged into the Bay and as our Public Works folks will tell us that the first inch and a half which this system would collect is the most polluted because the first rains pick up all the oils and fertilizers and all the nasty things that have collected during the dry times onto the surface, whether it's the surface of the road or the surface of our yards and lifts that up. There are so many benefits to this in terms of getting it right. We will be able to study and measure and report on the efficacy of these three different typologies of bioswale in terms of picking up these contaminants and not putting them directly into the Bay, which she thinks we all want to do that. Second, in addition to some of the technical performance our residents will be able to go and look at this and she could see us putting up a little plaque or marker and talking about this and the residents can drive over and look at it. Part of the problem of the projects has been once we get in there on the initial project and broken ground and put things back together people's expectations have been missed and that causes upset in this case. We can set the expectations right, right from the start by giving something for them to go look at. She

thinks it will help a lot in terms of residents buying into the blue and green infrastructure. And it will help us once Jacobs by the end of the year finishes their work on the new timeline and on the different design criteria that we asked them to study, we'll also have hopefully some results from this. The next step will be putting together design criteria packages for specific projects and if a project calls for a bioswale wouldn't it be nice if we had a measurable from a Public Works standpoint and from a community standpoint which ones of these we like and work better. She thinks it's a good thing to do. She was disappointed that the number was so high and really wanted to be less. She thinks we ought to be able to find the funding for this and she hopes we do.

Commissioner Samuelian said he supports this, it is new, it is different. His questions really are a little practical around the number, it's a big number. He asked if there are opportunities to achieve what we want to do for this neighborhood in a different way, a little more cost-efficient, is there way to slice it, and then second to Commissioner Góngora's point we know we are going to do work in this neighborhood it needs some level of work. He is a little concerned that we're going to spend money and then rework. He asked Roy Coley to talk about the cost, value engineering opportunities, and rework.

Roy Coley said there are always opportunities for value engineering, what is before the Committee is multiple designs of different technologies and if you wanted to go with the lowest-cost version we could go back to the designer and say of all these different types some that include concrete some that include mechanical soils and if we want the cheapest option we could ask them to provide us the cheapest option and we wouldn't have to do them all. That would be the easiest path to a lower cost then we would have one particular design that would be installed, we wouldn't have the multiples. The area between North Bay Road and the water, which the city has a 25 foot right-of-way there and an additional 25 foot easement that in the right-of-way we intended to install one of these sections. That section would most likely remain untouched into the future, so future projects would not go through there and replace it. This area here might be impacted in some percentage of this bioswale would be redesigned and rebuilt along the way. He would like to frame it that it is several years away. To summarize where he thinks we are to Commissioner Góngora's question, when the La Gorce project was canceled. That solicitation was canceled, both designs were canceled, and then the subsequent meeting that we had when the Lakeview folks showed up and they wanted to be next and then after that Orchard Park folks showed up and they wanted to be next. That was when the Commission authorized the Administration to get on this path that we ultimately ended with Jacobs to come back and advise us who should be next at what size and under what design criteria, so he anticipates by the end of this year having that information before the Commission and then if approved and whichever neighborhood is at the top of that list then they would go into design for work that wouldn't take place for a couple years, so if this neighborhood isn't at the very top of the list we are years out from doing work there.

Commissioner Arriola said he wanted to correct the record because to say that we are doing things, we're not. There's no construction going on right now as part of our resiliency program other than some minor things. We were ready beginning of 2018, we awarded contracts to go to upper North Bay Road, and we canceled all of that to do the Jacobs study. We will at the end of this year conclude those studies, discussions, recommendations, and then begin the queuing process and then begin bidding process. So at the end of this year will have had the second anniversary of the pause. By the time we get back into the rhythm of identify neighborhoods, going through the bidding process, selecting the winning bids is a couple years down the road. This pause will be four or five years in the making and we were ready last year to go.

Commissioner Góngora said that he wants to get the best bioswale for less money. This is a big price ticket item, but we want to make sure we do the best for the neighborhood. He thinks we need to leave the talk of the pause in the past. This item was left behind because of some flaws in the RFP, not because this body doesn't want to move forward with the project and we are moving forward with the project and he thinks it's important that perhaps in the July Commission meeting, they get a report as to where we're at, so that we don't continue to talk about pauses or non-pauses and well on the same page of moving this forward together. For today's purposes, he'll move this item forward and ask that Administration work to perhaps

bring the cost down without lessening the quality of the project because it is a big price, but that we do move forward and do this because he knows this is a critical point and the neighborhood needs this.

Commissioner Samuelian seconded it.

Commissioner Malakoff said that this is her neighborhood and she was not happy with the pause, she sees flooding on upper North Bay Road every time there is heavy rain or every time there's a high tide. The bioswale which she thinks is wonderful to do and she thinks we should do just what Roy Coley is proposing which is trying out the different types. However, the neighborhood was promised a 25 foot pedestrian pathway so that people who live in the neighborhood can finally enjoy walking there and looking at the Bay and the sunset. Right now there are so many houses chockablock with walls and fences and landscape that there's no way on all the street ends to get to actually see the Bay. Unless you have one of the homes on the Bay, there is no vision for the rest of the neighborhood to enjoy it and that was promised as part of this city and private owner agreement. She hopes when the bioswale is done that those who live in the neighborhood will be able to walk.

Commissioner Arriola asked if we have the money for this.

John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer said that we would have to use stormwater bond funds and it is doable.

Commissioner Arriola said so this would be a Band-Aid for a period of time, but since it is going to be very difficult to get any construction done in the upper North Bay Road for many years, he asked how long this project would last for.

Roy Coley said a portion of it could last into perpetuity, there will be parts that the project would not touch, so some of it would go into perpetuity and some of it might be touched when the upper North Bay Road project is finally designed.

Commissioner Samuelian said he has seconded the motion and he is supportive of exactly the way the Commissioner Góngora said it. He wouldn't be as negative about it, this is the first time we've had a bioswale like this. This came from the ULI recommendations, this is totally consistent with our blue and green so he thinks there's a lot of positive in trying this and see what happens. He would love to do it at a lower price. He said we want to do this, and he actually thinks this is our first action in terms of implementing what ULI told us about blue and green infrastructure which represents a positive step towards water quality which is right on the top of our community agenda. He is pleased we are moving forward.

Mayra Diaz-Buttacavoli, resident spoke. She said in order to do what FDOT has in plans today as based on our meeting we had two weeks ago is that they would be raising Alton Road about a foot. In doing so, they would be putting inlets on the swale to capture water that may flow from the street into the swale so that it doesn't go onto private property, and those inlets would take up the water and take it down into the storm sewer. What she stated before, as far as their meeting with FPL is that obviously we cannot keep the wires that exist on Alton Road and in a lot of other neighborhoods, so this is something we need to speak about with FPL as to where we can place these transformers and the Street ends are the only thing in the connection at the streets between Alton and North Bay are the only locations that we have. She is asking that the city look at this globally and not just into one connecting street between Alton and North Bay because it affects Alton Road and it could potentially affect anything else that you may do on North Bay Road. On Alton Road it seems to her that there needs to be coordination of thought and of gameplay in order for anything to be successful for either the connecting roads or Alton Road. They need to know where to put the transformers, since they cannot be put on the medians or in front of people's homes.

Commissioner Arriola said these are all valid points, that's why doing things piecemeal is not smart.

Commissioner Góngora asked if the Administration is looking into the concerns that Ms. Diaz-Buttacavoli is raising.

The resident said to clarify the point of Ms. Diaz-Buttacavoli is what is unique about 59th Street is that we have 4 property owners that are willing to try this and we have 4 properties that their swales are empty. It is a perfect opportunity to do this type of installation and then North Bay in the Bay that will be empty once they clear the situation there.

Roy Coley said our designers were made aware of the of the FDOT project and coordinated with the FDOT to be sure that the design you see before you is not a conflict with their plans.
Commissioner Samuelian asked if that includes the potential of undergrounding.

Roy Coley said the location for undergrounding transformers has not been contemplated because there is no plan that identifies where those would go at this point.

Ms. Diaz-Buttacavoli said they had a meeting with FDOT two weeks ago; none of this was brought up by the city nor by FDOT. All they are asking is for there to be coordination. She said she appreciates that there are 4 homes that are in agreement with it, but did anybody talk to the four homes on the corner of Alton Road?

Commissioner Góngora said he agrees with Ms. Diaz-Buttacavoli because whenever we're doing projects at the same time that other governmental entities are doing projects, we always should. Part of his motion will be that coordination happens with the Alton Road project to all be on the same page.

MOTION: Commissioner Góngora motioned to move this forward and asked that the Administration work to perhaps bring the cost down without lessening the quality of the project because it is a big price and also coordinate with the other projects happening on Alton Road. Commissioner Samuelian seconded.

15. DISCUSSION TO REVIEW THE MAYOR'S PANEL ON OCEAN DRIVE, SAFETY, SECURITY, AND INFRASTRUCTURE SUBCOMMITTEE'S MOTION FOR A SECRET SHOPPER PROGRAM AS AN INVESTIGATIVE TOOL

June 5, 2019 – C4 Y

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Office of the City Manager

ACTION

Amy Mehu, Special Assistant to the City Manager, presented the item. She said at the May 1st subcommittee meeting of Safety, Security, and Infrastructure the group discussed evaluating and taking action on deceptive practices along Ocean Drive sidewalk cafés and they realized that this is a grander issue citywide, not just on Ocean Drive and so they tried to determine the best way to evaluate and take enforcement actions on such establishments. The tool that was recognized as being the most sustainable was using the secret shopper program and emulating that how we use it for the trolleys, the parking garages, and parking lots that Leslie Rosenfeld has worked out. They've identified that using the secret shopper would be the best tool to use and that we can also use it not only for the negative things, but also for the positive and highlight establishments that are doing the things that we see as being beneficial to the City brand. While it does come with the cost of establishing the secret shopper program and the cost to their service there is the grander value of dealing with these deceptive issues that hurt our City' brand.

Commissioner Malakoff asked how we hire secret shoppers and how are they interviewed so that they know what to do and how to be camouflaged.

Dr. Leslie Rosenfeld, Chief Learning Officer, said we currently have excellent successors already employed, six of them. These assessors work in an undercover capacity in some ways, and they are

already out and about assessing the customer service, the levels that we receive from our trolley drivers, from our valet operators, from our garage attendant, and from our garage security. So we already have that in place and we have been doing it for several years.

Commissioner Malakoff said she is not sure how successful they are as far as the garages are concerned because they go so infrequently that she doesn't think they are getting a true picture of the real service of the attendants in the garage.

Dr. Leslie Rosenfeld said that we actually visit each of our garages at least 45 times per quarter. We interact with garage attendants each time we enter those garages. So the data that we have is very useful and we been using it to continually improve that service. It is a little bit more challenging with the security monitors because they're not in one specific location and sometimes we enter those garages, the intent is to touch them 45 times each quarter as well.

Commissioner Arriola asked what the secret shoppers are looking for.

Dr. Leslie Rosenfeld said we assess three things each time we enter garage, we are assessing the cleanliness and the appearance of the garage and then we are interacting with the garage attendant and rating the level of customer service they're providing. We have 10 specific criteria we are looking at. The rating is done via the communication system and it's the greeting that's received if the question is being answered, if they are able to provide the information that's being specifically requested, if the assessor is asking for a location can they provide that location and so on.

Commissioner Arriola asked if we outsource that or if we do it ourselves.

Dr. Leslie Rosenfeld said that we are doing that internally, we have six part-time employees that work approximately 29 hours a week that do that as well as doing cleanliness assessments of the public rights-of-way, assessing our trolleys, our restrooms. Actually, we do send out a report on a quarterly basis to the Commission on each of these performance initiatives, so each of you will be receiving the quarter three reports for the garages in July.

Commissioner Arriola asked if we are contemplating keeping this in house for the secret shoppers for Ocean Drive.

Amy Mehu said yes, it is the best mechanism for enforcement purposes and the idea is that as they're out there and there are actionable items, they would be reported to the respective enforcement agencies, be it Code Compliance or the Police Department. We would give them a set of criteria that we are trying to identify. She said she would work with Leslie and the panel to identify the different sets of criteria that we know are the deceptive issues and that also based off of our sidewalk café code, we would look at that and make sure that they meeting those things as well.

Commissioner Samuelian said the goal is to improve the experience for all our customers here in Miami Beach, whether they be tourists or residents. We have some great operators in Miami Beach, we just have some bad apples still doing things that are unacceptable and they're doing it on public property. That's a real problem. He thinks what we're using is a tried-and-true mechanism. The city has had experience with it actually good operators use secret shoppers to monitor their own behavior and he thinks the message we have here from our committee is enough is enough. What we want to do is highlight the good folk. He thinks it's a step on the journey, we've done other things, and there's more to come.

Amy Mehu said the \$25,000 is for a pilot in the MXE that's also including that portion of Washington Avenue that's misconstrued to be part of the MXE, but it's separate from it and that's where we have the highest density of issues and sidewalk cafes also. We would like to focus of there, it's not going to be statistically valid where it's not citywide and right now we are not requesting it for the whole years' worth of

costs, but at least enough to get a good taste and shed some light on a lot of the issues and it can also help improve how we strategize with our Code.

Commissioner Arriola said he loves this and congratulated Commissioner Samuelian on it. He thinks it is a huge potential benefit, he thinks we need to figure out what it is we want to measure. We are trying to stop bad behavior. The essential element is the criteria that are going to be measured.

Ceci Velasco, Executive Director of Ocean Drive Association, said that they can take a look at that, they haven't really looked at the specifics of that, but certainly Ocean Drive advocated for it. It's something that the Ocean Drive Association wanted to do themselves, but didn't have the resources or the manpower to do it. They are saying it should not only be Ocean Drive and maybe extend to Espanola Way and also to Lincoln Road, because those are the tourist areas and they are finding that we have complaints from all of those three areas, not just Ocean Drive. Collins Avenue and Washington Avenue have few sidewalk cafes, so her suggestion is to include Ocean Drive, Espanola Way, and Lincoln Road.

Commissioner Samuelian asked what the Administration thinks about the geography that was mentioned.

Amy Mehu said if we are growing it to include all of those areas it is going to be an increase in the amount of sidewalk cafes establishments which would increase the \$25,000 cost.

Commissioner Samuelian said he likes the recommendation. He suggested piloting the pilot a little and rework the numbers. Let's start small, will set aside the money so we can do the whole area that staff thinks is right, but maybe still start in the smaller area just to work out the kinks that would be his only thought, but we'll have the funding to do the entire area.

Commissioner Arriola said we have the same issue on Lincoln Road and Espanola Way, but let's move forward with the MXE on this. Perfect it and we'll have the report card, that is going to be the exact same report card for Espanola Way and Lincoln Road so he suggested bringing it back to the next FCWPC meeting to look what that additional will look like. He said let's approve this for the MXE; staff come back with what it would cost to include Espanola Way and Lincoln Road.

Amy Mehu asked if the Committee also would like her to bring back the report card to the Ocean Drive Committee.

Commissioner Samuelian said he could be a sounding Board, but she can also bring it to the Ocean Drive Committee. He said we welcome the input from the good business operators there. He thinks this could really have a positive effect.

Commissioner Arriola asked what the purpose of the secret shopper report card will be. He asked if we will then use that to inform the City Manager on whether he should renew or revoke sidewalk permits, is it going to go into a report card that the ODA puts out for compliance purposes, what are we going to use the data for.

Amy Mehu said first if it's actionable, intel that we are receiving from the secret shoppers and Code Compliance goes out and does cite that for sidewalk café violations, those violations do stack up against their future sidewalk café application. Some can be revoked or the future application can be denied by the City Manager. We will be able to have more streamlined information to do that now versus what we're doing currently and also it would give the general landscape that lets the City Manager have the full view of it, so if it's not enough for the violation. He could still review it.

Commissioner Arriola said to loop in legal because whatever we are going to do, he wants it to have teeth and actually work and to be fair to the operators. If we have secret shoppers and there is going to be repercussion if we find you to be in violation of certain behaviors we're expecting, what is the criteria that will inform the City Manager, is it three strikes and you're out or two strikes? Make sure legal we've defined

it so that they can't protest an appeal so let's work with Legal, the ODA, and Communications and then get this report card.

Commissioner Samuelian said he agrees, to encourage Administration to work closely with the City Attorney's office. He would say two things, one what the secret shoppers are able to do is identify where there's a problem and what the problem is and we will be able to take action. He wanted to confirm that the City Manager has broad discretion when there are violations of our sidewalk café permits. There is some stringent actions that he can take, including revoking sidewalk café permits. He thinks we have a lot of tools and what this tool will do is allow us to pinpoint the problem and then we are expecting action.

Commissioner Arriola wanted to make sure that these things are not easy to appeal. Meaning a report lands on the City Manager's desk, secret shoppers have surveyed a particular restaurant found 5 violations, we want to make sure the report card checks all the boxes so that if they protest it is very clear and fair.

Ms. Velasco said they would also say the methodology is important too, comprehensive, not random sample because then you can have somebody come in and appeal it saying nobody else on the street was picked or there were only 5 people that were reviewed.

Commissioner Samuelian said we would welcome the business community input into that process. So he would encourage the Administration to meet with Ceci and other good operators.

Ms. Velasco said Leslie does a great job with all the city services. They have the hospitality end of it and have secret shoppers that come in all the time and it has really helped their businesses. On the hospitality end they are happy to help.

Commissioner Arriola asked if we should be doing this in house or if we are better off going with a third party to have that independent layer.

Amy Mehu said that the reason why we're doing it in house is so when we're doing the reporting it would be referred to our in-house staff, Code Compliance, PD, and they would be able to do their own independent investigation based off of those results it would trigger their investigation, it wouldn't automatically be a violation, there is some separation, their findings are reported to the respective department and the respective departments investigated it. She said she would leave it to legal to let her know we can use a private resource for that. The original thought was that we were just trying to stay away from using social media, trying to stay away from the yelp reviews and instead of creating a new wheel, we wanted to work off of something that was already existing. If there is an opportunity to outsource it and obtain the same goal, where there are actionable items for Code Compliance and PD to investigate and then do their own violations for, we'd be receptive to that.

Commissioner Samuelian said his thoughts are that we want to get it done and he would look to the Administration to work with the City Attorney. He is comfortable with the recommendation to of doing it in-house. If after review outsourcing to a third party is a better solution, he would be open to that, but that he thinks they are dictating the what and I thinks they can be comfortable that the Administration will get the how right.

Ms. Velasco said if it is outsourced it is going to be a lot more money. She has seen it and managed it. She does think that city is capable of handling it internally and is happy to help.

VOTE OF ACCLAMATION TO FUND THE \$25,000 PILOT FOR THE MXE DISTRICT

DIRECTION: Come back to the July 31, 2019 FCWPC meeting with how much it would cost to fund Lincoln Road and Espanola Way. Also, bring the report card criteria to the Ocean Drive Panel.

DEFERRED ITEMS

16. DISCUSSION REGARDING ZERO BASED BUDGET (ZBB) EXERCISE FOR SANITATION

May 8, 2019 – C4 F

Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola
Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred to the July 26, 2019 FCWPC meeting, per request from the Commission Budget Workshop.

17. DISCUSSION TO EXAMINE THE SCOPE AND FUNDING OPTIONS FOR THE 72ND STREET PROJECT

May 8, 2019 – R7 A

Office of Capital Improvement Projects

ACTION

Commissioner Alemán said that she asked for this item to be discussed to get an update and see what action the Committee needs to take. She said this is the 72nd Street G.O. Bond project, there was an update at the G.O. Bond Oversight Committee meeting, but she was out of town. She is worried about this project getting stuck in the mud and she wants the Committee to have a chance to receive an update and see if there's anything that we can do to keep it moving.

David Martinez, CIP Director, gave an update. He said we are just about done with the last feasibility effort that we had taken on. However, the next step is to start preparing a design criteria package and in order to prepare a design criteria package he needs to understand what is going to be the ultimate scope of the work. Without that we would be wasting our money if we start putting something else together so that's where we are. He said he is also preparing a memorandum for the July 19th budget finance meeting that is going to have a lot more detail and in terms of the costs and some other items of operation and maintenance, a lot more comprehensive to hopefully shed more light into what the needs are. They can talk more about the programming and some of those type of things.

Commissioner Malakoff asked if that will include the utilities.

David Martinez said yes, we have a meeting next week with FPL to learn more about the transmission lines and even though we have some ideas of what that could cost, but just to really fine tune it. We really have all the information, we already have an aquatics expert on board with Desmond, a reputable firm that is going to be part of the criteria package preparation, so we're at a place where we're ready to move.

Commissioner Alemán confirmed with David Martinez that he has scope questions that need to be answered so that he can put the finals on that design criteria package and issue it. She asked what the scope questions are.

David Martinez said the program has been identified through the process and as we put together the information that went on for the G.O. Bond program. There are several elements on there that are very defined, some of them are a little more ambiguous, we have to figure out how big of a library we want, confirm that it is 500 parking spaces. We need to talk about the retail or the commercial in terms of what size, but most of the elements are already pretty defined. If he were to be told to go with exactly what we have we move, there will obviously be some internal discussions between all the departments that are involved in this, Parking, Parks and Recreation, Real Estate and we would all have a brainstorm session to fine tune the details.

Commissioner Alemán said on the size of library, the number of parking spaces, and the size of the retail they specified minimums. We didn't want to specify an exact amount because we wanted to leave room for creativity. Each of the bidders is going to come forward with their concept and based on that, those factors are going to vary somewhat, so we specified a minimum threshold, above that they can exceed our expectations.

David Martinez said that is correct.

Commissioner Alemán asked how the Committee can we help David Martinez into a posture here where this can issued.

Commissioner Samuelian asked when we will have the O&M costs.

David Martinez said they are putting those together and they are going to be part of the memorandum that they would issue for the July 19th FCWPC meeting.

John Woodruff, Chief Financial Officer, said he is working with David on that, he said they heard a lot of input at the last meeting about this. We focused on funding options for the \$10 million gap and it turned into more of a scope discussion. We are trying to hit all of the above at the July 19th meeting and have a separate item where we can hopefully get through all that. If we don't get through the discussion, there is a meeting a week later, so we're just trying to get out of the mud.

Commissioner Samuelian asked if the G.O. Bond Oversight Committee reviewed the project of late and if they provided any commentary around some of the stuff we're talking about

David Martinez said they have. It comes up at almost every meeting; they want to make sure this project happens. They are concerned whether or not it is going to happen or not timely.

Commissioner Samuelian said if they are engaging on it that is what he wanted to know. He supported the project when it went forward, he does support the project, and his concern is the additional \$10 million. He thinks we have lots of other capital needs. He viewed the G.O. bond as helping to really solve a lot of our capital problems and really take a step forward and now to see that this will usurp some discretionary capital is not something he's comfortable with. He does still support the project; he'd love to do it for the budget we went to the voters with.

Commissioner Arriola said he likes to do things right and likes to never settle for good, he goes for great especially when we have once in a lifetime opportunities particularly this project. He said he said this last year, not to take the \$10 million out that we will regret it and people have strong conviction that we could value engineer it. We regret it. Nevertheless, he still thinks we need to go for the right plan; the full plan the community deserves it. This is a catch up for North Beach. This project is so many things and it is a lot of money but it is still a fraction of what we have been investing into South Beach for many years. He is going to keep hammering everyone not to seek a compromise just to move things forward. He is going to still advocate for the project to be funded at the full amount to do it right.

Commissioner Samuelian said if this was that discussion and rewinding the clock and we were talking about it, that would be a different discussion, but we compromised. We talked about how much we could fit we said what can we do and there was an explicit decision, it went through the resident committee, it went through several processes. We went here, we went to the public in 15 to 20 meetings and said we could do this for this number, and we pledged fiscal responsibility now less than a year later to come back and take \$10 million from areas that we need capital that doesn't fit for him. That's his problem. Had we done it at the time that would have been fine, but we landed in this place and we have the funding to do a great project. He supports the project, he wants to see it happen, but he really thinks we need to live within our means.

Commissioner Alemán said it is not fiscally irresponsible for us to complement G.O. Bond projects from our annual capital plan. In fact in our 2020 capital plan, we plan to do just that already, we plan to purchase additional security cameras, we plan to purchase additional lighting. Those are G.O. Bond items. So if we are going to say that we're not going to complement G.O. Bond projects with annual capital then we should go ahead and take those line items right out because that's exactly what it is. In this case we scoped a project, tried to figure out at the time how to right size the G.O. Bond, this project was given an arbitrary head cut without saying that we were going to reduce the scope. She said she was with Rogelio Madan and she asked him for a follow-up on the Aria Town Center Garage project. Her understanding was Pacific Star Capital has submitted a plan to Planning for their project that no longer involves the City funding and no longer needs the \$10 million of parking funds that were sitting allocated to that project, so if that's the case we've got that money that can be moved over now. She believes that not only will we have majority support for the full scope of this project, which is a true Civic Center for North Beach, but there is overwhelming public support in North Beach for the full scope of this project and she thinks if we deliver anything less the community is going to have a big issue with us for doing so. So what we need to do is resolve this and get this thing out the door per our promises. In tranche one there is a design to complete the first step which is issuing this design criteria package that David Martinez is trying to issue. What she would say is that at the July 19th FCWPC meeting, let's be prepared to make some decisions, that's a full budget meeting we will have the full Commission. Let's be prepared to make a real decision at that meeting so that we can get David out of the mud.

Commissioner Arriola said to Commissioner Samuelian that he hears him and he agrees with him on trying to stay within scope. However, this was one particular item where he thought it was a mistake to cut back and the truth of the matter is that a substantial portion of monies to go towards the parking garage element of it is money that we really should and have to spend and whether it comes from the G.O. Bond or other buckets it doesn't matter. It is money that this Committee allocated to spend for parking needs and as Commissioner Alemán just said the fact that there may be a deal in the works right now for town center that we had previously allocated money to fund a parking garage there that might now be freed up that allows us to move it to the 72nd Street project. We do this all the time, regardless of the G.O. Bond we move money around all the time to meet needs. We scale back on plans, we increase plans based on needs and as we look at this project now we realize that to do it right, we need the additional funds we previously committed to another project that have potentially now been freed up so he would be comfortable taking that money from what we had been earmarking for the town center garage and moving towards this project. He doesn't know if we can move forward yet because we still don't know the status of the town center project. He said it might be a moot point if that money is not available, and then we have to look at this in another light. He asked David Martinez what direction he needs right now from the Committee beyond this discussion.

David Martinez said until he knows what the scope is there is nothing he can really do. It is all based on whether we have \$53.8 or \$64.4 million.

Commissioner Arriola said for him for sure to shoot for the higher number to do it right because he thinks we will regret it long-term because it is a project we will do once and it will be here for 50 something years or more, we need to do it right. Commissioner Alemán he thinks is in that direction, Commissioner Samuelian is not.

Commissioner Malakoff said she is in that direction, but she doesn't want it coming from the transportation \$10 million. She really thinks we are going to need that down the line. Eventually we are really going to have across the MacArthur transportation.

DIRECTION: Come back to the July 19th FCWPC meeting with more details.

18. DISCUSSION TO REVIEW THE CITY'S FORTHCOMING STORMWATER MANAGEMENT BUDGET AS WELL AS RELATED UTILITIES, ABOVE GROUND, AND OTHER ASSOCIATED COSTS

September 12, 2018 – C4 G
Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred to the July 26, 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending information from Jacobs Engineering.

19. DISCUSSION REGARDING APPROPRIATING SERIES 2017 STORMWATER BOND PROCEEDS AND SERIES 2017 WATER AND SEWER BOND PROCEEDS TO NORTH BEACH TOWN CENTER

June 5, 2019 – C4 I
Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola
Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the July 26, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

20. DISCUSSION ON UPDATING MINIMUM WAGES ON CITY FUNDED CONSTRUCTION CONTRACTS

January 16, 2019 – C4 M
Sponsored by Commissioner Steinberg
Procurement/CIP

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred to the July 31, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

21. DISCUSSION REGARDING CREATING A CONNECTION BETWEEN OCEAN DRIVE AND LINCOLN ROAD THROUGH ESPANOLA WAY

June 5, 2019 – C4 H
Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola
Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the July 31, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

22. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE LOCATION OF A STORAGE FACILITY AND NEW RESTROOMS FOR SOUNDSCAPE PARK

January 16, 2019 – C4 I
Tourism and Culture

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred to the July 31, 2019 FCWPC meeting, pending designer renderings.

23. DISCUSSION REGARDING VACATING A PORTION OF OCEAN COURT BETWEEN THE CLEVELANDER AND ESSEX HOTELS IN FAVOR OF THE JESTA GROUP PURSUANT TO SECTION 82-37 OF THE CITY CODE TO ENABLE A PEDESTRIAN BRIDGE TO LINK BOTH PROPERTIES

June 5, 2019 – C4 F
Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola
Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the September 20, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

24. DISCUSSION REGARDING THE REVIEW OF THE JULIA TUTTLE BUS RAPID TRANSIT DEMONSTRATION PROJECT

May 16, 2018 – C4 R

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Transportation

ACTION

DIRECTION: Update to be provided at the July 31, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

25. UPDATE ON THE PROGRESS OF THE TRAFFIC MITIGATION STRATEGY TO HELP REDUCE TRAFFIC IMPACTS OF THE CONNECTING MIAMI CONSTRUCTION PROJECT

March 13, 2019 – R7 G

Sponsored by Commissioner Samuelian
Transportation

ACTION

DIRECTION: Update to be provided at the July 31, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

26. DISCUSSION PERTAINING TO A FUTURE PLAN FOR THE PARKING LOT ON THE NORTH SIDE OF 75TH STREET BETWEEN COLLINS AVENUE AND OCEAN TERRACE

June 5, 2019 – C4 E

Economic Development

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the July 31, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

27. UPDATE ON FDOT AND CITY CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS AND TRAFFIC MITIGATION STRATEGIES

June 5, 2019 – R9 E

Sponsored by Commissioner Góngora
Transportation

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item to be heard at the July 31, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

28. DISCUSSION REGARDING ESTABLISHING A HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND

April 11, 2018 – C4 O

Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola
Finance/Planning

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred to the September 20, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

29. DISCUSSION REGARDING BENCHMARKING OF IMPACT FEES

January 16, 2019 – C4 G

Sponsored by Commissioner Alemán
Economic Development

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item withdrawn by sponsor.

30. **DISCUSSION ON MIAMI BEACH COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION AND ITS FINANCIAL CONDITION**

April 10, 2019 – C4 D

Sponsored by Vice-Mayor Malakoff

Office of Housing & Community Services

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred to the September 20, 2019 FCWPC meeting.

31. **DISCUSSION REGARDING THE BIGBELLY PROGRAM AND POTENTIAL WAYS TO SUBSIDIZE ITS COST**

October 17, 2018 – C4 I

Sponsored by Commissioner Arriola

Public Works

ACTION

DIRECTION: Item deferred to be discussed further during or subsequent to the Zero Based Budget item, as BigBelly is proposing to offset costs by including a 5G component to the program.